

# Contents

<b>Foreword</b>	<b>xv</b>
<i>Roumeen Islam</i>	
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
<i>Bob Nakamura</i>	
The Distribution of Oversight Tools and Implications	2
Oversight and the Budget Process	3
A Study of Countries' Experiences	5
<b>I. OVERVIEW</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>1. Tools for Legislative Oversight: An Empirical Investigation</b>	<b>9</b>
<i>Riccardo Pelizzo and Rick Stapenhurst</i>	
The Distribution of Oversight Tools and the Potential for Oversight	13
Forms of Government and Oversight Tools	15
Oversight Tools and Income Level	15
Oversight Tools and Level of Democracy	19
Conclusions	20
Annex: Oversight and Democracy	22
Notes	26
Bibliography	27
<b>2. Oversight and Democracy Reconsidered</b>	<b>29</b>
<i>Riccardo Pelizzo</i>	
Legislative Oversight: Causes and Consequences	30
Democracy and Oversight: A Disputed Relationship	32
Tools of Oversight and Democracy: Evidence of Efficacy	40

Conclusion	43
Notes	45
Bibliography	46
<b>II. OVERSIGHT AND THE BUDGET PROCESS</b>	<b>49</b>
<b>3. The Legislature and the Budget</b>	<b>51</b>
<i>Rick Stapenhurst</i>	
The Legislature and the Budget Ex Ante	53
The Legislature and the Budget Ex Post	57
Conclusions	61
Notes	63
Bibliography	63
<b>4. Budgets – An Accountant’s Perspective</b>	<b>67</b>
<i>Kerry Jacobs</i>	
The Secret Art of Budgeting	69
Budgets and Control	69
Beyond Budgets	72
Budget and Performance Centers	73
Implications for Parliamentary Oversight	75
Conclusion	76
Note	77
Bibliography	77
<b>5. Assessing the Power of the Purse: An Index of Legislative Budget Institutions</b>	<b>79</b>
<i>Joachim Wehner</i>	
Variables	81
Data	84
Construction of the Index	86
Discussion and Analysis	88
Conclusions	91
Annex	92
Notes	94
Bibliography	94
<b>6. The Role of the Legislature in the Budget Drafting Process: A Comparative Review</b>	<b>99</b>
<i>Katherine Barraclough and Bill Dorotinsky</i>	
Recommendations of International Good Practices	99
Early Release of Budget Information	100
The Role of the Legislature	105
Parliamentary versus Presidential Systems	108
Conclusion	109

Notes	110
Bibliography	110
<b>7. A Note on What Happens if No Budget Is Passed before the Fiscal Year Begins</b>	<b>111</b>
<i>Bill Dorotinsky</i>	
Presidential versus Parliamentary Systems	113
Notes	114
<b>8. Public Accounts Committees</b>	<b>117</b>
<i>Riccardo Pelizzo and Rick Stapenhurst</i>	
Public Accounts Committees (PACs)	118
Roles and Functions of PACs	119
The Success of PACs	120
Conclusions	127
Notes	127
Bibliography	128
<b>9. The Value of a Nonpartisan, Independent, Objective Analytical Unit to the Legislative Role in Budget Preparation</b>	<b>131</b>
<i>Barry Anderson</i>	
Potential Value	132
Core Functions	133
Fundamental Characteristics	136
Examples of Independent Budget Units	136
Conclusions	138
Notes	138
Bibliography	138
<b>10. Legislative Budget Offices: International Experience</b>	<b>141</b>
<i>John K. Johnson and Rick Stapenhurst</i>	
Examples of Specialized Legislative Budget Offices	142
Independent Budget Office Issues	151
Conclusion	156
Notes	156
Bibliography	157
<b>III. COUNTRY CASE STUDIES</b>	<b>159</b>
<b>11. Administrative Review and Oversight: The Experience of Postcommunist Legislatures</b>	<b>161</b>
<i>David M. Olson</i>	
Oversight in the Polish Sejm	161
Resources for Parliamentary Review of Administration	163

