

---

## CONTENTS

Acknowledgments and Permissions xiii

A Note to Readers on Citations and Abbreviations xvii

### INTRODUCTION: CONSTITUTIONAL COSMOLOGY—CONVERGENCE, RESISTANCE, AND ENGAGEMENT 1

Transnationalism and Constitutional Review 1

The Distinctiveness of Constitutions as Law 3

The Functions of Judicial Review 3

An Expanding Universe of Law 5

Historic Relationships of Constitutions to a Global Audience 6

Three Postures toward the Transnational 8

Transnational Sources, Foreign and International 10

Engagement and Constitutional Law in the United States 11

Engagement in a Pluralist Global Context: Transnational  
Constitutionalism? 14

### CHAPTER 1: RESISTING THE TRANSNATIONAL 17

#### A. Sources of Resistance 18

Constitutions as Self-Constituting and Self-Expressive 18

Interpretive Theory: Originalism, Contractarianism, and Popular  
Sovereignty 20

Interpretive Theory: Representation-Reinforcement and  
“Majoritarianism” 22

Law as Autochthonous Identity 24

Judging under Constraints: Sources and Discretion, Expertise, Opportunity  
Costs, and Comparison 26

Political Resistance: Nation-Building, Western Dominance, and Cultural  
Exceptionalism 27

Political Resistance and Principled Substantive Disagreement 28

The Political Economy of Transnationalism and Constitutional  
Interpretation 29

Cultural Elites, Self-Interested Judges, and the Politics of Citation 30



B. Jurisprudential Assumptions 30

Positivism 30

Organic Conceptions of Law 31

Will, Organicity, and Exceptionalism 32

C. Manifestations of Resistance: Silence, Indifference, and Active Resistance 32

Articulated Resistance Inside the United States 33

Silent Resistance or Indifference 34

Articulated Resistance Outside the United States 34

Ambivalent Resistance 35

Resistance in Specific Settings—Foreign Investment, Control of Natural Resources, and Supranational Regimes 35

D. Resistance, Differentiation, and the Expressive Function of Constitutions 38

**CHAPTER 2: CONVERGENCE WITH THE TRANSNATIONAL 39**

A. Influences toward Postures of Convergence 40

Of Archetypes, Incentives, and Supranational Courts and Organizations 40

Convergence or Fragmentation? 41

Convergence in Law or As Interpretive Posture 42

B. Convergence Postures and Their Normative or Jurisprudential Foundations 43

Universal Moral Rights 45

Epistemic Arguments 47

Interpretive Discretion and Legitimacy 48

Arguments from Judges' Roles 49

Support for the International Legal System 49

Checks against Horrific Conduct or Backsliding from Democracy 51

Positive Textualist Arguments 52

C. Doctrinal Implications and Manifestations 54

Different Presumptions? 54

Extraterritorial Effects 55

Margins of Appreciation 57

Proportionality, Balancing, and Means-End Analysis 60

Scope of Its Use 60

Proportionality Inherent in Constitutional Review? 61



Divergent Predictions 63  
 Dualism/Monism and Convergence 64

#### D. Interpretive Approaches and Convergence Postures 65

Multiple Interpretive Roots 65  
 The Necessary Incompleteness of Convergence as Interpretive  
 Approach 66

### CHAPTER 3: ENGAGEMENT WITH THE TRANSNATIONAL 71

#### A. Engagement: Deliberative and Relational Modes 73

Deliberative Engagement: Australia, the United States, Canada,  
 and Japan 73  
 Expressive and Affiliative Functions of Engagement 77  
 Relational Engagement: South Africa and Elsewhere 78

#### B. Normative or Jurisprudential Foundations 81

Positive law 81  
 Pragmatism or Consequentialism 81  
 Law as Inquiry 82  
     Autopoiesis 84  
     Process and Justification 84  
 Constitutional Law as Mediating the Domestic and the Global 85

#### C. Doctrinal or Interpretive Manifestations 86

Texts That Call For or Invite Comparison—Limitations Clauses and  
 Other Examples 86  
 Multi-Valenced Interpretation 88  
 The Judicial Role, Constitutionalism, and Interpretive Approaches 90  
 Legal Hierarchies and Multi-Vocal Constitutionalism in Europe 91

#### D. Positive Influences 95

Globalization, Transnational Disputes, and Plural Legal Orders 95  
 Past Colonialism and the Commonwealth Nations 96  
 Increases in Comparative Legal Knowledge 97  
 Institutional and Strategic Concerns, Mandatory Consideration  
     as Soft Monitoring 97  
 Independent Judging Gone Global: Judicial Networks and the  
     Ideology of Judging 98  
     The Idea of Independent Judging in International and  
     Constitutional Law 98



