

Contents

<i>Foreword by Sir Michael Wood</i>	xiii
<i>Preface</i>	xv
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xvii
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xix
<i>Note on Citations</i>	xxi
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xxiii
<i>Table of Treaties and Legislation</i>	xxx i

PART I. OVERVIEW, HISTORY, MATERIALS, AND *DRAMATIS PERSONAE*

The Vienna Rules	3
1. A Single Set of Rules of Interpretation	5
1. Introduction	5
1.1 Guide to analytical approach	9
2. Applicability of the Vienna Rules Generally	12
2.1 History of recognition by the ICJ of the Vienna rules	13
2.2 Express endorsement of the Vienna rules by the ICJ	15
2.3 Endorsement of the Vienna rules by other international courts and tribunals	17
2.4 Endorsement of the Vienna rules by national courts	18
3. Definitions and Key Concepts	19
3.1 Treaty	20
3.2 Party, signatory, etc	22
3.3 Treaty relations	23
3.4 Preparatory work	24
3.5 Intertemporal law	25
3.6 'Interpretation' and 'application'	26
4. The Process of Interpretation and the Nature of the Rules	29
4.1 The process of interpretation and the principle of autonomous interpretation	29
4.2 A general 'rule' and 'rules' of interpretation	33
4.3 Are the Vienna rules 'rules'?	36
5. Four Examples	38
5.1 Interpretation by the European Court of Human Rights—a typical approach	39
5.2 An interpretation by an arbitral tribunal of the International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes (ICSID)—interpretation and application	41

5.3	Interpretation within a national legal system—contrasting application of Vienna rules and domestic precedent	45
5.4	Interpretation within a national legal system—increasing awareness of the Vienna rules in courts in the UK	48
2.	Development of Rules of Interpretation	51
1.	Introduction	51
2.	Treaty Interpretation in the Greco-Roman Era	54
3.	Grotius, Pufendorf, Vattel, and Canons of Interpretation	55
4.	The Harvard Draft Convention on the Law of Treaties	56
5.	The Permanent Court of International Justice	59
6.	Restrictive Interpretation and Effectiveness	60
7.	Institut de Droit International	62
8.	The Practice of the International Court of Justice Before the Vienna Convention	63
9.	The New Haven School and World Public Order	65
10.	The Work of the International Law Commission and the Vienna Conference	69
3.	Interpretative Material Generated in Making Treaties	74
1.	Introduction	74
2.	Making Treaties	75
2.1	Who initiates and negotiates treaties?	75
2.2	Negotiating and drawing up a treaty	75
2.2.1	<i>Negotiation and full powers</i>	76
2.3	Adoption and authentication of a treaty text	77
2.4	Concluded and other instruments	78
2.4.1	<i>Final acts and protocols</i>	79
2.4.2	<i>Distinguishing treaties from other instruments</i>	80
3.	Statements or Declarations by States Affecting Interpretation of Treaties	84
3.1	Reservations	84
3.2	Interpretative declarations	86
3.3	Differentiating between reservations and interpretative declarations	87
3.4	Wrinkles in the distinction	87
3.5	Confusing terminology	88
3.6	Significance of how the maker characterizes a statement or declaration	89
3.7	'Conditional declarations'	90
3.8	Other declarations	91
3.9	Statements in response to declarations	92
3.10	Effects of responses to interpretative declarations	93
3.11	Effects of interpretative declarations	94

