

COMPLETE TABLE OF CONTENTS

CITATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS	xxv
FOREWORD <i>François Rigaux</i>	xxix
INTRODUCTION <i>Jean-Yves Carlier</i>	1
 PART I – NATIONAL REPORTS	 7
 TABLE OF CONTENTS FOR ALL NATIONAL REPORTS	 9
1 AUSTRIA (Klaus Hullmann)	11
Abbreviations and acknowledgements	11
I Procedure	12
II Statistics	21
III Analysis of the case law	23
A <i>Persecution</i>	23
1 Evaluation of the fear	23
1.1 Past events	23
1.2 Future fear	24
1.2.1 Objective elements	24
1.2.1.1 Requirement for objective elements	24
1.2.1.2 Type of objective element	25
1.2.1.3 Source of the objective element	26
1.2.1.3.1 Time	26
1.2.1.3.2 Place	28
1.2.2 Subjective elements	33
1.2.3 Reference to a degree of risk	34

1.2.4	Reference to human rights	35
1.2.4.1	Formal reference to human rights	35
1.2.4.2	Implicit reference to human rights	36
1.2.5	Proportionality in the assessment	37
1.3	Proof	38
1.3.1	Burden of proof	38
1.3.2	Benefit of the doubt	41
2	Nature of the persecution	42
2.1	Physical	42
2.2	Psychological	42
2.3	Economic	43
3	Agent	44
4	Subject	45
4.1	Claimant	45
4.2	Family	46
4.3	Others	47
5	Reasons	48
5.1	Race	48
5.2	Religion	48
5.3	Nationality	49
5.4	Membership of a particular social group	49
5.5	Political opinions	50
5.5.1	Active political opinions	50
5.5.2	Passive political opinions	52
6	Exclusion and cessation	52
<i>B</i>	<i>Breach with the country of origin</i>	53
<i>C</i>	<i>Family reunion</i>	54
2	BELGIUM (Dirk Vanheule)	57
	Abbreviations, citations and acknowledgements	57
I	Procedure	59
II	Statistics	61
III	Analysis of the case law	62
<i>A</i>	<i>Persecution</i>	62
1	Evaluation of the fear	62
1.1	Past events	62
1.2	Future fear	63
1.2.1	Objective elements	63
1.2.1.1	Requirement for objective elements	63
1.2.1.2	Type of objective element	64

1.2.1.3	Source of the objective element	67
1.2.1.3.1	Time	67
1.2.1.3.2	Place	69
1.2.2	Subjective elements	72
1.2.3	Reference to a degree of risk	74
1.2.4	Reference to human rights	75
1.2.4.1	Formal reference to human rights	75
1.2.4.2	Implicit reference to human rights	79
1.2.5	Proportionality in the assessment	82
1.3	Proof	83
1.3.1	Burden of proof	83
1.3.2	Benefit of the doubt	86
2	Nature of the persecution	87
2.1	Physical	88
2.2	Psychological	89
2.3	Economic	91
3	Agent	93
4	Subject	97
4.1	Claimant	97
4.2	Family	97
4.3	Others	99
5	Reasons	99
5.1	Race	99
5.2	Religion	99
5.3	Nationality	100
5.4	Membership of a particular social group	100
5.5	Political opinions	102
5.5.1	Active political opinions	102
5.5.2	Passive political opinions	104
6	Exclusion and cessation	105
<i>B</i>	<i>Breach with the country of origin</i>	107
<i>C</i>	<i>Family reunion</i>	109
3	SWITZERLAND (Klaus Hullmann)	111
	Abbreviations and acknowledgements	111
I	Procedure	113
II	Statistics	122
III	Analysis of the case law	123
<i>A</i>	<i>Persecution</i>	123
1	Evaluation of the fear	123

