
TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE	xiii
TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS	xvii
TABLE OF CASES	xix
PART I INTRODUCTORY ISSUES	1
1 The law of tort and the environment: an introduction to the debate and foundational issues	3
1 Introduction	3
1.2 The need for environmental law	5
1.2.1 Growing awareness of environmental damage	5
1.2.2 The source of the environmental problem	6
1.2.3 The purpose of environmental law	7
1.3 The law of tort and the environment	8
1.4 Fundamental issues regarding the law of tort and the environment	10
1.4.1 Current limitations of tort	11
1.4.2 The role of tort in an environmental context	12
1.4.2.(a) The philosophy of tort	12
1.4.2.(b) The role of tort in an environmental context	14
1.4.2.(c) The effect of insurance on the role of tort	15
1.4.3 EU initiatives	16
1.4.4 Specific proposals for increasing the role of tort as a means of environmental protection	17
1.4.5 Concluding remarks	19
1.5 Conclusion	19

PART II	TRADITIONAL TORT BASED REMEDIES AND ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION: AN ANGLO-AMERICAN PERSPECTIVE	21
2	Common law approaches to environmental harm	23
2.1	Introduction	23
2.2	Trespass to land	24
2.2.1	Type of harm	24
2.2.2	Trespass and fault	27
2.3	Nuisance	28
2.3.1	Type of harm	28
2.3.2	The locality doctrine	30
2.3.3	Nuisance and fault	32
2.3.4	General restrictions on liability in nuisance	38
2.3.4(a)	The defence of prescription	38
2.3.4(b)	The defence of statutory authority	39
2.3.4(c)	The hypersensitive plaintiff.	40
2.4	The rule in Rylands v. Fletcher	41
2.5	Public nuisance	44
2.6	Negligence	46
2.6.1	Key elements of the tort	46
2.6.2	Negligence and the environment	48
2.7	Breach of statutory duty	51
2.8	Conclusions	53
3	Establishing liability for environmental damage: main issues	55
3.1	Introduction	55
3.2	The need to establish fault	55
3.3	Causation	56
3.3.1	Difficulties in establishing causation for environmental damage	56
3.3.2	Establishing causation for environmental damage	58
3.3.2(a)	Cases where there is only one known cause	59
3.3.2(b)	Cases where there is more than one possible cause	59
3.3.3	Main issues associated with establishing causation for environmental damage	73
3.3.3(a)	Limitations of the material contribution test	73
3.3.3(b)	The burden of proof	75
3.4	Standing requirements in tort	78
3.5	Remedies in tort for environmental damage	84

3.5.1	Damages	84
3.5.1(a)	Exemplary damages	85
3.5.1(b)	Pure economic loss	86
3.5.1(c)	Intangible environmental values	95
3.5.2	Injunctions	97
3.5.2(a)	Prohibitory injunctions	97
3.5.2(b)	Quia timet injunctions	98
3.5.2(c)	Mandatory injunctions	101
3.5.2(d)	Damages in lieu of an injunction	103
3.6	Conclusions	110

PART III THE ROLE OF TORT AS A MEANS OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION: THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES AND EU INITIATIVES

4	The role of tort in an environmental context	115
4.1	Introduction	115
4.2	Theoretical perspectives on the role of tort	116
4.2.1	The economic analysis of tort	116
4.2.2	Corrective verses distributive justice	127
4.2.2.(a)	Corrective justice	127
4.2.2.(b)	Distributive justice	128
4.2.3	The pluralistic view of tort	130
4.3	The role of tort in an environmental context	137
4.3.1	Private enforcement of environmental standards	137
4.3.2	Private law and the public interest in the environment	140
4.4	The effect of insurance on the role of tort	150
4.4.1	Public liability policies and the 'pollution exclusion'	150
4.4.2	Environmental impairment liability	153
4.4.3	Re-evaluation of existing public liability policies	155
4.4.4	Effect of insurance on risk management	156
4.4.5	The problem of historic pollution	158
4.5	Conclusions	160
5	EC developments on civil liability for environmental damage	163
5.1	Introduction	163
5.2	General EC environmental policy	163
5.2.1	Background	163

