

# CONTENTS

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xxi
<i>Table of Treaties</i>	xxxiii
<i>Table of Other Instruments</i>	xxxvii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xliii
<i>Note to the Reader</i>	xlvii

INTRODUCTION	1
--------------	---

## PART I OVERARCHING ELEMENTS

1 APPLICATION OF HUMAN RIGHTS LAW	5
1.1 At all times: during both peace and armed conflict	5
1.1.1 Treaty provisions and their interpretation	5
1.1.2 Practice of States and UN Charter bodies	6
1.2 Scope of application: jurisdiction	9
1.2.1 Treaty provisions	9
1.2.2 Interpretation of the reference to 'territory' in the ICCPR provision	10
1.2.3 Application where there is no jurisdiction clause	11
1.2.4 Meaning of 'jurisdiction'	12
1.2.5 Where the State has lost control of parts of its national territory	13
1.2.6 Control of another State's territory as a result of military action	14
1.2.7 Responsibility for transfers to other States	18
1.2.8 Control or decisive effect over persons outside own territory	18
1.2.9 Activities affecting persons outside the States bound by a regional treaty	21
1.3 International peacekeeping operations: jurisdiction and imputability	22
1.4 Relationship between 'jurisdiction' and 'imputability'	25
1.5 Relationship between 'jurisdiction' and 'occupation'	28
2 ENSURING RIGHTS	30
2.1 Treaty provisions and general principles	30
2.2 The obligation to 'ensure' or 'secure' rights	32
2.2.1 Immediate and full implementation	32
2.2.2 Ensuring the separation of powers and basic principles of democracy	33
2.2.3 The requirement of reality in the justice system	34
2.2.4 Steps necessary to prevent violations of specific rights	35
2.2.5 Obligation of 'due diligence' with regard to the actions of private persons or entities	37



2.2.6	Punishment to be of a nature to deter future violations	38
2.2.7	Situations in which it is impossible to ensure respect	39
2.2.8	Clash of international obligations	41
2.3	Realization of economic, social, and cultural rights	42
2.3.1	Interpretation developed by the UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	42
2.3.2	Interpretation of ESCR by the African Commission	46
2.3.3	Hybrid obligations	46
2.4	The requirement of non-discrimination	49
2.4.1	Treaty provisions	49
2.4.2	Meaning of 'discrimination'	52
2.4.3	Distinctions based on nationality	54
2.4.4	Profiling in counter-terrorism measures	55
2.5	Right to a remedy	57
2.5.1	Treaty provisions	57
2.5.2	Requirement for remedy where a violation of a treaty right is concerned	58
2.5.3	Meaning of 'effective remedy'	60
2.5.4	Relationship between right to a remedy and other rights	64
2.5.5	International counter-terrorism measures and right to a remedy	66
2.5.6	Right to a remedy during states of emergency	67
3	THE REGIME OF LIMITATIONS AND DEROGATIONS	68
3.1	General principles	68
3.1.1	Some absolute rights	68
3.1.2	Freedoms with inherent limitations	68
3.1.3	Measures during an emergency	69
3.1.4	Non-discrimination	70
3.1.5	ECHR and the margin of appreciation	70
3.1.6	Derogations and limitations to economic, social, and cultural rights	70
3.2	System of limitations	71
3.2.1	General overview of treaty provisions	71
3.2.2	Provided by 'law'	72
3.2.3	Purpose	75
3.2.4	Necessity	76
3.2.5	Abuse of rights	78
3.3	System of derogations	79
3.3.1	General overview of the treaty provisions	79
3.3.2	Interpretation of 'emergency' by the treaty bodies	82
3.3.3	Derogations prohibited because they would violate other rules of international law	89
3.3.4	The overarching need to maintain the rule of law	90
3.3.5	Interpretation of 'to the extent strictly required by the exigencies of the situation'	99
3.3.6	Conclusion	104
4	THE ROLE OF INTERNATIONAL HUMANITARIAN LAW IN HUMAN RIGHTS LAW	106
4.1	Introduction	106



