

# Contents

|                              |                 |
|------------------------------|-----------------|
| <i>Foreword</i>              | <i>page xvi</i> |
| <i>Preface</i>               | <i>xx</i>       |
| <i>Table of cases</i>        | <i>xxiii</i>    |
| <i>List of abbreviations</i> | <i>xli</i>      |

## **Part I Background and context**

|          |                                                                                        |          |
|----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|
| <b>1</b> | <b>Introduction and overview</b>                                                       | <b>3</b> |
|          | The main research question                                                             | 4        |
|          | Scope of analysis                                                                      | 6        |
|          | Treaty law as the relevant basis of human rights obligations                           | 6        |
|          | UN-mandated peace operations: some terminology                                         | 7        |
|          | Preparing the stage                                                                    | 11       |
|          | Whose obligations towards whom?                                                        | 11       |
|          | The obligations of states                                                              | 11       |
|          | Military forces as the relevant state agents                                           | 13       |
|          | Civilians as the relevant rights-holders                                               | 13       |
|          | A selection of substantive norms: the protection of an individual's physical integrity | 14       |
|          | Human rights treaties in context: the legal framework of peace operations              | 16       |
|          | The immunities and privileges of the United Nations                                    | 20       |
|          | Clarifications concerning method                                                       | 21       |
|          | Principles of interpretation: human rights treaties                                    | 21       |



|          |                                                                                                                                                               |           |
|----------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
|          | Judicial activism vs. judicial self-restraint in human rights bodies                                                                                          | 25        |
|          | The interpretation of UN Security Council resolutions                                                                                                         | 27        |
|          | The interpretation of other instruments                                                                                                                       | 32        |
|          | The relevance of international customary law                                                                                                                  | 34        |
|          | Outline of the book                                                                                                                                           | 36        |
| <b>2</b> | <b>The context</b>                                                                                                                                            | <b>42</b> |
|          | The emerging relevance of human rights law in UN-mandated peace operations                                                                                    | 42        |
|          | The increased complexity of peace operations                                                                                                                  | 43        |
|          | Globalism vs. regionalism                                                                                                                                     | 45        |
|          | The mainstreaming of human rights in the United Nations                                                                                                       | 48        |
|          | Two trends in peace operations: the protection of civilians and the protection of human rights                                                                | 49        |
|          | The protection of civilians                                                                                                                                   | 49        |
|          | The protection of human rights                                                                                                                                | 53        |
|          | The failure of peace operations to respect or protect human rights                                                                                            | 55        |
|          | The 'humanisation' and the 'human-rightism' of international law                                                                                              | 57        |
|          | The other side of the coin: the alleged inappropriateness of applying human rights treaties                                                                   | 60        |
|          | The two approaches of the European Court of Human Rights and the United Nations Human Rights Committee: an example of the fragmentation of international law? | 61        |
|          | The fundamental policy consideration: peace and security vs. human rights                                                                                     | 64        |
|          | Peace and human rights                                                                                                                                        | 65        |
|          | (National) security and human rights                                                                                                                          | 66        |
|          | The relevance for UN-mandated peace operations                                                                                                                | 70        |
|          | Conflicting values in peace operations: the effectiveness of peace operations and the effectiveness of human rights                                           | 71        |
|          | The 'square peg, round hole' argument                                                                                                                         | 76        |



|         |                                                                                                                                  |     |
|---------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| Part II | Two fundamental arguments for non-applicability of human rights treaties                                                         |     |
| 3       | The argument of non-applicability <i>ratione personae</i>                                                                        | 85  |
|         | Overview of the chapter                                                                                                          | 85  |
|         | The capacity of actors in peace operations to bear responsibility under international human rights law                           | 87  |
|         | Troop contributing states                                                                                                        | 87  |
|         | The human rights obligations of international organisations                                                                      | 87  |
|         | The relevance of international legal personality                                                                                 | 88  |
|         | The international legal personality of the United Nations and NATO                                                               | 91  |
|         | Objective and subjective personality                                                                                             | 98  |
|         | Attribution of conduct during UN-mandated peace operations                                                                       | 99  |
|         | The context                                                                                                                      | 99  |
|         | The responsibility of states and of international organisations                                                                  | 99  |
|         | Are the general principles of international responsibility relevant for human rights law? The notion of 'self-contained regimes' | 102 |
|         | The relevance of the issue for the present book                                                                                  | 105 |
|         | Overview of the further analysis                                                                                                 | 107 |
|         | Attribution of conduct of military forces during peace operations: rules and principles of general international law             | 108 |
|         | Relevant provisions in the Articles on State Responsibility                                                                      | 108 |
|         | Relevant provisions in the Draft Articles on Responsibility of International Organizations                                       | 111 |
|         | The legal status of peace operations                                                                                             | 112 |
|         | Application of the general rules and principles in UN-mandated peace operations                                                  | 113 |
|         | Attribution of conduct under human rights law: a lower threshold?                                                                | 121 |
|         | Direct responsibility                                                                                                            | 121 |
|         | 'Indirect responsibility': the concept of positive obligations                                                                   | 125 |
|         | The <i>Behrami/Saramati</i> case                                                                                                 | 129 |



