

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
PREFACE -----	v
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS -----	xi
TABLE OF CASES-----	xliii
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES -----	li
 Chapter I: Introduction: Reproductive Rights and Comparative Constitutional Law -----	 1
A. The U.S. Supreme Court's Abortion Decisions-----	2
Roe v. Wade, 410 U.S. 113 (1973) -----	5
Note on Doe v. Bolton -----	25
Questions and Comments on Roe and Doe-----	25
Planned Parenthood of Southeastern Pennsylvania v. Casey, 505 U.S. 833 (1992) -----	26
Questions and Comments on <i>Casey</i> -----	75
B. Abortion and Constitutional Law in Canada and Germany-----	76
1. The Morgentaler Decision: Some Background Notes on Abortion and the Constitution in Canada -----	76
Morgentaler, Smoling and Scott v. The Queen, [1988] 1 S.C.R. 30 (Supreme Court of Canada) --	77
Questions and Comments on <i>Morgentaler</i> -----	112
2. Introduction to the German Abortion Decisions -----	113
<i>West German Abortion Decision: A Contrast to Roe v. Wade</i> , 9 John Marshall J. of Prac. & Proc. 605 (1978)-----	115
Questions and Comments on the 1975 German Abortion Decision -----	133
Abortion and Reunification in Germany -----	133
The 1993 Decision: Gerald L. Neuman, Casey in the Mirror: Abortion, Abuse and the Right to Protection in the United States and Germany, 43 Am. J. Comp. L. 273 (1995) -----	134
Questions and Comments on the 1993 Abortion Decision -----	139
C. Concluding Note on Comparisons-----	140
1. Glendon's Argument-----	140
2. Tribe's Response -----	141

	Page
3. Do Different Constitutional Regimes Matter? -----	142
4. Differences in Constitutional Consensus and Duties -----	142
Chapter II: What Is Comparative Constitutional Law -----	144
A. The Value of Comparative Constitutional Study: Competing Perspectives -----	144
Donald P. Kommers, <i>The Value of Comparative Constitutional Law</i> , 9 John Marshall J. of Prac. & Proc. 685 (1976) -----	146
Günter Frankenberg, <i>Critical Comparisons: Re-thinking Comparative Law</i> , 26 Harv. Int'l L.J. 411 (1985) -----	150
Questions and Comments -----	153
B. Comparing Legal Decisions and the Concept of Borrowings	
1. The Death Penalty: Stanford and Soering -----	153
Stanford v. Kentucky, 492 U.S. 361 (1989) -----	153
Soering v. United Kingdom, 11 EHRR 439 (1989) (European Court of Human Rights) -----	157
2. The Relevance of Practical Concerns in the Study of Comparative Constitutional Law -----	167
3. The Relevance of Comparative Constitutional Law in Generating Philosophical or Social Scientific "Hypotheses" -----	168
4. Dispelling the Sense of False Necessity and Learning About Other Cultures -----	169
5. Note on Constitutional "Borrowing" and Other Transnational Influences -----	169
a. Influences in Hungary? -----	171
b. Influences in Turkey? -----	171
c. U.S. Freedom Support Act -----	171
d. Ethnocentricity? -----	172
e. Inevitability of Borrowings? -----	172
f. Comparative Constitutional Law for Domestic Purposes -----	172
g. Comparative Experience and Public Opinion ----	173
6. Note on Constitutionalism, Sovereignty and International Agreements -----	173
7. Note on the Unit of Comparison: The Irish Experience With Reproductive Freedom and Popular Initiative -----	174
a. Compared to What? -----	180
b. Candidates for Determining the Unit of Comparison -----	181
c. Frankenberg's Critique of "Functionalism" -----	182
8. Critical Comparison? -----	186
Questions and Comments -----	188

	Page
Chapter III: Constitutions and Constitutionalism	190
A. General Considerations	190
Cass Sunstein, <i>Constitutionalism and Secession</i> , 58 U. Chi. L. Rev. 633 (1991)	190
Questions and Comments on Sunstein	195
Walter F. Murphy, <i>Constitutions, Constitutionalism, and Democracy</i> , in <i>Constitutionalism and Democracy: Transitions in the Contemporary World</i> (Douglas Green- berg, Stanley N. Katz, Melanie Beth Oliviero and Steven C. Wheatley eds., 1993)	195
Questions and Comments on Murphy	206
Edward McWhinney, <i>Constitution-Making: Principles, Process, Practice</i> (1981)	207
Daniel P. Franklin & Michael J. Baun (eds.), <i>Political Cul- ture and Constitutionalism: A Comparative Approach</i> (1994)	213
B. Constitutions without Constitutionalism	222
H.W.O. Okoth-Ogendo, <i>Constitutions Without Constitu- tionalism: Reflections on an African Political Paradox</i> , in <i>Constitutionalism and Democracy: Transitions in the Contemporary World</i> (Douglas Greenberg, Stanley N. Katz, Melanie Beth Oliviero and Steven C. Wheatley eds., 1993)	222
Questions and Comments on Okoth-Ogendo	233
Carlos Santiago Nino, <i>Transition to Democracy, Corpora- tism and Presidentialism with Special Reference to Latin America</i> , in <i>Constitutionalism and Democracy: Transitions in the Contemporary World</i> (Douglas Green- berg, Stanley N. Katz, Melanie Beth Oliviero and Steven C. Wheatley eds., 1993)	234
Note on Constitutions as Obstacles to Constitutionalism ----	246
Note on the People's Republic of China	247
Note on the Role of International (or Extra-National) Influences in Promoting Domestic Constitution-Making or Interpretation	249
Chapter IV: Constitutional Moments and Transitions	251
A. Constitutional Change and Constitutional Legitimacy	251
1. Consent and Legitimacy	251

