

Table of Contents

PREFACE.....	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	v
CITATIONS AND ACRONYMS.....	vi
TABLE OF CASES.....	liii
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES.....	lxiii

Chapter 1: WHAT IS A CONSTITUTION? 1

A. Why Comparative Constitutional Law?1

A.1. The Controversy Over Citation to Foreign Constitutional Material in Domestic Constitutional Adjudication.....6

S. V. Makwanyane and Another [South Africa Death Penalty Case] (South Africa)7

Roper v. Simmons (U.S.).....13

Lawrence v. Texas (U.S.).....16

The Relevance of Foreign Legal Materials in U.S. Constitutional Cases: *A Conversation between Justice Antonin Scalia and Justice Stephen Breyer*18

Richard A. Posner, *Foreword: A Political Court*.....24

Jeremy Waldron, *Foreign Law and the Modern Ius Gentium*25

Vicki C. Jackson, *Constitutional Comparisons: Convergence, Resistance, Engagement*.....27

Notes and Questions29

A.2. Constitutional Borrowing in the Making and Design of Constitutions.....33

B. What is Constitutionalism? 36

Louis Henkin, *A New Birth of Constitutionalism: Genetic Influences and Genetic Defects*36

Daniel S. Lev, *Social Movements, Constitutionalism and Human Rights: Comments from the Malaysian and Indonesian Experiences*.....38

Notes and Questions: Constitutionalism as Ideal or Ideology?41

C. Constitutionalism and the Rule of Law..... 41

Michel Rosenfeld, *The Rule of Law and the Legitimacy of Constitutional Democracy*40

C.1. The Rule of Law: Predictability versus Fairness and Justice46

<i>Princess Soraya Case</i> (Germany)	46
<i>Retroactive Criminal Legislation Case</i> (Hungary)	49
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	53
D. Constitutional Models	55
D.1. Written versus Unwritten Constitutions	55
Giovanni Sartori, <i>Constitutionalism: A Preliminary Discussion</i>	55
Eric Barendt, <i>An Introduction to Constitutional Law</i>	58
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	62
D.2. Major Types of Contemporary Constitutional Systems	63
Ulrich K. Preuss, <i>Patterns of Constitutional Evolution and Change in Eastern Europe</i>	64
Michel Rosenfeld, <i>The Identity of the Constitutional Subject</i>	66
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	74
D.3. Constitutions Beyond the Nation-State?	77
D.3.1. The Transnational Constitution: The EU Constitutional Treaty and Its Aftermath	77
Pavlos Eleftheriadis, <i>The Idea of a European Constitution</i>	78
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	86
<i>Maastricht Treaty Case</i> (Germany)	90
<i>Maastricht I Decision</i> (France)	93
<i>Treaty of Amsterdam Decision</i> (France)	94
<i>The Lisbon Treaty Case</i> (Germany)	95
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	110
E. The Birth, Alteration and Revision of the Constitution: Perspectives on Constitution Making and Constitutional Amendments	116
Hannah Arendt, <i>On Revolution</i>	117
Jon Elster, <i>Constitutional Bootstrapping in Philadelphia and Paris</i>	118
András Sajó, <i>Preferred Generations: A Paradox of Restoration Constitutions</i>	119
<i>Certification of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa</i> (South Africa)	122
John Bell, <i>French Constitutional Law</i>	126
Rett R. Ludwikowski, <i>Constitution-Making in the Region of Former Soviet Dominance</i>	127
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	128
E.1. Amending the Constitution	130

<i>Privacy of Communications Case [The Klass Case]</i> (Germany).....	133
<i>On Constitutional Amendment Adopted by Referendum</i> (France).....	137
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	138

Chapter 2: JUDICIAL ENFORCEMENT OF THE CONSTITUTION AND MODELS OF CONSTITUTIONAL ADJUDICATION ..139

A. The Place of Constitutional Adjudication in a Working Constitutional Order..... 140

<i>Marbury v. Madison</i> (U.S.).....	140
<i>United Mizrahi Bank Ltd. v. Migdal Village</i> (Israel)	143
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	149

B. Principal Models of Constitutional Adjudication 153

B.1. The Centralized versus Decentralized Model: Abstract versus Concrete Review 153

Victor Ferreres Comella, <i>The Rise of Constitutional Courts</i>	153
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	157
Wolfgang Zeidler, <i>The Federal Constitutional Court of the Federal Republic of Germany: Decisions on the Constitutionality of Legal Norms</i>	161
John Bell, <i>Jurisdiction of the French Constitutional Council</i>	163
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	164

B.2. The Independence of the Constitutional Adjudicator: Appointments, Court Composition, and Relations With the Other Branches of Government 165

Alec Stone Sweet, <i>Constitutional Adjudication and Parliamentary Democracy</i>	166
<i>Note on Appointment to the U.S. Supreme Court</i>	167

B.3. Who? What? and Whom?: Standing, Justiciability and the Binding Effect of Constitutional Adjudication 167

B.3.1. Standing 168

<i>Note on the U.S. Political Question Doctrine and Other Limits on Constitutional Adjudication</i>	171
--	-----

B.3.2. Binding Effects of Constitutional Adjudication..... 173

C. Constitutional Interpretation 173

C.1. Typology of Constitutional Arguments 174

C.1.1. United States 174

Richard H. Fallon, Jr., <i>A Constructivist Coherence Theory of Constitutional Interpretation</i>	174
---	-----