Contexts of State, Power, and Time	167
Concluding Observations	169
Bibliography	169
<b>12. Separation of Powers and Legislative Oversight in Russia</b>	<b>173</b>
<i>Thomas F. Remington</i>	
Oversight	174
Budget Control	176
Conclusions	180
Notes	181
Bibliography	182
<b>13. Administrative Review and Oversight: The Experience of Westminster</b>	<b>183</b>
<i>Mark Shephard</i>	
Challenges to Reforming Parliamentary Effectiveness	183
Oversight and Effectiveness in the Westminster Parliament	184
Select Committees	187
Notes	190
Bibliography	190
<b>14. Explaining Patterns of Oversight in Brazilian Subnational Governments</b>	<b>193</b>
<i>Scott W. Desposato</i>	
Institutions Shaping Legislative Oversight	194
How Change Can Happen	197
Notes	200
Bibliography	200
<b>15. Evolving Patterns of Legislative Oversight in Indonesia</b>	<b>201</b>
<i>Edward Schneier</i>	
The Evolving Structure and Roles of the Indonesian Legislature	203
The Tools of Oversight	204
The Special Case of the Military	209
Constitutional Change and Continuing Realities	210
Notes	213
Bibliography	213
<b>16. Legislative Oversight and the Israeli Committee System: Problems and Solutions</b>	<b>217</b>
<i>Chen Friedberg</i>	
The Knesset and Its Oversight Role	217
The Parliamentary Committee System in the Knesset	218

Conclusions	226
Bibliography	227
<b>17. Parliamentary Oversight of Defense in South Africa</b>	<b>229</b>
<i>Robert J. Griffiths</i>	
The Establishment of Parliamentary Defense Oversight	230
The Strategic Defense Procurement Package and Parliamentary Oversight	232
The Implications for Defense Oversight	235
Postscript	238
Notes	239
Bibliography	239
<b>18. Keeping a Watchful Eye? Parliaments and the Politics of Budgeting in Latin America</b>	<b>243</b>
<i>Carlos Santiso</i>	
Parliaments and Budget Governance	244
Parliaments and Financial Reform	245
Benefits of Centralization	246
Risks of Centralization	248
Parliaments and Public Budgeting	250
Legal Powers	251
Institutional Capacities	256
Political Incentives	257
Conclusions: Politics of Public Budgeting	261
Notes	262
Bibliography	263
<b>19. Does Parliament Make a Difference? The Role of the Italian Parliament in Financial Policy</b>	<b>267</b>
<i>Carolyn Forestiere and Riccardo Pelizzo</i>	
Institutional Theories	268
Party System Theories	269
The Italian Parliament	269
Data Analysis	272
Conclusions	275
Notes	275
Bibliography	276
<b>20. Legislative Budgeting in the Czech Republic</b>	<b>279</b>
<i>Zdenka Mansfeldová and Petra Rakušanová</i>	
Procedures for Approving the State Budget	279
Changes in the Rules of Procedure	280
Bargaining Process	280
Political Negotiations of the Draft of the State Budget	281

Deputies: Attitudes and Voting	282	
The Budget Committee	283	
Supreme Audit Office	285	
Trends, Indicators, and Explanatory Factors	286	
Control Functions of the Budget Committee	287	
Conclusion	289	
Notes	290	
Bibliography	291	
<b>21. Budget Accountability and Legislative Oversight in Transition: The Case of Post-Suharto Indonesia</b>	<b>293</b>	
<i>Vishnu Juwono and Sebastian Eckardt</i>		
Democratization and the Evolving Political Role of Indonesia's Parliament		
Post-Suharto	294	
Internal Organization of the DPR	296	
Parliament and the Budget Process	298	
Conclusion	305	
Notes	306	
Bibliography	308	
<b>22. Establishment of Uganda's Parliamentary Budget Office and Parliamentary Budget Committee</b>	<b>311</b>	
<i>Hon. Beatrice Birungi Kiraso</i>		
The Structure of the Parliament of Uganda and the New Budget Committee	312	
The Parliamentary Budget Office	313	
The Budget Cycle	316	
The Successes	319	
Challenges	320	
Annex: Parliamentary Budget Office (PBO) Initial Structure	322	
<b>Conclusions</b>		
<b>Legislatures and Administration in Oversight and Budgets: Constraints, Means, and Executives</b>	<b>323</b>	
<i>David M. Olson</i>		
Oversight as Concept	323	
Constitution and Power Distribution	325	
Organization, Procedures, and Members of Parliaments	326	
Contexts, Time, and Executives	328	
Bibliography	330	
<b>Boxes</b>		
Box 3.1	Brazilian Congress and the Budget Process	54
Box 3.2	Ghana's Parliament and Introducing Value Added Tax	55
Box 3.3	The Polish Parliament's Budget Research Office	57

