

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

1. Orientation	1
2. Introduction to the Volume	6
3. Summing up	15
4. Thanks	16

CHAPTER 1. THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES

CONFLICTS OF FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS AS CONSTITUTIONAL DILEMMAS

LORENZO ZUCCA	19
1. Introduction	19
2. Defining Genuine Conflicts of Fundamental Rights	23
2.1. The Main Distinction	25
2.2. A (Practice Oriented) Typology of Conflicts	26
3. Balancing and Incommensurability	28
4. Dealing with Conflicts	31
4.1. Constitution-Perfecting, Conflict-Solving, Theories	33
4.2. The Presumption of Priority	35
5. Conclusion	37

PRIVACY RIGHTS IN CONFLICT: IN SEARCH OF THE THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK BEHIND THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS' BALANCING OF PRIVATE LIFE AGAINST OTHER RIGHTS

AAGJE IEVEN	39
1. Introduction	39
2. Privacy Rights in Conflict	40
2.1. Private Life v. Freedom of Expression	41
2.2. Private Life v. other Persons' Privacy Rights	44
2.3. Rights of the Child	48
2.4. Right to Life	51

3.	In Search of the Court's Theoretical Framework	52
3.1.	Some General Principles	52
3.2.	A Theoretical Framework.....	54
3.2.1.	What is Judicial Minimalism?.....	54
3.2.2.	Judicial Minimalism on the European Court of Human Rights.....	55
3.2.3.	Some Critical Remarks.....	57
4.	Balancing Private Life Against other Rights: Privacy in a Democratic Society	60
4.1.	Deliberative Democracy and Human Rights: A Common Foundation in Human Autonomy.....	61
4.2.	Deliberative Democracy, the Margin of Appreciation Doctrine, Minority Rights and Critical Debate	64
4.3.	Implications for the Resolution of Conflicts Between Fundamental Rights.....	65
4.3.1.	For Rights Conflicts in General	65
4.3.2.	For Conflicts with Privacy Rights.....	67

CONSTITUTIONAL DEMOCRACY, CONSTITUTIONAL INTERPRETATION AND CONFLICTING RIGHTS

EVELYNE MAES.....	69
-------------------	----

1.	Introduction	69
2.	Constitutional Democracy.....	71
2.1.	Crisis of Democracy	71
2.2.	Rise of Constitutional Democracy	73
2.3.	Habermas' Theory on Constitutional Democracy.....	74
3.	Habermas on Constitutional Interpretation and Balancing Rights	80
3.1.	Judicial Review.....	80
3.2.	Balancing Conflicting Rights	84
4.	Models of Interpretation.....	87
4.1.	Originalism	87
4.2.	Procedural Democracy Interpretation of Ely	90
4.3.	Fundamental Rights Interpretation by Dworkin.....	93
5.	Conclusion	97

CHAPTER 2. TOWARDS A GENERAL APPROACH TO DEAL WITH
CONFLICTING FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS

BACK TO BASICS: WITHOUT DISTINCTION – A DEFINING
PRINCIPLE?

ALISON STUART 101

1. Introduction 101

2. Textual Primacy of the Non Distinction Norm 103

2.1. The Current Non Discrimination Test..... 106

3. Judicial Handling of the Non Distinction Norm 108

3.1. International Jurisprudence on Non Discrimination on the Basis
of Sex 109

3.2. Regional Jurisprudence on Non Discrimination on the Basis
of Sex 111

4. The Non Distinction Norm as a Method of Interpretation..... 120

5. The Proposed Legal Application of the Non Distinction Norm..... 124

6. Conclusion 128

CUTTING TO THE CORE OF CONFLICTING RIGHTS: THE QUESTION
OF INALIENABLE CORES IN COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE

GERHARD VAN DER SCHYFF 131

1. Introduction 131

2. Approaches to Cores 132

2.1. Objective and Subjective Approaches 133

2.2. Absolute and Relative Approaches 133

3. Conflicting Cores Considered 135

4. European Convention 137

4.1. One-Stage Rights..... 139

4.2. Two-Stage Rights..... 140

5. South African Bill of Rights..... 141

5.1. Interim Bill of Rights 142

5.2. Final Bill of Rights..... 142

6. Conclusion 146

TOWARDS A SOCIALIZATION OF FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS

MARLIES GALENKAMP	149
1. Introduction	149
2. Conflicts of Fundamental Rights Within the Dutch Setting	150
3. The Absolutism of the Fundamental Rights Discourse	154
4. Problems	156
5. Lessons from Ownership	158
6. No Rights Without Responsibilities	159
7. Back to Practice	161
8. Conclusions	164

