

# Table of Contents

## Preface

xv

## Chapter 1

|   |          |
|---|----------|
| <b>Function and Nature of the Preliminary Ruling Procedure</b>                    | <b>1</b> |
| 1 Uniformity of the Community Legal Order   | 1        |
| 1.1 Full Effect of Community Law  | 1        |
| 1.1.1 Concept of Full Effect  | 1        |
| 1.1.2 Direct Effect and Primacy of Community Law                                  | 2        |
| 1.2 Application of Community Law by National Courts                               | 3        |
| 1.2.1 Obligation to Ensure the Full Effect of Community Law                       | 3        |
| 1.2.2 Obligation to Ensure Legal Protection                                       | 5        |
| 1.3 Remedies before National Courts   | 6        |
| 1.3.1 Availability of Remedies  | 6        |
| 1.3.2 Organization of and Procedures before National Courts                       | 7        |
| 2 Uniform Application and Interpretation of Community Law                         | 9        |
| 2.1 Risks of Divergences in the Interpretation of Community Law                   | 9        |
| 2.2 Function of Article 234 EC  | 10       |
| 2.3 System of Article 234 EC  | 12       |
| 3 Features of the Preliminary Ruling Procedure                                    | 14       |
| 3.1 Instrument of Cooperation between National Courts and the Court of Justice    | 14       |
| 3.1.1 Common Function   | 14       |
| 3.1.2 Allocation of Jurisdiction between National Courts and the Court of Justice | 15       |
| 3.2 Function of the Court of Justice under Article 234 EC                         | 20       |
| 3.3 Non-contentious Character of the Preliminary Ruling Procedure                 | 23       |
| 3.4 Rules Governing the Preliminary Ruling Procedure                              | 24       |



|                                     |  |           |
|-------------------------------------|--|-----------|
| 3.4.1                               | Article 234 EC   | 24        |
| 3.4.2                               | Statute of the Court of Justice  | 25        |
| 3.4.3                               | Rules of Procedure   | 25        |
| 3.4.4                               | Costs  | 26        |
| <br><b>Chapter 2</b>                |  |           |
| <b>Scope of Article 234 EC</b>      |  | <b>27</b> |
| 1                                   | Community Law  | 27        |
| 1.1                                 | EC Treaty and Treaties of Accession  | 27        |
| 1.1.1                               | Scope and Limits   | 27        |
| 1.1.2                               | Application of Community Law by National<br>and Community Institutions                   | 28        |
| 1.1.3                               | Situations outside the Scope of Community Law  | 30        |
| 1.1.4                               | Treaty on European Union   | 31        |
| 1.2                                 | Specific Provisions of the EC Treaty   | 32        |
| 1.2.1                               | Article 234 EC   | 32        |
| 1.2.2                               | State Aids (Articles 87 EC and 88 EC)  | 32        |
| 1.2.3                               | Failure to Act (Article 232 EC)  | 33        |
| 1.2.4                               | Extra-Contractual Responsibility (Articles 235<br>EC and 288, Second Paragraph EC)       | 34        |
| 1.3                                 | General Principles of Law  | 34        |
| 1.4                                 | Internal Situations  | 35        |
| 2                                   | Reference to Community Law by National Law   | 36        |
| 2.1                                 | Applicability of Article 234 EC  | 36        |
| 2.2                                 | Forms of References to Community Law   | 39        |
| 2.3                                 | Limits to the Jurisdiction of the Court of Justice                                       | 40        |
| 2.4                                 | Reference to Community Law by Contractual Provisions                                     | 41        |
| 2.5                                 | Reference to National Law by Community Law   | 41        |
| 3                                   | Acts of the Institutions   | 42        |
| 3.1                                 | Scope of Article 234 EC  | 42        |
| 3.2                                 | Legal Nature of a Community Act  | 43        |
| 3.3                                 | Specific Acts  | 44        |
| 3.4                                 | International Agreements   | 45        |
| 3.4.1                               | Applicability of Article 234 EC  | 45        |
| 3.4.2                               | Limits to the Jurisdiction of the Court of Justice                                       | 46        |
| 3.4.3                               | Agreements Prior to the EC Treaty  | 48        |
| 3.4.4                               | International Agreements Forming Part of the<br>Legal Background to the Main Proceedings | 49        |
| <br><b>Chapter 3</b>                |  |           |
| <b>National Courts or Tribunals</b> |  | <b>51</b> |
| 1                                   | Concept of National Court or Tribunal  | 51        |
| 1.1                                 | Conditions   | 51        |
| 1.2                                 | Compulsory Jurisdiction  | 53        |
| 1.3                                 | Jurisdictional Function  | 53        |