4.2	The International Court of Justice	106
4.3	United Nations Human Rights Council	108
4.4	Human rights treaty bodies	108
4.4.1	Treaty requirements to consider international humanitarian law	108
4.4.2	The African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights	109
4.4.3	Inter-American Commission and Court of Human Rights	111
4.4.4	The European Court of Human Rights	115
4.5	Non-State actors	117
4.5.1	Introduction	117
4.5.2	Different approach in IHL and human rights treaties	117
4.5.3	Human rights responsibilities of non-State actors and individuals	118
4.6	Utility of using international humanitarian law in a human rights assessment	122
4.6.1	Where the two bodies of law provide the same rules	122
4.6.2	IHL rules that can be impliedly included in ESCR rules	123
4.6.3	Express reference to IHL in human rights treaties	124
4.6.4	IHL rules that do not exist in human rights treaties	124
5	INTERNATIONAL MEASURES TO PREVENT TERRORISM AND HUMAN RIGHTS PROTECTION	127
5.1	Introduction	127
5.2	Counter-terrorism treaties	128
5.2.1	Universal treaties	128
5.2.2	Regional treaties	130
5.3	Measures taken by the UN Security Council	137
5.3.1	Requirement to criminalize terrorist acts and provide mutual assistance	137
5.3.2	Sanctions regime—freezing of assets and travel restrictions	142
5.3.3	Security Council requirements for counter-terrorism measures to respect human rights	145
5.4	Measures taken by the UN Human Rights Commission and Human Rights Council	147
5.4.1	Before 2001	147
5.4.2	Resolutions on counter-terrorism and human rights after 2001	147
5.4.3	Special rapporteurs on counter-terrorism and human rights	148
5.5	Measures taken by the UN General Assembly and UN Secretary-General	149
5.5.1	Counter-terrorism treaties	149
5.5.2	Resolutions on counter-terrorism and human rights	150
5.5.3	Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy	150
5.6	International case-law relating to binding UN Security Council measures and human rights	153

---

## PART II ABSOLUTE PROHIBITIONS

6	PROHIBITION OF ARBITRARY DEPRIVATION OF LIFE	161
6.1	Treaty provisions and basic principles	161



6.2	Law enforcement operations	163
6.2.1	Basic principles	163
6.2.2	The need for an adequate legislative framework, training, and advance planning	165
6.2.3	Arrest and lack of necessity for the use of lethal force	167
6.2.4	Demonstrations and riots	169
6.2.5	Use of technologies labelled 'non-lethal'	171
6.3	Use of force during armed hostilities	172
6.3.1	Evaluation of necessity to use armed force and adequate planning	172
6.3.2	Need for proper identification of suspected rebels	176
6.3.3	Protecting the lives of injured persons	177
6.4	Death or disappearance of persons in the power of government agents	178
6.4.1	Deaths in custody	178
6.4.2	Where person was last seen with government agents	178
6.5	Responsibility of the State to protect life when killings are committed by non-State actors	180
6.6	Requirement to investigate possible violations of the right to life	184
6.6.1	When an investigation is required	186
6.7	Armed conflict and 'arbitrary deprivation of life'	188
6.7.1	Meaning of the term 'war' in human rights treaties	192
7	<b>PROHIBITION OF TORTURE, INHUMAN OR DEGRADING TREATMENT OR PUNISHMENT</b>	194
7.1	Absolute nature of the prohibition	194
7.2	Definitions	196
7.2.1	Inhuman treatment or punishment	196
7.2.2	Degrading treatment or punishment	198
7.2.3	Torture	199
7.3	Evaluation of certain practices	202
7.3.1	The death penalty	202
7.3.2	Indefinite detention	205
7.3.3	Isolation	206
7.3.4	Rape and other forms of sexual violence	209
7.3.5	Use of physical force and methods of restraint	209
7.3.6	Corporal punishment	211
7.3.7	Discrimination	212
7.3.8	Lack of medical care	212
7.3.9	Poor physical conditions of detention	213
7.4	Non-refoulement	214
7.4.1	General principle	214
7.4.2	Method of evaluating that the risk is real	214
7.4.3	Rule and evaluation method the same for all persons	215
7.4.4	Diplomatic assurances	217
7.4.5	Extraordinary renditions	218
7.5	Preventive and deterrence measures	218
7.5.1	Interrogation methods	219