CHAPTER 3. THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND CONFLICTING RIGHTS

RIGHTS IN CONFLICT: THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS AS A PRAGMATIC INSTITUTION

OLIVIER DE SCHUTTER and FRANÇOISE TULKENS	169
1. Introduction	169
2. Conflicts Real or Imagined	174
2.1. Conflicts Between a Right Protected Under the Convention and another Interest	175
2.2. Rights of an 'Absolute' Character and Rights Subject to Restrictions	179
2.3. Obligations to Respect and Obligations to Protect	181
2.4. Conclusion	187
3. The Classical Solutions to Situations of Real Conflicts	188
3.1. The 'Necessity' Test	188
3.2. Balancing	191
3.3. The National Margin of Appreciation	198
4. The Procedural Turn	203
4.1. Practical Concordance	203
4.2. Transforming the Background Conditions	206
4.3. Encouraging Deliberative Processes	208
4.4. Developing Standards Through Adjudication	210
4.5. Two Guiding Principles	213
5. Conclusion	215

CONFLICTS BETWEEN FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS AND THE
EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS: AN OVERVIEW

PEGGY DUCOULOMBIER 217

1. Types of Conflict 219

1.1. Conflicts of Rights and Horizontal Situations 219

1.2. Conflicts of Rights and Vertical Cases..... 222

1.3. The Link Between the Structure of the Conflict and the Methods
of Resolution 224

1.4. Conflicts Between Rights and Procedural Questions 225

2. Current Solutions..... 226

2.1. Conflicts Between Rights, Balance of Interests and
Proportionality 227

2.2. Conflicts of Rights and Positive Obligations 229

2.3. The Influence of Conflicts on the Margin of Appreciation..... 230

3. Towards a Human Rights Hierarchy?..... 234

3.1. Hierarchy in the Field of Human Rights..... 234

3.2. The European Convention and the Idea of Hierarchy..... 236

3.3. Abstract and Concrete Hierarchy..... 238

3.4. The Hierarchical Framework Proposed to Solve Conflicts
Between Rights..... 239

3.5. Practical Concordance: An Alternative? 243

4. Conclusion: Effect on the Court’s Future..... 246

THE SEARCH FOR AN EQUILIBRIUM BY THE EUROPEAN COURT OF
HUMAN RIGHTS

LETO CARIOLOU..... 249

1. Introduction 249

2. General Remarks on the Court’s Adjudication..... 250

3. The Court’s Overall Rejection of a Utilitarian Theory of Convention
Rights..... 251

4. The Impact of the Reasoning of an Interference on the Protection of a
Convention Right..... 253

5. The Requirement of a Qualitative Assessment of the Values Concerned
in a Given Case..... 255

6. The “Incompleteness of Ranking” Between Potentially Competing
Convention Rights..... 259

7. The Role of Balancing 261

8. “Balancing” as a Tool of Development of a Normative Theory	265
9. Conclusion	268

CHAPTER 4. CONFLICTING RIGHTS AND CONSTITUTIONAL COURTS

BALANCING CONFLICTING HUMAN RIGHTS: KONRAD HESSE’S NOTION OF “PRAKTISCHE KONKORDANZ” AND THE GERMAN FEDERAL CONSTITUTIONAL COURT

THILO MARAUHN and NADINE RUPPEL.....	273
1. Introduction	273
1.1. Categorizing Conflicts Within a Human Rights System	274
1.2. Exemplary Case Law of the Federal Constitutional Court.....	276
1.3. A Biographical Note on Konrad Hesse	278
2. “Practical Concordance”: Terminology and Methodology.....	279
2.1. Konrad Hesse’s Methodology	279
2.2. Constitutional Doctrine and the Notion of “Practical Concordance”	281
3. “Practical Concordance” and its Application by the German Federal Constitutional Court.....	284
3.1. The “Mephisto” Ruling.....	285
3.2. The “Mutzenbacher” Ruling	287
3.3. The “Crucifix” Ruling.....	289
3.4. The “Headscarf” Ruling.....	292
4. “Practical Concordance” and <i>Effet Utile</i>	294
5. In Conclusion	296

CONFLICTING RIGHTS IN SOUTH AFRICAN CASE LAW

CAROLE LEWIS	297
1. Introduction	297
2. The South African Legal Framework	299
3. Freedom of Expression and Defamation	299
4. Freedom of Expression and the Right to a Fair Trial.....	305
5. Freedom of Expression and Intellectual Property Rights.....	312
6. Conclusion	315