- Judging as an Activity with Supranational Elements 99
  - Autonomy and judicial control of interpretive sources 99
  - Human rights law's protection of judicial independence 100
  - Independence of judges from each other 100
- Judicial Networks 100
- Courts Constructing Influence? 101

**CHAPTER 4: CONSTITUTIONAL ADJUDICATION IN THE  
U.S. SUPREME COURT: WHY ENGAGE THE TRANSNATIONAL? 103**

- A. Deliberative Engagement: An Internal Perspective 103
  - Reflective Comparisons and Expressive Aspects of Interpretation  
in U.S. Constitutional History 104
    - Freedom and Equality 105
    - Due Process and Criminal Procedure 106
    - Executive Power 106
    - Citizenship and Immigration 107
    - Cruel and Unusual Punishment 108
  - Overlapping Normative Commitments and Constitutional Justice Seen  
from Outside 108
  - Implementing the Constitution: Functionality and Doctrine 110
    - Change, New Problems, Health and Safety Regulation 111
    - Criminal Procedure 111
    - Separation of Powers 112
    - Federalism 112
    - The Law of Nations in the Constitution 113
  - Inevitability of Comparison, Multiple Perspectives, and Ethical Judging:  
Reflective Comparison and Impartiality 114
- B. Relational Engagement: Constitutional Symbiosis in a Globalizing  
Legal World 117
  - Strategic or Institutional Goals, Weak State–Strong State Differences? 118
  - Moral Obligations and Claims of Outsiders 119
    - A Transnational Court? 119
    - An Influential Court? 120
    - Relational Constitutionalism and Minimal Cosmopolitanism? 121
  - Judges and National Legitimacy in a Transnational Environment 122
    - Judges as Diplomats? 123
    - Diffuse Instrumentalism, Diffuse Legitimacy 124
  - Jurisprudential Change and Constitutional Interdependence 124
    - Permeable Boundaries 124



Pluralism, Courts, and Constitutional Self-Defense	125
Constitutional Coexistence and Interdependence	128

## CHAPTER 5: ENGAGEMENT, U.S. INTERPRETIVE THEORY, AND MULTIFUNCTIONAL CONSTITUTIONS 133

A. Engagement and Leading Interpretive Approaches	133
Text- or “Moment”-Focused Positivism, Originalism, and Intentionalism	134
Purposivism	135
Multi-Valenced (“Common Law”) Practice-Based Approaches	136
B. Rejecting Resistance: Legitimate Interpretation in the United States	139
Fear of Being Bound	140
Originalism and Formalism	140
Democracy, Self-Rule, and Sovereignty	142
Interpretive License	145
Separation of Powers, Federalism, and the Treaty Power	145
National Ethos and the Perils of Pragmatic Comparative Inquiry	147
Rule of Law, “Persuasive Authority,” and Judicial Discretion	147
Expertise and Bounded Rationality	150
Comparability Challenges	151
Constitutional Situation Sense, Contextualized Judgment, and Socialization	151
C. Questioning Convergence: Constitutions as Embodiments of National Distinctiveness and Plural Functions	154
Compromise and Constraint in Constitutional Design	155
Local Authorship and Universal Reason	155
Textual, Institutional, and Practice-Based Distinctions	156
Treaties, Presumptions, and Sub-Constitutional Implementation	157
International Law and Interpretive Space	158
Elusiveness of Goal	158

## CHAPTER 6: ENGAGING THE TRANSNATIONAL: A CONTEXTUAL FRAMEWORK 161

A. Three Contextual Considerations	162
The Nature of the Issue and of Domestic Sources of Interpretation	162
Fifth Amendment Grand Jury Clause	162
Establishment Clause	163
Eighth Amendment	163



