## Contents

| Tai | ble of Cases, Laws, and Resolutions  | xv    |
|-----|--|-------|
| Lis | st of Abbreviations  | xxiii |
|     |  |       |
| 1.  | Introduction   | 1     |
|     | 1. Domestic Accountability in the Shadow of ICTs   | 3     |
|     | 2. The (Positive) Complementarity Turn in International Criminal   |       |
|     | Justice  | 7     |
|     | 3. Research Method, Limitations, and Terminology   | 10    |
|     | 4. The Case Studies: Rwanda, Sierra Leone, and the DR Congo  | 14    |
|     | 4.1. Rwanda: zero-impunity, prosecutions, and traditional justice  | 14    |
|     | 4.2. Sierra Leone: amnesty, truth and reconciliation, and prosecutions   | 15    |
|     | 4.3. DR Congo: partial amnesty, failed truth-seeking, and prosecutions   | 16    |
|     | 5. Book Outline  | 17    |
| 2   | The (Positive) Complementarity Turn in International Criminal  |       |
|     | Justice (1 oom) Comprending Family Fa | 20    |
|     | 1. The Rise and Fall of Domestic Accountability in Time and Space  | 21    |
|     | 2. From Subsidiarity to Shadow: Tracing Complementarity's  |       |
|     | Ascendance   | 24    |
|     | 3. The Mechanics of Complementarity as Global Governance   | 30    |
|     | 4. Beyond Complementarity: Reimagining Relations with States   | 35    |
|     | 5. International Criminal Tribunals, Complementarity, and  |       |
|     | Statebuilding  | 38    |
| 2   | Institutional Decign, Pagulating Polations between States and ICTs   | 41    |
| 5.  | Institutional Design: Regulating Relations between States and ICTs   |       |
|     | 1. Institutional Design, Concurrent Jurisdiction, and Shadow Effects  2. (International) Primacy   | 41    |
|     | <ul><li>2. (International) Primacy</li><li>2.1. The original aims</li></ul>  | 43    |
|     | <ul><li>2.1. The original aims</li><li>2.2. Nipped in the bud: the false promise of 'open-ended' and</li></ul>   | 43    |
|     | 'conditional' primacy  | 46    |
|     | 2.3. 'Targeted' (quasi-absolute) primacy over high-level suspects  | 49    |
|     | 2.4. The completion strategy and rule 11 bis: conditionality in action   | 51    |
|     | 2.5. Rehabilitating the domestic: from 'conditional' to 'absolute'   |       |
|     | primacy and back   | 58    |
|     | 3. A Hybrid and Restrictive Mandate  | 59    |
|     | 3.1. The original aims   | 60    |
|     | 3.2. Primacy and rule 11bis: law without practice  | 61    |