CONFLICTS OF FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS BEFORE THE CONSTITUTIONAL COURT OF BELGIUM: THE CASE OF FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION

NICOLAS BONBLED.....	317
1. Introduction	317
2. Conflicts of Fundamental Rights Before the Constitutional Court.....	318
2.1. The Jurisdiction of the Constitutional Court	318
2.2. A Typology of Conflicts	321
2.2.1. Conflicts of Rights.....	321
2.2.2. Conflicts of Guarantees	322
3. Conflicts Involving Freedom of Expression and other Fundamental Rights.....	325
3.1. Freedom of Expression v. Right to Health.....	325
3.2. Freedom of Expression v. Rights of Children.....	326
3.3. Freedom of Expression v. Right of Property and Right to a Healthy Environment.....	328
3.4. Freedom of Expression v. Right not to Be Discriminated Against .	329
3.4.1. Holocaust Denial.....	329
3.4.2. Racism, Xenophobia and “Manifest Hostility” towards the European Convention on Human Rights.....	331
3.4.3. Incitement to Discrimination, Hatred or Violence	332
3.5. Freedom of Expression v. Right to Life and Right to Respect of Private and Family Life.....	334
4. Conflicts of Constitutional and International Guarantees of Freedom of Expression.....	336
4.1. Relations Between Constitutional and International Guarantees of Freedom of Expression.....	337
4.2. An Integrative and Flexible Approach to Conflicts of Guarantees.	340
5. Conclusion	343

CONFLICTS BETWEEN FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS IN THE JURISPRUDENCE OF THE CONSTITUTIONAL COURT OF THE CZECH REPUBLIC

DAVID KOSAŘ.....	347
1. Background Information	347
1.1. Basic Features of the Czech Constitutional Court.....	348
1.2. Charter of Fundamental Rights and Basic Freedoms	351

2.	Conflicts Between Fundamental Rights: Theoretical Foundations	354
2.1.	Introductory Remarks	355
2.2.	Proportionality Test	357
2.3.	Balancing	358
2.4.	Test of “Minimizing Impingement upon a Fundamental Right” ..	361
2.5.	Summary of Part 2	363
3.	Conflicts Between Fundamental Rights: Practical Application.....	363
3.1.	Abstract and Concrete Constitutional Review Cases	365
3.2.	Individual Constitutional Complaint Cases.....	367
4.	Different (Proportionality) Test for Abstract/Concrete Judicial Review and for Individual Constitutional Complaints?	371
4.1.	Reversal Order of the Final Stages of the Proportionality Test	372
4.2.	Different Content of the Balancing Stage	373
4.3.	Recommendations.....	375
5.	Conclusion	378

CHAPTER 5. CONFLICTS RELATING TO LEGAL PLURALISM AND CULTURAL DIVERSITY

MUSLIM PERSONAL LAW (MPL) IN CANADA: A CASE STUDY CONSIDERING THE CONFLICT BETWEEN FREEDOM OF RELIGION AND MUSLIM WOMEN’S RIGHT TO EQUALITY

	WAHEEDA AMIEN	381
1.	Introduction	381
2.	Application of MPL	384
3.	Secular Options for Marriage and Divorce	388
3.1.	Assimilation	388
3.2.	Accommodation	391
4.	Shari’a Arbitration Tribunals.....	396
5.	Constitutional Framework.....	405
5.1.	Equality.....	405
5.2.	Freedom of Religion	408
5.3.	Resolving the Conflict Between the Right to Equality and Freedom of Religion	414
6.	Conclusion	418

FREEDOM OF RELIGION VERSUS SEX EQUALITY AND STATE NEUTRALITY: THE DIFFERENCE THE METHOD OF REVIEW CAN MAKE

TITIA LOENEN..... 421

1. Introduction 421
3. Similar Principles, Different Approaches, Different Results..... 422
4. Burqas in the Classroom..... 426
5. Headscarves in the Courtroom..... 427
6. Conclusions..... 429

LEGAL PLURALISM AND ISLAM IN THE SCALES OF THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS: THE LIMITS OF CATEGORICAL BALANCING

