## Contents

Table of Cases	XXI
Preface for Instructors	XXXV
Acknowledgments	xxxvii
Part One	
Family Formation, Regulation, and Dissolution	
Chapter 1 • Introduction to the Study of Family Law in the World Community	3
A. An Introduction to Comparative Law	3
1. Why Study Comparative Law?	4
Nora V. Demleitner, Combating Legal Ethnocentrism	8
Problem 1-1	10
2. What Is Comparative Family Law?	11
John C. Reitz, How to Do Comparative Law	11
Shirley S. Abrahamson & Michael J. Fischer, All the World's a	
Courtroom: Judging in the New Millennium	18
Problem 1-2	19
Marckx v. Belgium	20
Notes and Questions	20
Johan Meeusen, Judicial Disapproval of Discrimination against	
Illegitimate Children	28
B. An Introduction to International Law	30
1. Overview of International Law	31
a. Sources of International Law	31
b. Explicit Agreements	32
Frederic L. Kirgis, International Agreements and U.S. Law	40
Notes	42
c. Customary International Law	43
d. General Principles of International Law	45
Notes and Questions	47
Problem 1-3	48
Notes	50
e. Enforcing Human Rights Norms in U.S. Courts Kenneth Roth, The Charade of U.S. Ratification of International	51
Human Rights Treaties	51
Note	53

Jack Goldsmith, Should International Human Rights Law Trump	
U.S. Domestic Law	53
Problem 1-4	56
Notes	56
2. International Institutions	58
a. United Nations	59
b. The Hague Conference on Private International Law	61
c. Council of Europe	62
L. v. Finland	66
Notes and Questions	72
d. European Union	77
e. Organization of American States	80
f. African Union	83
Problem 1-5	86
Notes and Questions	87
Chapter 2 • Regulation of Marriage	89
A. The Importance of Marriage	89
Claude Levi-Strauss, The Family, in Man, Culture, and Society	89
Joan A. Metge, Marriage in Modern Māori Society	90
B. The Power to Regulate Marriage	92
1. Customary Law	92
David L. Chambers, Civilizing the Natives: Customary Marriage	
in Post-Apartheid South Africa	93
Notes and Questions	95
Suen Toi Lee v. Yau Yee Ping	98
Problem 2-1	99
Kalyton v. Kalyton	100
Notes and Questions	102
Janet Kabeberi-Macharia & Celestine Nyamu, Marriage by	
Affidavit: Developing Alternative Laws on Cohabitation	
in Kenya	102
2. Religious Law	104
In re Marriage of Vryonis	107
Notes and Questions	110
3. Constitutional Law	113
a. Constitutional Allocation of Power between the Legislative	
Branches	113
b. Constitutional Allocation of Power between the Judiciaries	114
Notes and Questions	116
4. International Law	116
Universal Declaration of Human Rights [UDHR]	116
1956 Supplementary Convention on the Abolition of Slavery,	
the Slave Trade and Institutions and Practices Similar to	
Slavery	117
Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination	
against Women	118
Fact Sheet No. 23, Harmful Traditional Practices Affecting the	
Health of Women and Children, Office of the High	
Commission for Human Rights	119

