

Contents

Foreword	XI
List of Figures and Tables	XIII
Abbreviations	XIV
1	Introduction 1
2	Mediation to Address Drawbacks of Domestic and International Commercial Arbitration 13
2.1	Introduction 13
2.2	Popularisation of Arbitration 14
2.2.1	<i>Early Days of Arbitration</i> 14
2.2.2	<i>International Commercial Arbitration</i> 16
2.2.3	<i>Court-Annexed Arbitration</i> 20
2.3	Spread of Mediation 22
2.3.1	<i>History of Mediation</i> 22
2.3.2	<i>Court-Annexed Mediation</i> 23
2.3.3	<i>Commercial Mediation</i> 27
2.3.4	<i>International Commercial Mediation</i> 34
2.3.4.1	Enforcement as Contracts 45
2.3.4.2	Enforcement as Court Orders or through Notaries 46
2.3.4.3	Enforcement as Consent Arbitral Awards 47
2.4	Conclusion 55
3	Mediation to Address Drawbacks of Arbitration in the Investor-State Dispute Settlement Regime 57
3.1	Introduction 57
3.2	Investor-State Arbitration 58
3.2.1	<i>Promotion of Investor-State Arbitration</i> 59
3.2.2	<i>Investor-State Arbitration Drawbacks</i> 71
3.2.2.1	Arbitration Costs 71
3.2.2.2	Delays 77
3.2.2.3	Legitimacy Crisis 79
3.2.2.3.1	<i>Unpredictable and Inconsistent Awards</i> 79
3.2.2.3.2	<i>Lack of Transparency</i> 81

3.2.2.3.3	<i>Constraints on Sovereignty and Allegations of 'Regulatory Chill'</i>	84
3.2.3	<i>Current ISDS Reform Proposals</i>	86
3.2.4	<i>Summary</i>	95
3.3	Current Role of Investor-State Mediation	97
3.3.1	<i>Definition</i>	97
3.3.2	<i>Benefits of Investor-State Mediation</i>	99
3.3.3	<i>Promoting Mediation/Conciliation in ISDS</i>	102
3.3.3.1	IBA	107
3.3.3.2	International Investment Agreements	108
3.3.3.3	Singapore Convention on Mediation	112
3.3.3.4	ICSID Mediation Rules	117
3.4	Conclusion	119
4	Underutilisation of ADR in ISDS – A 'Fork in the Road'?	121
4.1	Introduction	121
4.2	Formulation of ISDS Clauses and Problems with Interpretation	123
4.2.1	<i>The First Stage</i>	125
4.2.2	<i>The Second Stage</i>	134
4.3	Choosing between Conciliation and Arbitration	138
4.4	Possible Solutions	152
4.4.1	<i>Making Changes to the Convention and Rules</i>	153
4.4.2	<i>Making Changes to IIAs</i>	155
4.5	Conclusion	155
5	Empirical Analysis of the Validity of Arguments against Mandatory ISM	157
5.1	Introduction	157
5.2	Previous Empirical Studies	160
5.3	Data and Methodology	163
5.4	Common Critiques of Investor-State Mediation – Findings and Discussion	168
5.4.1	<i>Would Mandatory Investor-State Mediation Be Futeile Because Amicable Dispute Settlement Mechanisms Are Unsuitable for Certain Types of Investor-State Disputes?</i>	168
5.4.1.1	<i>Settling a Case Would Make a State Look Weak and Indicate an Admission of Guilt</i>	170

5.4.1.2	Difficulty Determining an Authority to Settle on Behalf of a State	171
5.4.1.3	Shifting the Blame to an Arbitrator Rather than Being Accountable for Settlement Terms	174
5.4.1.4	Mediation Not Suitable for Disputes with Non-pecuniary Claims	178
5.4.2	<i>Would Mandatory Investor-State Mediation Contribute to Secret Outcomes Because Amicable Settlements Impede Transparency?</i>	180
5.4.3	<i>Would Mandatory Investor-State Mediation Be a Waste of Time Because Settlements Pay Less Compared to What Investors Are Awarded When They Win?</i>	185
5.4.4	<i>Has the Non-enforceability of Settlement Agreements Been a Problem in Practice?</i>	188
5.5	Conclusion	191
6	General Conclusions and Recommendations	194
6.1	Three Key Findings	194
6.2	Three Avenues for ISM Reform	197
6.2.1	<i>Mandatory Mediation in Multi-tier Dispute Resolution Clauses for New IIAs</i>	198
6.2.1.1	The Unilaterally Mandatory Mediation Step	198
6.2.1.2	Integrating Mandatory Mediation into the Existing Cooling-Off Periods	199
6.2.1.3	Detailed Provisions for Mandatory Mediation Procedures	200
6.2.1.4	MFN Clause with ISDS Carve-Out	201
6.2.2	<i>Amendments to ICSID with Additional Mandatory Mediation Step for All Types of Investor-State Arbitration Cases</i>	202
6.2.3	<i>Mauritius Convention Style Multilateral Treaty</i>	203
	Annexes	205
	Bibliography	208
	Index	255