KAREN MEERSCHAUT and SERGE GUTWIRTH..... 431

1. Introduction 431
2. Legal Pluralism as a Conflict of Human Rights 433
3. The Refah-Case: Strasbourg's Categorical Rejection of Legal Pluralism . 435
 - 3.1. The Framework of Article 11 ECHR..... 435
 - 3.2. Legal Pluralism and Sharia as Contrary to Secularism, Equality and Democracy 436
 - 3.3. A Problematic Precedent for Legal Pluralism, Muslims and Islam. Discussion of the Arguments 438
 - 3.4. Secularism and Neutrality: No Clear Meaning 440
 - 3.5. Strasbourg's Two Strands of Case-Law Concerning the Freedom of Religion..... 444
 - 3.6. Legal Pluralism and Gender Equality 447
 - 3.7. An Essentialising Discourse on Islamic Law 448
4. Malaysia: Islamic Law and the Malaysian Model of a Pluralistic-Uniform Legal System..... 451
 - 4.1. Malaysia: A 'Communitarian-Liberal Democracy' 451
 - 4.2. Malaysia: Quasi-Secular or Quasi-Islamic? 453
 - 4.3. Legal Pluralism in Family Law and Islamic Family Law 456
 - 4.4. Some Critical Points About the Legal Pluralism in Malaysia 459
5. Conclusion: A Plea for a Nuanced and Context-Sensitive Form of Balancing..... 462

CHAPTER 6. CONFLICTS RELATING TO ECONOMIC RIGHTS

ENVIRONMENT VERSUS FREE ENTERPRISE: A CONFLICT BETWEEN FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS?

IGNACIO GARCÍA VITORIA	469
1. Introduction	469
2. The Right to a Healthy Environment	471
2.1. The Constitutionalization of Environmental Goals	471
2.2. Judicial Enforceability	473
3. Free Enterprise as a Constitutional Right	475
4. A Necessary Delimitation of the Constitutional Substance of Economic Liberties.....	478
5. The Core-Periphery Model	482
5.1. A Cultural Approach	482
5.2. The Free Development of the Personality	483
5.3. Measures that May Hinder Internal Trade	485
5.4. Barriers to Entry	487
5.5. Measures Favouring Certain Firms	489
6. Conclusion	490

THE LAW OF NUISANCE AND HUMAN RIGHTS

FRANCIS McMANUS	493
1. Summary.....	493
2. The Law of Nuisance	493
3. Historical Development of the Law of Nuisance	498
4. The Miasmatic Theory of the Transmission of Disease and Nuisance ...	500
5. Nuisance and the Rule in <i>Rylands v. Fletcher</i>	501
6. Elements of the Law of Nuisance.....	502
6.1. Unreasonable Conduct.....	502
6.2. What Factors Are Taken into Account?.....	503
7. Social Utility of the Defender's Conduct	504
8. Motive of the Defender	505
9. Locality	506
9.1. Locality and the Effect of Planning Permission.....	507
10. Duration and Intensity	509
11. Time of Day.....	509
12. Sensitivity of Pursuer	509
13. Social Utility of Thing Interfered with.....	510

14. Could the Nuisance Have Been Avoided by the Pursuer?.....	511
15. Is the State of Affairs Typical of Modern Life?	511
16. Need for an Emanation from the Defender's Premises	512
17. Did the Pursuer Live in Fear of the Adverse State of Affairs?.....	514
18. The Law of Nuisance and Human Rights	514
19. Conclusions.....	518

THE DISPOSSESSED AND THE DISTRESSED: CONFLICTS IN LAND-RELATED RIGHTS IN TRANSITIONS FROM UNLAWFUL TERRITORIAL REGIMES

YAËL RONEN	521
1. Introduction: Unlawful Territorial Regimes and Restitution of Property	521
2. The Cases.....	525
2.1. The Baltic States.....	525
2.2. East Timor	529
2.3. The TRNC.....	533
3. Rights Related to Land	537
3.1. Introduction.....	537
3.2. Rights Protecting Original Owners	538
3.3. Rights Protecting Current Occupants	541
3.3.1. Proprietary Rights.....	541
3.3.2. Non-Proprietary Rights	543
4. Balancing the Rights	545
4.1. Introduction.....	545
4.2. Good Faith	546
4.3. The Link Between Residence and Land Rights.....	547
4.4. The Relationship Between the Individual and the Unlawful Territorial Regime.....	553
5. Conclusion	556

**CONFLICTING ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL RIGHTS:
THE PROPORTIONALITY PLUS TEST**

WOUTER VANDENHOLE.....	559
1. First Type Conflicts	563
2. Second Type Conflicts: Principles.....	565
2.1. Prioritisation of the Most Vulnerable Groups	565

2.2.	Core Content – Minimum Essential Level	567
2.3.	Prioritization of Certain Rights?	571
3.	Second Type Conflicts: Some Cases	573
3.1.	The Right to Housing Versus the Right to Property	573
3.2.	The Right to Housing Versus the Right to Housing.	578
3.3.	The Right to Health Versus other Social Rights	579
3.4.	Right to Social Security Versus other Social Rights.	583
4.	Third Type Conflict: Extraterritorial Obligations	585
5.	Conclusions.	586

CONFLICTS BETWEEN FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS OR CONFLICTING FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS VOCABULARIES?