	Page
Walter F. Murphy, Consent and Constitutional Change, in Human Rights and Constitutional Law (James O'Reilly ed., 1992) -----	251
Note on Murphy and the Intemporal Problem-----	257
Historical Note on Adoption of Post-World War II Constitutions in Germany and Japan -----	258
2. Constitution-Making: Clean Breaks or Evolutionary Change? -----	260
Jon Elster, <i>Essay: Forces and Mechanisms in the Constitution-Making Process</i> , 45 Duke L.J. 364 (1995) -----	261
Bruce Ackerman, The Future of Liberal Revolution (1992) -----	266
Gary Jeffrey Jacobsohn, Apple of Gold: Constitutionalism in Israel and the United States (1993)	275
Stanley N. Katz, Constitutionalism in East Central Europe: Some Negative Lessons from the American Experience (1993)-----	283
Questions and Comments on Constitutional Transitions -----	287
B. Modern Constitutional Regime Change: Principle and Compromise -----	287
1. Constitutions of Principle or Compromise: Poland-----	288
Wiktor Osiatynski, <i>The Constitution-Making Process in Poland</i> , 13 Law and Policy 125 (1991) and <i>Perspectives on the Current Constitutional Situation in Poland</i> , in Constitutionalism and Democracy: Transitions in the Contemporary World (Douglas Greenberg, Stanley N. Katz, Melanie Beth Oliviero and Steven C. Wheatley eds., 1993)	288
Osiatynski (1991) -----	288
Osiatynski (1993) -----	293
Questions and Comments on the Idea of a Constitution of Principle -----	297
2. Eastern Europe and Constitutional Change-----	298
András Sajó and Vera Losonci, <i>Rule by Law in East Central Europe: Is the Emperor's New Suit a Straitjacket?</i> , in Constitutionalism and Democracy: Transitions in the Contemporary World (Douglas Greenberg, Stanley N. Katz, Melanie Beth Oliviero and Steven C. Wheatley eds., 1993)	298
Questions and Comments on Sajó and Losonci -----	309

	Page
Stephen Holmes and Cass R. Sunstein, <i>The Politics of Constitutional Revision in Eastern Europe</i> , in <i>Responding to Imperfection: The Theory and Practice of Constitutional Amendment</i> (Sanford Levinson ed., 1995) -----	310
Questions and Comments on Entrenchment and Amendment -----	326
Note on South Africa's Procedure for Adopting a New Constitution and the Possibility of Unconstitutional Constitutions and Amendments -----	326
a. Historical and Political Context -----	327
In re Certification of the Constitution of the R.S.A., 1996 (4) S.A. 744, 776-79 (Constitutional Court, Sept. 6, 1996) -----	327
b. The Multi-Party Negotiating Process, The Interim Constitution, and the Role of the Constitutional Court -----	329
Questions and Comments -----	332
Note on Historical Context in Constitutionalism: Incrementalism and Clean Breaks -----	333
C. Constitutional Transitions And the Problem of "Lustration" ---	334
1. Notes on the Problem of the Prior Regime in U.S. Constitutional History -----	335
2. Retroactivity, The Rule of Law, and Doing Justice in Eastern Europe -----	336
Ruti Teitel, <i>Paradoxes in the Revolution of the Rule of Law</i> , 19 Yale J. Int'l L. 239 (1994) --	336
László Sólyom, <i>The Hungarian Constitutional Court and Social Change</i> , 19 Yale J. Int'l L. 223 (1994) -----	342
Decision on the Act on the Illegality of the Communist Regime (Dec. 21, 1993) Constitutional Court of the Czech Republic, in III Transitional Justice: How Emerging Democracies Reckon with Former Regimes 620 (Neil J. Kritz ed., 1995) -----	347
Questions and Comments on Transitional Justice -----	354
Chapter V: Constitutional Entrenchment, Courts and Democracy	
A. Constitutionalism Without a Constitution? -----	357
1. The Constitution of the United Kingdom -----	358
S.E. Finer, Vernon Bogdanor, & Bernard Rudden, <i>On the Constitution of the U.K.</i> , in <i>Comparing Constitutions</i> (1995) -----	358
Questions and Comments -----	370