3.12	Decisions of courts and tribunals on interpretative declarations	95
3.13	Conclusion on interpretative declarations	98
4.	Preparatory Materials	99
4.1	How far does preparatory work trace history?	99
4.1.1	<i>What illuminates a common understanding?</i>	100
4.1.2	<i>Tracing a historical line</i>	101
4.1.3	<i>Looking at the main source</i>	101
4.1.4	<i>Using all material available to negotiators</i>	103
4.2	Whether preparatory work can be differentially admissible	104
4.3	Documents associated with treaty negotiations	105
4.4	Admissibility of documents from a unilateral source	106
4.	Who Uses the Vienna Convention to Interpret Treaties? <i>— EU!</i>	109
1.	Introduction	109
2.	International Organizations	111
2.1	General interpretative competence in international organizations	111
2.2	The two Vienna Conventions on the Law of Treaties	112
2.3	The United Nations and other organizations	113
2.4	The European Community and European Union	113
3.	International Courts and Tribunals	114
3.1	International Court of Justice	114
3.2	Arbitration	115
3.3	The World Trade Organization Dispute Settlement Understanding	116
3.4	The International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes (ICSID)	119
3.5	The European Court of Human Rights	119
3.6	The European Court of Justice	120
3.6.1	<i>The treaties founding the Community</i>	121
3.6.2	<i>Treaties to which the Community is a party with non-member states</i>	122
3.6.3	<i>Community instruments giving effect to treaties with non-members</i>	124
3.7	Other international courts and tribunals	126
4.	National Legal Systems	126
4.1	Implementation of treaties	126
4.2	Judicial interpretation within national legal systems	128
4.2.1	<i>Parties to the Vienna Convention generally</i>	128
4.2.2	<i>The common law tradition</i>	129
4.2.3	<i>States which are not parties to the Vienna Convention</i>	133

PART II. INTERPRETATION APPLYING THE VIENNA CONVENTION ON THE LAW OF TREATIES

A. The General Rule

5.	The General Rule: (1) The Treaty, its Terms, and their Ordinary Meaning	141
----	---	-----

1. A 'Treaty'	142
1.1 The 'treaty' and its 'terms'	144
1.2 The sound of silence—absent and implied terms	145
2. 'Good Faith'	147
2.1 History and preparatory work relating to 'good faith'	148
2.2 Ordinary meaning of 'good faith'	150
2.3 'Good faith' in context and in the light of the Convention's object and purpose	152
2.4 Issues and practice	152
2.4.1 'Good faith' generally	152
2.4.2 'Good faith' meaning reasonableness	157
2.4.3 'Good faith' limiting interpretation of a power	157
2.4.4 'Good faith' requiring balancing of treaty elements	158
2.4.5 'Good faith' and the principle of effectiveness (ut res magis valeat quam pereat)	159
3. 'Ordinary Meaning'	161
3.1 History and preparatory work	162
3.2 Ordinary meaning of 'ordinary meaning to be given to the terms of the treaty'	163
3.3 Issues and practice	165
3.3.1 Role of ordinary meaning	165
3.3.2 Dictionaries and other sources of definitions	166
3.3.3 Literal meanings of single terms	169
3.3.4 No ordinary meaning or no single one?	170
3.3.5 Generic terms	172
3.3.6 'Ordinary' to whom?	173
3.3.7 Treaty language and terms	174
3.3.8 Terms and concepts	176
4. 'Context'	177
4.1 Background and context	178
4.2 Issues and practice	178
4.2.1 Immediate context—grammar and syntax	178
4.2.2 Title, headings, and chapeaux	180
4.2.3 Context showing structure or scheme	182
4.2.4 Related and contrasting provisions	185
4.2.5 Preamble	186
4.2.6 Punctuation and syntax	187
5. 'Object and Purpose'	189
5.1 History and preparatory work relating to 'object and purpose'	190
5.2 Ordinary Meaning of 'object and purpose' in context	191
5.3 Issues and practice	194
5.3.1 Singular object and purpose	194
5.3.2 Finding object and purpose from preamble and substantive provisions	196
5.3.3 Can the object and purpose be used to counter clear substantive provisions?	197
5.3.4 Object and purpose identifying general scope of treaty	199

