

CONTENTS

FOREWORD	xix
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	xxi
ABBREVIATIONS	xxiii
BIBLIOGRAPHICAL NOTE ON PRINT AND INTERNET RESOURCES	xxv
 CHAPTER I: INTRODUCTION	 1
1. The Evolution of International Concern with Human Rights	1
Louis B. Sohn, <i>The New International Law: Protection of the Rights of Individuals Rather than States</i>	1
2. The History and Place of Human Rights in Regional Organizations	15
Dinah Shelton, <i>The Promise of Regional Human Rights Systems</i>	16
A. The Council of Europe	17
Peter Leuprecht, <i>Innovations in the European System of Human Rights Protection: Is Enlargement Compatible with Reinforcement?</i>	18
i. Applicants for Membership: The Case of Belarus	21
Parliamentary Assembly, <i>Situation in Belarus</i> , Doc. 9543, 13 September 2002 Report	22
Parliamentary Assembly, <i>Situation in Belarus</i> , Doc. 9543, Report of the Debate of 26 September 2002	24
Parliamentary Assembly, Resolution 1306 (2002), <i>Situation in Belarus</i>	25
Reply from the Committee of Ministers to the Parliamentary Assembly	28
ii. Enforcing Obligations against Member States	30
Peter Leuprecht, <i>Innovations in the European System of Human Rights Protection: Is Enlargement Compatible with Reinforcement?</i>	31
iii. Human Rights in Observer States	36
Parliamentary Assembly Res. 1349 (2003), Abolition of the Death Penalty in Council of Europe Observer States	37
B. Other European Institutions	42
i. The European Union	42
Jean-Marie Henckaerts, <i>The Protection of Human Rights in the European Union: Overview</i>	43

<i>Bosphorus Hava Yollari Turizm Ve Ticaret Anonim Şirketi v. Ireland</i>	47
Elizabeth F. Defeis, <i>Human Rights and the European Union: Who Decides? Possible Conflicts between the European Court of Justice and the European Court of Human Rights</i>	55
ii. Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE)	62
Erika Schlager, <i>A Hard Look at Soft Law: The OSCE</i>	66
C. The Americas.	68
i. Human Rights in the Americas 1826–1948.	68
ii. The OAS and Human Rights.	70
Thomas Buergenthal, <i>The Inter-American System for the Protection of Human Rights</i>	71
<i>Interpretation of the American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man within the Framework of Article 64 of the American Convention on Human Rights.</i>	72
iii. Member State Obligations: The Case of Cuba	77
<i>Exclusion of the Present Government of Cuba from Participation in the Inter-American System.</i>	79
iv. Responses to Extra-Legal Assumptions of Power.	80
Article 9, OAS Charter, as Amended by the Protocol of Washington.	81
OAS Permanent Council, <i>The Situation in Peru.</i>	82
OAS Permanent Council, <i>Support for the Democratic Government of Venezuela</i>	82
v. Sanctioning a Government for Human Rights Violations: The Somoza Case	83
Resolution II, XVII Meeting of Consultation of Ministers of Foreign Affairs	84
D. Africa.	85
Rachel Murray, <i>Human Rights in Africa: From the OAU to the African Union (2006)</i>	86

CHAPTER II: THE NORMATIVE INSTRUMENTS	91
1. Introduction	91
2. An Overview of the Regional Human Rights Instruments.	92
A. Europe.	92
i. The European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms.	92
ii. Other Council of Europe Conventions	94
B. The Americas	101
i. American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man.	101
ii. The Conventions	102

