

Contents

1	Introduction	1
1.1	What Are [Systematic] Literature Reviews About?	2
1.2	Brief History of Systematic Reviews	3
1.3	Addressing Variety in Literature Reviews	5
1.3.1	Variety in Types of Literature Reviews	5
1.3.2	Specific Approaches for Disciplines	7
1.4	Scope and Outline of Book	7
1.4.1	What Does the Book Cover	8
1.4.2	What Does the Book Not Cover	9
1.4.3	Part I: Basic Concepts for Effective Literature Reviews	9
1.4.4	Part II: Quantitative Analysis and Synthesis	11
1.4.5	Part III: Qualitative Analysis and Synthesis	12
1.4.6	Part IV: Reporting Literature Reviews	13
1.4.7	Epilogue	14
1.5	How to Use This Book?	14
1.5.1	Type of Study and Use	14
1.5.2	Structure of Chapters	17
1.5.3	Informed Choices for Undertaking and Assessing Literature Reviews	18
1.6	Key Points for Book	18
	References	19

Part I Basic Concepts for Effective Literature Reviews

2	Objectives and Positioning of [Systematic] Literature Reviews	25
2.1	Literature Sensitivity and Professional Knowledge	26
2.2	Research Processes and Literature Reviews	27

2.2.1	Basic Research Processes	27
2.2.2	Where Literature is Used and How in Empirical Studies	29
2.2.3	Solving Practical Problems and Use of Literature	32
2.3	Evaluating Literature	32
2.3.1	Difference Between Critical Evaluation and Critiquing	33
2.3.2	Elements of Appraisals	33
2.4	Synthesising Literature	35
2.5	Archetypes of Literature Reviews	36
2.5.1	Narrative Overviews	37
2.5.2	Narrative Reviews	39
2.5.3	Systematic Literature Reviews	40
2.5.4	Systematic Reviews	41
2.5.5	Umbrella Reviews	42
2.6	Propositional Logic and Literature Reviews	42
2.6.1	Brief Introduction to Propositional Logic	43
2.6.2	Overview of Literature Reviews Related to Propositional Logic	45
2.7	Research Paradigms and Literature Reviews	46
2.8	Avoiding Plagiarism	49
2.9	Key Points	51
2.10	How to ...?	53
2.10.1	... Select an Appropriate Approach to a Literature Review?	53
2.10.2	... Evaluate Which Studies Are of Interest for a Review	53
2.10.3	... Avoid Plagiarism	54
2.10.4	... Write a Literature Review	54
	References	54
3	Quality of Literature Reviews	57
	co-authored by Harm-Jan Steenhuis	
3.1	Quality Based on Fitness for Purpose as Frame of Reference for Literature Reviews	58
3.2	Quality Based on Archetypes of Literature Reviews	60
3.2.1	Narrative Overview	60
3.2.2	Narrative Review	64
3.2.3	Systematic Literature Review	66
3.2.4	Systematic Review	69
3.2.5	Relating the Archetypes to Quality of the Review	70
3.2.6	Criteria for Systematic Literature Reviews and Systematic Reviews	73

3.3	Associating Research Paradigms with Literature Reviews	74
3.3.1	Distinguishing Between Idiographic and Nomothetic Research	74
3.3.2	Background to Research Paradigms	75
3.3.3	(Post)Positivist Perspectives and Archetypes of Literature Reviews	78
3.3.4	Interpretivist Perspectives and Archetypes of Literature Reviews	81
3.3.5	Extending the Interpretivist Approach to Academic Mastery	85
3.3.6	Hermeneutic Perspectives on Literature Reviews	87
3.4	Quality by Effectively Linking Literature Reviews to Empirical Studies	90
3.5	Quality by Evidencing Engagement with Consulted Studies	93
3.5.1	Close Reading	94
3.5.2	Achieving Rigour for Citations-In-Text	95
3.6	Key Points	98
3.7	How to	99
3.7.1	... Evaluate the Quality of a Literature Review	99
3.7.2	... Achieve a Higher Degree of Accuracy in Literature Reviews	100
3.7.3	... Write Literature Reviews	100
	References	101
4	Developing Review Questions	107
4.1	Differentiating Research Objectives and Review Questions	108
4.2	What Are Good Questions for a Literature Review?	110
4.2.1	Guiding Collection and Analysis of Literature	110
4.2.2	Single Guiding Question as Point of Reference	110
4.2.3	Narrowly Focused	111
4.2.4	Clarity of Good Review Questions	111
4.2.5	Assuming Possibility of Different Outcomes or Opinions	112
4.2.6	Building on Sound Assumptions	114
4.3	Starting Points for Review Questions	114
4.3.1	From Generic to Specific and Vice Versa	114
4.3.2	Establishing Causation	116
4.3.3	Testing and Falsification of Theories	117
4.3.4	Considering the Spatial Dimension	118
4.3.5	Considering the Temporal Dimension	118
4.3.6	Artefacts, Methods and Tools	119
4.3.7	Setting and Evaluating Policy	119
4.3.8	Investigating Assumptions	120
4.3.9	Rigour and Reliability	121