|     |   |    |
|-----|---|----|
| 1.4 | Independence  | 55 |
| 1.5 | Procedure <i>Inter Partes</i>   | 56 |
| 2   | Bodies Satisfying the Criteria of a National Court or Tribunal within the Meaning of Article 234 EC | 57 |
| 2.1 | Judge Investigating in Criminal Matters   | 57 |
| 2.2 | Council of State  | 57 |
| 2.3 | Courts Having Special Jurisdiction  | 58 |
| 3   | Bodies Exercising Jurisdictional and Administrative Functions                                       | 64 |
| 3.1 | Accounting Offices  | 64 |
| 3.2 | Courts Exercising Administrative Functions  | 64 |
| 4   | Bodies Not Considered To Be Courts or Tribunals   | 65 |
| 4.1 | Administrative Appeal Bodies  | 65 |
| 4.2 | Public Prosecutor   | 66 |
| 4.3 | Other Bodies  | 67 |
| 5   | Arbitration   | 68 |
| 5.1 | Conventional and Compulsory Arbitration   | 68 |
| 5.2 | Arbitration by National Courts  | 69 |
| 6   | Court or Tribunal of a Member State   | 69 |
| 6.1 | Courts of Territories Having a Special Status   | 69 |
| 6.2 | Courts Common to More Than One Member State   | 70 |

## Chapter 4

### Participation in the Preliminary-Ruling Procedure 71

|       |   |    |
|-------|---|----|
| 1     | Persons Entitled to Participate in the Preliminary-Ruling Procedure | 71 |
| 1.1   | Parties in the Main Proceedings and Other Participants              | 71 |
| 1.2   | Third Persons   | 73 |
| 1.3   | Intervenants  | 73 |
| 2     | Rights of the Participants  | 74 |
| 2.1   | Right To Be Heard   | 74 |
| 2.2   | Right To Be Informed  | 74 |
| 3     | Limits to the Participation   | 77 |
| 3.1   | National Court as Dominus Litis                                     | 77 |
| 3.2   | Questions Raised by Parties before the National Court               | 78 |
| 3.3   | Challenging the Jurisdiction of the Court of Justice                | 79 |
| 3.4   | Challenging Facts and National Law                                  | 79 |
| 3.5   | Determination of the Preliminary Questions                          | 80 |
| 3.5.1 | Exclusive Competence of National Courts                             | 80 |
| 3.5.2 | Artificial Disputes   | 81 |
| 3.5.3 | Questions Proposed by Parties in the Main Proceedings               | 81 |
| 3.6   | Extraordinary Proceedings   | 82 |
| 3.6.1 | Request for Interpretation of a Preliminary Judgment                | 82 |
| 3.6.2 | Request for Revision of a Preliminary Judgment                      | 83 |
| 3.6.3 | Request to Supplement Preliminary Judgments                         | 83 |



**Chapter 5**

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| <b>Entitlement of National Courts to Refer Preliminary Questions</b>                   | <b>85</b> |
| 1 Position of National Courts under Article 234 EC                                     | 85        |
| 1.1 Rights and Obligations of National Courts  | 85        |
| 1.1.1 General Conditions for Preliminary References                                    | 85        |
| 1.1.2 Obligation and Entitlement to Make a Reference                                   | 86        |
| 1.2 Exclusive Competence of National Courts to Refer                                   | 87        |
| 2 Entitlement of National Courts to Refer  | 88        |
| 2.1 Function and Scope   | 88        |
| 2.2 Entitlement to Refer and National Law  | 89        |
| 2.3 Entitlement to Refer and Community Law   | 90        |
| 3 Nature of the Main Proceedings   | 91        |
| 3.1 Whether or Not the Procedure Is <i>Inter Partes</i>                                | 91        |
| 3.2 Nature of the Decision To Be Given by the National Court                           | 92        |
| 3.3 Summary Proceedings  | 93        |
| 4 Questions on Interpretation or Validity  | 94        |
| 4.1 Questions Raised by Parties in the Main Proceedings                                | 94        |
| 4.2 Questions Raised by a National Court of Its Own Motion                             | 95        |
| 4.3 Obligation of National Courts to Raise Points of Community Law of Their Own Motion | 96        |

