

# *Contents*

<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xxv
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xxxi

## I. SYSTEMS OF LIABILITY

<b>1. Introduction</b>	3
101 Europe, European tort law and international tort law	3
101-1 Europe	3
101-2 European tort law	4
101-3 International tort law	6
102 Focus of the book	6
102-1 Aim of the book	6
102-2 Three national systems	7
103 Plan and structure of the book	8
103-1 Introduction	8
103-2 Part I: Systems of liability	9
103-3 Part II: Requirements of liability	11
103-4 Part III: Categories of liability	13
<b>2. Europe</b>	15
201 Comparative law and <i>ius commune</i>	15
201-1 Influences on Community law	15
201-2 Influences on national laws	16
202 European Convention on Human Rights	18
203 European Union	20
203-1 History and structure	20
203-2 Judiciary	21
204 Vicinity of liability for breach of Community law	23
204-1 Legislation and case law	23
204-2 Vertical direct effect	25
204-3 Horizontal direct effect	26
204-4 Purposive interpretation (horizontal indirect effect)	28
204-5 Article 288 EC: liability of Community institutions	29
205 General principle of liability for breach of Community law	31
205-1 Member State liability for breach of Community law	31
205-2 Link between Member State liability and Article 288 EC	32
205-3 Liability of individuals for breach of Community law	35
205-4 Member State liability for judicial decisions	37
206 Requirements for liability for breach of Community law	39

## Contents

<b>3. France</b>	<b>41</b>
301 Introduction	41
301-1 History	41
301-2 <i>Code civil</i>	42
301-3 Judiciary	43
301-4 Doctrine	45
302 Fault liability (arts. 1382 and 1383 <i>Code civil</i> )	46
302-1 General observations	46
302-2 <i>Abus de droit</i> (abuse of rights)	48
303 General rule of strict liability for things (art. 1384 al. 1 <i>Code civil</i> )	49
303-1 History and background	49
303-2 <i>Fait de la chose</i> (fact of the thing)	51
303-3 <i>Gardien</i> (custodian): general observations	53
303-4 <i>Garde commun</i> (common custodianship); transfer of custodianship	54
304 Specific rules of strict liability for things	56
305 General rule of strict liability for persons (art. 1384 al. 1 <i>Code civil</i> )	57
306 Specific rules of strict liability for persons	60
 <b>4. Germany</b>	 61
401 Introduction	61
401-1 History	61
401-2 <i>Bürgerliches Gesetzbuch</i> (Civil Code)	62
401-3 Judiciary	63
401-4 Doctrine	65
402 Fault liability: the BGB provisions	66
402-1 General rules	66
402-2 Requirements for fault liability	67
402-3 § 823 I BGB: infringement of a right	69
402-4 § 826 BGB: intentional infliction of damage <i>contra bonos mores</i>	70
403 Fault liability: judge-made safety duties ( <i>Verkehrspflichten</i> )	72
403-1 Origin, character, and place in the legal system	72
403-2 Application	74
404 Fault liability: judge-made rights	75
404-1 Right to business ( <i>Recht am Gewerbebetrieb</i> )	75
404-2 General personality right ( <i>allgemeines Persönlichkeitsrecht</i> )	76
405 Rules of stricter liability	77
405-1 General observations	77
405-2 Liability for things	78
405-3 Liability for persons	79

## *Contents*

<b>5. England</b>	80
<b>501 Introduction</b>	80
501-1 Common law in England	80
501-2 Common law around the world	81
501-3 Judiciary	82
501-4 Legislation and judiciary	84
501-5 Doctrine	86
<b>502 Origins of tort law</b>	87
502-1 Writs	87
502-2 Torts	88
502-3 Trespass and case	89
<b>503 Tort of negligence</b>	90
503-1 History	90
503-2 Rise and fall of the neighbour principle	92
503-3 Current situation	93
503-4 Relationship between the requirements	94
<b>504 Intentional torts to the person</b>	96
504-1 Torts	96
504-2 Defences	98
<b>505 Intentional interference with goods</b>	99
505-1 Trespass to land	99
505-2 Trespass to goods	101
<b>506 Rules of stricter liability</b>	103
506-1 Public and private nuisance	103
506-2 Other rules of stricter liability	105
 <b>6. <i>Ius Commune</i></b>	106
<b>A INTRODUCTION</b>	106
<b>601 Overview</b>	106
<b>B THE QUEST FOR A EUROPEAN <i>IUS COMMUNE</i></b>	107
<b>602 From old to new <i>ius commune</i></b>	107
<b>603 Search for harmonization</b>	108
603-1 Publications and principles	108
603-2 Background of the discussion	111
<b>C VARIOUS LEGAL RULES</b>	113
<b>604 Fault liability</b>	113
604-1 Requirements	113
604-2 Casuism and conceptualism	114
604-3 Unlawfulness and fault	115
<b>605 Stricter liability</b>	116
<b>606 The basic liability rules in the Principles</b>	118
<b>607 Common law and codified law</b>	119