Report of the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination	
against Women	120
Report of the Committee on Progress Achieved in the	
Implementation of the Convention: Note by the Secretariat	120
Notes and Questions	121
Problem 2-2	122
C. Procedural Requirements for Entry into Marriage	123
1. France: Age, Consent, Banns, and Compulsory Civil Ceremony	123
The French Civil Code (1804)	123
Civil Code of Québec, Book Two	125
Notes and Questions	126
Karl August Prinz Von Sachsen-Gessaphe, Concubinage in Mexico	127
2. The Importance of Formalities	128
Chief Adjudication Officer v. Kirpal Kaur Bath	128
Notes and Questions	130
D. Mail-Order Marriages	131
1. The Factual Background	132
Robert J. Scholes & Anchalee Phataralaoha, The "Mail-Order	
Bride" Industry and Its Impact on U.S. Immigration	132
Suzanne H. Jackson, Marriages of Convenience: International	
Marriage Brokers, "Mail-Order Brides," and Domestic	
Servitude	133
Notes and Questions	134
Kerry Abrams, Immigration Law and the Regulation of Marriage Robert J. Scholes & Anchalee Phataralaoha, The "Mail-Order	134
Bride" Industry and Its Impact on U.S. Immigration	135
2. Legal Responses of Countries of Destination	137
Suzanne H. Jackson, Marriages of Convenience: International	10,
Marriage Brokers, "Mail-Order Brides," and Domestic	
Servitude	137
3. Legal Responses of Countries of Origin	139
Republic Act No. 6955 (1990)	139
Republic Act No. 9208 (2003)	140
Notes and Questions	141
4. International Legal Responses	142
a. Discrimination against Women	142
CEDAW General Recommendation No. 21, ¶ 16	142
b. Trafficking	143
Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons,	1 10
Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United	
Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime	143
Notes and Questions	143
c. Slavery	144
Problem 2-4	144
hapter Three • Dissolution of Marriage: A Continuing Conundrum	147
A. Historical Origins of Western Law of Dissolution: From Customary to	
Religious to State Control	148
Mary Ann Glendon, The Transformation of Family Law	148
Notes and Questions	153

Notes and Questions	155
B. Contemporary Divorce Reform	156
1. Modern Divorce Reform in the United States	156
Riley v. Riley	158
Mo. Ann. Stat. §452.320	160
La. Rev. Stat. Ann § 9:307	161
Problem 3-1	163
2. Divorce Reform in England	164
Matrimonial Causes Act, 1973, c.18	165
Problem 3-2	168
Notes and Questions	168
3. Divorce Reform in the Republic of Ireland	170
Article 41—The Family	172
McA v. McA	173
Problem 3-3	175
Notes and Questions	176
4. A Glimpse of Divorce Reform Around Europe—And Around the World	179
a. Western Europe	179
Notes and Questions	182
b. East Asia	184
Notes and Questions	188
c. Africa	189
5. The Debate Continues	189
C. The Intersection of Religion and the State in Contemporary Regulation	
of Divorce	191
1. Nations Delegating Exclusive Control of Civil Marital Status to the State	192
Williams v. Williams	192
Note	193
Avitzur v. Avitzur	194
Notes and Questions	195
Marcovitz v. Bruker	198
Notes and Questions	201
2. Nations Regulating Termination of Marriage through Religious Norms	
or Institutions	203
a. Unitary Systems and Islamic Law	203
b. Pluralistic Personal Law Systems	206
Notes and Questions	206
Problem 3-4	209
Problem 3-5	210
Chapter 4 • Domestic Partnerships and Same-Sex Marriage	211
A. Domestic Partnerships	211
Kelly Kollman, Same-Sex Unions: The Globalization of an Idea	211
Notes and Questions	213
Pacté Civil de Solidarite	215
Notes and Questions	216
Problem 4-1	218
B. Same-Sex Marriage	219
Notes and Questions	221

Minister of Home Affairs and Another v. Fourie	224
In re Marriage Cases	230
Notes and Questions	232
Civil Marriage Act	234
Government Gazette, Republic of South Africa	236
	237
Problem 4-2	238
C. International Human Rights and Same-Sex Couples	239
	239
	239
	240
Arthur S. Leonard, European Court Victory for Same-Sex Partners 2	241
	242
	243
	244
	246
	10
Chapter 5 • Recognition of Foreign Marriages and Divorces	247
	247
	248
	250
	250 251
	253
	260
	260 262
	262 265
	263 267
	267 267
	267 267
	267 269
	271
	277
	278
	278
	280
Problems	288
Chanton 6 a Violance hatruson Esmily Manchan	101
	291
	291
	292
	295
Jeffrey Fagan & Angela Brown, Violence between Spouses and Intimates: Physical Aggression between Women and Men	
	295
	295
World Health Organization, The World Report on Violence	- , ,
	296
Report of the Secretary General, In-Depth Study on All Forms	<b>.</b> , U
	296