|   |                                                                                                                                                                                        |     |
|---|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
|   | Introduction to the case                                                                                                                                                               | 129 |
|   | The content of the 'ultimate authority and control' test                                                                                                                               | 132 |
|   | Developments 'post- <i>Behrami/Saramati</i> '                                                                                                                                          | 136 |
|   | The European Court of Human Rights: cases applying the 'ultimate authority and control' test                                                                                           | 136 |
|   | Domestic case law: the <i>Al-Jedda</i> case                                                                                                                                            | 138 |
|   | The European Court of Human Rights tries again: the <i>Al-Jedda</i> case                                                                                                               | 141 |
|   | Domestic case law: the Dutch cases concerning Srebrenica                                                                                                                               | 142 |
|   | Domestic case law: the Belgian <i>Mukeshimana-Ngulinzira</i> case                                                                                                                      | 144 |
|   | Reactions from the UN and states                                                                                                                                                       | 144 |
|   | The (lack of an) approach of the UN Human Rights Committee                                                                                                                             | 146 |
|   | A normative assessment of the 'ultimate authority and control' test                                                                                                                    | 146 |
|   | The incompleteness of the <i>Behrami/Saramati</i> decision: two unexplored avenues to holding contracting states responsible when conduct is (also) attributable to the United Nations | 151 |
|   | Dual and multiple attribution                                                                                                                                                          | 151 |
|   | The responsibility of member states for acts of the organisation                                                                                                                       | 156 |
|   | Conclusions                                                                                                                                                                            | 164 |
| 4 | The argument of non-applicability <i>ratione loci</i>                                                                                                                                  | 165 |
|   | Territory and jurisdiction                                                                                                                                                             | 165 |
|   | The extraterritorial application of the ECHR: general starting points                                                                                                                  | 167 |
|   | The settled issue: the ECHR can apply extraterritorially                                                                                                                               | 167 |
|   | 'Jurisdiction' defined as the exercise of authority and control                                                                                                                        | 169 |
|   | The contentious issues: an overview of the further analysis                                                                                                                            | 173 |
|   | A basis for comparison: the position under the ICCPR                                                                                                                                   | 177 |
|   | The ICCPR can also apply extraterritorially                                                                                                                                            | 177 |
|   | The similar definition of 'jurisdiction'                                                                                                                                               | 180 |



|                                                                                                                    |     |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| The application of the ICCPR in UN-mandated peace operations                                                       | 181 |
| The exercise of extraterritorial jurisdiction in peace operations: four categories                                 | 185 |
| Exercise of authority or control over a territory                                                                  | 185 |
| The general principles                                                                                             | 185 |
| Transitional administration                                                                                        | 190 |
| 'Safe areas', 'security zones', and other places of protection                                                     | 194 |
| Buffer zones                                                                                                       | 198 |
| Combat operations                                                                                                  | 202 |
| Exercise of authority or control over individuals                                                                  | 204 |
| Arrest                                                                                                             | 204 |
| Detention                                                                                                          | 207 |
| An individual is killed by a state agent                                                                           | 211 |
| Extraterritorial effects of territorial or extraterritorial conduct                                                | 215 |
| Extradition and expulsion                                                                                          | 215 |
| Cross-border incidents                                                                                             | 217 |
| The requirement of a close connection between the conduct and the injury                                           | 217 |
| Effects of a foreign state's conduct                                                                               | 218 |
| <i>The Manóilescu/Dobrescu and Treska cases: the birth of a 'due diligence' doctrine, or a slip of the tongue?</i> | 220 |
| The discussion of an ' <i>espace juridique</i> ' limitation                                                        | 224 |
| A sidestep: the universality of human rights                                                                       | 224 |
| The possible relevance of the ' <i>espace juridique</i> '                                                          | 227 |
| The relationship between the host state and the peace operation                                                    | 233 |
| Competing 'jurisdictions'                                                                                          | 233 |
| Conflicting international obligations                                                                              | 236 |
| Conclusions                                                                                                        | 237 |