## xii CONTENTS

|    |  | 3.3. 'Targeted' primacy: litigating 'greatest responsibility'                  | 63  |  |  |
|----|--|--|-----|--|--|
|    |  | 3.4. Hybrid crimes: insulating the international from domestic scrutiny        | 67  |  |  |
|    |  | 3.5. Searching for domestic impact: reconciling hybridity with a               |     |  |  |
|    |  | restrictive mandate  | 67  |  |  |
|    | 4.   | Complementarity (Domestic Primacy or Subsidiarity)                             | 68  |  |  |
|    |  | 4.1. The original aims   | 69  |  |  |
|    |  | 4.2. An admissibility framework open to challenge                              | 71  |  |  |
|    |  | 4.3. Avoiding conflict: self-referrals and uncontested admissibility           | 73  |  |  |
|    |  | 4.4. From conditionality (unable or unwilling) to consensuality                |     |  |  |
|    |  | (inactivity)   | 74  |  |  |
|    |  | 4.5. Consolidating international supremacy: 'same case, same conduct'          | 78  |  |  |
|    |  | 4.6. Importing a restrictive mandate through gravity                           | 82  |  |  |
|    |  | 4.7. Plausible deniability: from conditional admissibility to consensual       |     |  |  |
|    |  | and targeted quasi-primacy   | 83  |  |  |
|    | 5.   | Unpacking the Nexus of ICT Institutional Design, International                 |     |  |  |
|    |  | Trials, and Domestic Accountability  | 86  |  |  |
| 4. | In   | ternational Intervention and Domestic Prosecutions                             | 90  |  |  |
|    |  | Introduction   | 90  |  |  |
|    |  | The International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda                                 | 91  |  |  |
|    | ~.   | 2.1. Early prosecutorial strategy: investigations 'all over the place'         | 91  |  |  |
|    |  | 2.2. Open-ended primacy in action: dissuasive or iterative competition?        | 93  |  |  |
|    |  | 2.3. ICTR versus Kagame: probing the coercive limits of primacy                | 98  |  |  |
|    |  | 2.4. Rule 11 <i>bis</i> : foregrounding the iterative potential of primacy     | 105 |  |  |
|    |  | 2.5. Unpacking primacy's effects on domestic prosecutions                      | 107 |  |  |
|    | 3  | The Special Court for Sierra Leone   | 110 |  |  |
|    | ٥.   | 3.1. Prosecutorial strategy: targeted or target-driven?                        | 110 |  |  |
|    |  | 3.2. The SCSL and domestic prosecutions: neutral or dissuasive?                | 114 |  |  |
|    |  | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·  |     |  |  |
|    |  | 3.3. Failed iteration: amnesty repeal, rule 11 bis, and drawdown               | 118 |  |  |
|    | 4  | 3.4. Unpacking a restrictive mandate's effects on domestic prosecutions        | 122 |  |  |
|    | 4.   | The International Criminal Court   | 125 |  |  |
|    |  | 4.1. Prosecutorial strategy: imbuing complementarity with (extralegal) meaning | 105 |  |  |
|    |  | (  | 125 |  |  |
|    |  | 4.2. Complementarity in action: trading iteration for accommodation            | 128 |  |  |
|    |  | 4.3. In the ICC's shadow: NGO justice and the rise of human rights             |     |  |  |
|    |  | prosecutions   | 132 |  |  |
|    |  | 4.4. Inadmissibility in reverse: complementarity as pretext for ICC            |     |  |  |
|    |  | inaction   | 135 |  |  |
|    |  | 4.5. Unpacking complementarity's effects on domestic prosecutions              | 139 |  |  |
|    | 5.   | Interim Conclusion: Domestic Prosecutions in the Court's Shadow                | 142 |  |  |
| 5. | International Intervention and Capacity Building |  |     |  |  |
|    |  | Introduction   | 147 |  |  |
|    |  | The International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda                                 | 148 |  |  |
|    |  | 2.1. Specialist genocide courts and the waning shadow of                       |     |  |  |
|    |  | international influence  | 148 |  |  |

|    |                       | CONTI   | ENTS | xii |
|----|-----------------------|---|------|-----|
|    | 2.2. Gacaca: challer  | nging international oversight                       |      | 152 |
|    |                       | hadow: rule 11 bis, iteration, and two-tier justice |      | 155 |
|    |                       | acy? Penitentiary reform in Rwanda                  |      | 160 |
|    |                       | macy's effects on capacity building                 |      | 162 |
| 3. | The Special Court     |   |      | 165 |
|    | •                     | acy (building), and 'demonstration effects'         |      | 165 |
|    |                       | g: a missed opportunity for iteration?              |      | 167 |
|    | ,                     | n: witness protection, training, and penitentiary   |      | 10, |
|    | reform                |   |      | 170 |
|    | 3.4. Beyond the cal   | l of legacy: legal aid and anti-corruption          |      | 172 |
|    |                       | ybrid mandate's effects on capacity building        |      | 175 |
| 4. | The International C   |   |      | 178 |
|    |                       | ICC's symbolic shadow: mobile courts and            |      |     |
|    | prosecution su        |   |      | 178 |
|    |                       | lian justice? Unpacking Congo's jurisdictional      |      |     |
|    | turf wars             |   |      | 182 |
|    | 4.3. The struggle fo  | r a hybrid court: walking the iteration-isolation   |      |     |
|    | tightrope             |   |      | 184 |
|    | 4.4. Positive compl   | ementarity (in)action: capacity building            |      |     |
|    | with(out) the c       |   |      | 189 |
|    | 4.5. Deromanticizi    | ng domestic justice: how able was/is the            |      |     |
|    | Congolese judi        | iciary?   |      | 190 |
|    | 4.6. Unpacking cor    | nplementarity's effects on capacity building        |      | 193 |
| 5. | Interim Conclusion    | n: Capacity Building in the Court's Shadow          |      | 196 |
| In | ternational Interve   | ention and Norm Internalization                     |      | 200 |
| 1. | Introduction          |   |      | 200 |
| 2. | The International (   | Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda                        |      | 20  |
|    | 2.1. Domesticating    | genocide: keeping internationals at bay             |      | 20  |
|    | 2.2. Rule 11bis and   | norm dissemination: catalyst or                     |      |     |
|    | epiphenomeno          | on?   |      | 200 |
|    | 2.3. Iteration in act | ion: abolition of the death penalty                 |      | 20  |
|    | 2.4. Normative mix    | (-up)? A common law fair trial in the civil         |      |     |
|    | law's shadow          |   |      | 210 |
|    | 2.5. In the ICTR's s  | hadow: what counts as a fair domestic trial?        |      | 212 |
|    | 2.6. Unpacking pri    | macy's effects on norm internalization              |      | 210 |
| 3. | The Special Court     | for Sierra Leone                                    |      | 218 |
|    | 3.1. Charging dom     | estic crimes: a missed opportunity for iteration?   |      | 218 |
|    | 3.2. Domesticating    | international crimes: international indifference,   |      |     |
|    | domestic obsti        | nance, or calculated neglect?                       |      | 220 |
|    | 3.3. The death pena   | alty: probing the limits of international influence |      | 224 |
|    | 3.4. The SCSL's inco  | omplete shadow: ordinary criminal justice practi    | ce   | 220 |
|    | 3.5. 'No one is above | ve the law': the normative paradox of 'greatest     |      |     |
|    | responsibility's      | ?   |      | 228 |
|    | 3.6. Unpacking a h    | ybrid/restrictive mandate's effects on norm         |      |     |