AN ANALYSIS OF DIVERGING USES OF ‘FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS’ IN THE CONTEXT OF INTERNATIONAL AND EUROPEAN TRADE LAW

JOHN MORIJN 591

1.	Introduction	591
2.	Diverging Uses of ‘Fundamental Rights’ in the Context of International and European Trade Law	594
2.1.	Uses of the ‘Fundamental Rights Vocabulary’ in the General Context of Economic Globalisation: Different Challenges to Interdependence	595
2.2.	International Trade Law and the Core Labour Standards Debate: Sequencing the Fundamental Rights List by Prioritising Procedural Rights	599
2.3.	European Trade Law and the Nature of Economic Free Movement Rules: Extending the Fundamental Rights List to Include Economic Market Freedoms	603
3.	Re-Approaching ‘Conflicts Between Fundamental Rights’ in the Context of International and European Trade Law: Identifying Conceptual and Methodological Promises and Challenges Beneath and Beyond Babel.	611
4.	Conclusion	616

CHAPTER 7. ARE CONFLICTING RIGHTS REALLY AN ISSUE?

'THE RIGHTS AND FREEDOMS OF OTHERS': THE ECHR AND ITS PECULIAR CATEGORY OF CONFLICTS BETWEEN INDIVIDUAL FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS

JACCO BOMHOFF.....	619
1. Introduction: Conflicts Between Fundamental Rights and the European Convention.....	619
2. 'The Rights and Freedoms of Others': Elements of an Internal Critique .	623
2.1. Introduction.....	623
2.2. Confusion About Relevant Rights in Specific Cases	624
2.3. Who May Be 'Others'?	625
2.4. Internal Critique and Structural Weaknesses	627
3. The Contingency of the Category of 'Conflicts Between Fundamental Rights'	627
3.1. Introduction.....	627
3.2. Factual Contingency and the 'True Conflict'/Non-Conflict Boundary	628
3.3. Institutional Contingency and the Comparative Perspective: Introduction.....	630
3.4. Institutional Contingency (1): Understandings of Rights.....	630
3.5. Institutional Contingency (2): Alternative Conceptualizations ...	632
4. Convention Exceptionalism and the Missing Structural Perspective....	634
4.1. Introduction.....	634
4.2. Convention Exceptionalism (1): No Division of Powers Jurisdiction.....	635
4.3. Convention Exceptionalism (2): Visions of a 'Democratic Society'	637
5. The Missing Structural Perspective in Convention Case-Law.....	638
5.1. Introduction.....	638
5.2. The Missing Structural Perspective (1): Difficult Aims.....	639
5.3. The Missing Structural Perspective (2): Neglected Aims	643
5.4. The Missing Structural Perspective (3): Aims and Effects	644
6. Taking 'Conflicts Between Fundamental Rights' Seriously	645
6.1. Introduction.....	645
6.2. Illusions of Micro-Management, Juridification and De-Politicization	646
6.3. Taking 'Conflicts Between Fundamental Rights' Seriously: Suspicious and Suboptimal Conceptualizations	647
6.4. (1): Majorities as 'Others'	648

6.5.	(2): Public Bodies and Officials as ‘Others’	649
6.6.	(3): Redistribution and Access to Public Resources.....	651
7.	Conclusion: The Future of Conflicts Between Rights Before a <i>Quasi-Constitutional Court</i>	652

FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS AND OTHER INTERESTS: SHOULD IT REALLY MAKE A DIFFERENCE?

JANNEKE H. GERARDS.....	655
1. Introduction	655
2. Proliferation of Fundamental Rights in the Case Law of the ECtHR and the ECJ	656
2.1. Introduction: Different Types of Rights and the Normative Debate About Proliferation	656
2.2. The European Court of Human Rights	659
2.2.1. Positive Obligations and the Proliferation of Convention Rights	659
2.2.2. Evolutive Interpretation and the Proliferation of Fundamental Rights	663
2.2.3. Conclusion	666
2.3. The European Court of Justice	667
3. Judicial Assessment of Cases Concerning Fundamental Rights and other Individual Interests.....	672
3.1. Introduction.....	672
3.2. National Courts: The Example of the United Kingdom and the Netherlands	674
3.2.1. The UK	674
3.2.2. The Netherlands	678
3.3. The European Court of Justice	681
3.4. Conclusion	685
4. The Legal Distinction Between Fundamental Rights and Individual Interests – Is there an Alternative?	686