4.4	Population-Intervention-[Comparison]-Outcome	122
4.4.1	Root Format Population-Intervention-Outcome	122
4.4.2	Format Population-Intervention-Comparison-Outcome and Other Variants	123
4.4.3	Enhancing Population-Intervention-Outcome by Using Models	126
4.4.4	Using Theories and Laws of Observed Regularities	131
4.5	Scoping Study for Review Questions	132
4.5.1	Scoping Review as Protocol-Driven Literature Review	132
4.5.2	Scoping Study for Topical Mapping	136
4.6	Key Points	136
4.7	How to ...?	138
4.7.1	... Develop Review Questions That Are Worthwhile	138
4.7.2	... Conduct and Time a Scoping Review or Scoping Study	139
4.7.3	... Write a Literature Review	140
	References	140
5	Search Strategies for [Systematic] Literature Reviews	145
	co-authored by Lynn Irvine	
5.1	Criteria for Retrieving Publications	146
5.2	Types of Sources	150
5.2.1	Primary Sources	150
5.2.2	Secondary Sources	152
5.2.3	Tertiary Sources	152
5.2.4	Propositional Writings	153
5.2.5	Professional Publications	153
5.2.6	Other Types of Publications and Sources	153
5.3	Iterative Search Strategy	154
5.4	Keywords, Controlled Vocabulary and Database Search Strategies	159
5.4.1	Defining Keywords as Search Terms	159
5.4.2	Search Operators	164
5.4.3	Field Searching	166
5.4.4	Controlled Vocabulary	167
5.4.5	Selecting Databases	168
5.4.6	Using Databases and Search Engines	170
5.4.7	On Using Publishers' Databases	172
5.5	Other Search Strategies	172
5.5.1	Hand Searching	172

5.5.2	Snowballing	174
5.5.3	Backward and Forward Searching	174
5.5.4	Root and Branch Searches	175
5.5.5	Citation Pearl Growing	176
5.5.6	Expert Panels	177
5.6	Enhancing Effectiveness of Search Strategies	178
5.6.1	Determining Saturation When Searching	178
5.6.2	Trading Off Specificity and Sensitivity	180
5.6.3	Complementary Search Strategies	182
5.6.4	Expert Panels	184
5.7	Grey Literature	184
5.8	Undertaking the Search and Recording Results	188
5.9	Scoping Reviews and Scoping Studies for Search Strategy	190
5.10	Key Points	191
5.11	How to ...?	193
5.11.1	... Set an Appropriate Search Strategy	193
5.11.2	... Determine Which Type of Sources to Consider	193
5.11.3	... Write a Literature Review	193
	References	194
6	Setting Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria	201
6.1	Filtering for Relevant Sources	202
6.2	Inclusion Criteria	203
6.2.1	Content	203
6.2.2	Date of Publication	204
6.2.3	Language	205
6.2.4	Types of Source	206
6.2.5	Research Design and Method	206
6.2.6	Sampling	207
6.2.7	Data Analysis	207
6.3	Exclusion Criteria	208
6.4	Quality of Evidence	210
6.4.1	Hierarchy of Evidence Pyramid—Systematic Reviews	211
6.4.2	GRADE: Grading of Recommendations, Assessment, Development and Evaluations	213
6.4.3	Quality of Evidence for Qualitative Analysis and Synthesis	219
6.5	Determining Level of Evidence for Other Archetypes	220
6.6	Scoping Reviews and Scoping Studies for Setting Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria	223
6.7	Key Points	226