### Part III Circumstances that may exclude or modify the application of the treaties

|                                                                                   |     |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 5 The applicability of human rights law during armed conflicts                    | 243 |
| The settled issue: human rights law applies, in principle, during armed conflicts | 243 |



|                                                                                                                  |     |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| The contentious issue: the relationship between IHL and human rights law                                         | 247 |
| Overview                                                                                                         | 247 |
| The relevance of the issue for the present book                                                                  | 248 |
| The applicability of IHL to troop contributing states in UN-mandated peace operations                            | 248 |
| The applicability of the law of belligerent occupation                                                           | 250 |
| The right to life                                                                                                | 252 |
| The right to liberty and security                                                                                | 255 |
| Prohibition against torture                                                                                      | 255 |
| The <i>lex specialis</i> theory                                                                                  | 256 |
| The complementarity theory                                                                                       | 259 |
| The 'most favourable protection of victims' theory                                                               | 260 |
| The human rights-based theory                                                                                    | 261 |
| The practice under the ECHR and the ICCPR                                                                        | 263 |
| The jurisdiction of the European Court of Human Rights and the UN Human Rights Committee to apply IHL            | 263 |
| Methodological and practical challenges                                                                          | 268 |
| The case law of the European Court of Human Rights                                                               | 272 |
| The views of the UN Human Rights Committee                                                                       | 282 |
| The Committee's General Comments                                                                                 | 282 |
| The Committee's country-specific practice: Concluding Observations to Periodic State Reports                     | 285 |
| The Committee's country-specific practice: jurisprudence                                                         | 289 |
| Advantages and disadvantages of the application of IHL by human rights tribunals                                 | 290 |
| Can a general theory be identified?                                                                              | 293 |
| Implications for the application of the ECHR and the ICCPR when peace operations are involved in armed conflicts | 296 |
| <b>6 Derogations</b>                                                                                             | 298 |
| The legal basis for derogations                                                                                  | 298 |
| Derogation from human rights treaties in peace operations                                                        | 299 |



|   |                                                                                                                                                          |     |
|---|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
|   | The emergency requirement: the problem of extraterritorial derogations                                                                                   | 299 |
|   | A threat to the ‘life of the <i>entire</i> nation’ or to the ‘life of <i>affected parts</i> of the nation’?                                              | 302 |
|   | A similar test for extraterritorial derogations?                                                                                                         | 306 |
|   | Consistency with other obligations under international law                                                                                               | 311 |
|   | A way to avoid the ‘absurdity’ argument                                                                                                                  | 312 |
| 7 | <b>Norm conflicts between UN Security Council mandates and human rights treaties</b>                                                                     | 314 |
|   | The UN Charter Article 103                                                                                                                               | 314 |
|   | Introduction to the problem                                                                                                                              | 314 |
|   | A necessary background: constitutionalism vs. legal pluralism                                                                                            | 315 |
|   | Charter obligations and Charter body decisions                                                                                                           | 318 |
|   | Obligations and authorisations                                                                                                                           | 319 |
|   | The general prevailing effect of Article 103                                                                                                             | 322 |
|   | Norm conflicts between Charter obligations and human rights                                                                                              | 323 |
|   | The special situation of human rights                                                                                                                    | 323 |
|   | Human rights norms as a substantive limitation of the competence of the UN Security Council                                                              | 323 |
|   | The right to life, freedom from torture, and the right to liberty and security, as a substantive limitation of the competence of the UN Security Council | 328 |
|   | Is there a presumption of human rights compliance?                                                                                                       | 332 |
|   | A review of relevant case law                                                                                                                            | 333 |
|   | The European Court of Human Rights: the <i>Behrami</i> and <i>Saramati</i> cases                                                                         | 333 |
|   | The UN Human Rights Committee: the <i>Sayadi and Vinck</i> case                                                                                          | 335 |
|   | The European Court of Justice and the Court of First Instance: the <i>Kadi and Al-Barakaat</i> case                                                      | 338 |
|   | The UK House of Lords: the <i>Al-Jedda</i> case                                                                                                          | 344 |
|   | The European Court on Human Rights tries again: the <i>Al-Jedda</i> case                                                                                 | 346 |