**Chapter 6**

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| <b>Facultative and Obligatory References</b>   | <b>99</b> |
| 1 Necessity of a Decision on a Question of Interpretation or Validity                              | 99        |
| 1.1 Appreciation by the National Court   | 99        |
| 1.1.1 Relevance of the Questions Raised by the Case before the National Court                      | 99        |
| 1.1.2 Necessity of a Preliminary Reference   | 100       |
| 1.1.3 Formulation of the Preliminary Questions   | 109       |
| 1.2 Absence of Power of the Court of Justice to Assess the Necessity of a Preliminary Reference    | 110       |
| 1.3 Appreciation by the National Court of the Necessity of a Facultative or Obligatory Reference   | 112       |
| 1.4 Appreciation by the National Court of the Necessity of Questions on Interpretation or Validity | 114       |
| 2 Presumption of Relevance of a Preliminary Reference  | 115       |
| 3 Facultative References   | 116       |
| 4 Obligatory References  | 118       |
| 4.1 Purpose  | 118       |
| 4.2 Notion of a Court against Whose Decisions There Is No Judicial Remedy under National Law       | 119       |
| 4.3 Obligation to Refer in Summary Proceedings   | 120       |
| 4.4 Obligatory Reference of a Question on Interpretation   | 121       |
| 4.4.1 <i>Acte Éclairé</i> ('Clarified Act')  | 121       |
| 4.4.2 <i>Acte Clair</i> ('Clear Act')  | 122       |



|       |  |     |
|-------|--|-----|
| 4.5   | Obligatory Reference of a Question on Validity   | 124 |
| 4.5.1 | Questions on Validity Raised before a Court<br>against Whose Decisions There Is No Judicial Remedy | 124 |
| 4.5.2 | Suspension of a National Measure to Implement<br>a Community Act                                   | 124 |
| 4.5.3 | Non-applicability of the CILFIT Criteria   | 125 |
| 4.6   | Violation of the Obligation to Refer   | 126 |

## Chapter 7

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>The Decision to Refer</b>                                    | <b>129</b> |
| 1 Effect and Legal Nature                                       | 129        |
| 1.1 Condition of and Basis for the Preliminary Procedure        | 129        |
| 1.2 Character of an Incident in the Main Proceedings            | 129        |
| 2 Organization of National Courts and Their Procedure           | 130        |
| 2.1 Competence of National Courts by Virtue of National Law     | 130        |
| 2.2 Admissibility of the Action in the Main Proceedings         | 131        |
| 2.3 Appeal against the Decision to Refer                        | 132        |
| 2.4 Termination of the Proceedings before the National Court    | 134        |
| 3 Form of the Decision to Make a Reference                      | 135        |
| 4 Stage of the Procedure  | 136        |
| 4.1 Discretion of National Courts                               | 136        |
| 4.2 Prior Determination of the Facts and the<br>Legal Framework | 137        |
| 4.3 Requirement of a Pending Dispute                            | 138        |
| 5 Contents of the Decision to Refer                             | 139        |
| 5.1 Function of the Information in the Decision to Refer        | 139        |
| 5.2 Information on the Facts and Legal Framework                | 142        |
| 5.2.1 Information Required for a Useful Reply                   | 142        |
| 5.2.2 Degree of Precision                                       | 146        |
| 5.2.3 Consequences of Incomplete Information                    | 147        |
| 5.3 Setting Out of the Reasons for the Reference                | 148        |

