Acknowledgements page xi List of Abbreviations xvi

Introduction: The Call for Collaboration

- 1 Collaboration Calling 1
- 2 The Collaborative Constitution as Practice and Principle 13
- 3 Constitutions, Comparison, Context 18
- 4 Outline and Overview 23

PART I INSTITUTIONS AND INTERACTIONS

- 1 Constitutionalism beyond Manicheanism 31
  - 1 Introduction 31
  - 2 Clash of the Titans 32
  - 3 The Terror of the Twin Tyrannies 42
  - 4 Political versus Legal Constitutionalism 50
  - 5 Conclusion: A Farewell to Arms 55
- 2 The Promise and Perils of Dialogue 58
  - 1 Introduction 58
  - 2 Divining Dialogue 60
  - 3 The Canadian Conversation: From Metaphor to Model 64
  - 4 The UK Debate about Dialogue 70
  - 5 Promises 73
  - 6 Perils 76
  - 7 Dialogue, Disagreement, Distortion 80
  - 8 Conclusion 85
- 3 The Case for Collaboration 86
  - 1 Introduction 86
  - 2 Dividing Constitutional Labour 87
  - 3 Curbing and Counteracting 94

- 4 Comity and Collaboration 97
- 5 Conflict within Constraints: From Showdown to Slowdown 106
- 6 Conclusion 116
- PART II RIGHTS IN POLITICS
- 4 Governing with Rights 121
  - 1 Introduction: A Shared Responsibility 121
  - 2 The Executive and the Constitution 123
  - 3 Executive Engagement with Rights 128
    - a Cabinet, Civil Servants, and Bill Teams 130

### viii

- b The Office of Parliamentary Counsel 132
- c The Attorney General and the Law Officers 134
- d The Minister: Claiming Compatibility between Law and Politics 137
- e The Joint Committee on Human Rights 138
- 4 Raising Rights-Consciousness 139
- 5 Envisioning Executive Constitutionalism 142
- 6 Conclusion 147
- 5 Legislating for Rights 150
  - 1 Introduction 150
  - 2 Unpacking Parliament 151
  - 3 The JCHR as a Hybrid Constitutional Watchdog 156
  - 4 Raising Rights-Consciousness in Parliament 163
  - 5 Conclusion 168
- 6 Legislated Rights: From Domination to Collaboration 170
  - 1 Introduction 170
  - 2 Deconstructing Executive Dominance 172
  - 3 Legislating for Terror 179
  - 4 Legislative Decision, Judicial Distortion, Democratic Debilitation 184
  - 5 Detecting Debilitation? 186
  - 6 Discerning Distortion? 189
  - 7 Claiming Compatibility: A Case Study of Money in Politics 195
  - 8 Conclusion 201

### PART III JUDGE AS PARTNER

# 7 Judge as Partner 205

- 1 Introduction: Between Supremacy and Subordination 205
- 2 The Contribution Courts Make 206
- 3 Janus-Faced Judging in a Joint Enterprise 208
- 4 From Faithful Agent to Constitutional Partner 212

1X

- 5 Of Common Law Rights and Clear Statements 215
- 6 The Principle of Legality as a Presumption of Partnership 220
- 7 Conclusion 227
- 8 The HRA as Partnership in Progress 230
  - 1 Introduction 230
  - 2 The Art of the Possible 233
  - 3 Taking Interpretation to the Limit 238
  - 4 Interpreting Rights, Declaring Wrongs 243
  - 5 Declarations as Decision not Dialogue 250
  - 6 The Hidden Strengths of Weak-Form Review 258
  - 7 Conclusion 264
- 9 Calibrated Constitutional Review 266
  - 1 Introduction: Between Abdication and Usurpation 266
  - 2 Courts as Quality-Control 267
  - 3 Mapping the Contours of Comity 272
  - 4 Calibrated Constitutional Review 277
  - 5 Courting Counter-Terrorism 281
  - 6 Proportionality in Partnership 287
  - 7 Conclusion 294
- 10 Courting Collaborative Constitutionalism 297
  - 1 Introduction 297
  - 2 Legislative Leeway at the End of Life 298
  - 3 Proportionality and Political Process Review 302
  - 4 Avoiding Pre-emption 308
  - 5 Court as Catalyst, Judge as Nudge 311
    - a Alerts, Prods, and Pleas 312
    - b Judicial Advice and Soft Suggestions 314
    - c Judicial Warnings 319
  - 6 Stepping in Where Parliament Fears to Tread 322
  - 7 From Passive Virtues to Collaborative Devices 327
  - 8 Conclusion 329

## PART IV RESPONSIVE LEGISLATURES

- 11 Underuse of the Override 333
  - 1 Great Expectations 333
  - 2 Canada in Context 337
  - 3 Reconciling Rights and Democracy UK-Style 344
  - 4 Underuse by Design not Demonisation 346

- 5 From Dialogue and Disagreement to Comity and Collaboration 353
- 6 The Upshot of Understanding the Override 357
- 7 Conclusion 360
- 12 Declarations, Obligations, Collaborations 363
  - 1 Introduction 363
  - 2 Uncovering Conventions 364
    - a What Are Conventions? 364
    - b Regular Practice 365
    - c Normative Obligation 367

- 3 Patterns of Political Response 368
- 4 Institutionalising a Compliance-Oriented Approach 370
- 5 Willing Compliance, Workaday Acceptance 372
- 6 An Open and Welcoming Response 376
- 7 Courting Controversy 379
  - a When Life Means Life 380
  - b Courting Counter-Terrorism 383
  - c Rhetoric, Resistance, and Registering Sex Offenders 386
  - d Political Wrangling about Prisoner Voting 391
- 8 A Convention to Comply with Declarations of Incompatibility? 397
- 9 Conclusion 400

# Conclusion: The Currency of Collaboration 403 1 Collaborative Leitmotivs 403

- 2 Broadening the Collaborative Horizon 408
- 3 Collaboration as Currency 411

Bibliography 417 Index 486