	Page
2. Introduction to the History of the Bill of Rights Debate in Great Britain -----	370
Michael Zander, <i>A Bill of Rights?</i> (3d ed. 1985) ----	375
Ronald Dworkin, <i>A Bill of Rights for Britain</i> (1990) -----	387
Questions and Comments -----	403
Mark Tushnet, <i>Living with a Bill of Rights</i> , in <i>Un-</i> <i>derstanding Human Rights</i> (Connor Gearty and	
Adam Tomkins eds., 1995) -----	403
Questions and Comments -----	411
B. Constitutionalism Without Entrenchment? -----	413
1. Legislative Override in Canada -----	415
Mark Tushnet, <i>Policy Distortion and Democratic</i> <i>Debilitation: Comparative Illumination of the</i> <i>Countermajoritarian Difficulty</i> , 94 Mich. L.	
Rev. 245 (1995) -----	415
Questions and Comments -----	425
2. Constitutional Entrenchment and Legislative Overrides in the U.S. -----	427
Katzenbach v. Morgan, 384 U.S. 641 (1966) -----	428
Boerne v. Flores, 521 U.S. 507 (1997) -----	434
Questions and Comments -----	441
C. Constitutional Review Without a Bill of Rights -----	442
Australian Capital Television Pty. Ltd. v. Commonwealth of Australia, (1992) 177 CLR 106 (High Court of Australia)	443
Questions and Comments -----	450
Note on the Status of Basic Laws in Israel -----	452
Chapter VI: Courts and Constitutionalism -----	455
A. Structure and Function of Constitutional Courts: An Introduc- tion -----	456
1. Centralized v. Decentralized Review -----	456
2. The Possible Significance of Civil Law vs. Common Law Traditions -----	457
a. Civil Law Judges -----	457
b. Stare Decisis -----	458
c. Case or Controversy Limitations -----	458
d. Convergence -----	459
Louis Favoreu, <i>Constitutional Review in Europe</i> , in <i>Consti-</i> <i>tutionalism and Rights: The Influence of the United</i> <i>States Constitution Abroad</i> (Louis Henkin and Albert	
J. Rosenthal eds., 1990) -----	459

	Page
Allan-Randolph Brewer Carias, <i>Judicial Review in Comparative Law</i> (1989) -----	477
Questions and Comments -----	487
B. Structure, Composition, Appointment and Jurisdiction of Constitutional Courts: The U.S., Germany, France, and Eastern Europe -----	488
1. Survey of Constitutional Courts, Jurisdiction and Composition -----	489
2. The United States and the U.S. Supreme Court -----	492
Henry Paul Monaghan, <i>The Confirmation Process: Law or Politics</i> , 101 Harv. L. Rev. 1202 (1988) ---	493
Lee Epstein, "A Better Way to Appoint Justices," <i>The Christian Science Monitor</i> (Mar. 17, 1992) ---	496
Questions and Comments -----	497
3. France and the Conseil Constitutionnel -----	498
John Bell, <i>French Constitutional Law</i> (1992) -----	500
Alec Stone, <i>The Birth of Judicial Politics in France: The Constitutional Council in Comparative Perspective</i> (1992) -----	507
Comments and Questions -----	516
4. Germany and its Federal Constitutional Court -----	516
a. Historical Background -----	516
b. The German Constitutional Court: Creation, Jurisdiction, Status -----	518
c. The German Constitutional Court and the Appointments Process Donald P. Kommers, <i>Judicial Politics in West Germany</i> (1976) -----	526
Comments and Questions -----	538
5. The Constitutional Courts of Eastern Europe -----	539
a. Constitutional Transitions and Constitutional Judges -----	540
b. Term Limits for Constitutional Judges? -----	540
c. Transitions and Institutional Capital -----	540
d. Countermajoritarianism and International Norms -----	541
e. Incrementalism in Establishing Constitutional Tribunals -----	541
f. Incrementalism, Social Welfare Rights and Judicial Review -----	542
C. Constitutional Courts and Foundational Cases -----	542
1. Germany and the Southwest Case -----	543

