Contents

Table of Cases xi

1. Introduction 1
   1. The abuse of constitutional identity 1
   2. The rise of constitutional identity 2
   3. Constitutional identity in the European Union 5
   4. Constitutional 'identity politics' 6
   5. Illiberal misappropriations 8
   6. Displacing identity 11
   7. The frame: constitutional identity *abuse* 12
   8. Structure of this book 16

2. Constitutional Identity in the European Union 21
   1. Introduction 21
   2. Constitutional pluralism 22
   3. Constitutional identity before Lisbon 24
      3.1 First intimations: *Solange* and *controlimiti* 24
      3.2 Constitutional identity in the Maastricht era 27
   4. Constitutional identity in the Lisbon era 28
      4.1 The Constitutional Treaty and the French and Spanish constitutional courts 28
      4.2 The German *Lisbon* judgment 29
      4.3 Constitutional identity review in East Central Europe 32
      4.4 Constitutional identity as a tool for constitutional contestation and dialogue 34
      4.5 The role of Article 4(2) TEU: relative primacy of EU law? 37
   5. A metaconstitutional argument 39
      5.1 The 'argument from constitutional identity' 41
      5.2 Problems with the argument 47
   6. Conclusion 49

3. Critiques of Constitutional Identity 51
   1. Introduction 51
   2. The viability of constitutional pluralism 51
      2.1 Constitutional pluralism and constitutional backsliding 54
   3. The critiques of constitutional identity 57
      3.1 The case of Hungary 58
      3.2 The case of Poland 59
      3.3 Constitutional identity: inherently dangerous? 61
      3.4 Abandon constitutional identity? 64

4. In defence of constitutional identity 65
4.1 Overstated conceptual critiques 66
4.2 Replacing identity with primacy? 70
4.3 A different conceptual frame for constitutional pluralism? 73
5. Constitutional identity abuse: a preview 76
5.1 Three dimensions of constitutional identity abuse 78

4. Generative Abuse of Constitutional Identity 83
1. Introduction 83
2. Constitutional identity and constituent power 85
2.1 Constitutional identity as the decision of the constituent power 86
2.2 Constitutional identity and the constraints of constituent power 88
2.3 From static to dynamic constitutional identity 91
3. The 2011 Hungarian constitution 93
3.1 The 'roundtable constitution' of 1989 and the unfinished revolution 94
3.2 The 'Fundamental Law' of 2011 96
4. Constitutional identity and constitutional change 101
4.1 Amending constitutional identity 103
4.2 Constitutional identity and constitutional instrumentalism 104
4.3 The Fourth Amendment 106
4.4 Commandeering constitutional identity: the Seventh and Ninth Amendments 107
5. Constitutional identity and constitutional courts 110
6. Constitutional identity 'beyond the constitution' 112
6.1 Hungary's 'historical constitution': historicizing the constitution … 114
6.2 … and constitutionalizing history 116
7. Conclusion 118

5. Substantive Abuse of Constitutional Identity 121
1. Introduction 121
2. The 'constitution' in 'constitutional identity' 122
2.1 'Constitutionalism': conceptual expectations 124
2.2 'European constitutionalism': contextual expectations 130
2.3 Collapsing constitutional identity into constitutionalism? 133
2.4 Conclusion 135
3. 'Illiberal democracy' as constitutional identity 136
3.1 Rejecting liberalism and embracing 'identity'? 138
3.2 Collapsing 'constitutionalism' into 'constitutional identity'? 141
4. Social homogeneity and the human dignity of refugees 143
4.1 Hungary's refugee policy since 2015 144
4.2 The invocation of constitutional identity 146
4.3 Constitutional identity and social homogeneity 148
4.4 The human dignity of refugees 152
5. The Polish judiciary capture 154
5.1 The Polish 'reforms' of the judiciary since 2015 155

5.2 European challenges to the judiciary capture 157
5.3 The constitutional identity defence 158
5.4 Constitutional identity, constitutionalism, and the rule of law 161
6. Conclusion 166

6. Relational Abuse of Constitutional Identity 169
1. Introduction 169
2. The importance of the relational 170
2.1 Constitutional ironism 171
2.2 Constitutional identity and 'relative authority' 173
2.3 Relational requirements 176
2.4 Substantive implications 178
2.5 Conflict 179
3. Relationality in practice 181
3.1 Openness to, and normative compatibility with, European law 181
3.2 Dialogue and good faith 182
3.3 The *Taricco* case: a blueprint for judicial dialogue 184
4. Intimations of relational abuse 185
4.1 The *Slovak Pensions* case 186
4.2 The case law of the German Constitutional Court: from barking to biting 187
5. Constitutional solipsism 191
5.1 From judicial dialogue to internal monologue: the case of Hungary 193
5.2 Politically mandated disengagement: the case of Poland 194
5.3 A function of authoritarianism 197
6. Conclusion 198

7. Conclusion 201
1. Three dimensions of constitutional identity abuse 201
2. Beyond the European Union 204
3. Rethinking constitutional identity 206
4. What now? 207

Index 211