xii

	World Health Organization, Preventing Violence: A Guide to	
	Implementing the Recommendations of the World Report	
	on Violence and Health	296
B. Family	Violence as a Human Rights Issue in the United Nations' System	297
	itional Human Rights Approaches	297
	Dorothy Q. Thomas & Michele E. Beasley, Domestic Violence	
	as a Human Rights Issue	297
	Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women	299
	Jan Arno Hessbruegge, Human Rights Violations Arising From	
	Conduct of Non-State Actors	299
	The Due Diligence Standard as a Tool for the Elimination of	
	Violence against Women	301
	Notes and Questions	302
2. Conv	vention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination	
	nst Women	304
"S"	Sally Engle Merry, Constructing a Global Law—Violence against	
	Women and the Human Rights System	305
	Goekce v. Austria	306
	Notes and Questions	311
	San Francisco, Ca., 1 Admin. Code ch. 12K, §12K.3(b)	313
3. Cons	vention against Torture	313
	a. State Responsibility for Private Acts	314
	Ali v. Reno	314
	Notes and Questions	316
	b. Torture	318
	Rhonda Copelon, Recognizing the Egregious in the Everyday:	0 1 0
	Domestic Violence as Torture	319
	Notes and Questions	319
4. Platfe	orms for Action, Declarations, and Reports of the Special Rapporteur	322
10 I ICCL	Berta Esperanza Hernandez-Truyol, Sex, Culture, and Rights:	
	A Re/Conceptualization of Violence for the Twenty-First	
	Century	322
	Notes and Questions	323
C. Region:	al Approaches	325
	vention of Belém do Pará	325
	Maria da Penha Maia Fernandes	326
	Notes and Questions	334
2. Euro	pean Convention on Human Rights	341
	Z and Others v. United Kingdom	341
	Bevacqua and S. v. Bulgaria	342
	Notes and Questions	346
3. Map	uto Protocol	349
1	Charter on Human Rights	350
	nary International Law	350
	Rhonda Copelon, Recognizing the Egregious in the Everyday:	
	Domestic Violence as Torture	350
	Notes and Questions	351
	Problem 6-1	353
E. Expand	ing the Analysis	353

	• •
CONTENTS	X11
CONTITIO	AII

1. Female Genital Mutilation: The Practice	353
Fact Sheet No. 23, Harmful Traditional Practices Affecting the	
Health of Women and Children	354
2. The Universality of Human Rights	357
Katherine Brennan, Note, The Influence of Cultural Relativism	on
International Human Rights Law: Female Circumcision as a	
Case Study	357
Makau Mutua, Savages, Victims, and Saviors: The Metaphor of	
Human Rights	358
Douglas Lee Donoho, Relativism Versus Universalism in Human	1
Rights: The Search for Meaningful Standards	358
Justice Albie Sachs, Introduction to The Changing Family:	
International Perspectives on the Family and Family Law	359
Sally Engle Merry, Constructing a Global Law—Violence agains	st
Women and the Human Rights System	360
Notes and Questions	360
3. National Legal Responses	364
a. Egypt's Approach	364
Susan A. Dillon, Comment, Yoni in the Land of Isis:	
Female Genital Mutilation Is Banned (Again) in Egypt	364
Notes and Questions	367
b. The United States' Approach	369
Problem 6-2	371
Adoption of Peggy	371
Notes and Questions	372
In re R-A	374
Islam v. Secretary of State for the Home Dep't	378
Notes and Questions	380
Asylum & Withholding Definitions	383
Problem 6-3	385
Part Two	
Rights and Responsibilities of Parents, Children, and the State	
	200
Chapter 7 • Custody: A Comparative Prologue	389
A. Decision-Makers and Private Ordering  B. Determining "Post Interests" - Permissible Factors and Considerations	390
<ul><li>B. Determining "Best Interests" — Permissible Factors and Considerations</li><li>1. Gender</li></ul>	394 395
Bolaji Owasanoye, The Regulation of Child Custody and Access	
in Nigeria	399
Note	400
Problem 7-1	401
Problem 7-2	401
Notes and Questions	403
D. Marianne Blair & Merle H. Weiner, Resolving Parental Custo	
Disputes—A Comparative Exploration	403
2. Religion	405
Hoffmann v. Austria	406
Notes and Questions	409