6.8	How to ...?	228
6.8.1	... Set Effective Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria	228
6.8.2	... Evaluate the Quality of Evidence in Studies	228
6.8.3	... Write a Literature Review	228
	References	229

Part II Quantitative Analysis and Synthesis

7	Principles of Meta-Analysis	237
7.1	Introduction to Meta-Analysis	238
7.2	Basics of Meta-Analysis	240
7.2.1	Conditions for Applicability	240
7.2.2	Use of Data in Meta-Analysis	242
7.2.3	Process for Meta-Analysis	244
7.3	Identifying and Coding Variables and Attributes for Inclusion in Meta-Analysis	247
7.4	Models for Calculating Effect Sizes	250
7.4.1	Common-Effect Models	251
7.4.2	Fixed-Effects Models	252
7.4.3	Random-Effects Models	254
7.4.4	Mixed-Effects Models	256
7.4.5	Meta-Regression	258
7.5	Common Measures for Effect Size Used in Meta-Analysis	260
7.5.1	Standardised Mean Difference	261
7.5.2	Weighted Mean Difference	263
7.5.3	Odds Ratio and Risk Ratio	263
7.5.4	Correlation Coefficients, Proportions and Standardised Gain Scores (Change Scores)	265
7.6	Methods for Meta-Analysis	266
7.7	Determining Between-Study Heterogeneity	268
7.7.1	Distinguishing Types of Between-Study Heterogeneity	269
7.7.2	Determining Statistical Heterogeneity	270
7.7.3	Forest Plot	274
7.7.4	Funnel Plot	276
7.7.5	L'Abbé Plot	278
7.7.6	(Galbraith) Radial Plot	280
7.8	Publication Bias and Sensitivity Analysis	282
7.8.1	Assessing Publication Bias	283
7.8.2	Sensitivity Analysis	285
7.9	Assessing Quality of Meta-Analysis	286
7.10	Key Points	288

7.11	How to ...?	291
7.11.1	... Choose the Most Appropriate Statistical Method for Meta-Analysis	291
7.11.2	... Write A Literature Review	292
	References	292
8	Meta-Analysis in Action: The Cochrane Collaboration	299
8.1	Background	299
8.2	Cochrane Collaboration	300
8.3	Cochrane Reviews	301
8.3.1	Question Choice	301
8.3.2	Identifying Relevant Studies	302
8.3.3	Analysing Results	303
8.3.4	Potential Sources of Bias	303
8.3.5	Biases in the Systematic Review Process	303
8.3.6	Analysing Data (Including Meta-Analysis)	304
8.3.7	Alternatives to Meta-Analysis	305
8.3.8	Summary of Findings	305
8.3.9	Drawing Conclusions	306
8.4	Example of a Cochrane Review	308
8.4.1	Organised in Patient (Stroke Unit) Care	308
8.5	Advantages of Cochrane Reviews	309
8.5.1	What Features Indicate that Cochrane Reviews Are Reliable?	310
8.6	Challenges for the Cochrane Collaboration	310
8.7	Key Points	311
	References	311
9	Other Quantitative Methods	313
9.1	Network Meta-Analysis: Making More Than One Comparison	314
9.1.1	Key Considerations in Network Meta-Analysis	314
9.1.2	Example of Network Meta-Analysis	316
9.2	Best-Evidence Synthesis	319
9.2.1	Conducting Best-Evidence Synthesis	320
9.2.2	Example: Exercise Prescription for Treating Shoulder Pathology	321
9.2.3	Example: Students' Learning with Effective Learning Techniques	323
9.2.4	Strengths and Weaknesses of Best-Evidence Synthesis	324
9.3	Qualitative Modelling of Causal Relationships	327

