

Contents

<i>Abbreviations</i>	xix
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xxi

PART 1: INTRODUCTION

1. Criminal Responsibility in International Law	3
1.1 War and law	3
1.2 From war crimes law to international criminal law	4
1.3 State responsibility vis-a-vis individual responsibility	5
1.4 International criminal law	8
1.4.1 Nature of norms	8
1.4.2 Pluralism or uniformity?	9
1.4.3 Sources of law	12
2. Collective Criminality, Individual Responsibility	17
2.1 Individual criminal responsibility	17
2.1.1 Developments in municipal criminal law	17
2.1.2 International criminal responsibility	18
2.2 System criminality	20
2.3 Bernays' collective criminality theory	22
2.3.1 Conspiracy—criminal responsibility at leadership level	23
2.3.2 Criminal organizations—criminal responsibility at execution level	26
2.4 Subsequent proceedings	30
2.4.1 Membership liability	32
2.4.2 Common design	33
2.4.3 Complicity	35
2.5 Concluding observations	36
3. Parameters of Criminal Responsibility	39
3.1 Terminology	39
3.2 Subjective element	40
3.2.1 ICC Statute	45
3.2.2 Ad hoc tribunals	50
3.3 Objective element	52
3.3.1 Broad and narrow understanding	53
3.3.2 Commission and omission	54

PART 2: ATTRIBUTING CRIMINAL RESPONSIBILITY

4. Perpetration and Participation	61
4.1 Codifying individual criminal responsibility	61
4.2 Participation in crime: a comparative perspective	65
4.2.1 Unitary and differentiated models	65
4.2.2 Derivative and autonomous models	67
4.2.3 Contribution and crime-oriented models	70
4.2.4 Naturalistic and normative models	71
4.2.5 Differentiated and unitary: a fading distinction	73
4.3 International models of participation: preliminary observations	74
4.4 Concluding remarks	74
5. Principals and Accessories	77
5.1 Introduction	77
5.2 The principal–accessory distinction	77
5.2.1 The advance of the normative approach	77
5.2.2 Bolstering the principal status	80
5.3 Distinguishing criteria: Roxin’s theory	81
5.4 ‘Control of the crime’	83
5.4.1 Dualism	85
5.4.2 Roxin’s theory and the ICC	86
5.5 Concluding observations	88
6. Forms of Criminal Responsibility	89
6.1 Introduction	89
6.2 Direct and indirect perpetration	89
6.2.1 Comparative perspective	89
6.2.2 International criminal tribunals	91
6.2.3 ICC	93
6.3 Co-perpetration	95
6.3.1 Comparative perspective	95
6.3.2 International criminal tribunals	96
6.3.3 ICC	99
6.4 Instigation, ordering, soliciting, and inducing	102
6.4.1 Comparative perspective	102
6.4.2 International criminal tribunals	104
6.4.3 ICC	107
6.5 Planning	110
6.5.1 Comparative perspective	110
6.5.2 International criminal tribunals	110
6.6 Aiding and abetting	112
6.6.1 Common law origin	112
6.6.2 Comparative perspective	116
6.6.3 International criminal tribunals	120
6.6.4 ICC	127

6.7	Common purpose liability	131
6.7.1	Comparative perspective	131
6.7.2	International criminal tribunals	133
6.7.3	ICC	145
6.8	Attempt	147
6.8.1	Comparative perspective	147
6.8.2	International criminal tribunals	150
6.8.3	ICC	151
6.9	Conclusion: mixed models of criminal participation	153
7.	Crime-Specific and Leadership Modalities	157
7.1	Introduction	157
	Leadership modalities	
7.2	JCE at leadership level	157
7.2.1	Indirect co-perpetration and interlinked JCE	158
7.2.2	Observations	163
7.3	Indirect co-perpetration at the ICC	165
7.3.1	Observations	168
7.4	Indirect co-perpetration and interlinked JCE compared	170
	Crime-specific modalities	
7.5	Complicity in genocide	171
7.5.1	International criminal tribunals	172
7.5.2	ICC	178
7.6	Inchoate offences	179
7.6.1	Conspiracy to commit genocide	179
7.6.2	Incitement to commit genocide	180
7.7	Concluding observations: theories of imputation	181
8.	Superior Responsibility	183
8.1	Introduction	183
8.2	Developments in the law on superior responsibility	184
8.2.1	The <i>Čelebići</i> case	185
8.2.2	Successor superior responsibility	187
8.2.3	Loosening the superior–subordinate relationship	189
8.2.4	Observations	192
8.3	The ambiguous nature of superior responsibility	195
8.4	Article 28 of the ICC Statute	197
8.4.1	Textual analysis	197
8.4.2	Nature of liability	199
8.5	Superior responsibility in national law	202
8.6	A multilayered concept	204
8.7	Superior responsibility as parallel liability	206
8.7.1	Revisiting its nature	206
8.7.2	Superior responsibility as ' <i>lex specialis</i> '	207
8.8	Concluding observations	209

PART 3: DEFENCES

9. Grounds for Excluding Criminal Responsibility	213
9.1 Introduction	213
9.2 Preliminary observations	214
9.2.1 International law defences and criminal law defences	215
9.2.2 Justification and excuse	215
9.2.3 The mental element and defences	217
9.2.4 The reasonable person standard and <i>Garantenstellung</i>	219
9.2.5 The <i>culpa in causa</i> or 'conduct-in-causing' analysis	221
9.3 Article 31 of the ICC Statute	221
9.4 Mental defect	224
9.4.1 Text	224
9.4.2 Comparative perspective	224
9.4.3 International jurisprudence	226
9.5 Intoxication	228
9.5.1 Text	228
9.5.2 Comparative perspective	230
9.5.3 International jurisprudence	233
9.6 Self-defence	233
9.6.1 Preliminary observations	233
9.6.2 Text	235
9.6.3 Comparative perspective	239
9.6.4 International jurisprudence	240
9.7 Duress	242
9.7.1 Text	242
9.7.2 Comparative perspective	243
9.7.3 International jurisprudence	249
9.8 Non-statutory defences	260
9.8.1 Belligerent reprisals	261
9.8.2 <i>Tu quoque</i>	263
9.8.3 Military necessity	264
9.9 Concluding observations	267
10. Mistake of Fact and Law	269
10.1 Introduction	269
10.2 The defence of mistake	269
10.2.1 Descriptive and normative elements	269
10.2.2 Mistake of fact	271
10.2.3 Mistake of law	271
10.2.4 The scope of mistake of law in ICL	272
10.3 International jurisprudence	274
10.4 Comparative perspective	276
10.4.1 Anglo-American law	276
10.4.2 Civil law	278

10.5 Article 32 of the ICC Statute	281
10.5.1 The interplay between Articles 32 and 30 of the ICC Statute	281
10.5.2 Interpreting Article 32	284
10.6 Concluding observations	285
11. Superior Orders	287
11.1 Introduction	287
11.2 Legal history	287
11.3 Article 33 of the ICC Statute	293
11.3.1 Text	293
11.3.2 Three conditions	295
11.4 International jurisprudence	296
11.5 Superior orders in national law	299
11.5.1 The conditional liability approach	299
11.5.2 Absolute liability approach	301
11.5.3 A combined approach	302
11.5.4 Justification or excuse?	303
11.6 Battlefield reality	304
11.7 Concluding observations	306
<i>Annex: Selected Provisions</i>	307
<i>Bibliography</i>	313
<i>Index</i>	333