## *Contents*

607-1 Different views on systematization	119
607-2 Predominance of judiciary over legislator	120
<b>D VARIOUS SCENES BEHIND THE RULES</b>	<b>122</b>
608 Legal cultures	122
608-1 Germany	122
608-2 England	123
608-3 France	124
608-4 Europe	124
609 Policy approaches	125
609-1 Introduction	125
609-2 England	126
609-3 France and Germany	128
610 The role of rights	129
<b>E THE WAY AHEAD</b>	<b>131</b>
611 Role of the Community institutions	131
612 The case for harmonization	133
613 The need for a European policy discourse	135

## II. REQUIREMENTS OF LIABILITY

<b>7. Protected Interests</b>	<b>141</b>
<b>A INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>141</b>
701 Overview	141
701-1 Protected interests in the framework of torts and damages	141
701-2 Protected interests in the framework of the legal systems	142
<b>B PROTECTION OF THE PERSON</b>	<b>143</b>
702 Life	143
703 Physical integrity and physical health	145
704 Mental health	146
705 Personality rights	149
705-1 Introduction	149
705-2 Germany	150
705-3 France	152
705-4 England	152
705-5 Article 8 ECHR	154
706 Wrongful conception (wrongful birth)	156
706-1 Protection of the right to self-determination	156
706-2 Heads of damage	158
707 Prenatal harm (wrongful life)	161
707-1 Actively caused prenatal harm	161
707-2 Not prevented prenatal harm	162
<b>C PROTECTION OF PROPERTY</b>	<b>165</b>
708 Introduction	165

## *Contents*

709	Germany	167
710	England	168
D	PROTECTION OF ECONOMIC INTERESTS	169
711	Introduction	169
712	France	171
713	Germany	172
714	England	174
714-1	The <i>Caparo</i> rule	174
714-2	The extended <i>Hedley Byrne</i> principle	175
714-3	Intentional interference with economic interests	177
E	CONCLUDING REMARKS	179
715	Balancing freedom and protection	179
716	The role of insurance	182
8.	Intention and Negligence	184
A	INTRODUCTION	184
801	Fault liability: intention and negligence	184
B	INTENTION	185
802	Intention in the legal systems	185
802-1	France	185
802-2	Germany	186
802-3	England	187
803	Comparative observations	188
C	NEGLIGENT CONDUCT	189
804	Negligence in the legal systems	189
804-1	England	189
804-2	Germany	190
804-3	France	192
805	The reasonable person balancing risk and care	193
805-1	The elements of negligence	193
805-2	The four factors of negligent conduct	194
805-3	Background and plan of the chapter	197
806	Magnitude of the risk	198
806-1	Seriousness of the harm	198
806-2	Probability of the harm	199
807	Precautionary measures	200
807-1	Costs, effort, and time	200
807-2	Reducing the risk	202
807-3	Duty to warn or to inform	203
807-4	Negligent victims	204

## *Contents*

808 Omissions	205
808-1 General remarks	205
808-2 Indications for affirmative duties	207
808-3 Fitting affirmative duties into the legal systems	209
809 Character and benefit of the conduct	211
809-1 General remarks	211
809-2 Assumption of risk	213
D NEGLIGENT PERSON	214
810 Knowledge and ability	214
810-1 Introduction	214
810-2 Knowledge	215
810-3 Ability	217
810-4 State of the art	217
811 Subjective and objective tests	219
811-1 Subjective test	219
811-2 Objective test	220
812 Standards of reference	222
812-1 General remarks	222
812-2 Professionals	223
813 Children and mentally disabled persons	225
813-1 Introduction	225
813-2 France	227
813-3 Germany	229
813-4 England	231
E DEFENCES AND GROUNDS OF JUSTIFICATION	233
814 Overview	233
815 Consent	234
F CONCLUDING REMARKS	235
816 Comparative observations	235
<b>9. Violation of a Statutory Rule</b>	<b>237</b>
901 Introduction	237
902 England	238
902-1 Private right of action: introduction	238
902-2 Private right of action: relevant factors	240
902-3 Scope of the statutory duty	241
902-4 Negligence and strict liability	243
903 Germany	243
904 France	245
905 Liability for breach of Community law	247
905-1 Violated rule must confer rights on individuals	247
905-2 Illustration: liability for inadequate banking supervision	249