3. Race	413
Van de Perre v. Edwards	414
Notes and Questions	421
4. Children's Preferences	422
C. v. Finland	424
Notes and Questions	427
Problem 7-3	429
Chapter 8 • Child Abduction, Jurisdiction, and Enforcement in International	121
Custody Disputes	431
A. The Hague Convention on the Civil Aspects of International Child	400
Abduction	432
1. Wrongful Removal and Retention	433
a. Habitual Residence	433
Mozes v. Mozes	433
Notes and Questions	439
Problem 8-1	440
Problem 8-2	441
b. Rights of Custody	443
Whallon v. Lynn	443
Notes and Questions	446
Croll v. Croll	449
Notes and Questions	455
Problem 8-3	458
c. Actual Exercise	458
Friedrich v. Friedrich	458
Notes and Questions	461
2. The Defenses	461
a. Grave Risk of Harm	461
Blondin v. Dubois	461
Blondin v. Dubois	464
Blondin v. Dubois	469
Notes and Questions	471
b. Children's Objection to Return	480
England v. England	480
Notes and Questions	483
c. Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms	486
Freier v. Freier	487
Notes and Questions	488
d. Consent or Acquiescence to the Removal	489
In re Ponath	489
Notes and Questions	490
e. One Year Elapsed from the Date of Wrongful Removal	491
Wojcik v. Wojcik	491
Lops v. Lops	494
Notes and Questions	497
Problems	499
B. Jurisdiction in International Custody Disputes and Enforcement of	
Foreign Orders	500

1. U.S. Domestic Law	501
a. Jurisdictional Bases, Forum Non Conveniens, and Simultaneou	S
Proceedings	502
In re Marriage of Reeman and Vikas Sareen	502
Notes and Questions	506
Problems	514
b. Modification and Enforcement Proceedings	515
White v. Harrison-White	516
Note and Questions	519
Susan L. v. Steven L.	521
Notes and Questions	524
Hosain v. Malik	528
Notes and Questions	537
Problems	540
2. International Conventions	542
a. 1996 Convention for the Protection of Children	542
Problems	544
Notes	545
b. Regional Conventions and Regulations	545
Notes	547
C. Other Remedies to Prevent or Respond to Abduction	549
1. Preventative Measures and Immediate Deterrence	549
Al-Silham v. Al-Silham	549
Notes and Questions	551
Long v. Ardestani	553
Notes and Questions	560
Patricia E. Apy, Managing Child Custody Cases Involving	<b>- - - -</b>
Non-Hague Contracting States	563
Notes	565
2. Sanctions and Tort Liability	567
a. International Parental Kidnaping Crime Act and Other Federal	F ( 7
Sanctions	567
United States v. Fazal-Ur-Raheman-Fazal	567
Notes and Questions	571
b. Additional Remedies under State Law	576
Anyanwu v. Anyanwu	576
Notes and Questions	582
c. Self Help and Other Options	584
Patricia E. Apy, Managing Child Custody Cases Involving	E O 1
Non-Hague Contracting States	584
Notes and Questions	585
anton 0 a Financial Cumport of Children	589
napter 9 • Financial Support of Children	
A. Who Must Support Children?  Chartier v. Chartier	590 590
John Eekelaar, Are Parents Morally Obliged to Care for Their	370
Children?	594
Notes and Questions	594 596
Problem 9-1	599
	377