	Page
Southwest Case, 1 BVerfGE 14 (1951) (Federal Constitutional Court of Germany), from Walter F. Murphy and Joseph Tanenhaus, <i>Comparative Constitutional Law: Cases and Commentaries</i> (1977) -----	544
Selected Provisions of the Basic Law for the Federal Republic of Germany (official translation, 1994) -----	548
Questions and Comments -----	552
2. France and the 1971 Decision on Associations -----	552
Alec Stone, <i>The Birth of Judicial Politics in France</i> (1992) -----	553
The 1971 Decision on Freedom of Association, and the 1962 Decision on the Referendum, from John Bell, <i>French Constitutional Law</i> (1992) -----	558
Selected Portions of French Constitutional Texts----	560
1958 Constitution-----	560
Preamble to the Constitution of 27 October 1946 -----	562
Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen (1789) -----	564
3. Israel, and the Bergman and Elon Moreh Decisions-----	566
Martin Edelman, <i>The Changing Role of the Israeli Supreme Court</i> , in <i>Comparative Judicial Systems: Challenging Frontiers in Conceptual and Empirical Analysis</i> (John R. Schmidhauser ed. 1987)-----	566
Gary Jeffrey Jacobsohn, <i>Apple of Gold: Constitutionalism in Israel and the United States</i> (1993) -----	577
Ronen Shamir, <i>"Landmark Cases" and the Reproduction of Legitimacy: The Case of Israel's High Court of Justice</i> , 24 <i>Law and Society Rev.</i> 781 (1990)-----	595
Questions and Comments -----	603
4. Hungary and South Africa on the Death Penalty-----	605
a. South Africa's Makwanyane Decision (1995) ----	605
b. Hungary's Death Penalty Decision (1990) -----	606
D. Adjudicatory Procedures-----	607
1. The United States Supreme Court: Procedure and Justiciability -----	609
Allen v. Wright, 468 U.S. 737 (1984) -----	611
Questions and Comments -----	620
2. France and the Conseil Constitutionnel -----	621
John Bell, <i>French Constitutional Law</i> (1992) -----	621

	Page
3. Germany's Constitutional Court -----	633
Donald Kommers, <i>The Constitutional Jurisprudence of The Federal Republic of Germany</i> (1989) -----	633
Questions and Comments -----	640
E. Justiciability, Judicial Activism, and The Effects of Different Forms of Judicial Review on Legislative Roles -----	640
1. India and Public Interest Litigation -----	641
Carl Baar, <i>Social Action Litigation in India: The Operation and Limits of the World's Most Active Judiciary</i> , in <i>Comparative Judicial Review and Public Policy</i> (Donald W. Jackson and C. Neal Tate eds., 1992) -----	643
Questions and Comments -----	650
Jamie Cassels, <i>Judicial Activism and Public Interest Litigation in India: Attempting the Impossible?</i> , 37 <i>Am. J. Comp. L.</i> 495 (1989) -----	651
Questions and Comments -----	662
2. On "Intermediate Societies" and Public Interest Litigation -----	663
Mauro Cappelletti, <i>The Judicial Process in Comparative Perspective</i> (1989) -----	663
Questions and Comments -----	666
3. Eastern Europe and Russia -----	666
Robert Sharlet, <i>Chief Justice as Judicial Politician</i> , 2 <i>East European Constitutional Review</i> 32 (Spring 1993) -----	667
Herbert Hausmaninger, <i>Towards a "New" Russian Constitutional Court</i> , 28 <i>Cornell Int'l L.J.</i> 349 (1995) -----	675
Questions and Comments -----	693
4. The Question of "Juridification" -----	696
Alec Stone, <i>Abstract Constitutional Review and Policy Making in Western Europe</i> , in <i>Comparative Judicial Review and Public Policy</i> (Donald W. Jackson & C. Neal Tate eds., 1992) -----	697
Questions and Comments -----	707
Chapter VII: Separation of Powers: Governments, Courts and Foreign/Military Affairs -----	709
A. Comparative Structures of Representative Government: Parliamentary or Presidential Systems; Voting -----	710
1. Parliamentary or Presidential? -----	710

	Page
2. Allocations of Powers-----	711
3. Electoral Systems-----	713
B. Legislative and Executive Power in Foreign and Military Affairs: Representative Decisionmaking and Commitment to Hostilities -----	714
German Commercial Treaty Case, 12 BVerfGE 372 (1952) (Federal Constitutional Court of Germany), from Hersch Lauterpacht ed., <i>International Law Reports</i> for 1952 (1957) -----	716
Loving v. U.S., 517 U.S. 748 (1996)-----	718
Questions and Comments -----	731
Lori Fisler Damrosch, <i>Constitutional Control Over War Powers: A Common Core of Accountability in Democratic Societies</i> , 50 U. Miami L. Rev. 181(1995) -----	731
Questions and Comments -----	744
C. Foreign Affairs, Military Decisions and the Courts: Of Justicia- bility and Political Questions -----	744
1. "Political Questions" and Foreign Affairs in the U.S.-----	744
Goldwater v. Carter, 444 U.S. 996 (1979)-----	744
Questions and Comments -----	752
2. Is There a "Political Question" Doctrine in Germany? ---	752
Thomas M. Franck, <i>Political Questions/Judicial Answers: Does The Rule of Law Apply to Foreign Affairs?</i> (1992)-----	757
Questions and Comments -----	770
3. Political Questions, Law and Legitimacy-----	770
Anne-Marie Slaughter-Burley, <i>Are Foreign Affairs Different?</i> (reviewing Thomas M. Franck, <i>Politi- cal Questions/Judicial Answers</i>), 106 Harv. L. Rev. 1980 (1993) -----	770
Questions and Comments -----	777
4. Political Questions and the "Legalization" of Politics ----	778
Michael Mandel, <i>The Charter of Rights and the Legalization of Politics in Canada</i> (1989) -----	778
Questions and Comments -----	788
Chapter VIII: Federalism: Power Sharing and Minority Protection -----	789
A. Federal Structure and Political Power: U.S., Canada, Germany, Switzerland and Europe -----	791
1. The United States -----	791
2. Canadian Federalism -----	792