1.1	Past events	123
1.2	Future fear	125
1.2.1	Objective elements	125
1.2.1.1	Requirement for objective elements	125
1.2.1.2	Type of objective element	127
1.2.1.3	Source of the objective element	129
1.2.1.3.1	Time	129
1.2.1.3.2	Place	132
1.2.2	Subjective elements	135
1.2.3	Reference to a degree of risk	135
1.2.4	Reference to human rights	137
1.2.4.1	Formal reference to human rights	137
1.2.4.2	Implicit reference to human rights	139
1.2.5	Proportionality in the assessment	141
1.3	Proof	142
1.3.1	Burden of proof	142
1.3.2	Benefit of the doubt	146
2	Nature of the persecution	147
2.1	Physical	147
2.2	Psychological	148
2.3	Economic	149
3	Agent	149
4	Subject	152
4.1	Claimant	152
4.2	Family	153
4.3	Others	154
5	Reasons	154
5.1	Race	154
5.2	Religion	154
5.3	Nationality	155
5.4	Membership of a particular social group	156
5.5	Political opinions	157
5.5.1	Active political opinions	157
5.5.2	Passive political opinions	158
6	Exclusion and cessation	158
<i>B</i>	<i>Breach with the country of origin</i>	161
<i>C</i>	<i>Family reunion</i>	161

4	CANADA (Jeanne Donald and Dirk Vanheule)	165
	Abbreviations, citations and acknowledgements	165
I	Procedure	167
II	Statistics	176
III	Analysis of the case law	177
A	<i>Persecution</i>	177
1	Evaluation of the fear	177
1.1	Past events	177
1.2	Future fear	178
1.2.1	Objective elements	178
1.2.1.1	Requirement for objective elements	178
1.2.1.2	Type of objective element	179
1.2.1.3	Source of the objective element	181
1.2.1.3.1	Time	181
1.2.1.3.2	Place	184
1.2.2	Subjective elements	188
1.2.3	Reference to a degree of risk	189
1.2.4	Reference to human rights	190
1.2.4.1	Formal reference to human rights	190
1.2.4.2	Implicit reference to human rights	195
1.2.5	Proportionality in the assessment	196
1.3	Proof	196
1.3.1	Burden of proof	196
1.3.2	Benefit of the doubt	197
2	Nature of the persecution	198
2.1	Physical	198
2.2	Psychological	200
2.3	Economic	201
3	Agent	203
4	Subject	206
4.1	Claimant	206
4.2	Family	206
4.3	Others	206
5	Reasons	207
5.1	Race	207
5.2	Religion	207
5.3	Nationality	208
5.4	Membership of a particular social group	208
5.5	Political opinions	212
5.5.1	Active political opinions	213

5.5.2	Passive political opinions	214
6	Exclusion and cessation	215
6.1	Exclusion	215
6.2	Cessation	220
<i>B</i>	<i>Breach with the country of origin</i>	221
<i>C</i>	<i>Family reunion</i>	224
5	GERMANY (Klaus Hullmann)	225
	Abbreviations and acknowledgements	225
I	Procedure	227
II	Statistics	237
III	Analysis of the case law	238
<i>A</i>	<i>Persecution</i>	238
1	Evaluation of the fear	238
1.1	Past events	238
1.2	Future fear	239
1.2.1	Objective elements	239
1.2.1.1	Requirement for objective elements	239
1.2.1.2	Type of objective element	240
1.2.1.3	Source of the objective element	244
1.2.1.3.1	Time	244
1.2.1.3.2	Place	247
1.2.2	Subjective elements	253
1.2.3	Reference to a degree of risk	254
1.2.4	Reference to human rights	255
1.2.4.1	Formal reference to human rights	255
1.2.4.2	Implicit reference to human rights	258
1.2.5	Proportionality in the assessment	260
1.3	Proof	263
1.3.1	Burden of proof	263
1.3.2	Benefit of the doubt	265
2	Nature of the persecution	266
2.1	Physical	266
2.2	Psychological	267
2.3	Economic	268
3	Agent	269
4	Subject	274
4.1	Claimant	274
4.2	Family	275
4.3	Others	277