7.5.2	Statements made as a result of torture may not be used as evidence	220
7.5.3	Access to a lawyer	220
7.5.4	Transparency of detention	221
7.5.5	Examination by a doctor	223
7.5.6	Detainee to be informed of his or her rights	223
7.5.7	Duty to investigate a complaint	223
7.5.8	Supervision by an independent body and complaint procedure	224
7.6	Right to humane treatment	225
7.6.1	Treaty provisions	225
7.6.2	Resolutions and other documents	226
<b>8</b>	<b>PROHIBITION OF ENFORCED DISAPPEARANCES</b>	<b>228</b>
8.1	Definition of 'enforced disappearance'	228
8.2	Enforced disappearance as a violation of human rights	229
8.2.1	Enforced disappearance as a serious multiple human rights violation	229
8.2.2	The right to life	230
8.2.3	The prohibition of torture, or inhuman or degrading treatment	235
8.2.4	The right to liberty and security of person	240
8.2.5	Right to a remedy	243
8.3	Specific instruments relating to enforced disappearance	246
8.3.1	United Nations Declaration on the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance, 1992	246
8.3.2	Inter-American Convention on Forced Disappearance of Persons, 1994	247
8.3.3	International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance, 2006	247

---

## PART III FUNDAMENTAL REQUIREMENTS OF DUE PROCESS

<b>9</b>	<b>PROHIBITION OF ARBITRARY DETENTION</b>	<b>253</b>
9.1	Basic principles	253
9.2	Meaning of 'detention'	254
9.2.1	Treaty provisions applicable to all forms of detention	254
9.2.2	Disciplinary measures and military service	254
9.2.3	House arrest and control orders	255
9.3	Deprivation of liberty to be in accordance with the law	255
9.4	Grounds for detention and procedure adopted must not be arbitrary	257
9.4.1	The ECHR	257
9.4.2	The other general human rights treaties	260
9.5	Administrative detention on security grounds	263
9.5.1	The ECHR	263
9.5.2	The other general human rights treaties	263
9.6	Information on reasons for detention	264
9.6.1	Treaty provisions	264
9.6.2	Meaning of 'arrest' not limited to criminal cases	265
9.6.3	Content and timing of the information	265
9.7	Access to persons outside the detention centre	266



9.7.1	Access to a lawyer	267
9.7.2	Access to a diplomatic or consular official	268
9.8	Right to supervision of the lawfulness of detention (habeas corpus)	269
9.8.1	Treaty provisions	269
9.8.2	Application to anyone in detention on request	270
9.8.3	Time within which the remedy must be available	270
9.8.4	Repetition of review	271
9.8.5	Must be heard by a court or a court-like body	271
9.8.6	Nature of evaluation and procedural guarantees	272
9.8.7	Application during armed conflict and emergency	276
<b>10</b>	<b>PRE-TRIAL DETENTION</b>	<b>280</b>
10.1	Introduction	280
10.2	Requirement for a lawful arrest	280
10.2.1	Arrest warrant	280
10.2.2	Arrest overseas: abduction or lawful arrest and transfer?	281
10.2.3	Arrest on reasonable suspicion of having committed an offence	282
10.2.4	Prompt information of charges against arrested person	284
10.3	Requirement to be brought promptly before a judicial officer	285
10.3.1	Treaty provisions	285
10.3.2	Purpose of this procedure	286
10.3.3	Meaning of 'promptly'	287
10.3.4	Required nature of the judicial authority	288
10.4	Right to trial within a reasonable time or to release	289
10.4.1	Treaty provisions	289
10.4.2	Basic principle	290
10.4.3	Elements that are to be taken into account	290
10.5	Derogation during states of emergency	294
10.5.1	Introduction	294
10.5.2	Requirement for a lawful arrest	295
10.5.3	Requirement to be brought promptly before a judicial officer	296
<b>11</b>	<b>CRIMES AND THE PRINCIPLE OF LEGALITY</b>	<b>300</b>
11.1	Legal basis required for conviction and punishment: basic principles	300
11.1.1	Treaty provisions	300
11.1.2	Non-derogability	301
11.1.3	Definition of 'crime'	301
11.2	Clarity of definition of crimes	302
11.2.1	Drafting and interpretation of legal provision	302
11.2.2	Penalties	303
11.2.3	Problem of 'terrorism' definition	304
11.3	Prosecution of an offence after practice of tolerance	304
11.3.1	Previous practice of not prosecuting certain persons in specific contexts	304
11.3.2	Previous non-prosecution based on amnesty legislation	306
11.4	International crimes and offences under general principles of law	306