Box 3.4	Enhancing Financial Transparency by Broadening Access to Information	59
Box 3.5	Analyzing the Political Context	62
Box 13.1	Objectives and Tasks for Scrutiny Committees	189
Box 21.1	The Role of the House of Regional Representatives (DPD) in the Budget Process	300
Box 21.2	Budget for Sale: The Role of Budget Brokers	303

## Figures

Figure 3.1	Heart of Executive-Legislative Relations: The Budget Process	53
Figure 3.2	Fiduciary Obligation	58
Figure 4.1	Model of a Controlled Process	70
Figure 5.1	Index of Legislative Budget Institutions	89
Figure 18.1	Governance of the Budget	245
Figure 18.2	Budget Institutions and Fiscal Discipline in Latin America, 2000	248
Figure 18.3	Reform Path of Budget Institutions in Latin America, 1990–2005	250
Figure 18.4	Index of Legislative Budgeting in Latin America, 2003	251
Figure 21.1	Responsibilities in the Public Expenditure Management Cycle	300

## Tables

Table 1.1	The Tools of Legislative Oversight	10
Table 1.2	Use of Oversight Tools, by Number of Respondents	14
Table 1.3	Number of Legislative Oversight Tools Used by Surveyed Countries	14
Table 1.4	Tools of Legislative Oversight, by Form of Government	15
Table 1.5a	Number of Legislative Oversight Tools, by Form of Government and Country	16
Table 1.5b	Number of Oversight Tools, by Form of Government	16
Table 1.6	Number of Oversight Tools, by Income Level	17
Table 1.7	Use of Committee Hearings, by Income Level	17
Table 1.8	Use of Hearings in Plenary Sitings, by Income Level	17
Table 1.9	Use of Questions, by Income Level	18
Table 1.10	Use of Question Time, by Income Level	18
Table 1.11	Use of Interpellation, by Income Level	18
Table 1.12	Use of Committees of Inquiry, by Income Level	19
Table 1.13	Presence of Ombudsman as Oversight Tool, by Income Level	19
Table 1.14	Number of Oversight Tools, by Level of Democracy	20
Annex Table 1	Number of Oversight Tools and the Probability That a Country Is Formally Democratic	23
Annex Table 2	Number of Oversight Tools and the Probability That a Country Is Liberal Democratic	24
Table 2.1	Correlation Analysis of Level of Democracy and Oversight Tools	32
Table 2.2	Logistic Regression, with Formal Democratic Status as a Dependent Variable	33
Table 2.3	Logistic Regression, with Liberal Democracy as a Dependent Variable	33
Table 2.4	Oversight Tools, Income Level, and Democracy	34