5	Reasons	279
5.1	Race	279
5.2	Religion	280
5.3	Nationality	282
5.4	Membership of a particular social group	283
5.5	Political opinions	284
5.5.1	Active political opinions	284
5.5.2	Passive political opinions	286
6	Exclusion and cessation	288
<i>B</i>	<i>Breach with the country of origin</i>	288
<i>C</i>	<i>Family reunion</i>	289
6	DENMARK (Pia Lynggaard Justesen)	291
	Abbreviations and acknowledgements	291
I	Procedure	292
II	Statistics	302
III	Analysis of the case law	303
<i>A</i>	<i>Persecution</i>	303
1	Evaluation of the fear	303
1.1	Past events	303
1.2	Future fear	304
1.2.1	Objective elements	304
1.2.1.1	Requirement for objective elements	304
1.2.1.2	Type of objective element	305
1.2.1.3	Source of the objective element	308
1.2.1.3.1	Time	308
1.2.1.3.2	Place	311
1.2.2	Subjective elements	313
1.2.3	Reference to a degree of risk	316
1.2.4	Reference to human rights	316
1.2.4.1	Formal reference to human rights	316
1.2.4.2	Implicit reference to human rights	327
1.2.5	Proportionality in the assessment	320
1.3	Proof	320
1.3.1	Burden of proof	320
1.3.2	Benefit of the doubt	322
2	Nature of the persecution	324
2.1	Physical	324
2.2	Psychological	325
2.3	Economic	325

3	Agent	326
4	Subject	327
4.1	Claimant	327
4.2	Family	328
4.3	Others	328
5	Reasons	328
5.1	Race	329
5.2	Religion	329
5.3	Nationality	330
5.4	Membership of a particular social group	330
5.5	Political opinions	331
5.5.1	Active political opinions	331
5.5.2	Passive political opinions	333
6	Exclusion and cessation	334
<i>B</i>	<i>Breach with the country of origin</i>	336
<i>C</i>	<i>Family reunion</i>	336
7	SPAIN (Carlos Peña Galiano)	337
	Abbreviations and acknowledgements	337
I	Procedure	338
II	Statistics	342
III	Analysis of the case law	342
<i>A</i>	<i>Persecution</i>	343
1	Evaluation of the fear	343
1.1	Past events	343
1.2	Future fear	344
1.2.1	Objective elements	344
1.2.1.1	Requirement for objective elements	344
1.2.1.2	Type of objective element	345
1.2.1.3	Source of the objective element	347
1.2.1.3.1	Time	347
1.2.1.3.2	Place	350
1.2.2	Subjective elements	351
1.2.3	Reference to a degree of risk	353
1.2.4	Reference to human rights	354
1.2.4.1	Formal reference to human rights	354
1.2.4.2	Implicit reference to human rights	356
1.2.5	Proportionality in the assessment	357
1.3	Proof	358
1.3.1	Burden of proof	358

1.3.2	Benefit of the doubt	363
2	Nature of the persecution	363
2.1	Physical	363
2.2	Psychological	363
2.3	Economic	364
3	Agent	365
4	Subject	365
4.1	Claimant	365
4.2	Family	366
4.3	Others	366
5	Reasons	367
5.1	Race	367
5.2	Religion	367
5.3	Nationality	368
5.4	Membership of a particular social group	368
5.5	Political opinions	369
5.5.1	Active political opinions	369
5.5.2	Passive political opinions	370
5.6	Others	370
6	Exclusion and cessation	370
<i>B</i>	<i>Breach with the country of origin</i>	371
<i>C</i>	<i>Family reunion</i>	372
8	FRANCE (Klaudia Schank and Carlos Peña Galiano)	373
	Abbreviations and acknowledgements	373
I	Procedure	375
II	Statistics	377
III	Analysis of the case law	378
<i>A</i>	<i>Persecution</i>	378
1	Evaluation of the fear	379
1.1	Past events	379
1.2	Future fear	379
1.2.1	Objective elements	379
1.2.1.1	Requirement for objective elements	379
1.2.1.2	Type of objective element	380
1.2.1.3	Source of the objective element	381
1.2.1.3.1	Time	381
1.2.1.3.2	Place	384
1.2.2	Subjective elements	385
1.2.3	Reference to a degree of risk	386