C.1.2. Germany	177
Winfried Brugger, <i>Legal Interpretation, Schools of Jurisprudence, and Anthropology: Some Remarks From a German Point of View</i>	177
Wolfgang Zeidler, <i>The Federal Constitutional Court of the Federal Republic of Germany: Decisions on the Constitutionality of Legal Norms</i>	180
Bernhard Schlink, <i>German Constitutional Culture in Transition</i>	182
C.1.3. France	186
Dominique Rousseau, <i>The Constitutional Judge: Master or Slave of the Constitution?</i>	186
Notes and Questions	188
C.2. Dilemmas of Constitutional Interpretation	190
C.2.1. Textualism and Beyond	190
<i>Australian Capital Television v. the Commonwealth of Australia</i> (Australia)	190
<i>Spinal Tap Case</i> (Germany)	193
<i>Griswold v. Connecticut</i> (U.S.)	194
<i>Reference Re Secession of Quebec</i> (Canada)	198
<i>Pensions Case</i> (Poland)	208
<i>Cunningham v. Canada</i> (Canada)	210
<i>Re B.C. Motor Vehicle Act</i> (Canada)	212
Notes and Questions	216
C.2.2. Originalism	219
<i>Note on the Debate over Originalism in the United States</i>	219
Notes and Questions	224
C.2.3. Fundamental Interpretive Doctrines and Techniques	226
C.2.3.A. Constitutional Interpretation and Balancing	226
C.2.3.B. Proportionality	228
<i>Pharmacy Case</i> (Germany)	228
<i>Liselotte Hauer v. Land Rheinland-Pfalz</i> (ECJ)	228
<i>R. v. Oakes</i> (Canada)	231
<i>Beit Sourik Village Council v. the Government of Israel</i> (Israel)	235
C.2.3.C. Law Making By the Judiciary As Constitutional Interpretation	235
<i>Princess Soraya Case</i> (Germany)	235
Notes and Questions	235

Chapter 3: STRIKING A BALANCE AMONG THE BRANCHES OF GOVERNMENT: HORIZONTAL SEPARATION OF POWERS	240
A. Separation versus Checks and Balances (Presidentialism and Parliamentarism).....	241
Bruce A. Ackerman, <i>The New Separation of Powers</i>	241
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	245
B. The Legislative Branch	251
B.1. Parliament	252
<i>Notes on Parliamentary Sovereignty and Autonomy</i>	252
<i>Parliamentary Dissolution Case (Germany)</i>	257
<i>Muhammad Nawaz Sharif v. Federation of Pakistan (Pakistan)</i>	259
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	262
B.2. Legislative Functions, Delegated Legislation	265
<i>Industrial Union Department, AFL-CIO v. American Petroleum Institute (U.S.)</i>	266
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	268
<i>Kalkar I Case (Germany)</i>	269
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	272
<i>Economic Authorization Case [On the Law Authorizing Government to Take Diverse Measures Concerning the Economic and Social Order] (France)</i>	273
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	277
B.3. Referendum: The Legislative and Constituent Powers of the People.....	284
<i>Santiago v. Commission on Elections (The Philippines)</i>	285
<i>Opinion on the Constitutional Referendum in Ukraine (Venice Commission)</i>	288
<i>President's Proposition for National Confidence Referendum Case (Republic of Korea)</i>	292
<i>McKenna v. An Taoiseach, An Tanaiste and Others (McKenna II) (Ireland)</i>	295
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	299
C. Executive Power.....	305
C.1. The Making of the Executive.....	305
<i>Competence Dispute between the President of the Republic and Members of the National Assembly (Republic of Korea)</i>	305
<i>Russian Prime Ministerial Appointment Case [Decision Concerning the Interpretation of Provisions of Article</i>	

<i>111, Para 4, of the RF Constitution</i>] (Russia)	307
<i>Presidential Appointments Case</i> (Hungary)	310
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	312
C.2. The Scope of Executive Power	317
<i>Youngstown Sheet & Tube Co. v. Sawyer</i> (U.S.).....	318
<i>Bank Investigation Case</i> (Poland)	323
<i>Tornado Case</i> (Germany)	326
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	328
<i>Tariff Council Case</i> (Latvia).....	332
<i>Modifications to the Composition and Functioning of the</i> <i>National Broadcasting Council</i> (Poland).....	333
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	335
C.3 Executive Immunities and Privileges.....	345
<i>Council of Civil Service Unions v. Minister for the Civil</i> <i>Service</i> (U.K.).....	346
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	349
<i>United States v. Nixon</i> (U.S.)	352
<i>Impeachment of the President (Roh Moo-Hyun)</i> (Republic of Korea)	354
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	358
D. The Judiciary.....	361
<i>United Engineering Workers Union v. Devanayagam</i> (Ceylon) ..	361
<i>Morris v. United Kingdom</i> (ECtHR).....	365
<i>Hinds v. the Queen</i> (Jamaica)	367
<i>Mistretta v. United States</i> (U.S.).....	369
<i>Removal of the Chief Judge</i> (Czech Republic).....	373
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	376
 Chapter 4. FEDERALISM AND VERTICAL SEPARATION OF POWERS	 384
A. Federalism's Various Forms	384
Martha A. Field, <i>The Differing Federalisms of Canada and</i> <i>the United States</i>	386
A.1. The U.S.: Pragmatic and Elastic Federalism	389
<i>McCulloch v. Maryland</i> (U.S.)	390
Joseph F. Zimmerman, <i>Contemporary American</i> <i>Federalism: The Growth of National Power</i>	393
A.2. Germany: Cooperative Federalism.....	400
<i>Television I Case</i> (Germany)	400