C. Africa.	105
F. Viljoen, <i>The African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights: The Travaux Préparatoires in the Light of Subsequent Practice</i>	105
Christof Heyns, <i>The African Regional Human Rights System: The African Charter</i>	107
3. Universality and Regional Diversity	109
A. The Universal Declaration and Regional Human Rights Instruments	111
B. Invoking Universal Norms in Regional Systems	115
<i>Nachova and Others v. Bulgaria</i>	116
<i>Yassin Abdullah Kadi v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities</i>	123
<i>Al-Adsani v. The United Kingdom</i>	134
<i>Katangese Peoples' Congress v. Zaire</i>	140
C. Convergence of Regional Norms?	142
<i>Compulsory Membership in an Association Prescribed by Law for the Practice of Journalism</i>	144
4. Comparing the Contents	148
A. Introduction to Treaty Interpretation.....	148
i. Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties	149
Article 31 General Rule of Interpretation.....	149
Article 32 Supplementary Means of Interpretation.....	149
ii. Deference to National Authorities.....	150
Y. Shany, "Toward a General Margin of Appreciation Doctrine in International Law?"	150
iii. Evolving Standards	154
<i>Christine Goodwin v. the United Kingdom</i>	154
iv. Implied Rights.....	164
<i>Johnston and Others v. Ireland</i>	164
B. Comparing the Contents: Selected Issues.....	170
i. The Right to Life.....	170
ECHR, Article 2 – Right to Life	171
American Declaration on the Rights and Duties of Man, Article I...171	
American Convention on Human Rights, Article 4. Right to Life ..171	
African Charter on Human and Peoples Rights, Article 4	172
<i>Res. 23/81, Case 2141 (United States)</i>	172
<i>Boso v. Italy</i>	177
<i>VO v. France</i>	177
ii. Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	183
<i>The Social and Economic Rights Action Center and the Center for Economic and Social Rights (SERAC) v. Nigeria</i>	184
<i>European Roma Rights Centre v. Italy (Merits)</i>	193

<i>Taskin and Others v. Turkey</i>	199
<i>Annual Report of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights 1993.</i>	208
<i>The Kichwa Peoples of the Sarayaku Community and Its Members v. Ecuador</i>	214
<i>Resolution on the Situation of Human Rights in Zimbabwe.</i>	220
C. Limitations and Clawback Clauses	222
i. Application of Limitation Clauses.	222
<i>Müller and Others v. Switzerland</i>	223
<i>"The Last Temptation of Christ" Case</i>	230
<i>The Word "Laws" in Article 30 of the American Convention on Human Rights.</i>	236
ii. Implied Limitations	242
<i>Hirst v. the United Kingdom (No. 2).</i>	242
iii. Clawback Clauses.	251
<i>Amnesty International v. Zambia</i>	251
5. Domestic Application of Regional Instruments	254
A. The Use of Reservations	254
i. Europe	255
ii. The Americas.	256
<i>The Effect of Reservations on the Entry into Force of the American Convention (Arts. 74 and 75)</i>	256
<i>Restrictions to the Death Penalty (Arts. 4(2) and 4(4) American Convention on Human Rights)</i>	259
B. National Constitutions and Laws	268
i. Constitutional Provisions	268
<i>The Constitution of Austria</i>	268
<i>Basic Law of the Federal Republic of Germany</i>	269
<i>The Constitution of Argentina.</i>	270
<i>Constitution of Venezuela (1999).</i>	271
<i>Constitution of South Africa (1996)</i>	272
<i>Constitution of Mozambique</i>	273
ii. Case Study: Argentina	273
Janet Koven Levit, <i>The Constitutionalization of Human Rights in Argentina: Problem or Promise?</i>	273
iii. Self-executing and Non-self-executing Treaties	281
T. Buergenthal, "Self-Executing and Non-Self-Executing Treaties in National and International Law"	281
<i>In re Alien Children Education Litigation.</i>	283
<i>Durand and Ugarte v. Peru</i>	288
<i>Civil Liberties Organization v. Nigeria</i>	290

iv. Legislative Incorporation: The UK Human Rights Act 1998292

*Al-Skeini and Others (Respondents) v. Secretary of State for
Defense (Appellant) and Others*292

CHAPTER III: STATE OBLIGATIONS..... 311

1. Introduction311

2. Identifying the State and the Obligations311

Velasquez Rodriguez Case, Merits312

*Case of 97 Members of the Gldani Congregation of Jehovah’s Witnesses
and 4 Others v. Georgia*317

Case of Assanidze v. Georgia.331

Woś v. Poland338

Chahal v. the United Kingdom346

3. The Nature of State Obligations355

D. Shelton, “Private Violence, Public Wrongs, and the Responsibility
of States”355

Öneryildiz v. Turkey359

A.R. Mowbray, *The Development of Positive Obligations under the
European Convention on Human Rights by the European Court of
Human Rights*370

