

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	v
<i>Acronyms</i>	xix

Introduction	1
1 Background of the research	1
2 Problem statement and state of the art.....	2
2.1 Legal uncertainty.....	2
2.2 Regulatory inaction.....	4
2.3 Stakeholder risks	5
3 Research objective	6
4 Research questions.....	7
5 Relevance of the research	10
6 2023 regulatory intervention	12
7 Methodology and structure	13
7.1 Typology, terminology, and interdisciplinary research.....	13
7.2 Money and virtual currencies	15
7.3 Fundamental analysis and critical assessment	16
7.4 Analysis and assessment of the 2023 update.....	18
7.5 Functional comparison.....	19
7.6 Integration and final assessment.....	20

PART I.

CONCEPTUAL ANALYSIS	21
---------------------------	----

Chapter I.

Typology and Terminology of Virtual Currencies	23
1 Introduction	23
2 Terminology of virtual currencies	24
2.1 Virtual currencies in the EU	24
2.2 Why ‘virtual currencies’?	27
2.2.1 ‘Digital’, ‘electronic’, or ‘virtual’?.....	27
2.2.2 ‘Cash’, ‘currency’, ‘money’, or none of the above?.....	30
2.3 Defining virtual currencies	33
3 Practical examples	36

3.1	Loyalty programs.....	36
3.1.1	Classic loyalty point programs.....	37
3.1.2	Mobile platforms	39
3.1.3	Frequent-flyer programs	39
3.2	In-game currencies	41
3.2.1	Pay-to-play.....	41
3.2.2	Free-to-play.....	44
3.2.3	Second Life	46
3.3	Prepaid value currencies.....	47
3.4	Cryptocurrencies.....	49
3.4.1	Background.....	50
3.4.2	Technical aspects	53
3.4.2.1.	Wallets and addresses	53
3.4.2.2.	Transactions	54
3.4.2.3.	Confirmation and blockchain.....	55
3.4.2.4.	Mining	58
3.4.2.5.	Other applications	61
3.4.3	Economic aspects.....	63
3.4.3.1.	Economics of cryptocurrencies	64
3.4.3.2.	Cryptocurrencies and fractional-reserve banking.....	67
3.4.3.3.	Mining risk	69
4	Typology	70
4.1	The ECB's typology of virtual currencies.....	71
4.1.1	Closed schemes.....	71
4.1.2	Unidirectional schemes.....	72
4.1.3	Bidirectional schemes	73
4.2	Application of typology to practical examples	73
4.2.1	Loyalty programs.....	74
4.2.2	In-game currencies	75
4.2.3	Prepaid value currencies.....	76
4.2.4	Cryptocurrencies	76
4.3	Alternative typology	77
5	Risk analysis	79
5.1	User risks.....	80
5.2	Market risks	82
5.3	Investor risks	84
5.4	Service provider risks	85
5.5	Risks and typology	85
6	Interim conclusions.....	87

.....

FRAMEWORKS

the EU.....

2.1.2	First E-money Directive	153
2.1.2.1	Directive.....	153
2.1.2.2	DG Internal Market Consultation Paper	155
2.1.2.3	Implementation in Member States.....	157
2.1.2.4	Review.....	160
2.1.3	Second E-money Directive	166
2.1.3.1	Directive.....	166
2.1.3.2	Implementation in the Member States	168
2.1.3.3	Review.....	169
2.1.4	Evaluation	169
2.2	E-money scope	170
2.2.1	Definition	171
2.2.1.1	Electronically, including magnetically, stored value	171
2.2.1.2	Represented by a claim on the issuer.....	173
2.2.1.3	Issued on receipt of funds for making payment transactions.....	174
2.2.1.4	Accepted by institutions other than their issuer .	176
2.2.2	Redeemability.....	177
2.3	E-money and virtual currencies	179
2.3.1	Closed scheme virtual currencies	179
2.3.2	Unidirectional scheme virtual currencies	179
2.3.3	Bidirectional scheme virtual currencies.....	181
2.3.4	Evaluation	182
3	Payment services	183
3.1	Regulatory background	183
3.1.1	Before 2007	184
3.1.1.1	Early stages.....	184
3.1.1.2	Proposal PSD1.....	185
3.1.1.3	European Central Bank Opinion.....	187
3.1.1.4	European Economic and Social Committee Opinion	188
3.1.1.5	Council negotiations	189
3.1.1.6	European Parliament adoption	190
3.1.2	First Payment Services Directive.....	191
3.1.3	Review	194
3.1.3.1	Implementation, green paper, and consultation .	194
3.1.3.2	Proposal PSD2.....	196
3.1.3.3	European Economic and Social Committee Opinion	199
3.1.3.4	European Central Bank Opinion.....	200
3.1.3.5	European Parliament Committee Stage – First attempt.	200