Daniel Halberstam and Roderick M. Hills, Jr., <i>State Autonomy in Germany and the United States</i>	403
Arthur Gunlicks, <i>German Federalism Reform: Part One</i> ...	405
A.3. Switzerland: Predominance of the Cantons	410
Thomas Fleiner, <i>Switzerland: Constitution of the Federal State and the Cantons</i>	410
A.4. India: Multiethnic Federalism.....	412
S.D. Muni, <i>Ethnic Conflict, Federalism, and Democracy in India</i>	412
A.5. Canada: Asymmetrical Federalism	415
<i>Re Quebec Objection to a Resolution to Amend the Constitution</i> (Canada).....	416
Peter Hogg, <i>Special Status</i>	418
Will Kymlicka, <i>Asymmetric Federalism</i>	419
A.6. Belgium: From Centralization to Ethnic Federalism to Confederation?.....	420
Wilfried Swenden, <i>Belgian Federalism: Basic Institutional Features and Potential as a Model for the European Union</i>	421
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	427
B. Decentralization in Nonfederal States	429
B.1. France: Can Decentralization Work in the Paradigmatic Case of the Indivisible Republic?.....	429
B.2. Spain and Its Autonomous Regions: Halfway Between the Unitary State and Federalism?	430
César Colino, <i>Constitutional Change without Constitutional Reform: Spanish Federalism and the Revision of Catalonia's Statute of Autonomy</i>	430
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	439
C. The Confrontation Between the Federation and Federated Governments	443
C.1. Federal Sovereignty, Federal-Entity Sovereignty and Democracy	443
<i>Southwest State Case</i> (Germany)	444
<i>McCulloch v. Maryland</i> (U.S.)	447
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	448
C.2. Confrontation and Cooperation Between the Federation and the Federated Governments	449
C.2.1. Determination of State Constitutional Structures by the Federation	449
<i>S.R. Bommai v. Union of India</i> (India).....	449

<i>Certification of the Constitution of the Province of Kwazulu-Natal (South Africa)</i>	453
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	458
C.2.2. Exclusive and Concurrent Powers	460
C.2.2.A. Domestic Powers	461
<i>United States v. Lopez (U.S.)</i>	461
<i>Amalgamated Society of Engineers v. Adelaide Steamship Co. Ltd. (Australia)</i>	469
<i>Victoria v. the Commonwealth (Australia)</i> .	475
Greg Taylor, <i>The Commerce Clause— Commonwealth Comparisons</i>	477
C.2.2.B. Foreign Relations	481
<i>Missouri v. Holland (U.S.)</i>	481
<i>Concordat Case (Germany)</i>	483
<i>Certification of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (South Africa)</i> .	485
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	487
C.2.3. Federation, Federated Entities Interaction At Work: Commandeering, Negotiation, Cooperation, Accommodation	492
C.2.3.A. Federal Commandeering of the State Legislature Or Executive	492
<i>New York v. United States (U.S.)</i>	492
<i>Dispute Concerning the Constitutionality of Certain Provisions of the National Education Policy Bill No. 83 of 1995 (South Africa)</i>	492
<i>Printz v. United States (U.S.)</i>	500
C.2.3.B. Cooperation, Negotiation and Accommodation	507
<i>Certification of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa Constitutional Court (South Africa)</i>	507
<i>Reference re Canada Assistance Plan (Canada)</i>	507
<i>Revenue Reallocation Case (Germany)</i>	509
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	516
<i>South Dakota v. Dole (U.S.)</i>	518
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	523
<i>Note on Transnational Federalism: The Case of the European Union</i>	523

Stephen C. Sieberson, <i>Did Symbolism Sink the Constitution? Reflections on the European Union's State-Like Attributes</i>	525
Chapter 5: DIGNITY, PRIVACY, AND PERSONAL AUTONOMY.....	527
A. Protecting Fundamental Rights	527
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	528
B. Abortion: A Paradigmatic Conflict?	539
<i>Roe v. Wade</i> (U.S.)	539
<i>Planned Parenthood of Southeastern Pennsylvania v. Casey</i> (U.S.)	543
<i>R. v. Morgentaler</i> (Canada)	546
<i>Daigle v. Tremblay</i> (Canada)	549
<i>Abortion I Case</i> (Germany)	549
<i>Family Planning Act Amendment</i> (Poland)	552
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	555
C. Life and Death	564
C.1. Death Penalty and Targeted Killings	564
<i>Gregg v. Georgia</i> (U.S.)	564
<i>Roper v. Simmons</i> (U.S.)	566
<i>State v. Makwanyane and Another</i> (South Africa)	568
<i>Boyce et al. v. Barbados</i> (Inter-American Court of Human Rights)	577
<i>United States v. Burns</i> (Canada)	577
<i>PAC v. Israel</i> (Israel)	579
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	581
C.2. Life Imprisonment	583
<i>R. v. Latimer</i> (Canada)	583
<i>Life Imprisonment Case</i> (Germany)	585
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	587
C.3. Suicide and Euthanasia	589
<i>Cruzan v. Director, Missouri Department of Health</i> (U.S.) ..	590
<i>In re a Ward of Court</i> (Ireland)	592
<i>Rodriguez v. British Columbia</i> (Canada)	598
<i>Pretty v. United Kingdom</i> (ECtHR)	600
<i>Washington v. Glucksberg</i> (U.S.)	604
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	606
D. Personal Identity: Body, Sexuality, Relationships	609