|   |                                                                                                                                                               |     |
|---|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
|   | Norm conflicts between authorisations under the UN Charter and rights under the European Convention on Human Rights: the (uncertain) <i>lex lata</i> solution | 347 |
|   | Attempts to reconcile the cases                                                                                                                               | 347 |
|   | An explanation of the view of the European Court of Human Rights                                                                                              | 349 |
|   | Norm conflict in practice in peace operations: the interpretation of resolutions authorising 'all necessary means'                                            | 351 |
| 8 | Legal challenges relating to the interrelationship between troop contributing states                                                                          | 353 |
|   | Regional differences                                                                                                                                          | 353 |
|   | Interoperability from a human rights perspective                                                                                                              | 355 |
|   | The mutual dependence between states                                                                                                                          | 357 |
|   | Indispensable third parties – the 'Monetary Gold' principle                                                                                                   | 360 |
|   | <b>Part IV Application <i>in concreto</i>: the right to life, to freedom from torture, and to liberty and security</b>                                        |     |
| 9 | Selected issues relating to the application of substantive provisions                                                                                         | 367 |
|   | The distinction between positive and negative obligations                                                                                                     | 367 |
|   | Overview                                                                                                                                                      | 367 |
|   | The starting point: the indivisibility of human rights                                                                                                        | 367 |
|   | Are human rights 'divisible' in peace operations?                                                                                                             |     |
|   | Building a case for separating negative and positive obligations                                                                                              | 368 |
|   | The right to life                                                                                                                                             | 374 |
|   | The relevant treaty provisions                                                                                                                                | 374 |
|   | Use of lethal force                                                                                                                                           | 375 |
|   | Introduction to the authority to use lethal force in peace operations                                                                                         | 375 |
|   | Personal self-defence                                                                                                                                         | 378 |
|   | Defence of the mission                                                                                                                                        | 379 |
|   | Chapter VII authorisation: the situation during combat operations                                                                                             | 381 |



|                                                                                                                     |     |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| Positive obligations under Article 2                                                                                | 386 |
| General content: relevance for peace operations                                                                     | 386 |
| Mandates concerning the protection of civilians under ‘imminent threat of physical attack’, and similar limitations | 391 |
| The right to liberty and security                                                                                   | 393 |
| Detention                                                                                                           | 393 |
| The prohibition against arbitrary arrest and detention                                                              | 393 |
| The right to be brought promptly before a judge                                                                     | 397 |
| The right to judicial review                                                                                        | 399 |
| Positive obligations under Article 5                                                                                | 400 |
| Transfer of detainees: the principle of <i>non-refoulement</i>                                                      | 401 |
| The application of the ECHR and the ICCPR on the transfer of detainees                                              | 401 |
| Bilateral detainee transfer agreements: ISAF                                                                        | 404 |
| Bilateral detainee transfer agreements: the Coalition Provisional Authority                                         | 406 |
| The impact of the agreements: the question of diplomatic assurances                                                 | 408 |
| The prohibition against torture                                                                                     | 418 |
| The obligation not to subject anyone to torture                                                                     | 418 |
| The scope of the prohibition                                                                                        | 419 |
| Positive obligations under Article 3                                                                                | 423 |
| Final reflections: is it ‘absurd’ to require compliance with the ECHR?                                              | 427 |

## Part V Conclusions

|    |                                                                                          |     |
|----|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 10 | Conclusions                                                                              | 433 |
|    | Many obstacles to the applicability of human rights treaties                             | 433 |
|    | <i>Inherent or invented</i> obstacles?                                                   | 434 |
|    | The better approach: transparent adaptations to the ordinary application of the treaties | 436 |
|    | <i>Sources and materials</i>                                                             | 439 |
|    | Selected UN documents                                                                    | 439 |
|    | Books, articles and other literature                                                     | 439 |
|    | <i>Index</i>                                                                             | 461 |