	Page
Martha Field, <i>The Differing Federalisms of Canada and the United States</i> , 55 Law and Contemporary Problems 107 (1992) -----	793
The Labatt Case: Introduction by Peter H. Russell, Rainer Knopff and Ted Morton eds., <i>Federalism and the Charter</i> (1989) -----	803
Labatt v. Attorney General of Canada, [1980] 1 S.C.R. 914 (Supreme Court of Canada) -----	804
The Crown Zellerbach Case: Introduction by Peter H. Russell, Rainer Knopff and Ted Morton eds., <i>Federalism and the Charter</i> (1989) -----	812
Regina v. Crown Zellerbach Canada Ltd., [1988] 1 S.C.R. 401 (Supreme Court of Canada) -----	813
Questions and Comments -----	822
3. German Federalism -----	825
a. "Bundestreue" and the Legislative Competence of the Länder -----	826
The First Television Case (1961), 12 BVerfGE 205 (Federal Constitutional Court of Germany) From Walter F. Murphy and Joseph Tanenhaus, <i>Comparative Constitutional Law: Cases and Materials</i> (1977) -----	827
b. The Reserved Powers of the German Länder and the Concordat Case (1957) -----	831
Concordat Case 6 BVerfGE 309 (1957 (Federal Constitutional Court of Germany) From Walter F. Murphy and Joseph Tanenhaus, <i>Comparative Constitutional Law: Cases and Materials</i> (1977) -----	831
Questions and Comments -----	834
c. Länder Authority Over Government Structure and Employees -----	835
d. Bundestreue as a Constraint on the Länder: The Hesse Atomic Weapons Referendum Case ---	836
e. "Administrative Federalism," the Role of the Bundesrat and the "Bundesrat Case", excerpted from Donald Kommers, <i>The Constitutional Jurisprudence of the Federal Republic of Germany</i> (1989) -----	837
Pension Insurance Amendment Case ("Bundesrat Case") (1975), 37 BVerfGE 363 (Federal Constitutional Court of Germany) Translation by Donald P. Kommers, <i>The Constitutional Jurisprudence of the Federal Republic of Germany</i> (1989) -----	839

	Page
4. Swiss Federalism-----	843
Otto Kaufman, <i>Swiss Federalism</i> , in <i>Forging Unity Out of Diversity: The Approaches of Eight Nations</i> (Robert Goldwin, Art Kaufman, and William Schambra eds., 1985)-----	845
Thomas O. Hueglin, <i>New Wine in Old Bottles? Federalism and Nation States in the Twenty-First Century: A Conceptual Overview</i> , in <i>Rethinking Federalism: Citizens, Markets and Governments in a Changing World</i> (Karen Knop, Sylvia Ostry, Richard Simeon and Katherine Swinton eds., 1995) -----	859
Questions and Comments -----	862
Note on Federalism and Finances -----	865
1. Government Structure-----	866
2. Equalization-----	867
3. Constitutional Culture-----	868
4. Judicial Review-----	868
5. Spending Powers and Centralization? -----	869
5. Federalism, Centralization and Decentralization: The European Union and Subsidiarity -----	870
George A. Bermann, <i>Taking Subsidiarity Seriously Federalism in the European Community and the United States</i> , 94 Colum. L. Rev. 331 (1994)-----	870
Questions and Comments -----	885
Note on Federalism and Constitutionalism Beyond National Borders -----	886
B. Federalism and the Protection/Accommodation of Minorities: Canada, Belgium, Ethiopia, and the U.S. -----	888
1. Canada -----	889
Barry Strayer, <i>The Canadian Constitution and Diversity</i> , in <i>Forging Unity Out of Diversity: The Approaches of Eight Nations</i> (Robert Goldwin, Art Kaufman, and William Schambra eds., 1985) -----	891
Excerpts from Canadian Constitutional Provisions	905
The Ford v. Quebec Case: Introduction by, Peter H. Russell, Rainer Knopff and Ted Morton eds., <i>Federalism and the Charter</i> (1989) -----	907
Ford v. Quebec (Attorney General), [1988] 2 S.C.R. 712 (Supreme Court of Canada) -----	910
James Tully, <i>Strange Multiplicity: Constitutionalism in an Age of Diversity</i> (1995)-----	920