5.3.5	<i>Object and purpose in a particular provision</i>	200
5.3.6	<i>Principle of effectiveness (general)</i>	200
6.	Conclusions	202
6.	The General Rule: (2) Agreements as Context, Subsequent Agreements, and Subsequent Practice	203
1.	Introduction	203
1.1	The linking notion of agreement	203
1.2	Substantial identity of effect of subsequent agreements on interpretation as of those at time of conclusion	204
1.3	Interpretative agreement in subsequent practice	208
2.	Agreements and Instruments Made in Connection with Conclusion of a Treaty	209
2.1	'Conclusion' of a treaty	209
2.2	Interpretative role of agreements connected with conclusion of a treaty	212
2.3	Interpretative role of instruments made by one or more parties	214
2.3.1	<i>Instruments covered by article 31(2)(b) of the Vienna Convention</i>	214
2.3.2	<i>Role of unilateral instruments covered by article 31(2)(b)</i>	215
3.	Subsequent Agreements	216
3.1	Fact of agreement, not form, is the key factor	216
3.1.1	<i>History and analysis</i>	217
3.1.2	<i>ICJ looks for fact of agreement, not form</i>	218
3.2	Less formal or informal agreement	220
3.3	Effect of amending agreements	222
4.	Subsequent Practice	225
4.1	Elements of subsequent practice	226
4.1.1	<i>History and development of the provision</i>	226
4.1.2	<i>Meaning of 'subsequent practice'</i>	226
4.1.3	<i>Practice to be concordant, common, and consistent</i>	227
4.1.4	<i>Practice may consist of executive, legislative, and judicial acts</i>	228
4.1.5	<i>'Subsequent practice' and 'subsequent conduct' distinguished</i>	230
4.1.6	<i>Practice 'in the application of the treaty'</i>	232
4.2	Deduction from absence of subsequent practice	232
4.3	Parties participating in the practice	235
4.3.1	<i>Practice must be attributable to parties</i>	235
4.3.2	<i>Agreement, not practice, of all parties is required</i>	235
4.3.3	<i>Practice of some parties only does not interpret a treaty 'inter se' unless so agreed</i>	236
4.3.4	<i>Practice of some parties in absence of that of others</i>	237
4.4	'Establishing' agreement	239
4.5	Subsequent practice linked with informal agreement, understandings, or other instruments	241
4.6	Subsequent practice and 'evolutive' interpretation distinguished	242
4.7	Subsequent practice and amendment differentiated	243
4.8	Subsequent practice in international organizations	246

4.8.1	<i>Whose practice in the organization?</i>	246
4.8.2	<i>Practice in relation to treaty establishing an organization</i>	247
4.8.3	<i>Practice in relation to treaty provisions other than constitutional ones</i>	249
7.	The General Rule: (3) Relevant Rules of International Law and Special Meanings	250
1.	Introduction	250
1.1	The intertemporal rule in general international law	252
1.2	Time factors in treaty interpretation	253
2.	History and Preparatory Work of Article 31(3)(c)	256
3.	Ordinary Meaning of Article 31(3)(c) in Context, etc	259
3.1	There shall be taken into account, together with the context...	259
3.2	Relevant rules of international law	260
3.2.1	<i>Relevance</i>	260
3.2.2	<i>Rules of international law</i>	260
3.3	Which are 'the parties'?	263
4.	Issues and Practice	265
4.1	Terms	266
4.1.1	<i>Extent of relevant 'international law'</i>	266
4.1.2	<i>'Rules'</i>	268
4.1.3	<i>Applicable in the relations between which 'parties'?</i>	269
4.2	Intertemporal and temporal issues	276
4.3	Clarifying meaning by reference to international law	278
4.4	Reference to other treaties	281
4.4.1	<i>Reference to international law stated in common form treaties</i>	282
4.4.2	<i>Reference to the same word as used in other treaties</i>	283
4.4.3	<i>Reference to terms or phrases used in treaties on the same subject</i>	283
4.5	Filling gaps by reference to general international law	284
4.6	Parallel and conflicting obligations	288
4.7	Taking account of international law developments	289
5.	Special Meanings	291
5.1	Introduction	291
5.2	History and preparatory work	291
5.3	Issues and practice	294
5.3.1	<i>Special meaning and ordinary meaning distinguished</i>	294
5.3.2	<i>Burden of establishing a special meaning</i>	295
5.3.3	<i>Evidence required to establish a special meaning</i>	296
5.3.4	<i>Special meanings and special regimes</i>	297
	 <i>B. Supplementary Means of Interpretation</i>	
8.	Supplementary Means of Interpretation	301
1.	Introduction	301

