

# CONTENTS

---

Preface xi

Table of Treaties and Cases xiii

## PART I: General Concepts

1. An Introduction to Proportionality 3
  - A. General Concepts 3
  - B. Legal Sources 8
  - C. The Structure of the Book 9
2. Ethical and Constitutional Foundations 11
  - A. The Possible Sources for Proportionality 11
  - B. A Philosophical and Religious Prism of Proportionality 12
    - Premodern Views of Proportionality 12
    - The Philosophical Background 14
  - C. The Rational Analysis of Proportionality 16
    - Rational Reciprocal Explanation 16
  - D. Proportionality as a Mode of Control 18
  - E. The Constitutional and Administrative Background to Proportionality Analysis 21
3. A General Overview of Proportionality in IHL 23
  - A. The History and Development of IHL Proportionality 23
  - B. Contemporary IHL and Proportionality 29
  - C. The Changing Nature of Armed Conflict and Proportionality 33
    - Applying Proportionality: Examples and Dilemmas 35
    - Fighting NSAs and the Application of the Principle of Proportionality 39
    - Parallel Application of IHL and International Human Rights Law 44
    - The Right to Life during Armed Conflicts 48
    - Different Balances of IHL/HRL in Different Types of Armed Conflicts? 50
  - D. Conclusion 55

## PART II: The Practical Application of Proportionality

4. Military Advantage 59
  - A. What Constitutes a Military Advantage? 60
  - B. Military Advantage of an Attack 65



5. Incidental Harm and the Analysis of Proportionality 73
  - A. Civilians or All Persons Protected from Attack 73
  - B. What Constitutes Harm? 78
    - Harm to the Person 78
    - Economic Damage 80
    - Civilian Objects 81
    - Damage to the Natural Environment 81
    - Benefitting from Proportional Harm 83
  - C. Indirect and Reverberating Effects 83
    - Foreseeable Harm 84
    - Causality 87
  - D. The Level of Expectation/Anticipation 88
  - E. A Balancing Act: What Constitutes a Violation? 92
    - Different Standards in Different Conflicts? 99
    - Excessive vs. Extensive: An Upper Limit to Civilian Harm? 100
  - F. From Whose Perspective Should Proportionality Be Examined? 101
6. Soldiers vs. Civilians 107
  - A. The Basic Dilemma 107
  - B. The Kasher vs. Walzer Debate 108
  - C. The Lives of Soldiers and Proportionality 110
  - D. The Context of Force Protection 114
  - E. The Enemy's Soldiers 117
7. Strategic and Cultural Considerations 119
  - A. The Meaning of "Concrete and Direct Military Advantage" 120
  - B. Policy Arguments Regarding Strategic and Cultural Considerations 121
    - The Divide between IHL and Laws on the Use of Force 121
    - An Inherent or Tangible Military Advantage? 122
    - Uncertainty and Manipulations 123
  - C. Who Bears the Burden of Accommodating a State's Sensitivities? 125
    - A Matter of Context? 126
    - Permitting Less Collateral Damage? 127
  - D. Different Requirements for Different States? 128
  - E. The Futility of Force, Deterrence, and Proportionality 131
8. Direct Participation in Hostilities and Its Effect on Proportionality 135
  - A. The Concept of Direct Participation in Hostilities 135
  - B. The Definition of Direct Participation in Hostilities 139
9. Human Shields and Proportionality 145
  - A. The Problem of Human Shields 145
  - B. Involuntary Human Shields 147



- C. Voluntary Human Shields 149
- D. Discerning Choice 150

- 10. The Principle of Distinction and Its Relation to Proportionality 155
  - A. The Definition of Military Objectives and Its Relation to Proportionality 155
  - B. Indiscriminate Attacks 159
  - Protection of Cultural Property 165

### PART III: Understanding Proportionality

- 11. The Vagueness of Proportionality 169
  - A. Experimental Meanings of Proportionality 169
  - B. The Formula of Proportionality 171
  - C. Rules of Thumb 174
  - D. Inherent Vagueness? 175
- 12. Procedural Aspects of Proportionality 177
  - A. The Legal Background 178
  - B. Procedures 179
  - C. The Suitable Decision-Maker 181
  - Doubts 187
  - D. How Much Intelligence Is Necessary? 189
  - E. Warnings 194
  - Roof Knocking 196
  - F. What Is the Role of Military Legal Advisors? 197
  - G. Conclusion 199
    - Creating a Zone of Reasonableness 199
    - Responsibility and Control 199
    - Organization and Culture 200
- 13. Judicial Review and Investigations 201
  - A. Introduction 201
  - B. *Ex Ante* Review 201
  - C. *Ex Post* Review: The Problem with the Criminal Approach 203
    - Criminal Investigations 204
    - The Problem with Criminal Investigations 205
    - Should Criminal Prosecutions Be Forsaken? 212
  - D. *Ex Post* Assessment: An Alternative to Criminal Trials 214
    - The Non-Exclusive Nature of the Grave Breaches Regime under IHL 215
  - E. The Saleh Shehadeh Targeted Killing 220



- 14. The Future of Proportionality 223
  - A. On the Future of Proportionality 224
    - Image-Fare 224
    - Cyber Warfare and Proportionality 225
    - Autonomous Weapons and Proportionality 226

Conclusion—A Way Forward? 231

Bibliography 233

Index 247