D.1. Transsexuals.....	610
<i>Transsexuals Case I</i> (Germany)	610
<i>Goodwin v. United Kingdom</i> (ECtHR)	610
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	614
D.2. Sexuality, Intimacy	617
<i>Griswold v. Connecticut</i> (U.S.).....	618
<i>Toonen v. Australia</i> (United Nations).....	618
<i>Dudgeon v. United Kingdom</i> (ECtHR)	619
<i>Lawrence v. Texas</i> (U.S.).....	623
<i>National Coalition for Gay and Lesbian Equality v.</i> <i>Minister of Justice and Others</i> (South Africa)	627
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	628
D.3. Relationships, Marriage	632
<i>Loving v. Virginia</i> (U.S.).....	632
<i>Transsexuals Case I</i> (Germany)	633
<i>Goodwin v. United Kingdom</i> (ECtHR)	633
<i>Minister of Home Affairs and Another v. Fourie and</i> <i>Another</i> (South Africa)	634
<i>Reference Re Same-Sex Marriage</i> (Canada).....	642
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	644
D.4. Families	646
<i>Elsholz v. Germany</i> (ECtHR).....	647
<i>Sex Education Case</i> (Germany)	649
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	650
E. Virtual Identity: Information, Data, Reputation	651
<i>Census Case</i> (Germany).....	652
<i>"Juki-Net Case"</i> (Japan)	652
<i>Tax Data Case</i> (Poland)	653
<i>M.S. v. Sweden</i> (ECtHR)	654
<i>Gaskin v. United Kingdom</i> (ECtHR)	655
<i>K.U. v. Finland</i> (ECtHR).....	656
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	658
 Chapter 6: EQUALITY, MINORITY, AND GROUP RIGHTS	 669
A. Formal versus Substantive Equality: The Scope of Constitutional Equality and the Subject and Domain of Equality.....	 670
Michel Rosenfeld, <i>Towards a Reconstruction of</i> <i>Constitutional Equality</i>	 670

<i>Trimble v. Gordon</i> (U.S.)	675
<i>University Professors Case</i> (France)	676
Thomas Würtenberger, <i>Equality, in the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Germany</i>	677
Susanne Baer, <i>Constitutional Equality: The Jurisprudence of the German Constitutional Court</i>	678
A.1. The Subject of Equality: Who Is Equal to Whom?	681
Michel Rosenfeld, <i>Affirmative Action and Justice: A Philosophical and Constitutional Inquiry</i>	681
<i>Mahe v. Alberta</i> (Canada)	682
A.2. The Domain of Equality: In Respect to What Are Equals to Be Equal?	682
Michel Rosenfeld, <i>Affirmative Action and Justice: A Philosophical and Constitutional Inquiry</i>	682
<i>Plessy v. Ferguson</i> (U.S.)	683
<i>Brown v. Board of Education</i> (U.S.)	686
<i>Ahmedabad Municipal Corporation v. Nawab Khan Gulab Khan and Others</i> (India)	688
<i>Numerus Clausus I Case</i> (Germany)	688
<i>Dandridge v. Williams</i> (U.S.)	688
<i>Cumulation of Pensions and Salaries</i> (France)	692
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	692
B. Framing Constitutional Equality in Terms of Attacks on Particular Inequalities: The Antidiscrimination Approach	694
B.1. Antidiscrimination in General: Legal Classifications, Rationality and Proportionality	695
<i>Railway Express Agency, Inc. v. New York</i> (U.S.)	696
<i>Re Amendments of the Code of Social Security and Health</i> (France)	697
John Bell, <i>The Principle of Equality</i>	697
Susanne Baer, <i>Constitutional Equality: The Jurisprudence of the German Constitutional Court</i>	698
B.2. Targeting Particular Inequalities	702
<i>Andrews v. Law Society of British Columbia</i> (Canada)	702
<i>Korematsu v. United States</i> (United States)	711
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	713
B.3. Untangling Permissible From Impermissible Inequalities Under the Antidiscrimination Approach	715
<i>Personnel Administrator of Massachusetts v. Feeney</i> (U.S.)	715
<i>Suppression of Rape Decision</i> (France)	717

B.4. Discrimination Based on Race, Ethnicity Or Religion	718
<i>Loving v. Virginia</i> (U.S.).....	718
<i>Thlimmenos v. Greece</i> (ECtHR).....	720
B.5. Discrimination Based on Sex or Gender	723
<i>Nocturnal Employment Case</i> (Germany)	723
<i>Craig v. Boren</i> (U.S.)	725
<i>President of the Republic of South Africa v. Hugo</i> (South Africa)	729
B.6. Discrimination Based on Sexual Orientation.....	734
B.6.1. Discrimination Targeting Gays and Lesbians.....	734
<i>Egan v. Canada</i> (Canada)	734
<i>Romer v. Evans</i> (United States)	739
B.6.2 Equality and Same-Sex Marriage.....	744
<i>Reference re Same-Sex Marriage</i> (Canada)	744
<i>Minister of Home Affairs, et al. v. Fourie, et al.</i> (South Africa)	748
B.7. Other Emerging Grounds Under the Antidiscrimination Approach: Compound Grounds; Contradictory Grounds; “direct” versus “indirect” Discrimination	752
<i>R (E) v. Governing Body of JFS and Others</i> (U.K.).....	757
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	765
C. Equality in Special Contexts and in Connection With Other Constitutional Rights.....	772
C.1. Elections	772
<i>Harper v. Virginia Board of Elections</i> (U.S.)	772
<i>Reynolds v. Sims</i> (U.S.).....	772
<i>Apportionment II Case</i> (Germany)	772
<i>Elections in New Caledonia</i> (France).....	772
<i>Bush v. Gore</i> (U.S.)	773
C.2. Education	775
<i>Numerus Clausus I Case</i> (Germany)	776
C.3. Access to Justice	777
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	778
D. Affirmative Action and the Interplay Between Individual and Group Equality: Beyond Antidiscrimination?	779
<i>Grutter v. Bollinger</i> (U.S.).....	779
<i>State of Uttar Pradesh v. Pradip Tandon</i> (India).....	788
<i>Hellmut Marschall v. Land Nordrhein-Westfalen</i> (ECJ).....	792
<i>Feminine Quotas Case</i> (France).....	797