4. The Obligations of Federal States377

T. Buergenthal, *The Inter-American System for the Protection of
Human Rights*377

The Mexican Elections Case379

5. State Obligations during Periods of Emergency.....389

A. Introduction.....389

B. Examples of Derogations and Suspensions391

i. Europe391

*Declaration Contained in a Note Verbale from the Permanent
Representation of the United Kingdom*391

Public Emergency in the United Kingdom391

The Anti-terrorism, Crime and Security Act 2001.....392

Article 5(1)(f) of the Convention.....393

Derogation under Article 15 of the Convention393

*Withdrawal of Derogation Contained in a Note Verbale from the
Permanent Representation of the United Kingdom*394

*Declaration Contained in a Letter from the Minister of Foreign
Affairs of Georgia*394

ii. The Americas.....395

C. Jurisprudence.....396

i. Europe396

Case of Ireland v. the United Kingdom.....396

<i>Aksoy v. Turkey</i>	409
ii. The Inter-American System	419
<i>Report on the Situation of Human Rights in the Republic of Guatemala</i>	419
<i>Habeas Corpus in Emergency Situations (Arts. 27(2), 25(1) and 7(6) American Convention on Human Rights)</i>	420
<i>Judicial Guarantees in States of Emergency (Arts. 27(2), 25 and 8 American Convention on Human Rights)</i>	425
iii. Africa	431
<i>Commission Nationale des Droits de l'Homme et des Libertés/Chad</i> ..	431
6. Amnesties, Lustration and Reconciliation	433
A. Amnesties	433
Chile, Annual Report of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights 1989–1990	433
<i>Chumbipuma Aguirre et al. v. Peru (Barrios Altos Case)</i>	439
<i>Case of Almonacid-Arellano et al. v. Chile</i>	447
<i>Zimbabwe Human Rights NGO Forum v. Zimbabwe</i>	466
B. Lustration	474
<i>Rios Montt v. Guatemala</i> , Rep. No. 30/93, Case 10.804	474
<i>Rainys and Gasparavičius v. Lithuania</i>	480

CHAPTER IV: THE REGIONAL INSTITUTIONS AND THEIR POWERS ... 491

1. Introduction	491
2. Procedural and Institutional Evolution	491
3. The European System	493
4. The Inter-American System	497
A. Historical Evolution	497
B. The Commission	499
i. Thematic Reports	500
<i>The Situation of the Rights of Women in Ciudad Juárez, Mexico: The Right to Be Free from Violence and Discrimination</i>	501
ii. Petitions	519
<i>Certain Attributes of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights</i>	520
C. The Inter-American Court	527
<i>"Other Treaties" Subject to the Consultative Jurisdiction of the Court (Art. 64 American Convention on Human Rights)</i>	529
A.P. van der Mei, <i>The Advisory Jurisdiction of the African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights</i>	541
5. The African System	542
A. Consideration of State Reports	543
B. Complaint Procedures	544

C. The Role of Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs).....	545
D. Budgetary, Political and Legal Problems.....	546
20th Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights	547
7. Compliance with Regional Decisions and Judgments.....	553
i. Europe	553
Hans-Jürgen Papier, <i>Execution and Effects of the Judgments of the European Court of Human Rights from the Perspective of German National Courts</i>	553
ii. The Americas.....	555
Annual Report of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights 2006	556
International Responsibility for the Promulgation and Enforcement of Laws in Violation of the Convention (Arts. 1 and 2 of the American Convention on Human Rights) ..	556
Response of the Government of the United States to October 10, 2002 Report No. 53/02 Case No. 11.140 (Mary and Carrie Dann)	561
iii. Africa	563
Legal Resources Foundation v. Zambia	564
Frans Viljoen & Lirette Louw, State Compliance with the Recommendations of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights, 1994–2004	569
CHAPTER V: COMPLAINT PROCEDURES	581
1. Overview	581
2. Jurisdiction	582
T. Buergenthal, <i>The Inter-American System for the Protection of Human Rights</i>	583
A. Initial Processing of Cases: Receivability	587
Tanko Bariga v. Nigeria	588
Iheanyichukwu A. Ihebereme v. USA	588
B. Subject Matter Jurisdiction	589
Zechnalova & Zehnal v. The Czech Republic	589
Frederick Korvah v. Liberia	595
C. Locus Standi and Personal Jurisdiction	596
i. Who Is a Victim?	596
Dudgeon v. United Kingdom	596
Rep. No. 28/98, Case 11.625 María Eugenia Morales De Sierra v. Guatemala	599
Center for the Independence of Judges and Lawyers v. Algeria, and Others	605

