

Contents

Foreword XI

List of Figures and Tables XIII

Abbreviations XIV

1 Introduction 1

2 Mediation to Address Drawbacks of Domestic and International Commercial Arbitration 13

2.1 Introduction 13

2.2 Popularisation of Arbitration 14

2.2.1 *Early Days of Arbitration* 14

2.2.2 *International Commercial Arbitration* 16

2.2.3 *Court-Annexed Arbitration* 20

2.3 Spread of Mediation 22

2.3.1 *History of Mediation* 22

2.3.2 *Court-Annexed Mediation* 23

2.3.3 *Commercial Mediation* 27

2.3.4 *International Commercial Mediation* 34

2.3.4.1 Enforcement as Contracts 45

2.3.4.2 Enforcement as Court Orders or through
Notaries 46

2.3.4.3 Enforcement as Consent Arbitral Awards 47

2.4 Conclusion 55

3 Mediation to Address Drawbacks of Arbitration in the Investor-State Dispute Settlement Regime 57

3.1 Introduction 57

3.2 Investor-State Arbitration 58

3.2.1 *Promotion of Investor-State Arbitration* 59

3.2.2 *Investor-State Arbitration Drawbacks* 71

3.2.2.1 Arbitration Costs 71

3.2.2.2 Delays 77

3.2.2.3 Legitimacy Crisis 79

3.2.2.3.1 *Unpredictable and Inconsistent
Awards* 79

3.2.2.3.2 *Lack of Transparency* 81

	3.2.2.3.3	<i>Constraints on Sovereignty and Allegations of 'Regulatory Chill'</i>	84
	3.2.3	<i>Current ISDS Reform Proposals</i>	86
	3.2.4	<i>Summary</i>	95
3.3		<i>Current Role of Investor-State Mediation</i>	97
	3.3.1	<i>Definition</i>	97
	3.3.2	<i>Benefits of Investor-State Mediation</i>	99
	3.3.3	<i>Promoting Mediation/Conciliation in ISDS</i>	102
	3.3.3.1	IBA	107
	3.3.3.2	International Investment Agreements	108
	3.3.3.3	Singapore Convention on Mediation	112
	3.3.3.4	ICSID Mediation Rules	117
3.4		<i>Conclusion</i>	119
4		<i>Underutilisation of ADR in ISDS – A 'Fork in the Road'?</i>	121
	4.1	<i>Introduction</i>	121
	4.2	<i>Formulation of ISDS Clauses and Problems with Interpretation</i>	123
	4.2.1	<i>The First Stage</i>	125
	4.2.2	<i>The Second Stage</i>	134
	4.3	<i>Choosing between Conciliation and Arbitration</i>	138
	4.4	<i>Possible Solutions</i>	152
	4.4.1	<i>Making Changes to the Convention and Rules</i>	153
	4.4.2	<i>Making Changes to IIAs</i>	155
	4.5	<i>Conclusion</i>	155
5		<i>Empirical Analysis of the Validity of Arguments against Mandatory ISM</i>	157
	5.1	<i>Introduction</i>	157
	5.2	<i>Previous Empirical Studies</i>	160
	5.3	<i>Data and Methodology</i>	163
	5.4	<i>Common Critiques of Investor-State Mediation – Findings and Discussion</i>	168
	5.4.1	<i>Would Mandatory Investor-State Mediation Be Futile Because Amicable Dispute Settlement Mechanisms Are Unsuitable for Certain Types of Investor-State Disputes?</i>	168
	5.4.1.1	<i>Settling a Case Would Make a State Look Weak and Indicate an Admission of Guilt</i>	170

5.4.1.2	Difficulty Determining an Authority to Settle on Behalf of a State	171
5.4.1.3	Shifting the Blame to an Arbitrator Rather than Being Accountable for Settlement Terms	174
5.4.1.4	Mediation Not Suitable for Disputes with Non-pecuniary Claims	178
5.4.2	<i>Would Mandatory Investor-State Mediation Contribute to Secret Outcomes Because Amicable Settlements Impede Transparency?</i>	180
5.4.3	<i>Would Mandatory Investor-State Mediation Be a Waste of Time Because Settlements Pay Less Compared to What Investors Are Awarded When They Win?</i>	185
5.4.4	<i>Has the Non-enforceability of Settlement Agreements Been a Problem in Practice?</i>	188
5.5	Conclusion	191
6	General Conclusions and Recommendations	194
6.1	Three Key Findings	194
6.2	Three Avenues for ISM Reform	197
6.2.1	<i>Mandatory Mediation in Multi-tier Dispute Resolution Clauses for New IIAs</i>	198
6.2.1.1	The Unilaterally Mandatory Mediation Step	198
6.2.1.2	Integrating Mandatory Mediation into the Existing Cooling-Off Periods	199
6.2.1.3	Detailed Provisions for Mandatory Mediation Procedures	200
6.2.1.4	MFN Clause with ISDS Carve-Out	201
6.2.2	<i>Amendments to ICSID with Additional Mandatory Mediation Step for All Types of Investor-State Arbitration Cases</i>	202
6.2.3	<i>Mauritius Convention Style Multilateral Treaty</i>	203
	Annexes	205
	Bibliography	208
	Index	255