

Contents

CHAPTER 1	Introduction	
	Introduction	3
CHAPTER 2	Access to Justice in Selected EC Member States	
	Belgium	
	Nicolas de Sadeleer with the collaboration of Jacques Sambon	
I	Belgium	9
I.1	The Ordinary Courts and Tribunals	9
I.2	The Council of State	11
I.3	The Arbitration Court	13
	Denmark	
	Ulf Kjellerup	
2	Denmark	21
2.1	The <i>locus standi</i> of citizen groupings and environmental NGO's	21
2.1.1	The organization of authorities and distribution of competencies	21
2.1.2	The Appeal Boards and their area of competence	23
2.1.3	The legislation providing access to justice	25
2.1.3.a	Procedures in legislation	26
2.1.3.b	Administrative review procedures – standing requirements	26
2.1.4	Judicial review challenging permit procedures	31
2.1.5	Administrative procedures challenging the acts or omission of acts by public authorities	33
2.1.6	Judicial review of acts or omission of acts by public authorities	36
2.1.7	Adequate and effective remedies	39
	France	
	Sandrine Bélier	
3	Introduction	47
3.1	The court structure and admissibility of complaints	47
3.1.1	The ordinary courts	47
3.1.2	The administrative courts	49
3.2	Environmental actions	51
3.2.1	Damages claims in environmental law	51
3.2.2	Criminal prosecutions under environmental law	52
3.2.3	Environmental administrative law	53
3.3	Proceedings instigated by environmental associations	54

3.3.1	Title and interest to sue for environmental protection associations	54
3.3.1.a	Title to sue	54
3.3.1.b	Legal interest and representation	55
3.3.2	Interest to act for the defence of the environment	55
3.3.2.a	Criminal prosecutions	55
3.3.2.b	Damages actions	56
3.3.2.c	Administrative actions	56
3.3.3	Concluding remarks	57
3.4	Analysis of case law 1996-2001	57
3.4.1	Proportion of environment cases	57
3.4.1.a	The relative impact of the actions by environmental associations	57
3.4.1.b	Distribution of associative actions	58
3.4.2	The effectiveness of associative actions	59
3.4.2.a	Administrative courts	59
3.4.2.b	Ordinary courts	59
3.4.3	The limits of direct actions	60
3.4.3.a	Time limits filing actions and court rulings	60
3.4.3.b	The implementation of legal rulings	60
3.4.4	Persistent and developing obstacles	60
3.4.4.a	Admissibility	60
3.4.4.b	Economic aspects	61
3.5	Conclusion	61

Germany

Miriam Dross

4.1	Germany	65
4.2	Legal framework of the public interest action in Germany	66
4.2.1	The Federal Nature Conservation Act (FNCA)	66
4.2.1.a	Areas of application	67
4.2.1.b	Actions against plan approval decisions	67
4.2.1.c	Further general prerequisites for admissibility	68
4.2.2	<i>Länder</i> regulation of public interest action	69
4.3	Analysis of cases in the period 1996-2001	71
4.3.1	Methodology	71
4.3.2	Scope of the collection of cases	71
4.3.3	Outcome of the cases in the period 1996-2001	74
4.3.4	Subject matters of actions and types of actions	77
4.3.5	Socio-economic aspects	79
4.4	Conclusions	81

	Italy	
	Stefano Nespor	
5	Italy	85
5.1	The Italian legal system and the environmental rights	85
5.2	Environmental rights and the Administrative Courts	85
5.2.1	In general	85
5.2.2	Standing and the Administrative Court	86
5.2.3	The evolution of standing in environmental matters	87
5.2.4	Does official recognition of environmental organizations preclude judicial recognition of standing of non-recognized organizations?	88
5.2.5	Does standing only concern decisions on strictly environmental matters?	88
5.2.6	Do only national representatives of the recognized environmental organization have standing?	89
5.2.7	Statistical data	90
5.3	Environmental rights and the Civil Courts	92
5.3.1	In general	92
5.3.2	Restoration under Article 18 of the Law 8-7-1986 n.349	93
5.3.3	Restoration based on the subsidiary action of the environmental organizations	93
5.4	Environmental rights and the Criminal Courts	94
5.4.1	In general	94
5.4.2	The Law 447\1988	94
	The Netherlands	
	Jonathan Verschuuren	
6	The Netherlands	97
6.1	Introduction	97
6.2	Description of proceedings in the Netherlands	97
6.2.1	Characteristics of the country	97
6.2.2	Procedures before administrative courts	98
6.2.2.a	Procedures against permits: 'anyone'	98
6.2.2.b	Abolishing the <i>actio popularis</i> in the Netherlands	100
6.2.2.c	Procedures against other environmental decisions: 'interested parties'	103
6.2.3	Procedures before civil courts	104
6.2.4	Procedures before criminal courts	106
6.2.5	Non-judicial procedures	107
6.3	Empirical data	108
6.3.1	Methodology	108
6.3.2	Sharp decline in the number of environmental and planning cases since 1997	108