1.2.4	Reference to human rights	386
1.2.4.1	Formal reference to human rights	386
1.2.4.2	Implicit reference to human rights	387
1.2.5	Proportionality in the assessment	388
1.3	Proof	390
1.3.1	Burden of proof	390
1.3.2	Benefit of the doubt	394
2	Nature of the persecution	395
2.1	Physical	395
2.2	Psychological	396
2.3	Economic	397
2.4	Administrative	398
3	Agent	398
3.1	State	398
3.2	Other	400
4	Subject	404
4.1	Claimant	404
4.2	Family	407
4.3	Others	408
5	Reasons	409
5.1	Race	409
5.2	Religion	409
5.3	Nationality	412
5.4	Membership of a particular social group	412
5.5	Political opinions	415
5.5.1	Active political opinions	415
5.5.2	Passive political opinions	418
5.6	Others	419
6	Exclusion and cessation	420
6.1	Exclusion	420
6.2	Cessation	425
<i>B</i>	<i>Breach with the country of origin</i>	433
<i>C</i>	<i>Family reunion</i>	436
9	GREECE (Paroula Naskou-Perraki)	441
I	Procedure	441
II	Statistics	445
III	Analysis of the case law	445
<i>A</i>	<i>Persecution</i>	446
1	Evaluation of the fear	446

1.1	Past events	446
1.2	Future fear	446
1.2.1	Objective elements	446
1.2.1.2	Type of objective element	446
1.2.1.3	Source of the objective element	448
1.2.1.3.2	Place	448
1.2.2	Subjective elements	449
1.2.3	Reference to a degree of risk	450
1.2.4	Reference to human rights	450
1.3	Proof	451
1.3.1	Burden of proof	451
1.3.2	Benefit of the doubt	452
2	Nature of the persecution	452
2.1	Physical	452
2.2	Psychological	452
2.3	Economic	453
4	Subject	453
5	Reasons	453
5.1	Race	453
5.2	Religion	454
5.3	Nationality	454
5.5	Political opinions	454
5.6	Others	455
C	<i>Family reunion</i>	455
10	ITALY (Bruno Nascimbene and Carlos Peña Galiano)	457
	Abbreviations	457
I	Procedure	458
II	Statistics	461
III	Analysis of the case law	462
A	<i>Persecution</i>	462
1	Evaluation of the fear	462
1.1	Past events	462
1.2	Future fear	463
1.2.1	Objective elements	463
1.2.1.1	Requirement for objective elements	463
1.2.1.2	Type of objective element	463
1.2.1.3	Source of the objective element	464
1.2.1.3.1	Time	564
1.2.2	Subjective elements	465

1.2.3	Reference to a degree of risk	465
1.2.4	Reference to human rights	466
1.3	Proof	466
2	Nature of the persecution	467
2.3	Economic	467
4	Subject	468
4.2	Family	468
5	Reasons	468
5.1 & 5.2	Race and Religion	468
5.5	Political opinions	468
<i>B</i>	<i>Breach with the country of origin</i>	469
11	LUXEMBOURG (Carlos Peña Galiano)	471
	Acknowledgements	471
I	Procedure	472
II	Statistics	474
III	Analysis of the case law	475
<i>A</i>	<i>Persecution</i>	475
1	Evaluation of the fear	475
1.1	Past events	475
1.2	Future fear	475
1.2.1	Objective elements	475
1.2.1.2	Type of objective element	475
1.2.1.3	Source of the objective element	476
1.2.1.3.1	Time	476
1.2.1.3.2	Place	477
1.2.3	Reference to a degree of risk	477
1.3	Proof	477
1.3.1	Burden of proof	477
4	Subject	478
4.2	Family	478
5	Reasons	478
5.5	Political opinions	478
5.5.1	Active political opinions	478
<i>C</i>	<i>Family reunion</i>	478
12	THE NETHERLANDS (Dirk Vanheule)	479
	Abbreviations and acknowledgements	479
I	Procedure	481