11.4.1	International crimes	306
11.4.2	General principles of law recognized by the community of nations	315
11.5	Individual criminal responsibility and prohibition of collective punishment	316
11.5.1	Treaty provisions	316
11.5.2	Treaty-body practice	317
<b>12</b>	<b>RIGHT TO BE HEARD BY A COMPETENT, INDEPENDENT, AND IMPARTIAL TRIBUNAL</b>	<b>318</b>
12.1	Treaty provisions	318
12.2	Right of access to a court	319
12.2.1	Basic principle	319
12.2.2	Access limited to procedures covered by fair trial treaty provisions	320
12.2.3	Procedures relating to the expulsion of non-nationals	321
12.2.4	Lack of access because of practical restraints	323
12.2.5	Immunities	324
12.2.6	Amnesties	329
12.2.7	International organizations' counter-terrorism measures	330
12.3	Definition of competent, independent, and impartial tribunal	331
12.3.1	Meaning of 'tribunal'	331
12.3.2	Meaning of 'competent', 'established by law'	332
12.3.3	Meaning of 'independent'	335
12.3.4	Meaning of 'impartial'	336
12.3.5	Military tribunals	337
12.3.6	Special courts	342
<b>13</b>	<b>ELEMENTS OF FAIR TRIAL</b>	<b>345</b>
13.1	Basic concept	345
13.2	Presumption of innocence	346
13.2.1	Basic principle	346
13.2.2	Statements by the executive	346
13.2.3	Military and anti-terrorism trials	346
13.2.4	Lengthy pre-trial detention	347
13.2.5	Placing persons on a 'terrorism' list	347
13.3	Equality of arms	348
13.3.1	Basic principle	348
13.3.2	Equality and adversarial procedure	348
13.3.3	Use of confidential or anonymous evidence	349
13.4	Public hearing	353
13.4.1	Treaty provisions and basic principles	353
13.4.2	Modalities	354
13.4.3	Exclusion of the public for security reasons	355
13.5	Means of defence	356
13.5.1	Adequate services of a lawyer	356
13.5.2	Right not to be compelled to testify against oneself or to confess guilt	363
13.5.3	Information on the nature and cause of a charge	364



13.5.4	Right to call and examine witnesses	365
13.5.5	Right of an accused to be present at the trial	365
13.5.6	Right to free assistance of an interpreter if the accused cannot understand or speak the language used in court	366
13.6	Right to trial within a reasonable time	366
13.7	Right to appeal to a higher tribunal	368
13.8	Prohibition of trial more than once for the same offence ( <i>ne bis in idem</i> )	369
13.9	Extradition to an unfair trial	371

## PART IV LIMITATIONS TO FREEDOMS

14	THE RIGHT TO HOME, PROPERTY, FREEDOM OF MOVEMENT, AND RESIDENCE	375
14.1	Treaty provisions	375
14.1.1	Right to respect for one's home	375
14.1.2	Right to respect for one's property	375
14.1.3	Right to freedom of movement and residence	376
14.1.4	Procedures relating to the expulsion of non-nationals	378
14.2	Meaning of terms	379
14.2.1	Meaning of 'home'	379
14.2.2	Meaning of 'property'	380
14.2.3	Meaning of 'freedom of movement and residence'	384
14.3	Destruction of property, forcible evictions, and internal displacement as a result of military operations	385
14.4	Restrictions on or loss of property, home, and movement during occupation	389
14.4.1	Loss of access to home or property	389
14.4.2	Destruction of property as a penalty	394
14.4.3	Restrictions on movement	395
14.4.4	Taking of occupied territory's natural resources	397
14.5	Counter-terrorism measures	398
14.5.1	Non-access to assets or other funds	398
14.5.2	Travel and residence restrictions	400
15	PARTICIPATION IN PUBLIC LIFE: FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION, ASSOCIATION, AND CONSCIENCE	401
15.1	Treaty provisions	401
15.1.1	Freedom of opinion and expression	401
15.1.2	Freedom of association and assembly	403
15.1.3	Right to conscience and religion	404
15.2	Meaning of terms	405
15.2.1	Meaning of 'expression'	405
15.2.2	Meaning of 'association' and 'assembly'	410
15.2.3	Meaning of 'conscience' and 'religion'	412
15.3	Interpretation of limitations to freedom of expression	414
15.3.1	Meaning of certain terms in the limitation clauses	414