2. History and Preparatory Work	303
2.1 Separating supplementary means from the general rule	303
2.2 Ready reference to preparatory work distinguished from basing interpretations on it alone	306
2.3 Distinction between use of supplementary means 'to confirm' and 'to determine' the meaning	307
3. Meaning of 'Recourse' and 'Supplementary'	310
3.1 'Recourse'	310
3.2 'Supplementary'	311
3.3 Further supplementary means	311
4. Issues and Practice	312
4.1 Systematic use of gateways, unsystematic use, and by-passing them	312
4.1.1 <i>Explicit reference to the qualifying gateway</i>	312
4.1.2 <i>Reaching the preparatory work informally</i>	313
4.1.3 <i>Incidental use of supplementary means</i>	315
4.1.4 <i>Admitting preparatory work introduced by parties</i>	316
4.2 Confirming meaning	316
4.2.1 <i>Role of 'confirming' when not 'determining'</i>	316
4.2.2 <i>Confirming a clear meaning</i>	323
4.2.3 <i>Using supplementary means to confirm 'intention'</i>	324
4.2.4 <i>Using supplementary means to 'reinforce' an interpretation</i>	326
4.2.5 <i>Using preparatory work as general support</i>	327
4.2.6 <i>Reciting and using preparatory work contrasted</i>	327
4.3 Determining meaning	328
4.3.1 <i>Qualifying conditions: 'ambiguous or obscure' or 'manifestly absurd or unreasonable'</i>	328
4.3.2 <i>Ambiguous by reference to availability of another word having one of the claimed meanings</i>	330
4.4 Modalities of use of supplementary means	331
4.4.1 <i>Using and construing preparatory work</i>	331
4.4.2 <i>Reading preparatory work to show agreement to exclude</i>	333
4.4.3 <i>Deduction from absence from preparatory work</i>	334
4.4.4 <i>Change of word or words during negotiation of treaty</i>	336
4.4.5 <i>Exclusion of preparatory work from consideration</i>	337
4.4.6 <i>May preparatory work be deployed as context?</i>	339
4.4.7 <i>Using preparatory work to identify or confirm object and purpose</i>	340
4.4.8 <i>Effect of interpretation recorded in preparatory work</i>	341
4.4.9 <i>Reading preparatory work in combination with other supplementary means</i>	342
4.5 Circumstances of conclusion and other supplementary means	343
4.5.1 <i>Meaning of 'circumstances of conclusion'</i>	343
4.5.2 <i>Comparison with provisions in other treaties or associated material as a circumstance of conclusion</i>	345
4.5.3 <i>Commentaries, explanatory reports, academic writing, etc</i>	346
4.5.4 <i>Other supplementary means</i>	349

C. Languages

9. Languages	353
1. Introduction	353
2. History and Preparatory Work	354
3. Ordinary Meaning of Terms in Article 33	359
4. Issues and Practice	360
4.1 Interpretation by reference first to only one of several languages	360
4.2 Use of 'versions', 'official' and other texts	362
4.3 Presumption of the same meaning in all authentic texts	363
4.4 How many languages must be considered if there is a need to reconcile texts?	364
4.5 Is the 'original' language of a treaty particularly significant for interpretation?	366
4.6 Translation of terms and legal concepts in different languages	369
4.7 Reconciliation where one or more texts are clear but another is ambiguous	375
4.8 Different punctuation in different languages	377
4.9 Reconciliation of language differences by reference to object and purpose	380
4.10 Using preparatory work in reconciling differences between languages	384
<i>Bibliography</i>	387
<i>Index</i>	397