9.4	Bibliometric Analysis	330
9.4.1	Purpose of Bibliometric Analysis	331
9.4.2	Conducting Bibliometric Analysis	333
9.4.3	Caveats of Bibliometric Analysis	335
9.4.4	Complementing Bibliometric Analysis	336
9.5	Systematic Quantitative Literature Reviews	336
	Authored by Catherine Pickering and Clare Morrison	
9.5.1	What is It?	337
9.5.2	It is Systematic	337
9.5.3	Quantifying Literature	340
9.5.4	Methods for Analysis and Displaying Results	342
9.5.5	Conclusions	344
9.6	Key Points	344
	References	345

Part III Qualitative Analysis and Synthesis

10	Principles of Qualitative Synthesis	353
	co-authored by Lisa Kidd	
10.1	Differentiating Qualitative Synthesis from Quantitative Synthesis	354
10.2	Purpose of Qualitative Synthesis	356
10.2.1	Aggregative Synthesis	357
10.2.2	Interpretive Synthesis	358
10.2.3	Supplementing Quantitative Synthesis	360
10.3	Selecting a Qualitative Review Approach	361
10.3.1	Overview of Methods for Qualitative Synthesis	361
10.3.2	Selecting a Method for Qualitative Synthesis	366
10.4	Qualitative Synthesis of Findings	374
10.4.1	Extraction of Data and Findings	376
10.4.2	Synthesising Findings	377
10.4.3	Software and Online Tools for Qualitative Synthesis	379
10.5	Quality Assessment for Qualitative Synthesis	379
10.5.1	Assessment of Quality of Studies in Qualitative Synthesis	379
10.5.2	Appraising Qualitative Synthesis	380
10.6	Key Points	381
10.7	How to ...?	382
10.7.1	... Undertake a Qualitative Synthesis	382
10.7.2	... Select the Most Appropriate Method for Qualitative Synthesis	382
10.7.3	... Write a Literature Review	383
	References	383

11	Methods for Qualitative Analysis and Synthesis	389
11.1	Meta-Summary: Aggregating Findings and Preparing for Meta-Synthesis	390
	Authored by Elisabeth Bergdahl	
11.1.1	Some Caution Before Starting	390
11.1.2	Qualitative Meta-Summary	391
11.1.3	Some Dos and Don'ts	393
11.1.4	Overview of Meta-Synthesis Versus Meta-aggregation	396
11.2	Thematic Analysis and Thematic Synthesis	396
	Authored by Margaret Bearman	
11.2.1	Thematic Analysis in Overview	398
11.2.2	Thematic Analysis Step-by-Step	399
11.2.3	Advantages and Disadvantages of Thematic Analysis as Qualitative Synthesis Approach	400
11.3	Meta-Ethnography	400
	Authored by Katie Robinson and Judi Pettigrew	
11.3.1	Seven Step Approach	401
11.3.2	Pros and Cons of Meta-Ethnography	403
11.4	Grounded Theory	404
	Authored by Parastou Donyai	
11.4.1	Basics of Grounded Theory Methodology	404
11.4.2	Grounded Theory Meta-Synthesis	406
11.4.3	Limitations	407
11.5	Discourse Analysis	408
	Authored by Dianna Dekelaita-Mullet	
11.5.1	Application of Discourse Analysis to Systematic Literature Reviews	408
11.5.2	Trustworthiness	410
11.6	Key Points	411
	References	411
12	Combining Quantitative and Qualitative Syntheses	417
12.1	Purpose of Mixed-Methods Synthesis	417
12.2	Approaches to Designs of Mixed-Methods Synthesis	419
12.3	Methods for Integrated Mixed-Methods Syntheses	423
12.3.1	Sequential Exploratory Method	423
12.3.2	Sequential Explanatory Method	425
12.3.3	Convergent Qualitative Method	427
12.3.4	Convergent Quantitative Method	429
12.4	Quality Criteria for Mixed-Methods Syntheses	431
12.5	Other Methods for Diversity in Mixed-Methods Synthesis	433
12.6	Key Points	434

12.7	How to ...?	435
12.7.1	... Select the Most Appropriate Method for Mixed-Methods Synthesis	435
12.7.2	... Write a Literature Review	435
	References	436