6.3.3	Number of cases brought before an administrative court by NGOs and other parties	109
6.3.4	Civil law cases	110
6.3.5	Number of cases won and lost by NGOs and local citizen groups	110
6.4	Case study	111
6.4.1	Introduction	111
6.4.2	Setting of the case	112
6.4.2.a	District Court of The Hague 24 November 1999	112
6.4.2.b	Court of Appeal of The Hague 2 August 2001	114
6.4.2.c	Supreme Court 21 March 2003	115
6.4.3	Environmental effectiveness	115
6.4.4	Legal and 'democratic' aspects	116
6.4.5	Socio-economic aspects	116
6.5	Conclusion	117

Portugal

Isabel Carinhas de Andrade with the collaboration of
Gonçalo Cavalheiro

7	Portugal	121
7.1	General legal framework of the country	121
7.2	Portuguese environmental law and enforcement procedures	121
7.3	Access to justice by citizens and NGOs – the <i>actio popularis</i>	122
7.3.1	Legal standing	123
7.3.2	Possible judicial procedures	125
7.3.3	Powers of the court	127
7.3.4	Legal representation	128
7.3.5	Court costs	128
7.3.6	Publicity of the decision	129
7.4	Non judicial procedures	129
7.5	Empirical data	129
7.5.1	Methodology	129
7.5.2	Analysis of relevant lawsuits between 1995-2002	130
7.5.3	Overview analysis	133

United Kingdom

Maurice Sheridan

8	United Kingdom	139
8.1	Legal regimes in the United Kingdom	139
8.1.1	The Criminal Courts	139
8.1.2	The Civil Courts	140
8.1.3	The Administrative Court	140
8.1.4	Environmental regulatory appeals	143

8.2	The issue of 'standing'	144
8.3	Third party interventions	147
8.3.1	In judicial review	147
8.3.2	Third party rights in other types of environmental proceedings	148
8.3.2.a	Third party rights on land-use appeals from decisions of the relevant public authorities	148
8.3.2.b	Third party rights on environmental license appeals from decisions of the regulatory authorities	149
8.3.2.c	Third party rights on statutory appeals/applications to the courts	149
8.4	Standing in criminal cases on environmental matters	150
8.5	Discussion of barriers to access to justice	151
8.5.1	The obligation to pay the costs of the other parties in judicial review proceedings if the application fails	151
8.5.2	Restricted access to 'pre-emptive' costs orders	152
8.5.3	Seeking an interim injunction where there is a requirement to give a cross-undertaking in damages	153
8.5.4	Restricted access to public legal assistance	154
8.5.5	Access to <i>pro bono</i> and similar representation	154
8.5.6	The disparate nature of environmental proceedings	155
8.5.7	Difficulties in accessing environmental appeals and case reports	155
8.6	Cases review	156
8.7	Conclusions	160
8.7.1	The question of formal procedural barriers to standing in environmental matters	160
8.7.2	The question of systemic or substantive barriers to access to justice	160

CHAPTER 3	Synthesis of the National Reports	
I	Introduction	165
2	Main empirical findings on access to justice	165
2.1	Overall number of cases	165
2.2	Trends observed	168
2.3	Outcome of cases	169
2.4	Sectors of environmental law involved	171
2.5	Conclusions regarding empirical findings	174
3	Benefits of NGO court actions	174
3.1	Contribution to environmental law and its enforcement	175
3.1.1	National environmental law	175
3.1.2	Community environmental law	176
3.1.3	Concluding remarks	177

3.2	Democratic aspects	177
3.2.1	Public awareness building	177
3.2.2	Improving participation	178
4	Conditions for access to justice	178
4.1	The competent courts and tribunals	179
4.1.1	Administrative courts	180
4.1.2	Civil courts	180
4.1.3	Criminal courts	181
4.1.4	Other review bodies	182
4.1.5	Concluding remarks	183
4.2	Standing	183
4.2.1	Different approaches to standing before administrative courts	183
4.2.2	Specific requirements for standing of NGOs	187
4.2.3	Conclusions on standing	192
4.3	Scope of review	192
4.4	Interim relief	194
4.5	Costs	195
4.6	Length of proceedings	196
5	Conclusions	197
CHAPTER 4	Further steps to align Community law with the Aarhus Convention	
1	The current state of Aarhus implementation at Community level	203
2	The Commission's proposal for a Directive on access to justice in environmental matters	205
3	Legislative resolution of the European Parliament	209
4	Conclusion	210
	Bibliography	212
	Annex	216
	Contributors	226