<i>Notes and Questions</i>	798
E. Protecting Group-Based Equality: National, Ethnic, Religious and Linguistic Majorities and Minorities	802
E.1. Protecting Majority Group Rights and Interests	803
<i>Ford v. Quebec</i> (Attorney General) (Canada)	803
<i>Mentzen Case</i> (Latvia)	807
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	809
E.2. Language Rights of Minorities	813
<i>Mahe v. Alberta</i> (Canada)	813
Susanna Mancini and Bruno de Witte, <i>Language Rights as Cultural Rights, a European Perspective</i>	819
<i>Belgian Linguistic Case</i> [Case "Relating to Certain Aspects of the Laws on the Use of Languages in Education in Belgium"] (ECtHR)	824
<i>Lau v. Nichols</i> (United States)	827
<i>St. Stephen's College v. University of Delhi</i> (India)	829
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	830
E.3. Aboriginal Group Rights	832
<i>Sandra Lovelace v. Canada</i> , Human Rights Committee (UN)	832
<i>Santa Clara Pueblo v. Martinez</i> (U.S.)	835
<i>R. v. Van Der Peet</i> (Canada)	838
<i>Sejdic and Finci v. Bosnia and Herzegovina</i> (ECtHR)	843
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	844
 Chapter 7: FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION	 847
A. The Scope of Protection	848
A.1. Why Protect Speech?	849
<i>Lange v. Atkinson</i> (New Zealand)	849
Alexander Meiklejohn, <i>Political Freedom</i>	850
<i>Whitney v. California</i> (U.S.)	851
<i>Irwin Toy Ltd. v. Attorney General of Quebec</i> (Canada)	852
<i>Curtis v. the Minister of Safety and Security and Others</i> (South Africa)	852
<i>Australian Capital Television v. the Commonwealth of Australia</i> (Australia)	853
A.2. Subversion of the Political Order: Clear and Present Danger	853
<i>Abrams et al. v. United States</i> (U.S.)	856
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	857

<i>Brandenburg v. Ohio</i> (U.S.)	859
<i>Ceylan v. Turkey</i> (ECtHR).....	860
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	863
A.3. What Amounts to Protected Expression	864
A.3.1. Protection of Symbols	866
<i>Texas v. Johnson</i> (U.S.).....	867
<i>Flag Desecration Case</i> (Germany)	869
A.3.2. Pornography.....	874
<i>Notes on Pornography</i>	875
A.4. Restrictions in the Private and Public Interests: Balancing ...	882
<i>Lüth Case</i> (Germany).....	882
<i>Irwin Toy Ltd. v. Attorney General of Quebec</i> (Canada).....	887
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	890
<i>Gardener v. Whitaker</i> (South Africa)	893
<i>Notes on "Third-Party Effect" and the "State Action"</i> <i>Doctrine</i>	894
B. Libel	897
B.1. Speech Interests and Reputation.....	897
<i>New York Times Co. v. Sullivan</i> (U.S.).....	899
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	903
<i>Mephisto Case</i> (Germany)	907
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	909
B.2. Public Issues, Public Figures.....	916
<i>Lee Kuan Yew v. Vinocur & ORS</i> (Singapore).....	916
<i>Lingens v. Austria</i> (ECtHR)	917
Peter Krug, <i>Civil Defamation Law and the Press in</i> <i>Russia: Private and Public Interests, The 1995</i> <i>Civil Code, and the Constitution</i>	919
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	921
<i>Bladet Tromsø and Stensaas v. Norway</i> (ECtHR).....	925
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	928
<i>Castells v. Spain</i> (ECtHR).....	930
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	932
<i>Lange v. Atkinson</i> (New Zealand)	934
<i>Lange v. Australian Broadcasting Corporation</i> (Australia).....	935
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	937
<i>Jameel and Others v. Wall Street Journal Europe</i> <i>SPRL</i> (U.K.)	938

<i>Notes and Questions</i>	942
C. Racist Speech	943
<i>Beauharnais v. Illinois</i> (U.S.).....	945
<i>Collin v. Smith</i> ["Skokie" Cases] (U.S.).....	947
<i>R.A.V. v. City of St. Paul, Minnesota</i> (U.S.)	948
Mari J. Matsuda, <i>Public Response to Racist Speech:</i> <i>Considering the Victim's Story</i>	952
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	953
<i>R. v. Keegstra</i> (Canada)	958
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	966
<i>Garaudy v. France</i> (ECtHR)	967
Friedrich Kübler, <i>How Much Freedom for Racist Speech?:</i> <i>Transnational Aspects of a Conflict of Human Rights</i>	971
<i>Holocaust Denial Case</i> (Germany)	972
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	977
D. Freedom of Assembly	981
<i>Director of Public Prosecutions v. Jones</i> (Margaret) (U.K.).....	982
<i>R (On the Application of Laporte) v. Chief Constable of</i> <i>Gloucestershire</i> (U.K.)	984
<i>Edwards v. South Carolina</i> (United States).....	989
<i>Brokdorf Case</i> (Germany).....	990
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	995
<i>Christine Mulundika v. the People</i> (Zambia)	999
<i>Baczowski and Others v. Poland</i> (ECtHR).....	1001
<i>Thomas v. Chicago Park District</i> (U.S.).....	1006
<i>Eugen Schmidberger, Internationale Transporte und</i> <i>Planzüge v. Republik Österreich</i> (ECJ).....	1007
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1012
CHAPTER 8: FREEDOM OF RELIGION AND BELIEF	1015
A. Free Exercise	1017
A.1. What Is Protected? What Is Religion?	1018
<i>Decision on Scientology</i> (Italy)	1018
<i>Syndicat Northcrest v. Amselem</i> (Canada).....	1020
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1024
<i>Church of the Lukumi Babalu Aye, Inc. v. City of</i> <i>Hialeah</i> (U.S.).....	1030
[The Ahmadis Cases] Tayyab Mahmud, <i>Freedom of</i> <i>Religion and Religious Minorities in Pakistan: A</i> <i>Study of Judicial Practice</i>	1034