II	Statistics	486
III	Analysis of the case law	487
A	<i>Persecution</i>	487
1	Evaluation of the fear	487
1.1	Past events	487
1.2	Future fear	487
1.2.1	Objective elements	487
1.2.1.1	Requirement for objective elements	487
1.2.1.2	Type of objective element	488
1.2.1.3	Source of the objective element	493
1.2.1.3.1	Time	493
1.2.1.3.2	Place	495
1.2.2	Subjective elements	497
1.2.3	Reference to a degree of risk	499
1.2.4	Reference to human rights	499
1.2.4.1	Formal reference to human rights	500
1.2.4.2	Implicit reference to human rights	504
1.2.5	Proportionality in the assessment	506
1.3	Proof	507
1.3.1	Burden of proof	507
1.3.2	Benefit of the doubt	510
2	Nature of the persecution	511
2.1	Physical	511
2.2	Psychological	512
2.3	Economic	512
3	Agent	512
4	Subject	514
4.1	Claimant	514
4.2	Family	514
4.3	Others	515
5	Reasons	515
5.1	Race	515
5.2	Religion	515
5.3	Nationality	516
5.4	Membership of a particular social group	516
5.5	Political opinions	518
5.5.1	Active political opinions	518
5.5.2	Passive political opinions	520
6	Exclusion and cessation	522
B	<i>Breach with the country of origin</i>	523
C	<i>Family reunion</i>	524

13	PORTUGAL (Carlos Peña Galiano)	527
	Abbreviations and acknowledgements	527
I	Procedure	528
II	Statistics	531
III	Analysis of the case law	532
A	<i>Persecution</i>	532
1	Evaluation of the fear	532
1.1	Past events	532
1.2	Future fear	532
1.2.1	Objective elements	532
1.2.1.1	Requirement for objective elements	532
1.2.1.2	Type of objective element	533
1.2.1.3	Source of the objective element	535
1.2.1.3.1	Time	535
1.2.1.3.2	Place	537
1.2.2	Subjective elements	538
1.2.3	Reference to a degree of risk	540
1.2.4	Reference to human rights	541
1.2.4.1	Formal reference to human rights	541
1.2.4.2	Implicit reference to human rights	541
1.2.5	Proportionality in the assessment	544
1.3	Proof	545
1.3.1	Burden of proof	545
1.3.2	Benefit of the doubt	547
2	Nature of the persecution	547
2.1	Physical	547
2.2	Psychological	548
2.3	Economic	549
3	Agent	550
4	Subject	551
4.1	Claimant	551
4.2	Family	552
4.3	Others	553
5	Reasons	554
5.1	Race	554
5.2	Religion	554
5.3	Nationality	555
5.4	Membership of a particular social group	556
5.5	Political opinions	557
5.5.1	Active political opinions	557

5.5.2	Passive political opinions	558
5.6	Others	559
6	Exclusion and cessation	560
<i>B</i>	<i>Breach with the country of origin</i>	560
<i>C</i>	<i>Family reunion</i>	562
14	UNITED KINGDOM (Dirk Vanheule)	563
	Abbreviations and acknowledgements	563
I	Procedure	564
II	Statistics	569
III	Analysis of the case law	570
<i>A</i>	<i>Persecution</i>	570
1	Evaluation of the fear	570
1.1	Past events	570
1.2	Future fear	572
1.2.1	Objective elements	572
1.2.1.1	Requirement for objective elements	572
1.2.1.2	Type of objective element	573
1.2.1.3	Source of the objective element	578
1.2.1.3.1	Time	578
1.2.1.3.2	Place	579
1.2.2	Subjective elements	582
1.2.3	Reference to a degree of risk	585
1.2.4	Reference to human rights	588
1.2.4.1	Formal reference to human rights	588
1.2.4.2	Implicit reference to human rights	589
1.2.5	Proportionality in the assessment	591
1.3	Proof	592
1.3.1	Burden of proof	592
1.3.2	Benefit of the doubt	594
2	Nature of the persecution	594
2.1	Physical	594
2.2	Psychological	595
2.3	Economic	597
3	Agent	598
4	Subject	599
5	Reasons	600
5.1	Race	600
5.2	Religion	600
5.3	Nationality	600

