

CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION	1
2. <i>TRAVAUX PRÉPARATOIRES</i> OF THE FAIR TRIAL PROVISIONS – ARTICLES 8 TO 11 – OF THE UNIVERSAL DECLARATION OF HUMAN RIGHTS	5
A. General Procedure	5
B. Article 10	11
1. Discussion	12
2. Interpretation	15
C. Article 11	16
1. Discussion	16
2. Interpretation	23
D. Article 9	23
1. Discussion	24
2. Interpretation	28
E. Article 8	29
1. Discussion	29
2. Interpretation	32
F. Conclusion	33
3. <i>TRAVAUX PRÉPARATOIRES</i> OF THE FAIR TRIAL PROVISIONS – ARTICLES 14 AND 15 – OF THE INTERNATIONAL COVENANT ON CIVIL AND POLITICAL RIGHTS	35
A. General Procedure	35
B. Article 14	43
1. Introduction and Initial Proposals	44
2. Second Session of the Commission	45
3. The Second Session of the Drafting Committee	46
4. Third to Fifth Sessions of the Commission	48
a. Scope of the Article	50
b. Independence and Impartiality	51
c. Public Trial	52
d. Equality before the Courts	53
e. Compensation for Erroneous Convictions	53
f. Draft Wording at the End of the Commission's Fifth Session	54

Contents

5.	The Sixth Session of the Commission	54
a.	Paragraph 1 – A Fair and Public Hearing	55
b.	Paragraph 2 – Presumption of Innocence and Minimum-Guarantees	56
c.	Sub-paragraph (b) – The Right to Counsel	57
d.	Sub-paragraph (c) – The Right to Obtain Witnesses	58
e.	Sub-paragraph (e) – Protection from Self-Incrimination	58
f.	Sub-paragraph (f) – Treatment of Minors	58
g.	Paragraph 3 – Compensation	60
6.	The Seventh Session of the Commission	61
a.	The Report by the International Group of Experts on the Prevention of Crime and the Treatment of Offenders	61
b.	The European Convention Study	61
c.	The General Adequacy of Article 14	63
7.	The Eighth Session of the Commission	63
a.	Right to a Fair and Public Hearing	64
b.	Publicity of the Proceedings and the Judgement	65
c.	Facilities and Time for the Preparation of a Defence	66
d.	Right to Examine Witnesses	67
e.	Compensation for Miscarriage of Justice	67
8.	The Fourteenth Session of the General Assembly – The Third Committee	69
a.	Paragraph 1 – A Fair and Public Hearing	69
b.	Paragraph 2	72
c.	Paragraph 4 – Compensation in Cases of Miscarriages of Justice	73
d.	Right to Review	74
e.	Double Jeopardy	74
f.	Adoption by the General Assembly in Plenary	75
C.	Article 15	75
1.	Introduction and Initial Proposals	75
2.	Second Session of the Commission	76
3.	The Second Session of the Drafting Committee	77
4.	The Fifth Session of the Commission	78
a.	Duty of State or Right of Individual?	78
b.	Retroactivity of Law and Penalties	79
c.	National or International Law and the Implications for the War Crimes Tribunals	79
d.	Draft Wording at the Conclusion of the Commission's Fifth Session	81
5.	The Sixth Session of the Commission	81
a.	Paragraph 1 – Retroactivity of Legislation and Punishment	81
b.	Paragraph 2 – Implication for the War Crimes Tribunals	82

c.	Draft Wording at the Conclusion of the Commission's Sixth Session	82
6.	The Seventh Session of the Commission	83
a.	The European Convention Study	83
b.	The General Adequacy of Article 14 (Now Article 15)	84
7.	The Eighth Session of the Commission	84
a.	Subsequent Legislation in Favour of the Accused	85
b.	The Implications for the Nürnberg and Tokyo War Crimes Tribunals	85
c.	The Reference to "Civilized Nations"	86
8.	The Fifteenth Session of the General Assembly – The Third Committee	86
a.	Paragraph 2 – The General Principles of Law Recognized by the Community of Nations	89
b.	Adoption by the General Assembly in Plenary	90
D.	Conclusion	90
4.	<i>TRAVAUX PRÉPARATOIRES</i> TO ARTICLE 4 OF THE INTERNATIONAL COVENANT ON CIVIL AND POLITICAL RIGHTS – NON-DEROGABLE RIGHTS – AND HOW THEY REFER TO THE RIGHT TO A FAIR TRIAL	93
A.	Article 4	93
1.	Second Session of the Commission	94
2.	Fifth Session of the Commission	95
3.	Sixth Session of the Commission	99
a.	Paragraph 1 – The Right to Derogate from the Covenant	100
b.	Paragraph 2 – Limitations on the Right to Derogate	101
c.	Paragraph 3 – Duty to Inform the United Nations of Derogations	103
d.	Draft Wording Adopted at the End of the Sixth Session of the Commission	103
4.	Eighth Session of the Commission	104
a.	Paragraph 1 – The Right to Derogate from the Covenant	104
b.	Paragraph 2 – Limitations on the Right to Derogate	107
c.	Paragraph 3 – Duty to Inform the United Nations of Derogations	107
d.	Draft Wording Adopted at the End of the Eighth Session of the Commission	108
5.	The Third Committee	108
6.	Draft Wording Adopted by the Third Committee and Reported to the General Assembly in Plenary	109
B.	Conclusion	110
5.	INTERPRETATIONS OF FAIR TRIAL NORMS BY THE HUMAN RIGHTS COMMITTEE: ARTICLES 14 AND 15 OF THE INTERNATIONAL COVENANT ON CIVIL AND POLITICAL RIGHTS	111
A.	Introduction	111
B.	Notice	112

Contents

1. Notice of Charges must be Timely	113
2. Notice of Charges must be Detailed	114
C. Presumption of Innocence	114
D. Counsel	115
1. Right to Select Counsel	115
2. Right to Appointed Counsel in Capital Cases	116
3. Right to Adequate Counsel	119
4. Opportunity to Prepare Defence	121
E. Hearing	125
1. Right to Prompt Trial	125
a. Promptness Includes Ability to Appeal	128
b. Burden on State to Enforce Right	128
c. Burden on State to Justify Delays	129
d. Economic/Administrative Circumstances not a Justification	129
2. Equality of Arms	130
3. Right to the Free Assistance of an Interpreter	131
4. Right to be Present at Trial	133
5. Right not to be Compelled to Confess Guilt	135
6. Right to Call and Examine Witnesses	136
7. Civil Suits Entitled to Protection	139
8. Limitation on Derogability of Rights in the Trial Process	139
F. Judgement and the Judiciary	141
1. Right to an Independent Judiciary	141
a. Independence Applied to Pre-trial stages	144
b. Independence and Impartiality Applied to the Jury	144
2. Right to a Public Trial	145
3. Right to have Judgement made Public	146
4. Right to Benefit from Lighter Penalty	146
5. Right not to be Held Guilty of any Criminal Offence for an Act or Omission not Constituting a Criminal Offence	147
6. Second Trial for the Same Offence Prohibited	147
G. Right to Appeal	148
1. Extent of Derogability of Right to Appeal	150
2. Review by Constitutional Court	150
H. Remedies	151
I. Conclusion	152
6. CONCLUDING REMARKS	153
BIBLIOGRAPHY	157
INDEX	163