<i>[The Ahmadis Cases] Nadeem Ahmad Siddiq, Enforced Apostasy: Zaheeruddin v. State and the Official Persecution of the Ahmadiyya Community in Pakistan</i>	1035
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1037
A.2. Religious Practices and Freedom of Conscience	1038
<i>Torcaso v. Watkins (U.S.)</i>	1038
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1040
<i>Japan v. Yasuko Nakaya [Gokoku (Shinto) Shrine Case] (Japan)</i>	1042
<i>Bijoe Emmanuel and Others v. State of Kerala and Others (India)</i>	1045
<i>Kokkinakis v. Greece (ECtHR)</i>	1047
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1051
A.3. Accommodation and Other Exceptions to General Rules.....	1053
<i>Goldman v. Weinberger (U.S.)</i>	1054
<i>Employment Division, Department of Human Resources of Oregon v. Smith (U.S.)</i>	1055
<i>Thlimmenos v. Greece European Court of Human Rights</i>	1060
<i>MK Marina Solodkin v. Beit Shemesh Municipality (Israel)</i>	1060
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1064
B. Church and State	1076
B.1. Models of Church-State Relations: Secularism, Separation, Coexistence, Benevolence and State Religion	1077
<i>Krystyna Daniel and W. Cole Durham, Jr., Religious Identity as a Component of National Identity: Implications for Emerging Church-State Relations in the Former Socialist Bloc</i>	1080
<i>Chan Hiang Leng Colin & ORS v. Public Prosecutor High Court (Singapore)</i>	1084
<i>S.R. Bommai v. Union of India (India)</i>	1086
<i>County of Allegheny v. A.C.L.U. (U.S.)</i>	1088
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1093
<i>Shavit v. the Chevra Kadisha (Burial Society) of Rishon Le Zion (Israel)</i>	1102
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1107
<i>[The Hindutva Cases] Brenda Cossman and Ratna Kapur, Secularism's Last Sigh?: The Hindu Right, The Courts, and India's Struggle for Democracy</i>	1110
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1112

B.2. Secular Education and Denominational Schools	1113
<i>Wisconsin v. Yoder</i> (U.S.).....	1113
<i>Note on Religious Self-government and Secession</i>	1116
<i>Teaching of the Catholic Religion Case Constitutional Court</i> (Italy)	1118
<i>Interdenominational School Case</i> (Germany)	1121
<i>Classroom Crucifix II Case</i> (Germany).....	1123
<i>Folgerø and Others v. Norway</i> (ECtHR)	1126
<i>Ms. Aruna Roy and others v. Union of India and others</i> (India)	1130
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1132
C. Religious Pluralism: The Clash	1141
<i>Headscarf Ludin Case</i> (Germany).....	1141
<i>Leyla Sahin v. Turkey</i> (ECtHR).....	1146
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1153
<i>Multani v. Commission Scolaire Marguerite-Bourgeoys</i> (Canada).....	1158
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1162
<i>Mahmud Sami Muhammad `Ali Wasil v. the Minister of Education</i> (Egypt).....	1164
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1168
 Chapter 9: CRIMINAL PROCEDURE (DUE PROCESS)	 1173
A. Adversarial versus Inquisitorial Systems.....	1176
A.1. The Expanding Role of International Law and Supranational Judicial Bodies	1180
B. General Principles of Fairness and Due Process	1181
B.1. Fair Trial	1181
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1184
B.2. The Presumption of Innocence and Reverse-Onus Provisions	1185
<i>S. v. Mbatha</i> (South Africa).....	1185
<i>O'leary v. the Attorney General</i> (Ireland).....	1187
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1189
B.3. Right to A Trial Before An Impartial Tribunal.....	1190
B.3.1. Impartiality	1190
B.3.2. Composition of Tribunals and Allocation of Responsibilities	1191
C. Pretrial Due Process	1192
C.1. Arrest, Search and Seizure	1193