## *Contents*

906 Comparative observations	251
906-1 Conferment of rights and private right of action; scope and causation	251
906-2 Negligence and strict liability	253
<b>10. Strict Liability</b>	<b>255</b>
1001 Introduction	255
1002 Background of strict liability	256
1003 Three variations on strict liability	258
1003-1 Liability with an extra debtor	258
1003-2 Liability for a defective object	259
1003-3 Liability with a limited defence	259
1004 Strict elements in negligence	260
1004-1 Raising the standard of care	260
1004-2 Shifting the burden of proof	262
1005 The blurred border between strict and fault liability	264
<b>11. Causation</b>	<b>266</b>
A INTRODUCTION	266
1101 General remarks	266
1102 Establishing and limiting causation; factual and legal causation	268
B CAUSATION IN THE LEGAL SYSTEMS	270
1103 Germany	270
1103-1 Adequacy theory	270
1103-2 Scope of the rule	272
1104 England	275
1105 France	278
1106 European Union	279
C ESTABLISHING CAUSATION	281
1107 Shifting the burden of proof	281
1107-1 Germany	281
1107-2 France	283
1107-3 England	284
1108 More than one possible cause	286
1108-1 Comparative overview	286
1108-2 Conclusion	289
1109 Successive causes	290
1109-1 Second event would have caused same damage as first event	290
1109-2 Second event increases damage caused by first event	292
1110 The loss of a chance	293
1110-1 France	293
1110-2 England	294
1110-3 Germany	296

## *Contents*

1110-4 Comparative overview	296
D UNEXPECTED AND UNLIKELY CONSEQUENCES	297
1111 Confusion and principles	297
1112 Tortfeasor takes victim as he finds him	299
12. Damage and Damages	301
A INTRODUCTION	301
1201 Purposes	301
1201-1 Reparation and compensation	301
1201-2 Recognition and satisfaction	302
1201-3 Punishment and prevention	303
1202 Features of the legal systems	306
1202-1 France	306
1202-2 Germany	309
1202-3 England	311
1202-4 Community law: liability of Member States	313
1202-5 Community law: liability of Community institutions	314
1202-6 European Convention on Human Rights	315
1203 Collateral benefits	316
B PERSONAL INJURY	318
1204 Introduction	318
1205 Future damage	319
1206 Non-pecuniary loss for personal injury	322
1207 Unconsciousness	323
C FAMILY TIES	325
1208 Introduction	325
1209 Loss of maintenance	326
1210 Non-pecuniary loss for loss of a loved one	329
1211 Nervous shock	331
D CONTRIBUTORY NEGLIGENCE	334
1212 Introduction	334
1213 Contributory risk	336
1214 Systematic observations	337
1215 Children	340
E CONCLUDING REMARKS	342
1216 Comparative observations	342
1217 Community law and effective national remedies	343

### III. CATEGORIES OF LIABILITY

13. Introduction	349
1301 Supervising persons, immovable and movable objects	349
1302 Liability for lack of information and for defective information	350

## Contents

<b>14. Liability for Movable Objects</b>	<b>353</b>
A INTRODUCTION	353
1401 Overview	353
B ANIMALS	355
1402 National rules	355
1403 Comparative observations	357
C MOTOR VEHICLES	359
1404 National rules	359
1404-1 France: <i>loi Badinter</i>	359
1404-2 Germany: <i>Straßenverkehrsgesetz</i>	362
1404-3 England: tort of negligence	363
1405 International perspective	366
1405-1 Comparative observations	366
1405-2 European law	368
D PRODUCTS	370
1406 History, future, and context of the EC Product Liability Directive	370
1407 Level of harmonization	373
1407-1 Options in the Directive; differences in the laws of damages	373
1407-2 Previously existing liability systems	374
1408 Defective product	376
1408-1 Relevant provisions	376
1408-2 Case law	378
1409 Damage	380
1410 Defences	382
1410-1 General observations	382
1410-2 Development risk defence	384
1411 Other requirements	386
E DANGEROUS SUBSTANCES AND THE ENVIRONMENT	388
1412 Introduction	388
1413 Law of neighbours	389
1413-1 Germany: § 906 and 1004 BGB	389
1413-2 England: private nuisance	390
1413-3 France: <i>trouble de voisinage</i>	392
1413-4 Comparative observations	393
1413-5 Article 8 ECHR	394
1414 Environmental liability	396
1414-1 Germany: <i>Umwelthaftungsgesetz</i> and <i>Wasserhaushaltsgesetz</i>	396
1414-2 England: <i>Rylands v Fletcher</i> and breach of statutory duty	397
1414-3 France: art. 1384 al. 1 CC and violation of a statutory rule	400
1415 International perspective	401
1415-1 Comparative observations	401