ii. Bringing a Case on Behalf of Another.....	606
<i>Vatan v. Russia</i>	606
iii. Death of the Applicant	612
<i>Karner v. Austria</i>	612
D. Territorial Jurisdiction	617
<i>Issa and Others v. Turkey</i>	618
Rep. No. 86/99, Case 11.589, <i>Armando Alejandro Jr., Carlos Costa, Mario De La Peña, and Pablo Morales v. Cuba</i>	623
<i>Hossein Alikhani v. United States</i>	627
E. Temporal Jurisdiction	634
<i>Blečić v. Croatia</i>	634
<i>Caesar v. Trinidad and Tobago</i>	650
<i>Annette Pagnoulle (on behalf of Abdoulaye Mazou) v. Cameroon</i> ...	655
F. Jurisdiction of the Inter-American Court	659
<i>Cayara v. Peru</i>	659
3. Interim Measures	666
A. The European System	667
<i>Mamatkulov & Askarov v. Turkey</i>	667
B. The Inter-American System	685
D. Shelton, <i>The Practice of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights in Issuing Precautionary Measures</i>	686
<i>Letter from the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights</i>	687
C. The African System	691
<i>International PEN, Constitutional Rights Project, Interights on behalf of Ken Saro-Wiwa Jr. and Civil Liberties Organisation v. Nigeria</i>	692
4. Admissibility of Complaints	696
A. Overview	696
<i>Velásquez Rodríguez Case</i>	696
B. Duplication of Procedures and the Six Months Rule	700
<i>Pauger v. Austria</i>	701
<i>Case of Posti and Rahko v. Finland</i>	704
<i>Case of Blake v. Guatemala</i>	706
C. Incompatible, Manifestly Ill-Founded, or Abuse of the Right of Petition. .	707
<i>X. v. Iceland</i>	708
<i>Drozd v. Poland</i>	709
<i>Ilesanmi v. Nigeria</i>	711
D. Exhaustion of Domestic Remedies	713
i. The Substance and Purpose of the Rule	715
<i>Van Oosterwijck v. Belgium</i>	715
<i>Velásquez Rodríguez Case</i>	720

<i>Anuak Justice Council v. Ethiopia</i>	725
ii. Exceptions to the Exhaustion Requirement	734
<i>John D. Ouko v. Kenya</i>	734
<i>Exceptions to the Exhaustion of Domestic Remedies (Arts. 46(1),</i> <i>46(2) (a) and 46(2) (b) American Convention on Human Rights)</i>	736
<i>Airey v. Ireland</i>	741
5. Post-Admissibility Procedures	749
A. Friendly Settlement and Striking Cases	751
<i>Caballero Delgado and Santana v. Colombia</i>	751
<i>Akman v. Turkey</i>	753
<i>Peoples' Democratic Organization for Independence and</i> <i>Socialism v. The Gambia</i>	755
B. Proving the Case	758
<i>Argentina</i>	759
<i>Velásquez Rodríguez Case</i>	762
<i>Kurt v. Turkey</i>	776
<i>Sevtap Veznedaroglu v. Turkey</i>	785
6. The Outcome: Remedies for Human Rights Violations	793
A. Introduction	793
B. The European System	794
D. Shelton, <i>Remedies in International Human Rights Law</i>	794
<i>Neumeister v. Austria</i>	798
<i>McCann and Others v. the United Kingdom</i>	806
<i>Brumarescu v. Romania</i>	808
C. The Inter-American System	817
D. Shelton, <i>Remedies in International Human Rights Law</i>	817
<i>Loayza Tamayo Case, Reparations (Art. 63(1) American</i> <i>Convention on Human Rights)</i>	819
<i>Myrna Mack Chang v. Guatemala Case</i>	841
<i>Aloeboetoe et al. v. Suriname, Reparations (Art. 63(1) American</i> <i>Convention on Human Rights)</i>	856
D. The African System	870
D. Shelton, <i>Remedies in International Human Rights Law</i>	870
CHAPTER VI: RESPONDING TO WIDESPREAD VIOLATIONS	875
1. Introduction	875
2. Modifying Procedural Rules	875
Afr. Comm.H.P.R., <i>Joined Communications 48/90 Amnesty</i> <i>International v. Sudan; 50/91 Comité Loosli Bachelard v. Sudan,</i> <i>52/91 Lawyers Committee for Human Rights v. Sudan, 89/93</i> <i>Association of Members of the Episcopal Conference of East Africa v.</i> <i>Sudan</i>	875