## X CONTENTS

Security and Liberty	164
International Law as Embedded Element in Constitutional Terms	165
Transnational Sources and “Open” Questions	165
The Nature of the Transnational Source and its Proposed Use	166
Authority and Institutional Setting: Courts and Legislatures	167
Authority and Source of Law: International and Foreign Law	168
International law as binding or potentially binding	169
International law and questions of comparison	170
International law as “part of our law”	171
The limited scope of international law	171
General, aspirational, or conflicted norms; clarity and enforceability	172
Gravitational pull and seriousness among rule of law constitutional democracies	173
Seriousness and cosmoskepticism: <i>Breard</i> , <i>Sanchez-Llamas</i> , and <i>Medellín</i>	175
Comparability: Normative and Functional Concerns	178
B. Fair Usage, Fair Process, and Recent Controversies	183
Fair and Accurate Usage: Death Penalty and Gay Rights Cases	184
Hate Speech and the Importance of National Context	186
Fair-Mindedness and the Multi-Directionality of Transnational Law: The Exclusionary Rule	187
Procedures for Gathering and Considering Transnational Legal Sources	189
C. Institutional Constraints and Prudential Silences: Limits on Engagement?	192
Lower Courts as well as Supreme Court?	192
Prudential Noncitation, “Silent Dialogues,” and Internal and External Legitimacy	193
 CHAPTER 7: ENGAGEMENT, EQUALITY, AND OLDER CONSTITUTIONS	 197
A. Equality and Interpretation over Time: Federal Power to Redress Gender Inequality	199
Reading the U.S. Constitution Holistically	199
The <i>Morrison</i> Case: Federal Power and Gender Equality	201
The Commerce Clause of the Original Constitution	202
The Fourteenth Amendment	205
Doctrinal Specificities and the <i>Hibbs</i> Case	206
B. Citizenship and Gender: <i>Nguyen</i>	206



C. Abortion, Reproductive Freedom, and Equality 210

    The Absence of Worldwide Consensus 212

    Health, Autonomy, Multiple Perspectives and *Gonzales v. Carhart* 215

    Social Rights, Social Reasons, Equality, and Abortion 217

    Liberty and Equality at Stake 220

    The Absence of a “Positive” State and the “Optionality” of Government Interests 220

D. Optional But “Compelling” State Interests in U.S. Constitutional Law: Affirmative Action in the United States and India 222

    Constitutional Solidarity, Societal Discrimination, and Individualized Consideration 223

    Temporary Measures? 224

    Super-Classifications and Specially Subordinated Groups 225

**CHAPTER 8: CONSTITUTIONAL PARTICULARITIES, FEDERALISM, AND THE TRANSNATIONAL 227**

A. Federalism and the Limits of Interpretive Engagement 227

    Historically Contingent Compromises 228

    Interdependent Federal Balances 229

    No Transnational Archetype 230

B. Federal Systems’ Varying Postures toward the Transnational 232

    Theoretical Tendencies? 232

    Federalism Tropes and the Transnational in the United States and Canada 234

    Constitutional Commonalities 235

    Distinctive Constitutional Histories and Federal Bargains 237

    Founding Divisions and Historic Momentum 238

    Age of Rights-Incorporating Texts 239

    Geopolitics 240

    Legal Culture: Rights and Negotiation, Written and Unwritten Constitutional Constraints 240

    Legal Culture and Legal Education 242

C. Federal Systems, Constitutional Adjudication, and Transnational Sources of Law 243

    Secession 244

    Commerce, Criminal Law, and National Power 245



Rights and Federalism 248

Death Penalty and the Allocation of Criminal Jurisdiction 248

Group Rights, Group Remedies, and Federal Compromises 250

D. Toward Moderating Certainties about Federalism 252

**CHAPTER 9: CONSTITUTIONS AS MEDIATING INSTITUTIONS, TRANSNATIONAL  
CONSTITUTIONAL VALUES, AND ENGAGEMENT IN TWENTY-FIRST CENTURY  
CONSTITUTIONAL INTERPRETATION 255**

A. The Interdependence of Constitutional and International Law 257

Recognition of States 258

International Law and Domestic Constitutional Compliance 259

Overlapping Subjects 261

International Incentives for Domestic Constitutional Change 261

Interlock and Overlap 262

B. Boundaries and Transitions at the Intersection of International and  
Constitutional Law: Transnational Constitutional Values? 262

Boundaries, Membership, and Secession 263

Transitional and Transnational Constitutional Processes 265

Federalism and the National/International Border 267

Risks of Transnational Constitutionalism: Law or Values? 270

C. The Future: The Gravitational Force of the Transnational and the  
Range of Constitutional Responses 273

Interdependence and Interpretation: Mediating the National and  
the Global 273

Constitutional Interdependence, Transnational Legal Process,  
Acculturation, and Changing Threats 275

Constitutional Diversity and the Mediating Role 277

Increased Interactions, Litigation, and Technology 278

Future Choices and the Enduring Significance of National  
Constitutions 279

**NOTES 287**

Table of Cases 477

Index 495