<i>Katz v. United States</i> (U.S.).....	1193
<i>Increased Police Powers to Combat Terrorism</i> (France)....	1195
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1196
C.1.1. Exclusionary Rule	1198
<i>Japan v. Hashimoto</i> (Japan).....	1199
<i>Edwards v. Police</i> (New Zealand).....	1200
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1200
C.2. Pretrial Detention, Bail, and Prompt Judicial Review	1201
C.3. Preventive Detention	1202
<i>United States v. Salerno</i> (U.S.)	1203
<i>A.D.M., Jabalpur v. S. Shukla</i> (India).....	1204
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1205
C.4. Interrogation and Detention: The Problem of Torture.....	1206
<i>Public Committee against Torture in Israel, et al. v. the</i> <i>State of Israel, The General Security Service, et al.</i> <i>(Israel)</i>	1206
<i>Aydin v. Turkey</i> (ECtHR)	1210
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1212
D. Right to Silence and Privilege Against Self- Incrimination	1213
David Dolinko, <i>Is There a Rationale for the Privilege Against</i> <i>Self-Incrimination?</i>	1213
D.1. The Privilege Before Trial.....	1213
<i>Miranda v. Arizona</i> (U.S.)	1214
<i>Note on Miranda</i>	1218
<i>R. v. Hebert</i> (Canada).....	1220
<i>Nandini Satpathy v. P.L. Dani</i> (India)	1222
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1224
D.2. The Right to Silence at Trial: Adverse Inferences	1225
<i>Griffin v. California</i> (U.S.).....	1225
<i>Murray v. United Kingdom</i> (ECtHR)	1227
Gordon Van Kessel, <i>European Perspectives on the</i> <i>Accused as a Source of Testimonial Evidence</i>	1230
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1232
E. Right to Counsel	1232
E.1. Right to Counsel Pretrial	1232
<i>R. v. Burlingham</i> (Canada).....	1233
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1236
E.2. Right to Counsel Appointed and Paid For By the State	1236
<i>The State v. Wessel Albertus Vermaas</i> (South Africa)	1236

<i>Ogawa et al. v. Japan [Defense Rejection Case] (Japan) ...</i>	1238
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1239
E.3. Right to the Effective Assistance of Counsel	1241
<i>Daud v. Portugal (ECtHR)</i>	1242
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1244
F. Right to Prepare and Conduct A Defense	1244
F.1. Preparation of A Defense	1245
F.1.1. Adequate Time and Facilities.....	1245
F.1.2. Access to the Prosecution's Case/Discovery Rules	1246
F.2. Right to Call and to Cross-Examine Witnesses: The Principle of Confrontation.....	1248
<i>Van Mechelen and others v. the Netherlands (ECtHR)</i>	1248
<i>R. V. Taylor and Crabb (U.K.)</i>	1251
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1253
G. Right to A Speedy Trial	1253
<i>Doggett v. United States (U.S.)</i>	1254
<i>Abdul Rehman Antulay and Others v. R.S. Nayak (India)</i>	1257
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1258
H. Right to Appeal	1259
Harlon Leigh Dalton, <i>Taking the Right to Appeal (More or Less) Seriously</i>	1259
<i>Omar v. France (ECtHR)</i>	1261
<i>Question on Omar v. France</i>	1264
I. Prohibition Against Double Jeopardy	1264
<i>R. v. van Rassel (Canada)</i>	1266
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1269
J. Prohibition Against Retroactivity of Penal Law	1269
<i>Cantoni v. France (ECtHR)</i>	1270
<i>Hagan v. Caspari (U.S.)</i>	1273
<i>Notes and Questions on Retroactivity of Statutes and Judicial Decisions in the U.S.</i>	1276
<i>Streletz, Kessler and Krenz v. Germany (ECtHR)</i>	1277
<i>Note on Applying the Law Most Favorable to the Accused</i>	1280
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1281
Chapter 10: RIGHTS IN ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL LIFE	1282
A. Property	1283
<i>Pennsylvania Coal Co. v. Mahon (U.S.)</i>	1284
<i>Hawaii Housing Authority v. Midkiff (U.S.)</i>	1285

<i>Hamburg Flood Control Case</i> (Germany)	1287
<i>Mellacher v. Austria</i> (ECtHR).....	1289
<i>Hutten-Czapska v. Poland</i> (ECtHR)	1293
<i>Rent Control Case</i> (Czech Republic).....	1298
<i>Pennell v. City of San Jose</i> (U.S.).....	1301
<i>Rustom Cavasjee Cooper v. Union of India</i> (India)	1303
<i>P.P. Rao, Basic Features of the Constitution</i>	1306
<i>His Holiness Kesavananda Bharati Sripadaglavaru v.</i> <i>State of Kerala</i> (India)	1309
<i>French Nationalizations Case</i> (France)	1314
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1317
B. Freedom of Economic Initiative and the Power to Regulate the Economy	1325
B.1. Freedom of Contract	1325
<i>Lochner v. New York</i> (U.S.)	1326
<i>Nebbia v. New York</i> (U.S.).....	1328
<i>Home Building & Loan Ass'n v. Blaisdell</i> (U.S.).....	1330
<i>Shelley v. Kraemer</i> (U.S.).....	1333
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1334
B.2. Choice and Practice of Occupation.....	1338
<i>Pharmacy Case</i> (Germany)	1339
<i>Kabushiki Kaisha Sumiyoshi v. Governor of Hiroshima</i> <i>Prefecture [Japanese Drug Store Case]</i> (Japan).....	1342
<i>State v. Lawrence</i> (South Africa)	1344
<i>Williamson v. Lee Optical of Oklahoma</i> (U.S.)	1346
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1347
C. Social and Welfare Rights	1352
<i>Family Burden Compensation Case</i> (Germany).....	1354
<i>CESCR-General Comment No. 3</i> (UN).....	1357
<i>Ahmedabad Municipal Corporation v. Nawab Khan Gulab</i> <i>Khan and Others</i> (India).....	1359
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1362
<i>Soobramoney v. Minister of Health (Kwazulu-Natal)</i> (South Africa)	1376
<i>In the Matter of Article 26 of the Constitutionp and in the</i> <i>Matter of the Health (Amendment) (No. 2) Bill 2004</i> (Ireland)	1379
<i>Confederation of Ex-Servicemen Associations and Others v.</i> <i>Union of India and Others</i> (India).....	1383
<i>Smoking in Closed Areas Case</i> (Italy).....	1386

