

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE	xiii
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	xiv
I INTRODUCTION	1
1. THE LEGAL SYLLOGISM	1
2. THE SEMANTIC NOTION OF LOGICAL VALIDITY	2
3. THE DEFEASIBILITY OF REASONING WITH RULES	3
1. Defeasibility and Modus Ponens	4
2. Reformulating the rule	4
3. Rules as means to draw conclusions	6
4. Similarity of structure	7
5. Adapting the premises	8
4. OVERVIEW OF THE BOOK	9
II OF REASONS	11
A. PHILOSOPHICAL ROOTS	11
1. RAZ ON REASONS	11
1. Reasons are facts	12
2. Complete reasons	12
3. Potential reasons and actual reasons	14
4. The strength of reasons	15
5. Cancelling conditions and exclusionary reasons	15
6. Exclusionary reasons and mandatory norms	19
7. Some conclusions about Raz's analysis of reasons	20
2. TOULMIN ON ARGUMENTATION	22
3. NAESS ON BALANCING REASONS	24
4. INSTITUTIONAL FACTS	25
1. Anscombe on brute facts	26
2. Searle on constitutive rules	27
3. Law as institutional fact	28
5. REASON-BASED FACTS	30
6. INTERNAL REALISM	31
7. A FINAL REMARK ON CONSTITUTION	34
B. A CAUSAL ACCOUNT OF REASONS	34
8. EXPLANATORY AND JUSTIFYING REASONS	35
9. GLORIA'S CAR	37
10. INTERRUPTIONS OF THE CONNECTION	38
1. Kinds of interruption	39
2. Consequences of the interruption	42
11. ADDITIONAL DEMANDS ON REASONS	43
1. Consciousness	43
2. Unwanted associations	44
12. SOME CHARACTERISTICS OF REASONS	45

C.	REASONS AND PRINCIPLES	46
13.	PERSONAL REASONS AND PERSONAL PRINCIPLES	46
1.	Personal reasons	46
2.	Personal principles	47
3.	Personal reasons and their consequences	48
14.	SOCIAL REASONS AND SOCIAL RULES	49
1.	Definitions	50
2.	Social rules and points of view	51
3.	The relation between personal principles and social rules	52
4.	The independence of social rules and reasons	53
5.	Exclusionary reasons, conflicting reasons, and social rules	54
15.	INSTITUTIONAL REASONS	54
1.	Institutional facts and institutional rules	55
2.	Validity and effectiveness of institutional rules	55
3.	Institutional rules and points of view	56
4.	The objectivity of institutional reasons	57
5.	The internal and the external perspective on rules	58
16.	PRINCIPLES AND REASONS	58
D.	KINDS OF REASONS	59
17.	CLASSIFICATORY REASONS AND RULES	61
1.	Classificatory rules	61
2.	Classification and evaluation	63
3.	The two levels of constitutive reasons	63
4.	The three functions of classificatory reasons	64
18.	DEONTIC REASONS, NORMS AND GOALS	65
1.	Deontic facts as a species of reason-based facts	65
2.	Some terminological issues	65
3.	Norms as opposed to deontic facts	66
4.	Goals and norms	67
5.	Weak and strong permissions	68
6.	The four functions of deontic reasons	68
7.	Digression: the truth conditions of deontic sentences	70
19.	ANANKASTIC REASONS	70
1.	The three functions of anankastic reasons	71
2.	Anankastic rules and laws of nature	72
20.	EPISTEMIC REASONS AND RULES OF INFERENCE	73
1.	The four functions of epistemic reasons	73
2.	Rules of inference	75
21.	KINDS OF RULES AND POINTS OF VIEW	75
22.	SUMMARY	75

III	REASONING WITH RULES	78
1.	THE STONE ON THE HILL	79
1.	1. Description of the example	79
	2. Two ways to characterise the situation	80
	3. Physical principles and legal principles	82
2.	LEGAL RULES AND DESCRIPTIONS OF THE LAW	82
3.	THE ROLE OF EPISTEMIC AND CONSTITUTIVE REASONS IN ARGUMENTS	85
4.	THE TWO STEP-MODELS OF REASONING WITH PRINCIPLES AND RULES	86
5.	THE VALIDITY OF RULES, PRINCIPLES AND GOALS	89
	1. Points of view	89
	2. Validity of legal rules	91
	3. Validity of social rules	92
	4. Interpretation and classification	95
	5. Principles of interpretation	97
	6. The recognition of goals	98
	7. Kinds of goals	98
	8. Goals and principles	99
	9. Goals and subgoals	101
6.	THE CONSTITUTION OF REASONS	101
	1. The elementary case of reason constitution	101
	2. Alternative conditions	103
	3. Rules with negative or incompatible conclusions	103
	4. Goals	104
	5. Proving and classifying the facts	105
	6. Summary of the constitution of reasons	106
7.	THE EXCLUSION OF RULES	106
	1. The scope limitations of rules	107
	2. Conflict rules	109
8.	RULES, GOALS AND PRINCIPLES	110
9.	REASONS AGAINST APPLICATION OF A RULE	113
10.	THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN LEGAL RULES AND LEGAL PRINCIPLES	115
11.	ANALOGOUS APPLICATION OF A RULE	118
12.	E CONTRARIO 'APPLICATION' OF A RULE	121
13.	DEFEASIBILITY OF REASONING WITH RULES, GOALS AND PRINCIPLES	123
14.	WEIGHING REASONS	124
15.	DEONTIC COLLAPSE, DEONTIC INFLATION, AND THE SHIFTING BOUNDARIES OF RATIONALITY	126
16.	CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	128