## Chapter 8

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <b>Preliminary Interpretation and Appreciation of Validity</b>               | <b>151</b> |
| 1 Foundation of the Exercise of Preliminary Jurisdiction                     | 151        |
| 2 Interpretation of Community Law  | 152        |
| 2.1 Concept of 'Interpretation'  | 152        |
| 2.2 Effects of the Interpretation of Community Law on<br>National Law        | 154        |
| 3 Appreciation of the Validity of Community Acts                             | 154        |
| 3.1 Place and Function in the EC Treaty                                      | 154        |
| 3.2 Pleading the Illegality of a Community Measure before<br>National Courts | 156        |
| 3.3 Indirect Legality Control through a Preliminary Reference                | 158        |
| 3.4 Action for Annulment and Validity Control                                | 159        |



|     |   |     |
|-----|---|-----|
| 4   | Interim Measures                            | 161 |
| 4.1 | Scope of the Competence of National Courts  | 161 |
| 4.2 | Conditions to Provide Interim Relief        | 163 |
| 4.3 | Power to Declare Community Acts Invalid     | 166 |
| 5   | Scope of Validity Control of Community Acts | 168 |
| 5.1 | Community Law and General Principles of Law | 168 |
| 5.2 | International Law                           | 169 |
| 5.3 | Procedural Aspects                          | 169 |

## Chapter 9

|     |   |            |
|-----|---|------------|
|     | <b>The Court of Justice and the Preliminary Questions</b>             | <b>171</b> |
| 1   | Determination of Preliminary Questions                                | 171        |
| 2   | Modification of Preliminary Questions                                 | 173        |
| 2.1 | Limits  | 173        |
| 2.2 | Elements of Community Law Not Mentioned in the Decision for Reference | 174        |
| 3   | Questions Not Submitted in the Decision for Reference                 | 177        |
| 3.1 | Questions Submitted by the Participants in the Preliminary Procedure  | 177        |
| 3.2 | Questions Rejected by the Referring Court                             | 179        |
| 3.3 | New Elements Presented during the Preliminary Procedure               | 179        |
| 4   | Interpretation of the Decision Making the Reference                   | 180        |
| 4.1 | Identification of the Elements of Community Law To Be Interpreted     | 180        |
| 4.2 | Imperfect Preliminary Questions                                       | 183        |
| 4.3 | Reformulation of Preliminary Questions                                | 184        |

## Chapter 10

|       |   |            |
|-------|---|------------|
|       | <b>Limits to the Competence to Give a Preliminary Ruling</b>                                  | <b>187</b> |
| 1     | Facts and Context of the Dispute in the Main Proceedings                                      | 187        |
| 1.1   | Establishment and Investigation of the Facts of the Case                                      | 187        |
| 1.1.1 | Division of Functions   | 187        |
| 1.1.2 | Responsibility of National Courts   | 188        |
| 1.1.3 | Assessment of the Facts of the Case   | 189        |
| 2     | National Law  | 192        |
| 2.1   | Interpretation of National Law  | 192        |
| 2.2   | Application of National Law   | 196        |
| 3     | Community Law   | 198        |
| 3.1   | Applicability of Community Law  | 198        |
| 3.2   | Application of Community Law to the Facts of the Case   | 198        |
| 4     | Compatibility of National Law with Community Law  | 202        |
| 4.1   | Absence of Jurisdiction of the Court of Justice   | 202        |
| 4.2   | Assistance to the National Court to Rule on the Conformity of National Law with Community Law | 206        |



