

# Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xxi
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xxix
<b>Introduction</b>	1
<b>Chapter 1: Methodology</b>	6
A. Perspective of This Study	6
B. The Relevant Decisions	7
I. Final judgments	8
II. Interim measures of protection	8
III. Interlocutory decisions other than provisional measures: no object of this study	13
IV. Advisory opinions: no object of this study	14
<b>Chapter 2: The Legal Framework</b>	18
A. Introduction	18
B. History of the Provisions on Compliance and Enforcement	19
I. The predecessor of Article 94 of the Charter: Article 13(4) of the League of Nations Covenant	19
II. The way from Article 13(4) League of Nations Covenant to Article 94 of the UN Charter	21
C. The Addressees of the Obligation of Compliance and of Potential Enforcement Action	24
I. “The parties:” states in their entirety	24
II. A special case: parties to ICJ proceedings that are non-members to the United Nations	25
III. Intervening states	27
D. The Obligation of Compliance	29
I. Compliance with final judgments	29
II. Compliance with provisional measures	32
1. Provisional measures as “decision” under Article 94(1)	32
2. Scope of the obligation	33



III. Non-compliance and possible defenses	34
E. Enforcement of ICJ Decisions	36
I. Preliminary remarks	36
II. Enforcement of ICJ decisions under the United Nations Charter	38
1. Enforcement of ICJ decisions through the Security Council	39
a. Nature of the Council's jurisdiction under Article 94(2)	39
b. Range of measures	44
c. The Security Council and the Court decision	48
d. The procedure before the Security Council	52
e. Desirability of an automatic procedure?	58
f. Enforcement of provisional measures	60
2. Enforcement by other UN organs	62
a. The General Assembly	63
b. ECOSOC	68
c. The Secretary-General	69
III. Unilateral enforcement and assistance by other actors	71
1. Availability of regular unilateral enforcement measures	71
2. The concrete measures available	72
3. Assistance by third states	74
4. Enforcement action by specialized agencies and regional organizations	75
5. Enforcement through proceedings before domestic courts	77
<b>Chapter 3: The ICJ Practice Analyzed</b>	<b>81</b>
A. Analysis of the Practice: Which Practice and How?	81
I. Form of the presentation	81
II. Selection of decisions for the analysis	82
III. Compliance with judgments	87



IV. Compliance with provisional measures	89
B. Compliance with Judgments	91
I. The Corfu Channel case	91
1. Background and proceedings before the Court	91
2. The judgments of 1949	94
3. Albania's response: non-compliance	95
4. The settlement	97
5. Conclusion	98
II. Asylum/Haya de la Torre	99
1. Background of the proceedings	100
2. The judgments of 20 and 27 November 1950	102
3. The judgment of 13 June 1951	103
4. The post-adjudicative phase: a difficult implementation	107
5. Reasons for the difficulties in the implementation	109
III. Rights of nationals of the United States of America in Morocco	110
IV. Ambatielos	113
V. Minquiers and Ecrehos	114
VI. Right of passage over Indian territory	117
1. The institution of the proceedings	117
2. The judgments of 1957 and 1960	118
3. Scope of the Court's findings	119
4. Portugal's complaint of non-compliance	121
VII. Sovereignty over certain frontier land	122
VIII. Arbitral award made by the King of Spain on 23 December 1906	126
IX. Temple of Preah Vihear	132
X. North Sea continental shelf	137
XI. Appeal relating to the jurisdiction of the ICAO Council	140



XII. Fisheries Jurisdiction	144
1. Background of the dispute	144
2. The proceedings before the Court	146
3. The judgments on the merits	148
4. The scope of the obligations arising from the judgment	150
5. Follow-up to the judgment	151
6. Conclusion	155
XIII. Continental shelf (Tunisia/Libya)	158
1. The special agreement and the proceedings before the Court	158
2. The judgment on the merits of 1982	159
3. Tunisia's request for revision, correction, and interpretation and the judgment of 1985	160
4. The final settlement	162
XIV. United States diplomatic and consular staff in Tehran	163
1. Background: the events of 1979	163
2. The reaction by the international community	164
3. The proceedings before the Court	166
4. The judgment of 24 May 1980	167
5. The follow-up to the judgment	169
6. Conclusion: the Court's role in the Tehran Hostages dispute	171
XV. Delimitation of the maritime boundary in the Gulf of Maine area	173
1. The efforts to submit the dispute to an ICJ chamber	173
2. The judgment of the Chamber	177
XVI. Continental shelf (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya / Malta)	178
XVII. Frontier dispute (Burkina Faso/Mali)	181
XVIII. Military and paramilitary activities in and against Nicaragua	184



1. Background of the case	184
2. The parties' submissions and the judgment on jurisdiction	186
3. The US reaction to the judgment on jurisdiction	190
4. The proceedings on the merits	192
5. The parties' reactions	197
6. Action undertaken to bring about US compliance	198
a. An initiative of interested private persons: domestic litigation in the US	198
b. Initiatives by Nicaragua	199
7. The proceedings on compensation before the ICJ and the final settlement	205
8. Conclusion	207
9. Evaluation	209
IXX. Land, Island and Maritime Frontier Dispute	211
1. Background of the case	211
2. The proceedings before a Chamber of the Court	212
3. The judgment of 11 September 1992	214
4. The aftermath of the decision	215
XX. Maritime delimitation in the area between Greenland and Jan Mayen	220
XXI. Arbitral award of 31 July 1989	224
1. The arbitral award of 31 July 1989	225
2. The proceedings before the ICJ	226
3. The judgment of 12 November 1991 and its aftermath	227
XXII. Territorial dispute	229
XXIII. Maritime delimitation and territorial questions between Qatar and Bahrain	234
1. Areas at dispute between Qatar and Bahrain and settlement attempts	234
2. The proceedings before the ICJ	236