B. Parent-State Relationship for the Support of Children	600
1. Income Transfers/Family Allowances	600
Notes and Questions	604
Problem 9-2	608
2. Child Support Assurance	608
Notes and Questions	609
Problem 9-3	611
3. Departing from the Guidelines	611
a. Parents' Ability to Opt-Out of the Child Support Guidelines	611
i. Absence of a Child Support Order	612
Close v. Close	613
Notes and Questions	614
Solangel Maldonado, Deadbeat or Deadbroke: Redefining Child	
Support for Poor Fathers	614
ii. Private Agreements and Child Support Guidelines	616
Notes and Questions	618
Hyde v. Commissioner of Inland Revenue	619
b. Courts' Discretion to Depart from the Guidelines	621
Lyon v. Wilcox	621
Notes and Questions	624
Chapter 10 • Establishing and Enforcing Child Support Orders Transnationally	627
A. U.S. Participation in International Agreements	628
1. Foreign Reciprocating Countries	628
2. State Reciprocity Arrangements	629
3. 2007 Hague Maintenance Convention	630
B. Establishing, Enforcing, and Modifying Child Support Orders in U.S.	
Tribunals on Behalf of Residents of Foreign Nations	632
1. Establishing an Initial Support Order	635
Gladis v. Gladisova	636
Notes	640
2. Simultaneous Proceedings	641
3. Enforcing a Foreign Order in a U.S. Tribunal	642
Country of Luxembourg, on Behalf of Ana Ribeiro v. Canderas	642
Notes and Questions	645
4. Modification Restrictions	653
Grave v. Shubert	654
Notes and Questions	655
C. Enforcing U.S. Support Orders Abroad	661
Problems	662
D. Multilateral Child Support Agreements around the Globe	665
Note	666
Chapter 11 • Adoption: A Comparative Exploration	669
A. A Glimpse of Adoption across Time and Culture	670
Laura J. Schwartz, Models for Parenthood in Adoption Law:	
The French Conception	674
Note and Questions	675
B. Termination of Parental Rights	676
1. Giving and Revoking Voluntary Consent	677

	• •
CONTENTS	XV11
COLVITIO	AVII

N v. Health Service Executive	678
Notes and Questions	684
2. Rights of Putative Fathers	685
Lehr v. Robertson	686
Keegan v. Ireland	689
Notes and Questions	692
Problem 11-1	695
C. Maintaining Links with the Family of Origin	695
Cheskes v. Ontario	702
$I.O$ 'T. $\nu$ . $B$ .	705
Notes and Questions	708
Odièvre v. France	711
Notes and Questions	713
Problem 11-2	714
Chapter 12 • International Adoption	717
A. Intercountry Adoption: Benevolent Option or Last Resort?	718
Problem 12-1	720
Elizabeth Bartholet, International Adoption: Propriety, Prospects	
and Pragmatics	720
Twila Perry, Transracial and International Adoption: Mothers,	
Hierarchy, Race, and Feminist Legal Theory	724
Sara Dillon, Making Legal Regimes for Intercountry Adoption	
Reflect Human Rights Principles: Transforming the United	
Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child with the	
Hague Convention on Intercountry Adoption	727
David M. Smolin, Intercountry Adoption and Poverty: A Human	
Rights Analysis	729
Susan R. Harris, Race, Search, and My Baby-Self: Reflections of a	
Transracial Adoptee	729
Susan Soon-Keum Cox, Ritual	731
Notes and Questions	732
D. Marianne Blair, Safeguarding the Interests of Children in	
Intercountry Adoption: Assessing the Gatekeepers	736
Notes and Questions	737
Problem 12-2	741
B. Regulation of International Adoption by International Conventions	742
1. U.N. Conventions	742
2. The Hague Intercountry Adoption Convention	744
a. Central Authorities	744
b. Accredited Agencies and Approved Persons	745
c. Convention Requirements for the Adoption Process	748
d. Recognition of Convention Adoptions and U.S. Certification	740
Procedures	752
Notes and Questions	753
Problems	
	758 760
C. Adopting a Child from Abroad—The Process  1. Pole of Adoption Agencies and Lawyers	760
Role of Adoption Agencies and Lawyers     U.S. Immigration Paguiroments	760
2. U.S. Immigration Requirements	763
a. Eligibility for Immediate Relative Status for an Orphan	764