Part IV Presentation and Writing

13	Reporting Standards for Literature Reviews	441
13.1	Relevance of Adequate Reporting	442
13.2	Reporting Methods and Tools for Extraction of Data, Analysis and Synthesis	444
13.2.1	Methods	444
13.2.2	Protocols	446
13.2.3	Spreadsheets and Other Tools	447
13.2.4	Online Tools	447
13.3	Making Results and Findings Accessible	449
13.3.1	Annotated Bibliography	449
13.3.2	Chronological Reporting	450
13.3.3	Thematic Reporting	451
13.3.4	Tabulation and Visualisation	452
13.4	Formats for Reporting	453
13.4.1	PRISMA Reporting	453
13.4.2	Other Formats for Reporting	455
13.4.3	Domain-Specific Reporting Formats	456
13.5	What Not to be Reported	457
13.6	Key Points	458
13.7	How to ...?	458
13.7.1	... Report What is Needed	458
13.7.2	... Identify What Needs No Reporting	459
13.7.3	... Write a Literature Review	459
	References	460
14	Data Management and Repositories for Literature Reviews	465
14.1	Data Management for Literature Reviews	465
14.2	Processes for Data Management	467
14.3	Repositories for Systematic Reviews	470
14.3.1	The Campbell Collaboration	470
14.3.2	Cochrane Library	470
14.3.3	Environmental Evidence Library of Evidence Syntheses	471
14.3.4	EPPI Centre	472
14.3.5	JBI	472
14.3.6	PROSPERO	472

14.3.7	Systematic Review Data Repository	473
14.4	Other Repositories	473
14.4.1	Academic Libraries.....	473
14.4.2	Scholarly Journals	473
14.4.3	Funding Councils.....	474
14.5	Preparing Data Sets for Repositories	474
14.6	Literature Reviews and Data Repositories Enabling Open Science	474
14.7	Key Points	476
	References	476
15	Writing Literature Reviews.....	479
15.1	What Makes Writing Literature Reviews Different	479
15.2	Timing the Start of Writing	483
15.3	Getting to the Writing of Literature Reviews	484
15.4	Process of Writing	486
15.5	Gaining Proficiency in Writing	489
15.6	Improving Text Structure: Revisiting the Basics	491
	Authored by Pat Baxter	
15.6.1	Paragraphs	491
15.6.2	Sentences.....	492
15.6.3	Punctuation	493
15.6.4	Use of Aspirates.....	494
15.6.5	Vocabulary: Some Common Pitfalls	494
15.7	Avoiding Some Common Errors and Inaccuracies When Writing	496
	Authored by Pat Baxter	
15.7.1	How Can Accuracy in Writing Be Improved?	496
15.7.2	How Can Efficiency in Writing Be Improved?	497
15.7.3	Avoiding Common Mistakes.....	497
15.7.4	Added Value of Peer Review	498
15.8	Key Points	499
	References	500
16	Publishing Literature Reviews	503
16.1	When is a Literature Review Worth Publishing	504
16.1.1	‘So What?’ Test.....	504
16.1.2	Articulation of Contribution to Scholarly Knowledge	506
16.2	Selecting Journals	507
16.3	Final Preparation of Manuscript.....	511
16.3.1	Taking Advantage from Feedback by Peers	511
16.3.2	Making It Happen	513
16.3.3	Letter to the Editor.....	517

16.4	Processes of Submission and Review	518
16.4.1	Submission and Initial Check	518
16.4.2	Review by Journal	520
16.4.3	Decision by Editor	521
16.4.4	Processes After Acceptance.	521
16.4.5	Special Issues.	522
16.4.6	Publication Fees and Open Access	522
16.5	Review Processes	523
16.5.1	Double-Blind Peer Review Process	523
16.5.2	Single-Blind Peer Review Process	523
16.5.3	Open Peer Review Processes	524
16.5.4	Other Types of Review Processes	524
16.6	Revising the Manuscript	525
16.7	Key Points	526
	References	527

Epilogue

17	The Dissenting Voices	531
17.1	Literature Reviews as Activation	531
17.2	And Caution Nurtures Craftsmanship	533
17.3	Balancing the Approach to Literature Reviews for Those Starting Out	534
	References	535
	Correction to: Developing Review Questions	C1
	Appendix A: Generic, Specialist Databases and Search Engines	537
	Appendix B: List of Journals Publishing Only Literature Reviews	541
	Index	547