|                   |   |            |
|-------------------|---|------------|
| 4.3               | Conformity with Community Law of the Law of another Member State              | 211        |
| <b>Chapter 11</b> |   |            |
|                   | <b>Obligation and Refusal to Give a Preliminary Ruling</b>                    | <b>213</b> |
| 1                 | Obligation to Give a Preliminary Ruling                                       | 213        |
| 1.1               | Scope   | 213        |
| 1.1.1             | General Principles  | 213        |
| 1.1.2             | Questions on Interpretation   | 215        |
| 1.1.3             | Questions on Validity   | 219        |
| 1.1.4             | Possible Consequences of a Preliminary Ruling                                 | 220        |
| 1.2               | Exceptions to the Obligation to Give a Preliminary Ruling                     | 220        |
| 1.3               | Circumstances without Influence on the Admissibility of Preliminary Questions | 228        |
| 1.3.1             | Questions Belonging to the Substance of the Case                              | 228        |
| 1.3.2             | Lack of Indications in the Decision Making the Reference                      | 229        |
| 1.3.3             | Applicability of the Provisions of Community Law To Be Interpreted            | 231        |
| 2                 | Requirement of a Case Pending Before the National Court                       | 231        |
| 2.1               | Absence of an Actual Dispute  | 231        |
| 2.1.1             | Principle   | 231        |
| 2.1.2             | Extinction of the Main Proceedings  | 232        |
| 2.1.3             | Hypothetical Questions  | 232        |
| 2.2               | Fabricated Disputes   | 233        |
| 2.3               | Factors without Influence on the Reality of a Dispute                         | 234        |
| 3                 | Absence of Information on the Factual and Legal Context of the Case           | 235        |
| 3.1               | Criterion of a Useful Reply   | 235        |
| 3.2               | Manifestly Inadmissible References  | 236        |
| 4                 | Preliminary Questions Bearing No Relation to the Case                         | 237        |
| 5                 | Questions Lacking Precision   | 239        |
| 5.1               | Absence of a Relation between the Case and Community Law                      | 239        |
| 5.2               | Preliminary Questions without Motivation                                      | 240        |
| 5.3               | Interests of the Participants in the Preliminary Ruling Procedure             | 241        |
| <b>Chapter 12</b> |   |            |
|                   | <b>Preliminary Judgment</b>   | <b>243</b> |
| 1                 | Legal Nature  | 243        |
| 1.1               | Binding Character   | 243        |
| 1.1.1             | Authority of a Preliminary Judgment   | 243        |
| 1.1.2             | Consequences for the Referring Court  | 244        |



|  |   |            |
|--|---|------------|
| 1.1.3                                  | Consequences for Other National Courts                                    | 244        |
| 1.1.4                                  | Consequences for National Authorities                                     | 244        |
| 1.2                                    | Scope of Preliminary Judgments  | 245        |
| 2                                      | Interpretative Judgments  | 245        |
| 2.1                                    | Retroactive Effect  | 245        |
| 2.2                                    | Restrictions of the Retroactive Effect of Interpretative Judgments        | 248        |
| 2.2.1                                  | Exclusive Competence of the Court of Justice                              | 248        |
| 2.2.2                                  | Exceptions  | 250        |
| 2.3                                    | Conditions for a Restriction of the Retroactive Effect                    | 251        |
| 2.3.1                                  | Procedural Conditions   | 251        |
| 2.3.2                                  | Substantive Conditions  | 252        |
| 2.3.3                                  | Legal Certainty   | 253        |
| 2.3.4                                  | Serious Difficulties  | 254        |
| 2.3.5                                  | Financial Consequences  | 254        |
| 3                                      | Judgments on Validity   | 256        |
| 3.1                                    | Consequences of a Judgment Declaring a Provision of Community Law Invalid | 256        |
| 3.1.1                                  | Consequences for the Institutions   | 256        |
| 3.1.2                                  | Consequences for National Authorities                                     | 257        |
| 3.1.3                                  | Consequences for the National Court                                       | 257        |
| 3.1.4                                  | Consequences for Other National Courts                                    | 258        |
| 3.2                                    | Retroactive Effect  | 258        |
| 3.3                                    | Restrictions of the Retroactive Effect of Judgments on Validity           | 259        |
| 3.3.1                                  | Exclusive Competence of the Court of Justice                              | 259        |
| 3.3.2                                  | Application by Analogy of Articles 231 EC and 233 EC                      | 259        |
| 3.3.3                                  | Exceptions  | 260        |
| 4                                      | Further References to the Court of Justice                                | 262        |
| <br><b>Chapter 13</b>                  |   |            |
| <b>Article 68 EC and Article 35 EU</b> |   | <b>265</b> |
| 1                                      | Article 68 EC   | 265        |
| 2                                      | Article 35 EU   | 265        |
| 2.1                                    | Competence of the Court of Justice  | 265        |
| 2.2                                    | Scope   | 266        |
| 2.3                                    | Courts or Tribunals of a Member State                                     | 267        |
| 2.4                                    | Admissibility   | 268        |
| 2.5                                    | Modification of Preliminary Questions                                     | 268        |



*Table of Contents*

xiii

**Annex**

**271**

- 1 Treaty Provisions on the Preliminary Ruling Procedure
- 2 Protocol on the Statute of the Court of Justice
- 3 Rules of Procedure of the Court of Justice
- 4 Information Note on References from National Courts  
for a Preliminary Ruling

271

273

274

278