<i>Numerus Clausus I Case</i> (Germany)	1388
<i>Free Textbooks Case</i> (Czech Republic)	1391
<i>Goldberg v. Kelly</i> (U.S.).....	1393
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1396
<i>DeShaney v. Winnebago County Department of Social Services</i> (U.S.).....	1407
<i>Carmichele v. Ministers of Safety and Security and of Justice and Constitutional Development</i> (South Africa).....	1410
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1411

Chapter 11: CONSTITUTIONAL GUARANTEES OF DEMOCRACY1414

A. Democracy and Law.....1415

A.1. The Nature and Extent of Constitutional Protection of Democracy 1415

McGinty v. Western Australia (Australia)..... 1415

Australian Capital Television v. the Commonwealth of Australia High Court (Australia) 1416

Reference re Secession of Quebec (Canada)..... 1416

Notes and Questions..... 1416

A.2. Transitional Justice 1418

Lustration Case (Czech and Slovak Federal Republic) 1418

Omar Jallow Case (Gambia) 1420

Notes and Questions..... 1421

A.3. Militant Democracy 1423

Socialist Reich Party Case (Germany)..... 1423

Christian Democracy Party Case (Poland)..... 1425

Refah Partisi (The Welfare Party) et al. v. Turkey (ECtHR) (Grand Chamber) 1426

Notes and Questions..... 1432

B. Democratic Activity: Rights of A Civil Society.....1437

B.1. Active Citizens..... 1437

Levy v. Victoria (Australia)..... 1437

Castells v. Spain (ECtHR)..... 1439

Mitsubishi Resin, Inc. v. Takano (Japan)..... 1439

Notes and Questions..... 1440

B.2. Citizens in the Civil Service..... 1442

Glasenapp v. Germany (ECtHR) 1443

Civil Service Commission v. National Association of Letter Carriers (U.S.)..... 1447

<i>Ahmed v. the United Kingdom</i> (ECtHR).....	1449
<i>Rekvényi v. Hungary</i> (ECtHR)	1451
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1453
C. The Right to Vote and Elections	1455
<i>New National Party v. South Africa</i> (South Africa).....	1455
<i>Harper v. Virginia Board of Elections</i> (U.S.)	1459
<i>Foreign Voters Case</i> (Germany).....	1460
<i>Kramer v. Union School District</i> (U.S.)	1461
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1464
C.2. Apportionment	1472
<i>McGinty v. Western Australia</i> (Australia).....	1473
<i>Reference re Provincial Electoral Boundaries</i> <i>(Saskatchewan)</i> (Canada).....	1474
<i>Kurokawa v. Chiba Prefecture Election Commission</i> <i>(Japan)</i>	1477
<i>Shaw v. Reno</i> (U.S.).....	1478
<i>Apportionment II Case</i> (Germany).....	1481
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1483
D. Political Parties	1485
D.1. Elections and Operation of Legislatures	1485
<i>Williams v. Rhodes</i> (U.S.).....	1486
<i>Five Percent Electoral Threshold Case</i> (Czech Republic) ..	1487
<i>All Germany Election Case</i> (Germany).....	1491
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1493
D.2. Parties and the Media	1496
<i>Radical Groups Case</i> (Germany).....	1496
<i>Bowman v. United Kingdom</i> (ECtHR)	1498
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1499
D.3. Political Parties and Money	1500
<i>Buckley v. Valeo</i> (U.S.)	1500
<i>Trade Unions' Political Contributions Case</i> (Republic of Korea).....	1504
<i>Party Finance II Case</i> (Germany)	1505
<i>Notes and Questions</i>	1506
 Chapter 12: STATES OF EMERGENCY, COMBATING TERRORISM, AND THE BOUNDS OF THE CONSTITUTION	 1511

A. Emergencies, Crises, and Combating Global Terrorism: Within Or Beyond the Constitution?	1513
Carl Schmitt, <i>Political Theology</i>	1513
Hans Kelsen, <i>General Theory of Law and State</i>	1516
Giorgio Agamben, <i>State of Exception</i>	1518
Bruce Ackerman, <i>The Emergency Constitution</i>	1521
Owen Gross, <i>Chaos and Rules: Should Responses to Violent Crises Always Be Constitutional?</i>	1533
Notes and Questions	1537
B. State-Of-Emergency Jurisprudence	1539
B.1. Judicial Review of Emergency Powers	1542
<i>Ex Parte Milligan</i> (U.S.)	1542
<i>Liversidge v. Anderson</i> (U.K.)	1543
<i>Teh Cheng Poh v. Public Prosecutor</i> (Malaysia)	1545
Notes and Questions	1547
<i>Lawless v Ireland</i> (ECtHR)	1548
<i>United Communist Party of Turkey v. Turkey</i> (ECtHR) ..	1550
<i>S.R. Bommai v. Union of India</i> (India)	1551
Notes and Questions	1554
B.2. Torture	1557
<i>Ireland v. United Kingdom</i> (ECtHR)	1558
<i>Public Committee Against Torture in Israel, et al. v. the State of Israel</i> (Israel)	1560
Notes and Questions	1562
C. Combating Terrorism: War Or Criminal Enforcement?	1565
Michel Rosenfeld, <i>Judicial Balancing in Times of Stress: Comparing the American, British and Israeli Approaches to the War on Terror</i>	1565
<i>Beit Sourik Village Council v. the Government of Israel</i> (Israel)	1568
<i>Hamdi v. Rumsfeld</i> (U.S.)	1577
<i>A(BC) v. Secretary of State for the Home Department</i> (U.K.)	1584
<i>The Aviation Security Act Case</i> (Germany)	1594
Notes and Questions	1599
INDEX	1603