	Page
Questions and Comments -----	923
a. Max Nemni, <i>Ethnic Nationalism and the Destabilization of the Canadian Federation</i> , in <i>Evaluating Federal Systems</i> 143 (Bertus deVilliers ed., 1994)-----	923
b. Richard Simeon, <i>Canada and the United States: Lessons from the North American Experience</i> , in <i>Rethinking Federalism</i> (Karen Knop, Sylvia Ostrey, Richard Simeon and Katherine Swinton eds., 1995) -----	923
c. Colin H. Williams, <i>A Requiem for Canada</i> , in <i>Federalism: The Multiethnic Challenge</i> 66 (Graham Smith ed., 1995)-----	924
d. Alain-G Gagnon, <i>Manufacturing Antagonisms: The Move Toward Uniform Federalism in Canada</i> , in <i>Evaluating Federal Systems</i> 138 (Bertus deVilliers ed., 1994) --	925
2. Belgium -----	925
Richard Cullen, <i>Adaptive Federalism in Belgium</i> , 13 <i>University of New South Wales Law Journal</i> 346 (1990)-----	925
Alexander Murphy, <i>Belgium's Regional Divergence: Along the Road to Federation</i> , in <i>Federalism: The Multiethnic Challenge</i> (Graham Smith ed., 1995) -----	934
Questions and Comments -----	946
Note on Northern Ireland -----	948
3. Ethiopia-----	949
Minasse Haile, <i>The New Ethiopian Constitution: Its Impact Upon Unity, Human Rights, and Development</i> , 20 <i>Suffolk Transnational L. Rev.</i> 1 (1996) -----	949
Questions and Comments -----	962
Note on the United States-----	963
Mark Tushnet, <i>Federalism and Liberalism</i> , 4 <i>Cardozo J. of Int'l & Comp. L.</i> 329 (1996) -----	965
Questions and Comments -----	975
Martha Minow, <i>Putting Up and Putting Down: Tolerance Reconsidered</i> , in <i>Comparative Constitutional Federalism: Europe and America</i> (Mark Tushnet ed., 1990) -----	976
Chapter IX: Pluralism, Rights, and Democracy -----	988
A. The United States-----	989
Regents of University of California v. Bakke 438 U.S. 265 (1978) -----	989

	Page
Notes on Fullilove v. Klutznick, 448 U.S. 448 (1980) and City of Richmond v. Croson, 488 U.S. 469 (1989)-----	1025
Adarand Constructors, Inc. v. Pena, 515 U.S. 200 (1995) -----	1026
Note on the Use of Race in Drawing Voting Dis- tricts -----	1044
Questions and Comments -----	1045
B. Pluralism and Democracy: The Positive State and Affirmative Action in India-----	1046
1. Selected Provisions, Constitution of India -----	1047
2. Background Readings on India -----	1051
Fali Sam Nariman, <i>The Indian Constitution: An Ex- periment in Unity Amid Diversity</i> , in Forging Unity Out of Diversity: The Approaches of Eight Nations (Robert Goldwin, Art Kaufman and William A. Schambra eds., 1985) -----	1051
Sankaran Krishna, <i>Constitutionalism, Democracy and Political Culture in India</i> , in Political Cul- ture and Constitutionalism (Daniel P. Franklin and Michael J. Baun eds., 1994) -----	1077
3. Compensatory Discrimination in India -----	1077
Marc Galanter, Law and Society in Modern India (1989) -----	1077
Symbolic Activism: A Judicial Encounter with the Counters of India's Compensatory Dis- crimination Policy -----	1077
State of Kerala v. N.M. Thomas, A.I.R. 1976 S.C. 490 (Supreme Court of India) -----	1091
Marc Galanter, Law and Society in Modern India (1989) -----	1107
Pursuing Equality in the Land of Hierarchy: An Assessment of India's Policies of Com- pensatory Discrimination for Historically Disadvantaged Groups -----	1107
Marc Galanter, Competing Equalities: Law and the Backward Classes in India (1984) -----	1116
Questions and Comments -----	1120
Thomas Sowell, Preferential Policies: An International Perspective (1990)-----	1122
Questions and Comments -----	1129
Bhikku Parekh, India's Diversity, in Dissent (Summer 1996) -----	1130
Questions and Comments -----	1134

