

## CONTENTS

---

|                                                                                           |           |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| <i>Acknowledgments</i>                                                                    | <i>ix</i> |
| 1. Freedom, Normative Judgments, and Reason                                               | 3         |
| 1.1. Freedom and Normative Judgments:<br>The Basic Issues                                 | 3         |
| 1.2. A Brief Outline                                                                      | 10        |
| 2. Reasons and Alternative Possibilities                                                  | 13        |
| 2.1. Introduction                                                                         | 13        |
| 2.2. Types of Reasons                                                                     | 13        |
| 2.3. A Requirement of Alternative Possibilities<br>for Objective <i>Pro Tanto</i> Reasons | 19        |
| 2.3.1. “Wrong” Implies “Can”                                                              | 24        |
| 2.3.2. Objections to “Wrong” Implies “Can”                                                | 33        |
| 2.4. An Alternative Possibilities Requirement<br>for “Right,” “Wrong,” and “Obligation”   | 41        |
| 2.5. Some Objections                                                                      | 44        |



|                                                                                 |     |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 3. Moral Obligation, Prudential Obligation,<br>and Alternative Possibilities    | 53  |
| 3.1. Introduction                                                               | 53  |
| 3.2. Moral Obligation, Reason,<br>and Alternative Possibilities                 | 53  |
| 3.3. Objections to the View that Moral Obligation<br>Requires Alternatives      | 58  |
| 3.3.1. A Problem with the Derivation                                            | 58  |
| 3.3.2. The Challenge of Frankfurt Examples                                      | 64  |
| 3.3.3. Reliance on “Ought” Implies “Can”                                        | 68  |
| 3.4. Prudential Obligation, Reason, and Alternative<br>Possibilities            | 69  |
| 3.5. Objections to the View that Prudential Obligation<br>Requires Alternatives | 71  |
| 3.5.1. Prudence or Self-Interest?                                               | 71  |
| 3.5.2. Prudential Obligation and Objective<br><i>Pro Tanto</i> Reasons          | 71  |
| 3.5.3. A Challenge from Frankfurt Examples                                      | 72  |
| 4. Axiological Appraisals and Alternative Possibilities                         | 83  |
| 4.1. Introduction                                                               | 83  |
| 4.2. Intrinsic Value and Reasons                                                | 84  |
| 4.3. A Requirement of Alternative Possibilities<br>for Intrinsic Value          | 87  |
| 4.4. The Morally Deontic’s Dependence on the<br>Axiological                     | 98  |
| 4.5. Pleasure and Reasons                                                       | 102 |
| 4.6. Virtue and Reasons                                                         | 107 |
| 5. Moral Sentiments and Alternative Possibilities                               | 113 |
| 5.1. Introduction                                                               | 113 |



|                                                                       |     |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 5.2. Forgiveness and Reasons                                          | 113 |
| 5.3. Indignation and Reasons                                          | 117 |
| 5.4. Guilt, Sorrow, and Reasons                                       | 117 |
| 5.5. Gratitude, Joy, Thankfulness, and Reasons                        | 120 |
| 5.6. The Moral Sentiments and Alternative Possibilities               | 123 |
| 6. Determinism's Impact on Normative Judgments                        | 125 |
| 6.1. Introduction                                                     | 125 |
| 6.2. Incompatibilism, Strong Alternatives, and Normative Assessments  | 125 |
| 6.2.1. Incompatibilism, Strong Alternatives, and Intrinsic Value      | 127 |
| 6.2.2. Incompatibilism, Strong Alternatives, Welfare, and Happiness   | 137 |
| 6.2.3. Incompatibilism, Strong Alternatives, and Moral Responsibility | 139 |
| 6.2.4. Incompatibilism, Strong Alternatives, and the Moral Sentiments | 140 |
| 6.3. Libertarianism, Luck, and Normative Appraisals                   | 141 |
| 6.4. Compatibilism, Weak Alternatives, and Normative Judgments        | 162 |
| 6.5. On the Viability of Semi-Compatibilism                           | 163 |
| 6.6. Revisiting Frankfurt Examples                                    | 169 |
| 6.7. Other Varieties of Semi-Compatibilism                            | 186 |
| 7. Imperiled Compatibilist Approaches                                 | 190 |
| 7.1. Introduction                                                     | 190 |
| 7.2. Strawsonian Semi-Compatibilism                                   | 190 |
| 7.2.1. An Outline of Strawsonian Compatibilism                        | 191 |



|                                                                       |     |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 7.2.2. Reactive Attitudes, Obligation, and Alternative Possibilities  | 195 |
| 7.2.3. Another Pathway to Questioning Strawsonian Semi-Compatibilism  | 199 |
| 7.3. Mesh Theories                                                    | 204 |
| 7.3.1. Hierarchical Control and Reason                                | 205 |
| 7.3.2. Assessment of the Revised Hierarchical View                    | 212 |
| 7.4. Wolf's Reason View                                               | 216 |
| 7.5. Watson's Mesh Theory                                             | 219 |
| 7.6. Concluding Remarks on Reasons-Responsiveness Accounts of Control | 227 |
| 8. Conclusion                                                         | 234 |
| 8.1. Summary of the Argument                                          | 234 |
| 8.2. Primary Ramifications                                            | 237 |
| <i>Appendix: Agent Causation and Luck</i>                             | 241 |
| <i>Bibliography</i>                                                   | 245 |
| <i>Index</i>                                                          | 255 |