IV	REASON-BASED LOGIC	130
1.	STATES OF AFFAIRS AND CASES	131
2.	RULES AND PRINCIPLES AS STRUCTURED LOGICAL INDIVIDUALS	134
3.	DERIVING REASONS FROM PRINCIPLES	137
4.	WEIGHING REASONS	139
5.	THE APPLICATION OF RULES	141
6.	THE LANGUAGE OF REASON-BASED LOGIC	144
7.	RULES OF INFERENCE	149
	1. A reservation	149
	2. Minimal entailment	149
	3. The rules	150
8.	VALID CONCLUSIONS	153
	1. Extensions of an RBL-theory	153
	2. The number of extensions of a theory	155
9.	THE RELATION BETWEEN FIRST ORDER PREDICATE LOGIC AND REASON-BASED LOGIC	158
V	APPLICATIONS OF REASON-BASED LOGIC	159
1.	RULE APPLICATION	159
	1. The theory and its conclusion	159
	2. The non-constructiveness of rule R4	160
	3. The derivation that a rule applies	161
	4. Observations on normal rule application	162
2.	WEIGHING REASONS	163
	1. An example	163
	2. Accrual of reasons	164
3.	ELEMENTARY GOAL-BASED REASONING	165
4.	THE EXCLUSION OF RULES	166
	1. Undercutters and the scope of rules	166
	2. Rebuttals	167
5.	A DEONTIC EXTENSION OF REASON-BASED LOGIC	169
6.	LEGAL RULES, GOALS AND PRINCIPLES	170
	1. Replacing reasons	170
	2. Example 1: The procession	171
	3. Example 2: The transfer of the stolen book	174
7.	A COMPLEX CASE OF UNDERCUTTERS	177
8.	CONFLICT RULES	180
	1. The formalisation of conflict rules	181
	2. When are two rules in conflict?	181
	3. Conflicting conflict rules (1)	182
	4. Conflicting conflict rules (2)	184
9.	REASONING ABOUT WEIGHTS	184
	1. An example	184
	2. Case-based reasoning as a way to reason about relative weights	185
10.	REASONS AGAINST THE APPLICATION OF A RULE	187
11.	REASONING BY ANALOGY AND THE E CONTRARIO ARGUMENT	189
	1. Applying an underlying principle	190
	2. Applying a non-applicable rule	191
	3. Reasoning for a new rule	193
	4. The e contrario argument	195

12.	REASONING ABOUT THE VALIDITY OF RULES	196
1.	Rules of recognition	197
2.	Interpretation	197
3.	Principles of interpretation	198
4.	Case-based interpretations	200
VI	CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS	203
A.	POSSIBLE AMENDMENTS TO REASON-BASED LOGIC	203
1.	THE ACCRUAL OF REASONS	203
2.	DEONTIC COLLAPSE AND DEONTIC INFLATION	205
3.	REASONS FOR INCOMPATIBLE CONCLUSIONS	206
4.	DECISIVE REASONS	208
5.	DIMENSIONS OF REASONS	209
1.	Relevance and weight	210
2.	The dimension of probability	210
3.	The dimension of degree	210
6.	EPISTEMIC RULES AND PROBABILITY	211
7.	EPISTEMIC RULES	213
B.	SEMANTICS FOR RULES	215
8.	DIRECTIONS OF FIT	215
9.	POSSIBLE WORLDS	217
10.	LOGICALLY POSSIBLE WORLDS	219
11.	LOGICALLY POSSIBLE WORLDS AND VALIDITY	220
12.	RULES AND CONSTRAINTS	220
13.	EXTENSIONAL AND INTENSIONAL LOGICS	221
14.	SEMANTICS FOR REASON-BASED LOGIC	223
15.	SEMANTICS FOR RULES	226
C.	REASON-BASED LOGIC IN COMPARISON	227
16.	CONSISTENCY MAINTENANCE APPROACHES	228
1.	Maximal consistent subsets	229
2.	The multiple extension 'problem'	230
3.	Brewka's theory of preferred subsets	231
4.	Evaluation of consistency maintenance approaches	232
17.	DEFAULT LOGIC	234
1.	Extensions of a theory	235
2.	Semi-normal defaults and undercutters	236
3.	Evaluation of default logic	237
18.	CONDITIONAL LOGICS	238
1.	Morreau's system	238
2.	An evaluation of conditional logics	240
19.	ARGUMENT-BASED LOGICS	241
1.	PS-logic	241
2.	Arguments	242
3.	Conflicts of arguments	242
4.	Three categories of arguments	243
5.	An evaluation of logics based on the comparison of arguments.	245

D.	TWO METAPHORS OF REASONING	245
20.	TWO METAPHORS	245
21.	THE CONTAINER METAPHOR AND POSSIBLE WORLDS	246
22.	THE INFORMATION CONTENT OF RULES	247
23.	THE PRAGMATIC NOTION OF VALIDITY	248
1.	Validity and effectiveness	248
2.	Effectiveness and validity in connection with argument types	249
3.	Causes and reasons	249
4.	Rules of inference should withstand criticism	250
5.	The fact-value distinction	250
6.	Rules of inference are social rules	251
24.	THE FORCES METAPHOR OF REASONING	252
25.	SUMMARY	254
	REFERENCES	255
	INDEX OF NAMES	260
	INDEX OF SUBJECTS	261