

# Contents

|                       |            |
|-----------------------|------------|
| <i>Foreword</i> ..... | <i>vii</i> |
|-----------------------|------------|

|                                                             |    |
|-------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| 1. Introduction .....                                       | 1  |
| I. The Relevance of Judicial Avoidance.....                 | 2  |
| II. The Legitimacy Questions.....                           | 11 |
| III. The Approach: Answering the Legitimacy Questions ..... | 14 |

## PART I

### FIRST LEGITIMACY QUESTION: ARE JUDICIAL AVOIDANCE PRACTICES LEGITIMATE?

|                                                                     |    |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| 2. Judicial Avoidance: A Matter of Competence .....                 | 19 |
| I. A Decision Reflecting the Competence of Courts .....             | 20 |
| II. Competence and Normativity.....                                 | 22 |
| III. Conclusion.....                                                | 25 |
| 3. Judicial Avoidance and the Rule of Law .....                     | 27 |
| I. Competence Norms and the Right to Access to Justice.....         | 28 |
| II. Instances of Avoidance and the Right to Access to Justice ..... | 34 |
| III. Conclusion: Answering the First Legitimacy Question.....       | 35 |

## PART II

### SECOND LEGITIMACY QUESTION: THE METHODOLOGY FOR LEGITIMATE JUDICIAL AVOIDANCE

|                                                                     |    |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| 4. Competence as Rules and Principles.....                          | 41 |
| I. Definite and Prima Facie Commands .....                          | 41 |
| II. Judicial Avoidance and Discretion .....                         | 42 |
| III. Conclusion: Judicial Avoidance and Formal Principles.....      | 46 |
| 5. Judicial Avoidance and the Balancing Method.....                 | 48 |
| I. Balancing Formal Principles: The Different Balancing Models..... | 53 |
| II. The Separation Model Adequacy.....                              | 56 |
| III. Formal Balancing and its Relation to Substantive Elements..... | 59 |
| IV. The Adequacy and Advantages of the Balancing Method .....       | 61 |
| V. Conclusion.....                                                  | 64 |

|      |                                                                                        |    |
|------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| 6.   | Balancing Specificities in Judicial Avoidance .....                                    | 65 |
| I.   | The Balancing Types .....                                                              | 66 |
| II.  | The Relationship between the Instances of Avoidance<br>and the Balancing Methods ..... | 67 |
| III. | Three Main Differences .....                                                           | 69 |
| IV.  | Factors in Formal Balancing .....                                                      | 76 |
| V.   | Conclusion.....                                                                        | 86 |

PART III  
INSTANCES OF AVOIDANCE  
AND LEGITIMATE PRACTICE

|      |                                                                  |     |
|------|------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 7.   | Admissibility Control: Establishing the Courts' Competence ..... | 93  |
| I.   | Justiciability as Conflict of Competences .....                  | 95  |
| II.  | Analysing the First Instance of Avoidance.....                   | 98  |
| III. | Conclusion.....                                                  | 108 |
| 8.   | Merits Avoidance: The Degree of the Courts' Scrutiny .....       | 110 |
| I.   | The Margin of Appreciation Doctrine .....                        | 113 |
| II.  | The Procedural Approach in the ECtHR.....                        | 122 |
| III. | The Legitimate Framework in the ECtHR Practice .....             | 134 |
| IV.  | Conclusion.....                                                  | 142 |
| 9.   | Concluding Remarks .....                                         | 143 |
|      | <i>Bibliography</i> .....                                        | 145 |
|      | <i>Index</i> .....                                               | 151 |