

# Table of Contents

<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xvii
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xix
<i>Table of Instruments</i>	xxv
<i>Note to the Reader</i>	xxvii

## INTRODUCTION

<b>1. An Introduction to European Antitrust Criminalization and Its Theoretical, Legal, and Practical Challenges</b>	3
A. Background and Context to the Book: 'The European Antitrust Criminalization Debate'	3
B. Aim of the Book	6
C. Scope of the Book	9
D. Methodology Employed in the Book	11
E. Structure and Layout of the Book	19

## PART I: THEORETICAL CHALLENGES

<b>2. Potential Theoretical Justifications for European Antitrust Criminalization</b>	25
A. Introduction	25
B. Two Relevant Theories of Antitrust Criminalization	26
C. The Relative Merits and Demerits of the Two Theories	33
D. The Current Relevance of Both Theories for EU Antitrust Enforcement	37
E. Conclusion	43
<b>3. European Antitrust Criminalization and the Challenge of Deterrence Theory</b>	44
A. Introduction	44
B. Step 1: Identifying the Deficiencies of the Current Approach to Deterrence	45
C. Step 2: A 'Robust' Criminalization Argument: Employing Criminal Punishment to Rectify the (Deterrence-Related) Deficiencies Identified	51
D. Step 3: Identifying and Analysing the Limitations of the Criminalization Argument Advanced (and Therefore the Challenge of Deterrence Theory)	55
E. Conclusion	78

<b>4. European Antitrust Criminalization and the Challenge of Retribution Theory</b>	80
A. Introduction	80
B. Step 1: Establishing a Framework to Determine ‘Moral Content’	83
C. Step 2: Employing the Framework to Examine the Moral Content of Cartel Activity (and Hence the Challenge of a Retribution-Based Criminalization Argument)	86
D. Conclusion	111

## PART II: LEGAL CHALLENGES

<b>5. European Antitrust Criminalization and the First Challenge of Due Process: A ‘Strengthening of Rights’ in Favour of the Accused?</b>	117
A. Introduction	117
B. Step 1: Articulating the Legal Framework	119
C. Step 2: Determining the Validity of the ‘Strengthening of Rights’ Contention	121
D. Step 3: Determining the Impact of the ‘Strengthening of Rights’ Contention	129
E. Conclusion	139
<b>6. European Antitrust Criminalization and the Second Challenge of Due Process: Imposing Criminal Sanctions alongside Civil Sanctions</b>	142
A. Introduction	142
B. Step 1: Determining the Validity of the ‘Additional Dynamic’ Contention	143
C. Step 2: Determining the Impact of the ‘Additional Dynamic’ Contention	152
D. Conclusion	173
<b>7. European Antitrust Criminalization and the Challenge of Legal Certainty</b>	175
A. Introduction	175
B. The Principle of Legal Certainty	176
C. Legal Certainty and the Concept of a Criminal Antitrust Offence	178
D. Legal Certainty and the Substance of a Criminal Antitrust Offence: Avoiding the Pitfalls of the UK Experience	182
E. Legal Certainty and the Existence of a Criminal Antitrust Offence: The Issue of ‘Sleeping Giants’	190
F. Conclusion	197

## PART III: PRACTICAL CHALLENGES

<b>8. European Antitrust Criminalization and the First Challenge of Design: Defining the Criminal Cartel Offence</b>	201
A. Introduction	201
B. Controlling the Potential (Negative) Impact of Regulation 1/2003	204

C. Resolving the Issue of 'Acceptable' Cartel Activity	218
D. Conclusion	229
9. European Antitrust Criminalization and the Second Challenge of Design: Understanding the Complexities of Leniency/Immunity	232
A. Introduction	232
B. The Co-Existence of Administrative Leniency/Immunity and Criminal Sanctions	234
C. The Unique Challenges of Criminal Immunity	249
D. Conclusion	256
10. European Antitrust Criminalization and the Third Challenge of Design: Identifying the Desirable Enforcement Strategies	260
A. Introduction	260
B. Avoiding the 'Compliance Trap'	262
C. Ensuring Support from Stakeholders	265
D. Designing the Enforcement Agency/Agencies	278
E. Securing International Cooperation	283
F. Conclusion	288

## CONCLUSION

11. Concluding Remarks on the Theoretical, Legal, and Practical Challenges of European Antitrust Criminalization	293
A. Introduction	293
B. Antitrust Criminalization Presents Difficult Theoretical Challenges	294
C. Antitrust Criminalization Must Overcome Complicated Legal Challenges	298
D. Antitrust Criminalization Must Overcome Complicated Practical Challenges	302
E. The Theoretical, Legal, and Practical Challenges of European Antitrust Criminalization Cannot Be Analysed in Isolation	309
F. Final Comments: Suggestions for Future Research	313

## ANNEXES AND BIBLIOGRAPHY

Annex I: Text of Article 101 TFEU	317
Annex II: Text of the (Original) UK Cartel Offence and Section 47 of the Enterprise and Regulatory Reform Act 2013	318
Annex III: Diagrammatical Representation of the Social Harm Due to Cartel Activity	321
<i>Bibliography</i>	323
<i>Index</i>	367