## *Contents*

1415-2 International law	402
1415-3 European Union law	403
F CONCLUDING REMARKS	405
1416 Comparative observations	405
<b>15. Liability for Immovable Objects</b>	<b>408</b>
A NATIONAL RULES	408
1501 Introduction	408
1502 France	409
1502-1 Strict liability for collapsing buildings (art. 1386 CC)	409
1502-2 General strict liability for things (art. 1384 al. 1 CC)	410
1503 Germany	412
1503-1 Liability for collapsing buildings (§ 836–838 BGB)	412
1503-2 <i>Verkehrspflichten</i>	413
1504 England	416
1504-1 Statutory duties: Occupiers' Liability Acts	416
1504-2 Public nuisance	419
B NEGLIGENCE AND STRICT LIABILITY	420
1505 Relation between negligence and strict liability	420
1506 Common issues in negligence and strict liability	421
1506-1 Liable person	421
1506-2 Character of the premises	422
1506-3 Unauthorized visitors	424
1506-4 Negligent visitors	425
1506-5 Protection of visitors against each other	427
C ROADS	429
1507 England: Highways Act 1980	429
1508 France: <i>Droit administratif</i>	431
1509 Germany: <i>Straßenverkehrssicherungspflichten</i>	432
1510 Comparative observations	434
D CONCLUDING REMARKS	435
1511 Comparative observations	435
<b>16. Liability for Other Persons</b>	<b>437</b>
A INTRODUCTION	437
1601 Overview	437
B CHILDREN AND MENTALLY DISABLED PERSONS	439
1602 Liability of parents	439
1602-1 France	439
1602-2 Germany	441
1602-3 England	442

## *Contents*

1603 Liability of other supervisors over children	443
1604 Comparative observations	445
1605 Supervising mentally disabled persons	447
C EMPLOYEES	448
1606 National rules	448
1606-1 Germany: § 831 BGB	448
1606-2 Germany: bypasses for § 831 BGB	450
1606-3 France	452
1606-4 England	454
1607 Comparative observations	456
1607-1 General remarks	456
1607-2 Rationales	458
1607-3 Conditions	459
17. Liability in Emergency Cases	462
1701 Pure omissions: emergency cases	462
1702 National rules	463
1702-1 France	463
1702-2 Germany	464
1702-3 England	465
1703 Duty to rescue	467
1703-1 When does a duty to rescue exist?	467
1703-2 Rescuer's standard of care	468
1703-3 Rescuer's right to compensation	470
18. Liability of Public Authorities	472
A INTRODUCTION	472
1801 Overview	472
B NATIONAL LEGAL SYSTEMS	474
1802 France	474
1802-1 Administrative liability	474
1802-2 Liability based on fault	476
1802-3 Liability based on risk: the equality principle	478
1803 Germany	481
1803-1 Introduction	481
1803-2 Civil servant's personal liability (§ 839 BGB)	482
1803-3 Discretion	485
1803-4 State liability (Article 34 <i>Grundgesetz</i> )	486
1804 England	488
1804-1 Introduction	488
1804-2 Tort of negligence: duty of care, discretion, and justiciability	489
1804-3 Tort of negligence and Article 6 ECHR: from <i>Osman</i> to <i>Z</i>	492

## *Contents*

1804-4 Tort of negligence: recent developments	495
1804-5 Misfeasance in a public office	497
C COMMUNITY LAW	498
1805 Sufficiently serious breach	498
1805-1 Relevant factors	498
1805-2 Application	500
1805-3 Terminology and comparison	502
1806 Liability for lawful acts and specific damage	504
D EUROPEAN CONVENTION ON HUMAN RIGHTS	507
1807 The right to life: Article 2 ECHR	507
1807-1 Introduction	507
1807-2 Protection against imminent life-threatening danger	509
1808 The right to physical integrity and health	511
1808-1 Article 3 ECHR	511
1808-2 Articles 2 and 8 ECHR	512
E CONCLUDING REMARKS	513
1809 The issue of public authority liability	513
1810 Inevitability and limits of discretion	515
1811 Strict liability and the equality principle	517
<i>Bibliography</i>	520
<i>Index</i>	523