5.2.2	Sources of EC legislation	165
5.3	Legal basis of EC intervention in environmental liability	166
5.3.1	Articles 174, 175, and 176 (formerly articles, 130r, 130s, 130t)	166
5.3.2	Article 95 (formerly article 100a)	167
5.3.3	Correct treaty basis	168
5.3.4	Subsidiarity	170
5.4	Development of an EC environmental liability policy	171
5.4.1	Impetus for EC action on civil liability for environmental damage	171
5.4.2	Chronology of developments on civil liability	172
5.4.2(a)	5th environmental action programme	173
5.4.2(b)	Proposals on civil liability for damage caused by waste	173
5.4.2(c)	Commission green paper on remedying environmental damage	174
5.4.2(d)	The Council of Europe convention on civil liability	175
5.4.2(e)	White paper on environmental liability	176
5.5	Reasons for EC intervention in environmental liability	177
5.5.1	The polluter pays and the precautionary principles	177
5.5.2	Private enforcement of EC environment policy	179
5.5.3	Internal market considerations	187
5.5.4	Transboundary pollution	189
5.6	Conclusions	193
PART IV INCREASING THE ROLE OF TORT AS A MEANS OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION: A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF EUROPEAN PROPOSALS AND SCHEMES ADOPTED IN CERTAIN EU MEMBER STATES		195
6	Strict liability	197
6.1	Introduction	197
6.2	The role of fault in EC member state tort law	198
6.3	Introduction of strict liability regimes in EC member states	204
6.4	European initiatives	213
6.4.1	The Lugano Convention	213
6.4.2	Draft directives on civil liability for damage caused by waste	215
6.4.3	Discussion documents	216
6.5	Main considerations	220
6.5.1	Scope of strict liability	220

6.5.2	Defences	223
6.5.2(a)	Conventional defences	223
6.5.2(b)	Regulatory compliance defence	223
6.5.2(c)	The development risk defence	227
6.6	Conclusion	231
7	Reducing the burden of proof on causation	233
7.1	Introduction	233
7.2	General considerations	233
7.3	Developments in member states	235
7.4	European initiatives	240
7.4.1	Lugano Convention	240
7.4.2	Draft directives on civil liability for damage caused by waste	241
7.4.3	Discussion documents	241
7.5	Main considerations	243
7.5.1	Cases where there is only one known causal agent	244
7.5.2	Cases where there is more than one possible causal agent	245
7.5.3	Retention of incentives to abate pollution	246
7.6	Conclusion	247
8	Access to justice I: liberal conferral of standing	249
8.1	Introduction	249
8.2	Developments in EU member states	250
8.2.1	Locus standi of non-governmental organizations (NGOs)	250
8.2.2	The right of public authorities to pursue actions in tort	253
8.3	European initiatives	257
8.3.1	Lugano Convention	257
8.3.2	Draft directives on civil liability for damage caused by waste	258
8.3.3	Discussion documents	258
8.4	Main considerations	260
8.4.1	Usurpation of private bargaining rights	260
8.4.2	The role of public authorities	261
8.4.3	Respective roles of the state and public interest groups	263
8.4.4	Remedies	263
8.5	Conclusion	265
9	Access to justice II: class actions	267
9.1	Introduction	267
9.2	Developments in member states	268

9.3	European initiatives	270
9.4	Main considerations	271
9.5	Conclusion	272
10	Remedies for environmental damage	273
10.1	Introduction	273
10.2	Developments in member states	273
10.2.1	Recoverable damages	273
10.2.2	Injunctive relief	277
10.3	European initiatives	278
10.3.1	Lugano Convention	278
10.3.2	Waste proposals	279
10.3.3	Discussion documents	279
10.4	Main considerations	281
10.4.1	The threshold of damage	281
10.4.2	Restoration standards	282
10.4.3	Economic loss	285
10.4.4	The availability of injunctive relief	288
10.5	Conclusion	289
11	Financial provision for extended civil liability	291
11.1	Introduction	291
11.2	Developments in member states	291
11.3	European initiatives	293
11.3.1	Lugano Convention	293
11.3.2	Waste proposals	293
11.3.3	Discussion documents	294
11.4	Main issues	295
11.4.1	Compulsory insurance	296
11.4.2	Relationship between liability insurance and compensation funds	298
11.5	Conclusion	299
PART V	CONCLUSIONS	301
12	Conclusion: the nature of civil liability in an environmental context	303
12.1	Introduction	303
12.2	The philosophical basis of tort law	303

12.3	The role of tort in an environmental context	305
12.4	The limits of tort	307
12.5	Means of increasing the role of tort in an environmental context	310
12.6	Conclusion - towards an idea of environmental rights?	313
	 APPENDIX	 317
	 INDEX	 329