

CONTENTS

Preface xi

Table of Treaties and Cases xiii

PART I: General Concepts

1. An Introduction to Proportionality 3
 - A. General Concepts 3
 - B. Legal Sources 8
 - C. The Structure of the Book 9
2. Ethical and Constitutional Foundations 11
 - A. The Possible Sources for Proportionality 11
 - B. A Philosophical and Religious Prism of Proportionality 12
 - Premodern Views of Proportionality 12
 - The Philosophical Background 14
 - C. The Rational Analysis of Proportionality 16
 - Rational Reciprocal Explanation 16
 - D. Proportionality as a Mode of Control 18
 - E. The Constitutional and Administrative Background to Proportionality Analysis 21
3. A General Overview of Proportionality in IHL 23
 - A. The History and Development of IHL Proportionality 23
 - B. Contemporary IHL and Proportionality 29
 - C. The Changing Nature of Armed Conflict and Proportionality 33
 - Applying Proportionality: Examples and Dilemmas 35
 - Fighting NSAs and the Application of the Principle of Proportionality 39
 - Parallel Application of IHL and International Human Rights Law 44
 - The Right to Life during Armed Conflicts 48
 - Different Balances of IHL/HRL in Different Types of Armed Conflicts? 50
- D. Conclusion 55

PART II: The Practical Application of Proportionality

4. Military Advantage 59
 - A. What Constitutes a Military Advantage? 60
 - B. Military Advantage of an Attack 65

5. Incidental Harm and the Analysis of Proportionality 73
 - A. Civilians or All Persons Protected from Attack 73
 - B. What Constitutes Harm? 78
 - Harm to the Person 78
 - Economic Damage 80
 - Civilian Objects 81
 - Damage to the Natural Environment 81
 - Benefitting from Proportional Harm 83
 - C. Indirect and Reverberating Effects 83
 - Foreseeable Harm 84
 - Causality 87
 - D. The Level of Expectation/Anticipation 88
 - E. A Balancing Act: What Constitutes a Violation? 92
 - Different Standards in Different Conflicts? 99
 - Excessive vs. Extensive: An Upper Limit to Civilian Harm? 100
 - F. From Whose Perspective Should Proportionality Be Examined? 101
6. Soldiers vs. Civilians 107
 - A. The Basic Dilemma 107
 - B. The Kasher vs. Walzer Debate 108
 - C. The Lives of Soldiers and Proportionality 110
 - D. The Context of Force Protection 114
 - E. The Enemy's Soldiers 117
7. Strategic and Cultural Considerations 119
 - A. The Meaning of "Concrete and Direct Military Advantage" 120
 - B. Policy Arguments Regarding Strategic and Cultural Considerations 121
 - The Divide between IHL and Laws on the Use of Force 121
 - An Inherent or Tangible Military Advantage? 122
 - Uncertainty and Manipulations 123
 - C. Who Bears the Burden of Accommodating a State's Sensitivities? 125
 - A Matter of Context? 126
 - Permitting Less Collateral Damage? 127
 - D. Different Requirements for Different States? 128
 - E. The Futility of Force, Deterrence, and Proportionality 131
8. Direct Participation in Hostilities and Its Effect on Proportionality 135
 - A. The Concept of Direct Participation in Hostilities 135
 - B. The Definition of Direct Participation in Hostilities 139
9. Human Shields and Proportionality 145
 - A. The Problem of Human Shields 145
 - B. Involuntary Human Shields 147

- C. Voluntary Human Shields 149
- D. Discerning Choice 150
- 10. The Principle of Distinction and Its Relation to Proportionality 155
 - A. The Definition of Military Objectives and Its Relation to Proportionality 155
 - B. Indiscriminate Attacks 159
 - Protection of Cultural Property 165
- PART III: Understanding Proportionality**
- 11. The Vagueness of Proportionality 169
 - A. Experimental Meanings of Proportionality 169
 - B. The Formula of Proportionality 171
 - C. Rules of Thumb 174
 - D. Inherent Vagueness? 175
- 12. Procedural Aspects of Proportionality 177
 - A. The Legal Background 178
 - B. Procedures 179
 - C. The Suitable Decision-Maker 181
 - Doubts 187
 - D. How Much Intelligence Is Necessary? 189
 - E. Warnings 194
 - Roof Knocking 196
 - F. What Is the Role of Military Legal Advisors? 197
 - G. Conclusion 199
 - Creating a Zone of Reasonableness 199
 - Responsibility and Control 199
 - Organization and Culture 200
- 13. Judicial Review and Investigations 201
 - A. Introduction 201
 - B. *Ex Ante* Review 201
 - C. *Ex Post* Review: The Problem with the Criminal Approach 203
 - Criminal Investigations 204
 - The Problem with Criminal Investigations 205
 - Should Criminal Prosecutions Be Forsaken? 212
 - D. *Ex Post* Assessment: An Alternative to Criminal Trials 214
 - The Non-Exclusive Nature of the Grave Breaches Regime under IHL 215
 - E. The Saleh Shehadeh Targeted Killing 220

- 14. The Future of Proportionality 223
 - A. On the Future of Proportionality 224
 - Image-Fare 224
 - Cyber Warfare and Proportionality 225
 - Autonomous Weapons and Proportionality 226
- Conclusion—A Way Forward? 231
- Bibliography 233
- Index 247