xviii

Rogan v. Reno	765
Notes and Questions	767
b. Eligibility for Immediate Relative Status for a Hague Convention	
Adoption	769
Problem 12-6	770
Notes and Questions	770
c. Process for Obtaining Orphan and Convention Visas	771
Note	776
d. Eligibility and Process for Obtaining Immediate Relative Status	
as an Adopted Child	776
Kaho v. Ilchert	777
Notes and Questions	780
3. Citizenship	783
4. Adoption, Readoption, and Recognition of Foreign Orders in U.S. Courts	784
a. Initial Adoption in U.S. Court	784
b. Readoption in a U.S. Court	785
c. Recognition of Foreign Adoption Decrees by U.S. Courts	785
Problems	786
Chapter 13 • Reproductive Rights	789
A. Reproductive Rights and Human Rights	789
1. International Population Issues	789
Reed Boland, Symposium on Population Law: The Environment,	
Population, and Women's Human Rights	791
Paula Abrams, Population Politics: Reproductive Rights and	
U.S. Asylum Policy	792
2. An Overview of Reproductive Rights	793
Barbara Stark, Reproductive Rights and Abortion	793
Barbara Stark, Crazy Jane Talks with the Bishop: Abortion in China	a,
Germany, South Africa and International Human Rights	793
General Recommendation No. 24, Report of the Committee	
on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women	796
Note and Question	797
3. The Protocol on the Rights of Women in Africa	797
Notes and Questions	798
B. State Natalist Policies	799
1. Pro-Natalist Policies	799
Notes and Questions	800
2. Anti-Natalist Policies	800
a. Iran	800
Janet Larsen, Iran's Birth Rate Plummeting at Record Pace:	
Success Provides a Model for Other Developing Countries	800
b. The People's Republic of China	802
Constitution of the People's Republic of China	803
Marriage Law of the People's Republic of China	803
Xiaorong Li, License to Coerce: Violence against Women, State	
Responsibility, and Legal Failures in China's Family-Planning	
Program	803
Population and Family Planning Law of the People's Republic	
of China	805

Information Office of The State Council of the People's Republic	
of China, Human Rights in China	806
Notes and Questions	808
Problem 13-1	811
Notes and Questions	811
More on Asylum	812
Notes and Questions	813
Problem 13-2	814
Problem 13-3	814
C. Abortion	815
Barbara Stark, Reproductive Rights and Abortion	815
Note and Questions	815
1. Municipal Approaches	816
a. Canada	816
b. El Salvador	818
c. Lebanon	819
Problem 13-4	820
Notes and Questions	820
2. Regional Approaches	821
a. Europe	821
b. The Americas	822
c. Africa	822
Notes and Questions	822
3. International Law	823
Notes and Questions	824
Chapter 14 • Children's Human Rights within the Family	827
A. Convention on the Rights of the Child	827
Jaap E. Doek, What Does the Children's Convention Require?	828
Notes and Questions	833
Michael King, Against Children's Rights	835
B. Children's Rights in the United States and South Africa	836
1. Children's Rights in the United States	836
Barbara Bennett Woodhouse, The Constitutionalization of	
Children's Rights: Incorporating Emerging Human Rights	
into Constitutional Doctrine	836
Martin Guggenheim, Ratify the U.N. Convention on the	
Rights of the Child, But Don't Expect Any Miracles	837
Notes and Questions	840
2. Children's Rights in South Africa	841
Constitution of the Republic of South Africa	841
Tshepo L. Mosikatsana, Children's Rights and Family Autonomy	
in the South African Context: A Comment on Children's	
Rights under the Final Constitution	842
Julia Sloth-Nielsen, Chicken Soup or Chainsaws: Some	
Implications of the Constitutionalisation of Children's Rights	
in South Africa	843
Notes and Questions	844
Government of the Republic of South Africa v. Grootboom	847

\* 4 1

	Notes and Questions	862
C. Corpor	al Punishment	865
1. The (	Committee's General Comment	865
	The Committee's General Comment on Corporal Punishment	865
2. The S	Special Expert's Report	868
	Paulo Sérgio Penheiro, World Report on Violence against	
	Children	868
3. Dom	estic Law and Law Reform Efforts	869
	Penny Booth, The United Nations Convention on the Rights of	
	the Child and the Punishment of Children under English	
	Law—Public and Private Vices?	869
	Katie Sykes, Bambi Meets Godzilla: Children's and Parent's	
	Rights in Canadian Foundation for Children, Youth and	
	the Law	870
	Penny Booth, The United Nations Convention on the Rights of	
	the Child and the Punishment of Children under English	
	Law—Public and Private Vices?	872
	Notes and Questions	874
	Committee on the Rights of the Child, Consideration of	
	Reports Submitted by States Parties	875
	Note and Questions	876
	Committee on the CRC—Comments on State Reports	
	Regarding Corporal Punishment	876
	Notes and Questions	878
Index		881