Contents

Foreword ..... *v*
List of Abbreviations ..... *xi*
Table of Cases ..... *xiii*
Legal Documents and Reports ..... *xvii*

Introduction 1

PART I
FUNDAMENTALS

1. **On the Concepts of Law and Human Rights** 13
   I. The Dual Nature of Law 13
   II. The Concept of Human Rights 14

2. **A New Concept of Evolutive and Static Interpretation** 17
   I. Evolutive Interpretation Within a Normative Theory of Interpretation 18
   II. Evolutive Interpretation as an Element of the Time Dimension of Interpretation 21
   III. Static Interpretation as the Parameter for Evolutive Interpretation 23

3. **The Legitimacy of Evolutive Interpretation Revisited** 28
   I. Evolutive Interpretation and the ECHR 30
      A. European Consensus 30
      B. Moral Reading and States' Commitment 35
      C. Rights Principle 39
   II. Evolutive Interpretation and the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties 41
      A. Parties' Intentions 42
      B. Object and Purpose 47
      C. Other Rules of International Law Applicable in the Relations between Parties 51
      D. Effectiveness 54

III. Evolutive Interpretation and General Principles of International Law 56
A. Objectivity of the Law 57
B. Human Dignity 58
C. *Pro Persona* Interpretation 60

4. The Criticism against Evolutive Interpretation Revisited 62
I. Democratic Legitimacy of Evolutive Interpretation 63
A. The Conceptual Problem of the Critique 65
B. The Problematic Positioning of Evolutive Interpretation 68
II. Sovereignty 71
A. Evolutive Interpretation as the Creation of New Obligations 72
B. The Contestable Concept of Validity 75
III. Rule of Law 77

PART II
THE ECHR CONSTITUTION

5. The Argument of Constitutionalism 85
I. Constitutionalism in the International Realm 85
II. Cosmopolitan Constitutionalism 90
III. Deliberative or Discursive Constitutionalism 91

6. The Constitutional Nature of the ECHR 94
I. The Constitutional Status of the ECHR's Judicial Review Mechanism 95
II. Locating the ECHR in the International Constitutionalism Debate 99

7. Three Basic Constitutional Principles of the ECHR 102
I. The Three Pillars of the Council of Europe as Constitutional Principles 103
A. Rule of Law 104
B. Democracy 107
C. Human Rights 111
II. The Ideal and Real Dimension in the ECHR 112
III. Time Dimension of Interpretation and the Dual Nature of the ECHR 113

PART III
BALANCED LEGITIMACY MODEL

8. **Setting the Scene for Balancing at the Interpretation Stage** 119
I. The Distinction between Rules and Principles 119
II. Connecting Static and Evolutive Interpretation to Formal and Material Principles 121
III. Balancing in the Different Stages of Law Application 122
IV. Balancing of Interpretive Canons 124
A. Alexy's Model of a Preference Relation for Canons 124
B. Klatt's 'Balancing-dependent Subsumption' 125
C. Wróblewski's 'Second-level Directive of Interpretation' 126
D. Interim Conclusions 128

9. **The Balancing Model for Evolutive and Static Interpretation** 129
I. Basic Ideas on the Balancing Model 129
II. Critical Aspects of Balancing in Human Rights Interpretation 131
III. Internal Structure of the Balancing Model 133
IV. Weight Formula 136

10. **External Justification** 139
I. How to Accord Weights in the ECHR? 140
II. Weighting Rules in the Time Dimension of Interpretation 142
A. Weighting Factors for the Intensity of the Interference With Static Principles 142
B. Weighting Factors for the Importance of Evolutive Principles 144
C. The Weight of Consensus 148
III. The Epistemic Reliability of the Underlying Premises 149

PART IV
THE BALANCED LEGITIMACY MODEL APPLIED

11. **The Right to Divorce** 155
I. Facts of the Case 155
II. Time Dimension of Interpretation 156
III. The ECtHR's Reasoning 157
IV. The Balancing of Static and Evolutive Interpretation 158
V. The Legitimacy of the Evolutive Approach to Interpretation 164

12. The Right to Assisted Suicide 165
I. Facts of the Case 165
II. Time Dimension of Interpretation 166
III. The ECtHR's Reasoning 167
IV. The Balancing of Static and Evolutive Interpretation 169
V. The Legitimacy of the Static Approach to Interpretation 172

13. The Right to Preservation of the Environment 173
I. Facts of the Case 173
II. Time Dimension of Interpretation 175
III. The ECtHR's Reasoning 177
IV. The Balancing of Static and Evolutive Interpretation 178
V. A Stalemate Case 181

Conclusion 182

Bibliography 185
Index 193