	Page
Note on Pluralism, Federalism, Group-Based Rights and Gender Equality -----	1136
Note on Citizenship -----	1139
a. Entrenched Definitions? -----	1141
b. Treatment of Noncitizens -----	1141
c. Admission of Noncitizens -----	1141
d. National Minorities -----	1141
Chapter X: Religious Pluralism and Constitutional Law -----	1143
A. Introduction -----	1143
1. State Support or Supervision: Examples -----	1144
a. Israel -----	1144
Asher Maoz, <i>Religious Human Rights in the State of Israel</i> , in <i>Religious Human Rights in Global Perspective: Legal Perspectives</i> (Johan D. van der Vyver and John Witte, Jr. eds., 1996) -----	1144
Ruth Lapidoth, <i>Freedom of Religion and Of Conscience in Israel</i> , 47 <i>Cath. U. L. Rev.</i> 441 (1998) -----	1149
Questions and Comments -----	1155
b. Greece -----	1155
c. Germany -----	1156
d. United States -----	1156
2. An Analytic Framework -----	1157
W. Cole Durham, <i>Perspectives on Religious Liberty: A Comparative Framework</i> , in <i>Religious Human Rights in Global Perspective: Legal Perspectives</i> (Johan D. van der Vyver and John Witte, Jr. eds., 1996) -----	1157
Questions and Comments -----	1166
3. Tension Between Constitutionalism and Religious Freedom? -----	1167
Makau Wa Matua, <i>Limitations on Religious Rights: Problematizing Religious Freedom in the African Context</i> , in <i>Religious Human Rights in Global Perspective: Legal Perspectives</i> (Johan D. van der Vyver and John Witte, Jr. eds., 1996) -----	1167
B. Problems of "Establishment" -----	1169
1. Religion and the Schools -----	1169
German School Prayer Case, 52 BVerfGE 223 (1979) (Federal Constitutional Court of Germany) Excerpted from Donald P. Kommers, <i>The Constitutional Jurisprudence of the Federal Republic of Germany</i> (2d ed. 1997) -----	1169

	Page
Questions and Comments -----	1174
German Classroom Crucifix Case II, 93 BVerfGE 1 (1995) (Federal Constitutional Court of Ger- many) Excerpted from and based upon Donald P. Kommers, <i>The Constitutional Jurisprudence of the Federal Republic of Germany</i> (2d ed. 1997)--	1174
Questions and Comments -----	1184
2. Other Public Endorsement of (Arguably) Religious Practices: Japan and the United States -----	1188
a. Japan -----	1188
Selected Provisions of Japan's Constitution--	1189
Kakunaga v. Sekiguchi, 31 Minshu 4 (1977) (Supreme Court of Japan, Grand Bench)--	1190
b. United States-----	1201
Lynch v. Donnelly, 465 U.S. 668 (1984) -----	1203
Questions and Comments -----	1208
1. "Not very" Religious? -----	1208
2. India and Defining Religion-----	1210
3. Religion and Ethnicity-----	1211
C. Problems of Religious Liberty and Cultural Preservation -----	1212
Wisconsin v. Yoder, 406 U.S. 205 (1972)-----	1213
Questions and Comments -----	1222
Kokkinakis v. Greece, 17 EHRR 397 (1993) (European Court of Human Rights) -----	1223
Questions and Comments -----	1244
1. Defending Wisconsin and Greece?-----	1244
2. Representation, Majorities and Minorities, and Judicial Review-----	1244
3. Russia, Religious Preferences and Constitutional Transition-----	1245
4. Civil and Criminal Penalties; State Action and Proportionality -----	1246
5. Transitions, Religious Establishment and Com- pensatory Justice in Eastern Europe-----	1247
6. Historical Specificity vs. Universality -----	1247
XI. Freedoms of Expression and Association and the State Ac- tion Problem -----	1248
A. A European Perspective on U.S. and European Free Speech/ Free Press Freedoms -----	1248
Roger Errera, "The Freedom of the Press: The United States, France, and Other European Countries," in <i>Con- stitutionalism and Rights: The Influence of the United States Constitution Abroad</i> (Louis Henkin and Albert J. Rosenthal eds., 1990)-----	1249