15.3.2	Expression perceived as supporting illegal organizations, enemy nations, or terrorism	415
15.3.3	Hate speech and war propaganda	419
15.3.4	Limitations on the press	421
15.4	Interpretation of limitations to freedom of association and assembly	424
15.5	Interpretation of limitations to manifestation of belief	426
15.6	Protection of the military and secret service	428
15.6.1	Protection of military or security information	428
15.6.2	The maintenance of military discipline	431
15.6.3	Conscientious objection to military service	433
15.7	Restrictions during military occupation	435
15.8	Restrictions on political parties	436
15.9	Restrictions on demonstrations and public protests	440
16	PROTECTION OF THE PERSONAL SPHERE: RIGHT TO PRIVATE AND FAMILY LIFE	444
16.1	Treaty provisions	444
16.2	Meaning of terms	445
16.2.1	Meaning of 'private life'	445
16.2.2	Meaning of 'family life'	445
16.3	Restrictions on prisoners	446
16.3.1	Correspondence	446
16.3.2	Contact with the family	448
16.4	Surveillance, interception, and searches	449
16.4.1	Secret surveillance	449
16.4.2	Search of premises	452
16.4.3	Search of a person and personal belongings	453
16.5	Databases	454
16.6	Placement on terrorism lists	457
16.7	Expulsions and displacement	457
16.7.1	Expulsions	458
16.7.2	Displacement as a result of conflict	462
16.8	Restrictions imposed during military occupation	463

## PART V PROTECTION OF VULNERABLE AND DISADVANTAGED POPULATIONS

17	ECONOMIC, SOCIAL, AND CULTURAL RIGHTS IN SITUATIONS OF VIOLENCE	467
17.1	Elements relevant to application in such situations	467
17.1.1	Possible derogations or limitations	467
17.1.2	Economic sanctions	470
17.1.3	Role of international humanitarian law	472
17.2	Interpretation of economic, social, and cultural rights in armed conflict situations	476
17.2.1	Case-law	476



17.2.2	General Comments of the CESCR	480
17.2.3	Concluding Observations of the CESCR	482
17.2.4	Fact-finding reports	486
17.2.5	Conclusion	490
17.3	Protection of ESCR through civil and political rights' individual petition systems	492
17.3.1	Rights included in both types of human rights treaties	492
17.3.2	Interpretation of civil rights covering also economic and social rights	492
17.4	Counter-terrorism measures and ESCR	494
17.4.1	Effect of restrictions to civil and political rights on ESCR	494
17.4.2	Effect of certain national counter-terrorism measures	494
17.4.3	Effect of being on the UN Security Council sanctions list	495
17.4.4	Conditions conducive to the spread of terrorism	496
17.4.5	Consideration of ESCR for emergency measures	497
17.4.6	Consideration of ESCR for peace agreements	498
18	<b>VULNERABLE GROUPS DURING ARMED CONFLICT AND OTHER VIOLENCE</b>	499
18.1	Recognition of vulnerable groups	499
18.2	Gender discrimination	500
18.2.1	Definition and impact on poverty and violence	500
18.2.2	Legal regulation of gender discrimination	501
18.2.3	Recognition of gender discrimination in situations of armed conflict	502
18.2.4	Militarization of boys	507
18.2.5	Legal requirements to counter gender discrimination in conflict situations	507
18.3	Violence against women	508
18.3.1	Phenomenon during conflict based on pre-existing attitudes	508
18.3.2	Legal prohibition of violence against women	511
18.3.3	Required preventive and reparation measures	515
18.4	Respecting human rights of people under 18 years of age	517
18.4.1	Specific problems faced by young children and adolescents in situations of violence	517
18.4.2	Requirement in human rights treaties to respect IHL rules that protect children during armed conflict	519
18.4.3	Human rights rules applicable to children	521
18.4.4	International practice on the application of children's rights in armed conflict	523
18.4.5	Classification of the most serious abuses by the UN Security Council	525
18.5	Law relating to the use of persons under 18 in the army and armed groups	526
18.5.1	Law relating to recruitment and use of such persons	526
18.5.2	Law relating to demobilization and reintegration	531
	<i>Select Bibliography</i>	535
	<i>Index</i>	541