Table 2.5	Oversight Tools, Income Level, and Democracy in Africa	34
Table 2.6a	Number of Oversight Acts in Italy's Legislature—Chamber of Deputies, 1976 to 2001	36
Table 2.6b	Number of Oversight Acts from the 7th to the 13th Italian Senate	37
Table 2.7a	The Upward Trend in Oversight Acts—Chamber of Deputies	38
Table 2.7b	The Upward Trend in Oversight Acts—Senate	38
Table 2.8a	Interpellations Directed to the Ministry of Budget from the Chamber	38
Table 2.8b	Interpellations Directed to the Ministry of Budget from the Senate	39
Table 2.9a	Interpellations Addressed to the Foreign Affairs Ministry from the Chamber of Deputies	39
Table 2.9b	Interpellations to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, from the Senate	40
Table 2.10	Effectiveness of Oversight Tools in the 14th Legislature	41
Table 2.11	Logit Models, with Oversight Tools and Democracy	41
Table 3.1	Legislatures' Powers to Amend the Budget	56
Table 5.1	Spearman Correlations between Indices	87
Table 5.2	Comparison of Budget-Amending and Non-Budget-Amending Legislatures	90
Annex Table 1	Data for the Index and Amendment Dummy	92
Annex Table 2	Construction of Composite Variables	93
Table 6.1	When Does the Executive Release a Prebudget Statement to the Public?	101
Table 6.2	Does the Prebudget Statement Describe the Government's Macroeconomic and Fiscal Framework?	102
Table 6.3	Does the Prebudget Statement Describe the Government's Policies and Priorities That Will Guide the Development of Detailed Estimates for the Upcoming Budget?	103
Table 6.4	Are Any Arrangements in Place for the Legislature to Establish Aggregate Expenditure Ceilings before Beginning Debate on Individual Expenditure Items?	104
Table 6.5	In Practice, Does the Legislature Generally Approve the Budget as Presented by the Executive?	106
Table 6.6	Is There a Specialized Budget Research Organization Attached to the Legislature That Conducts Analyses of the Budget (Organization May Be Part of the Audit Office)?	106
Table 6.7	What Best Describes the Committee Structure for Dealing with the Budget?	107
Table 6.8	Does a Legislative Committee (Or Committees) Hold Public Hearings on the Macroeconomic and Fiscal Framework Presented in the Budget in Which Testimony from the Executive Branch and the Public Is Heard?	108
Table 6.9	Does the Executive Present More Details or Provide a Better Explanation of any Budget Proposal, if Members of the Legislature (Including from Minority Parties) Request Such Information?	109

Table 7.1	If the Budget Is Not Approved by the Legislature before the Start of the Fiscal Year, Which of the Following Describes the Consequences?	112
Table 7.2	Provisions for Spending in the Event No Budget Is Enacted before the Fiscal Year, by System of Government	113
Table 8.1	Results Achieved by the PAC: How Frequently Has the PAC Achieved the Following Result?	121
Table 8.2	Success and Composition of the PAC: How Important Is This Factor?	122
Table 8.3	Success and Powers of PACs: How Important Are These Factors?	123
Table 8.4	Answers to the Question: Are Practices and Procedures Important for the Success of a PAC?	124
Table 8.5	The Least Important Practices and Dynamics for the Success of the PAC	125
Table 9.1	Distribution of CBO Staff	135
Table 9.2	Staffing by Core Function	135
Table 10.1	Characteristics of Budget Offices Reviewed	155
Table 12.1	Federal Budget Laws, 1992–2002	176
Table 14.1	Government and Opposition Average Party Cohesion, 1991–98	196
Table 14.2	Estimated Veto Frequency, 1991–98	197
Table 18.1	Legislative Capabilities Index in Latin America (2005)	246
Table 18.2	Legal Framework of Budgetary Systems in Latin America, 2005	249
Table 18.3	Executive-Legislative Budget Relations in Latin America	252
Table 19.1	Italian Budget Laws for 1982 to 2001	273
Table 19.2	Regression Analyses	274
Table 20.1	Deputies' Perception of Importance of Individual Activities of the Parliament, 1993 to 2003	282
Table 20.2	Voting on the State Budgets in the 1st Electoral Term	283
Table 20.3	Voting on the State Budgets on the 2nd Electoral Term	283
Table 20.4	Voting on the State Budgets in the 3rd Electoral Term	283
Table 20.5	Voting on the State Budgets in the 4th Electoral Term	283
Table 20.6	Committees according to Their Prestige in the Chamber of Deputies of the Czech Republic	284
Table 20.7	Activity of the Budget Committee over Five Terms, 1990–2004	286
Table 20.8	Fulfillment of the State Budget between 1991 and 2003	288
Annex Table 20.1	The Composition of the Government and Its Support in the Parliament	290
Annex Table 20.2	Names of Political Parties in English and Czech and Their Czech Abbreviations	290
Table 21.1	Top 10 Political Parties in the 1999 and 2004 General Elections	295
Annex	DPR Sectoral Commissions and Their Government Working Counterparts	306