	Page
B. Free Speech, Hate Speech, and Commercial Speech -----	1266
1. Canada -----	1267
Kent Greenawalt, <i>Free Speech in the United States and Canada</i> , 55 Law & Contemp. Probs. 5 (1992) -----	1267
Regina v. Keegstra et al., [1990] 3 S.C.R. 697 (Supreme Court of Canada) -----	1276
Note on Attis v. Board of School Trustees, [1996] 1 S.C.R. 825 (Supreme Court of Canada) -----	1308
Kathleen Mahoney, <i>The Canadian Constitutional Approach to Freedom of Expression in Hate Propaganda and Pornography</i> , 55 Law & Contemp. Probs. 77 (1992) -----	1309
Regina v. Butler, [1992] 1 S.C.R. 452 (Supreme Court of Canada) -----	1319
Questions and Comments -----	1328
1. Durability of Canada's Proportionality Doctrine -----	1328
2. Balancing Tests in the U.S.? -----	1328
Note on Commercial Speech and RJR-MacDonald Inc. v. Attorney General, [1995] 3 S.C.R. 199 ---	1330
RJR-MacDonald v. Attorney General, [1995] 3 S.C.R. 199 (Supreme Court of Canada) -----	1330
Questions and Comments -----	1335
2. The United States -----	1336
R.A.V. v. City of St. Paul, 505 U.S. 377 (1992) -----	1336
Questions and Comments -----	1354
C. Free Speech and Association Without a Constitution? A Quick Look at the U.K. and Israel -----	1360
1. Israel -----	1360
Daphna Sharfman, <i>Living Without a Constitution: Civil Rights in Israel</i> (1993) -----	1360
2. Britain -----	1365
Nathan Courtney, <i>British and United States Hate Speech Legislation: A Comparison</i> , 19 Brook. J. Int'l L. 727 (1993) -----	1365
Ronald J. Krotosynski, Jr., <i>Brind and Rust v. Sullivan: Free Speech and the Limits of a Written Constitution</i> , 22 Fl. St. U. L. Rev. 1 (1994) -----	1377
Questions and Comments -----	1383

	Page
Note on Campaign Finance and Freedoms of Speech and Expression -----	1384
Note on Pre-constitutional Traditions and Freedom of Speech in Botswana -----	1386
D. Defamation and the Constitutional Protection of Expression---	1387
1. The United States -----	1387
New York Times Co. v. Sullivan, 376 U.S. 254 (1964) -----	1387
2. Germany: The Lüth and Böll Cases -----	1402
The Lüth Case, 7 BVerfGE 198 (1958) (Federal Constitutional Court of Germany) Translation from Donald P. Kommers, The Constitutional Jurisprudence of the Federal Republic of Germany (1989) -----	1403
The Böll Case, 54 BVerfGE 208 (1980) (Federal Constitutional Court of Germany) Introduction and translation from Donald P. Kommers, The Constitutional Jurisprudence of the Federal Republic of Germany (1989) -----	1409
Questions and Comments -----	1412
E. State Action, Nongovernment Conduct and Rights -----	1413
Retail, Wholesale & Department Store Union, Local 580 v. Dolphin Delivery Ltd., [1986] 2 S.C.R. 573 (Supreme Court of Canada) -----	1414
Notes on the State Action Problem-----	1418
a. Scope Note -----	1418
b. The Charter and the Common Law -----	1418
c. United States -----	1419
i. Common Law Rules-----	1420
ii. Who is the Government? -----	1420
iii. Balancing -----	1423
d. Germany-----	1424
e. South Africa -----	1426
f. Interpretation in Light of a Constitution -----	1430
g. State Action and Affirmative Duties -----	1434
h. Conclusion -----	1435
XII. Social Welfare Rights-----	1436
A. Introduction: Selected Constitutional Provisions -----	1437
1. Irish Constitution (1937) -----	1437
2. Italian Constitution (1948) -----	1438
Questions and Comments -----	1439

	Page
B. Judicial Enforcement of Social Welfare Rights-----	1440
Asahi v. Japan, 21 Minshu 5 (1967) (Supreme Court of Japan)-----	1441
Dandridge v. Williams, 397 U.S. 471 (1970) -----	1444
Questions and Comments -----	1446
Note on Polish Family Allowance Case and German “Sozialstaat” -----	1451
C. The Debate Over Including Social Welfare Rights in Eastern European Constitutions -----	1452
1. Hungary as a Case Study -----	1452
Hungarian Benefits Case, 43/1995 (VI.30) AB Deci- sion (Constitutional Court of Hungary) 4 E. Eur. Case Rep. Const. L. 64 (1997) (English Transla- tion)-----	1452
Questions and Comments -----	1464
András Sajó, <i>How the Rule of Law Killed Hungar- ian Welfare Reform</i> , East European Constitu- tional Review, vol. 5 no. 1 (Winter 1996)-----	1465
Questions and Comments -----	1475
2. General Considerations -----	1476
Mark Tushnet, <i>Civil Rights and Social Rights: The Future of the Reconstruction Amendments</i> , 25 Loyola (L.A.) L. Rev. 1207 (1992) -----	1476
Questions and Comments -----	1481
Cass Sunstein, <i>Against Positive Rights</i> , in Western Rights? Post-Communist Application (András Sajó ed., 1996) -----	1482
Wiktor Osiatynski, <i>Social and Economic Rights in a New Constitution for Poland</i> , in Western Rights? Post-Communist Application (András Sajó ed., 1996) -----	1485
Questions and Comments -----	1496
INDEX -----	1499