<i>Akdivar and Others v. Turkey</i>	880
<i>Free Legal Assistance Group, Lawyers' Committee for Human Rights, Union Interafricaine des Droits de l'Homme, Les Témoins de Jehovah v. Zaire</i>	887
3. Inter-State Cases	890
<i>Case of Ireland v. the United Kingdom</i>	890
Søren C. Prebensen, <i>Inter-State Complaints under Treaty Provisions—The Experience under the European Convention on Human Rights</i>	898
<i>D. R. Congo v. Burundi, Rwanda and Uganda</i>	899
<i>Nicaragua v. Costa Rica</i>	910
4. Country Reports	937
Cecilia Medina, <i>The Role of Country Reports in the Inter-American System of Human Rights</i>	939
<i>Report on the Situation of Human Rights in Venezuela</i>	940
5. Condemnatory Resolutions	960
<i>Resolution on the Situation of Human Rights in Ethiopia</i>	961
<i>Submission by the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia in Accordance with Resolution No. Ex.Cl/Dec. 257(VIII) of the Executive Council of the African Union Concerning the 16th Activities Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights</i>	962
<i>Resolution on the Situation of Human Rights in the Darfur Region in Sudan</i>	966
<i>Comments of the Sudan on the Decision of the African Commission on Human and Peoples Rights Concerning Darfur during Its 38th Ordinary Session Held in Banjul, the Gambia, from 21 November to 5 December 2005</i>	967
6. Addressing Systemic Problems in the European System	969
<i>Case of Bottazzi v. Italy</i>	970
<i>Apicella v. Italy</i>	973
<i>Broniowski v. Poland</i>	993
<i>Committee of Ministers, Resolution (2004)3 on Judgments Revealing an Underlying Systemic Problem</i>	1010
CHAPTER VII: TOWARDS THE FUTURE	1013
1. Strengthening the Existing Systems	1013
A. Managing the European Caseload	1013
Martin Eaton and Jeroen Schokkenbroek, <i>Reforming the Human Rights Protection System Established by the European Convention on Human Rights</i>	1014
<i>Final Report of the Group of Wise Persons to the Committee of Ministers</i>	1018

B. Increasing the Effectiveness of the Inter-American System	1024
Permanent Council of the OAS, Committee on Juridical and Political Affairs.....	1024
<i>Preliminary Document from the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights on the First Stage in the Process of Reflection on the Inter-American System for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights Pursuant to Resolution AG/RES. 2030 (XXXIV-O/04)</i>	1026
<i>Preliminary Document of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights on the First Phase of the Process of Reflection on the Inter-American System for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights Pursuant to Resolution AG/RES. 2030 (XXXIV-O/04)</i> ...	1037
C. Building the African System	1042
Report of the Brainstorming Meeting on the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (ACHPR)	1042
2. Human Rights in the Middle East and Asia	1051
A. The Nascent Middle East System	1051
Mervat Rishmawi, <i>The Revised Arab Charter on Human Rights: A Step Forward?</i>	1052
B. Asia	1055
Randall Peerenboom, <i>Beyond Universalism and Relativism: The Evolving Debates About 'Values In Asia'</i>	1056
Vitit Muntarbhorn, <i>Asia, Human Rights and the New Millennium: Time for a Regional Human Rights Charter?</i>	1060
Li-ann Thio, <i>Implementing Human Rights in Asean Countries: 'Promises to Keep and Miles to Go Before I Sleep'</i>	1064
Asian Human Rights Charter	1075
Kuala Lumpur Declaration on the Establishment of the ASEAN Charter	1088
ASEAN Foreign Ministers Agree on Creation of Human Rights Body in ASEAN Charter—Romulo	1091
Statement on the Establishment of the ASEAN Committee on the Implementation of the ASEAN Declaration on the Protection and Promotion of the Rights of Migrant Workers, Manila	1091
TABLE OF CASES	1095
INDEX	1119