3. The judgment on the merits	238
XXIV. Gabčíkovo-Nagymaros	240
1. Background of the case	240
2. The proceedings before the ICJ	241
3. The judgment of 25 September 1997	243
4. The follow-up to the judgment	245
5. Evaluation	248
XXV. Kasikili/Sedudu	249
XXVI. LaGrand	253
1. The facts and the institution of proceedings before the Court	254
2. The parties' submissions	255
3. The judgment of 27 June 2001	258
4. Action required by the United States in order to comply with the judgment	259
XXVII. Arrest warrant of 11 April 2000	264
1. Background of the case	264
2. The judgment of 14 February 2002	266
3. The implications of the judgment	268
4. The follow-up to the judgment	269
XXVIII. Conclusion: An overall positive record of compliance with judgments	271
C. Compliance with Provisional measures	275
I. Anglo-Iranian Oil Company case	275
1. Background of the case	275
2. The interim measures taken by the Court	277
3. Iran's rejection of the provisional measures	280
4. The proceedings in the UN Security Council	281
5. Conclusion	285



II. Fisheries Jurisdiction	286
1. The proceedings on interim measures	286
2. The parties' reactions	289
3. Conclusion	293
III. Nuclear tests	296
1. Background: France's nuclear weapons program	296
2. Australia's and New Zealand's applications and requests for the indication of provisional measures	298
3. The orders of 22 July 1973	300
4. The situation after the orders	302
5. The judgments of 20 December 1974	306
6. A sequel in court: the proceedings in 1995	307
7. Non-compliance with the order: relevant factors	308
IV. United States diplomatic and consular staff in Tehran	310
1. The proceedings on interim protection and the Court's order	310
2. Iran's reaction	313
3. The US reaction: non-compliance?	316
4. Conclusion	320
V. Frontier dispute (Burkina Faso v. Mali)	321
VI. Military and paramilitary activities in and against Nicaragua (Nicaragua case)	324
1. Content of the measures	325
2. Reasoning of the order	327
3. The follow-up to the order	330
4. Conclusion	334
VII. Application of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide	334
1. Bosnia's application and the first proceedings on interim protection	335
2. The order of 8 April 1993	338



3. Events subsequent to the order	340
4. The second proceedings on interim protection	342
5. The order of 13 September 1993	345
6. Assessment	348
VIII. Land and maritime boundary between Cameroon and Nigeria	351
1. Background of the proceedings	351
2. The incidents of February 1996 and the proceedings on interim protection	352
3. The order of 15 March 1996	355
4. The follow-up to the order	359
5. Conclusion	363
IX. Vienna Convention on Consular Relations (Breard case)	364
1. Background	365
2. The order of 9 April 1998	366
3. The US reaction	368
4. The further proceedings	372
5. Conclusion	373
X. LaGrand	375
1. The order of 3 March 1999	375
2. The follow-up to the order	377
3. The further proceedings: the judgment as a vehicle for sanctioning the breach of an ICJ order	379
4. Conclusion	382
XI. Armed activities on the territory of the Congo (DRC v. Uganda)	383
1. Background of the case	383
2. Security Council Resolution 1304 and Congo's request for provisional measures	384
3. The relation between the request and the resolution	387



4. The Court and the Security Council resolution: possible routes	390
5. The order of 1 July 2000	391
6. The follow-up to the interim measures	395
7. Conclusion	398
XII. Conclusion: A mixed record for provisional measures	399
<b>Chapter 4: Lessons to be Learned from the Practice</b>	<b>403</b>
A. General Observations	403
I. Compliance and usefulness	403
II. Defiance and non-appearance before the Court: The Nicaragua judgment as a turning point	403
III. Delays and difficulties in implementation: Problems to some degree inevitable	404
IV. Source of jurisdiction: Relation of non-compliance and cases of compulsory jurisdiction	405
1. The alleged smoothness of proceedings based on specific consent	406
2. The experience in cases of compulsory jurisdiction	410
V. Non-compliance and highly political situations	413
VI. Subject-matter of the proceedings	413
VII. Factors with a doubtful or non-measurable impact on compliance	414
1. Relations between the parties and form of government	414
2. UN membership	415
3. Voting patterns and dissenting votes	415
4. Decisions of a Chamber <i>vis-à-vis</i> decisions of the full Court	416
VIII. The role of the UN main organs	417
B. The Weaker Record for Provisional Measures: Explanations and Possible Remedies	418



I. Circumstances under which the orders were issued/nature of the cases	419
1. Form of introduction of proceedings	419
2. Attitude of parties towards the proceedings	420
3. Political leverage	421
4. Preponderance of ulterior motives of the applicant of provisional measures	421
5. Low expectation of meaningful Security Council involvement	421
II. Inherent problems of interim protection before the Court	422
1. No final determination of the Court's jurisdiction	422
2. Practical problems: Time pressure and lack of knowledge and expertise	424
3. Brevity of the reasoning	424
4. Impression of bias/balancing of interests	425
5. Uncertainty about the recovery of potential losses and injuries	426
6. Degree of precision of the measures indicated	427
III. Uncertainty about the binding force	428
IV. Decisions by the Court for improved compliance with provisional measures: Complementary measures, further orders and sanctioning mechanisms in the judgment	430
1. Complementary measures and further orders to bring about compliance	430
2. Sanctioning non-compliance in the judgment on the merits	430
a. Jurisdiction for non-compliance claims	432
b. Admissibility of non-compliance	432
c. The relation between non-compliance claims and the main claim	434
d. Withholding of relief	434
Concluding Remarks	436
Zusammenfassung (German Summary)	438
<i>Bibliography</i>	447
<i>Index</i>	474