230

internalization

## xiv CONTENTS

| 4.    | The International Criminal Court                                     | 232  |
|-------|--|------|
|       | 4.1. Joining the ICC club: Congo as a battleground for               |      |
|       | legislative reform   | 232  |
|       | 4.2. Complementarity circumvented: direct application of the Rome    |      |
|       | Statute and fair trial compliance                                    | 236  |
|       | 4.3. Interrogating complementarity's purpose: domestic (re)trials    |      |
|       | of ICC defendants  | 239  |
|       | 4.4. Domesticating the Rome Statute: epiphenomenal complementarity   | 240  |
|       | 4.5. Rome's anti-impunity shadow: displacing amnesty and immunity    | 242  |
|       | 4.6. The shadow side of article 17: unintended diversionary          |      |
|       | complementarity  | 246  |
|       | 4.7. Unpacking complementarity's effects on norm internalization     | 251  |
| 5.    | Interim Conclusion: Norm Internalization in the Court's Shadow       | 253  |
| 7 I*  | the Court's Shadow. Maximizing Accountability in                     |      |
|       | the Court's Shadow: Maximizing Accountability in                     | 258  |
|       | Inwilling or Unable States   | 230  |
| 1.    | The (Positive) Complementarity Turn: Situating the ICC in a          | 250  |
| 2     | Decentralized and Opportunistic System of Global Justice             | 258  |
| 2.    | Three General Trends   | 260  |
|       | 2.1. From top-down coercion to bottom-up persuasion:                 | 2.50 |
|       | complementarity as cooperation                                       | 260  |
|       | 2.2. Unintended diversionary complementarity in the Court's          |      |
|       | symbolic shadow  | 264  |
|       | 2.3. From investigation to preliminary examination (and back?)       | 267  |
| 3.    | Three Intervening Factors  | 271  |
|       | 3.1. Temporal factors: a double-edged sword                          | 271  |
|       | 3.2. Bridging capacity and political will: disaggregating the        |      |
|       | 'black box' of the 'unable or unwilling' state                       | 276  |
|       | 3.3. Prosecutorial leadership: between arrogance and risk-averseness | 279  |
| 4.    | . Searching for Shadows  | 281  |
|       | 4.1. Reimagining the aims and addressees of international            |      |
|       | criminal justice   | 282  |
|       | 4.2. Rethinking institutional design and (positive) complementarity  | 285  |
|       | 4.3. From accommodation to iteration: enacting relationality at ICTs | 288  |
| Epilo | ogue: Interrogating the Ideology of (Positive) Complementarity:      |      |
| -     | ald the Future of International Criminal Justice Be Domestic?        | 295  |
|       |  |      |
| Bibli | ography  | 299  |
| Inde. |  | 335  |
|       |  |      |