5.4	Membership of a particular social group	600
5.5	Political opinions	603
5.5.1	Active political opinions	603
5.5.2	Passive political opinions	605
6	Exclusion and cessation	605
<i>B</i>	<i>Breach with the country of origin</i>	607
<i>C</i>	<i>Family reunion</i>	607
15	UNITED STATES (Dirk Vanheule)	609
	Abbreviations and acknowledgements	609
I	Procedure	610
II	Statistics	617
III	Analysis of the case law	618
<i>A</i>	<i>Persecution</i>	618
1	Evaluation of the fear	610
1.1	Past events	618
1.2	Future fear	620
1.2.1	Objective elements	620
1.2.1.1	Requirement for objective elements	620
1.2.1.2	Type of objective element	621
1.2.1.3	Source of the objective element	625
1.2.1.3.1	Time	625
1.2.1.3.2	Place	627
1.2.2	Subjective elements	628
1.2.3	Reference to a degree of risk	630
1.2.4	Reference to human rights	633
1.2.5	Proportionality in the assessment	642
1.3	Proof	643
2	Nature of the persecution	645
2.1	Physical	646
2.2	Psychological	647
2.3	Economic	649
3	Agent	650
4	Subject	655
5	Reasons	656
5.1	Race	656
5.2	Religion	657
5.3	Nationality	658
5.4	Membership of a particular social group	659
5.5	Political opinions	671

5.5.1	Active political opinions	670
5.5.2	Passive political opinions	673
6	Exclusion and cessation	682
<i>B</i>	<i>Breach with the country of origin</i>	682
<i>C</i>	<i>Family reunion</i>	682
PART II – GENERAL REPORT (Jean-Yves Carlier)		683
	Introduction	685
I	Statistics	687
II	Procedure	691
III	The notion of refugee	694
<i>A</i>	<i>The well-founded fear of being persecuted or the Theory of the Three Scales</i>	695
1	The level of risk (when is there well-founded fear?) (R.)	696
a)	The moment	697
b)	The place	699
α	Refugee <i>sur place</i>	699
β	Safe country	700
2	The level of violation of basic human rights (what constitutes persecution?) (P.)	701
a)	Women	704
b)	Deserters	704
c)	The agent and the victim of persecution	705
α	The agent of persecution	705
β	The victim of persecution	706
3	The level of proof (what constitutes sufficient proof of well-founded fear of being persecuted?) (P.)	
	Summary of the Theory of the Three Scales (R.P.P.)	710
<i>B</i>	<i>The reasons for persecution</i>	711
1	Membership of a particular social group	713
2	Political opinion	714
<i>C</i>	<i>Exclusion and cessation</i>	715
	Conclusion	716

APPENDIX	The harmonized application of the definition of the term 'refugee' in the European Union (Jean-Yves Carlier)	719
A	<i>Form</i>	719
B	<i>Content</i>	720
1	Elements of convergence	720
2	Elements of divergence	721
C	<i>Text</i>	723
BIBLIOGRAPHY		739
I	General	739
II	For each country	751
Austria		751
Belgium		753
Switzerland		756
Canada		757
Germany		759
Denmark		760
Spain		761
France		762
Greece		764
Italy		765
Netherlands		766
Portugal		766
United Kingdom		766
United States		767
INDEX		771
ABOUT THE EDITORS		795