	3.1.3.6	Council General Approach	201
	3.1.3.7	European Parliament Committee Stage – Second attempt and adoption	202
	3.1.4	Second Payment Services Directive	203
	3.1.5	Evaluation	205
3.2		Payment services scope	206
	3.2.1	Positive scope	206
	3.2.2	Scope exemptions	213
	3.2.2.1	Added value exemption	214
	3.2.2.2	Limited network exemption	216
	3.2.2.3	Money exchange exemption	218
3.3		Payment services and virtual currencies	218
	3.3.1	Closed scheme virtual currencies	218
	3.3.2	Unidirectional scheme virtual currencies	219
	3.3.3	Bidirectional scheme virtual currencies	219
	3.3.3.1	General remarks	219
	3.3.3.2	Member States' opinions	221
	3.3.3.3	European Commission's opinion	223
	3.3.3.4	Exemptions	224
	3.3.3.5	Additional remark	224
	3.3.4	Evaluation	224
4		Toward a unified framework?	225
5		Interim conclusions	229
	5.1	Findings	229
	5.2	Normative assessment	231
 Chapter IV.			
		Anti-Money Laundering in the EU	235
1		Introduction	235
2		Money laundering and the EU directives	236
	2.1	The concept of money laundering	236
	2.2	Road to Anti-Money Laundering Directive 4	238
3		Fourth Anti-Money Laundering Directive	240
	3.1	Proposal Fourth Anti-Money Laundering Directive	240
	3.2	Fourth Anti-Money Laundering Directive	242
4		Fifth Anti-Money Laundering Directive	244
	4.1	Commission proposal and legislative procedure	244
	4.2	Virtual currencies	248
	4.3	Virtual currency service providers	251
	4.4	Implementation of AMLD5	253
5		Virtual currencies under anti-money laundering rules	254
	5.1	Virtual currencies as money laundering tool	254

5.2	Virtual currency service providers until AMLD4	258
5.3	Virtual currency service providers after AMLD5	264
6	Sixth Anti-Money Laundering Directive.....	268
7	Interim conclusions.....	268
7.1	Findings.....	268
7.2	Normative assessment.....	269
 Chapter V.		
	Financial Instruments in the EU	273
1	Introduction	273
2	Regulatory background	275
2.1	Before 2004	275
2.2	First Markets in Financial Instruments Directive	277
2.3	Markets in Financial Instruments Regulation and Second Directive	278
3	Financial instruments scope	279
3.1	Personal scope of MiFID1 and 2	279
3.2	Material scope of MiFID1 and 2 – investment services.....	280
3.3	Material scope of MiFID1 and 2 – financial instruments.....	280
4	Markets in financial instruments and virtual currencies	283
4.1	Closed scheme virtual currencies	283
4.2	Unidirectional scheme virtual currencies	284
4.3	Bidirectional scheme virtual currencies	285
4.3.1	Cryptocurrencies intended as means of payment.....	285
4.3.1.1	EU perspective.....	285
4.3.1.2	Member State deviation: Germany	288
4.3.2	Cryptocurrencies intended as means of investment	291
4.3.2.1	EU perspective.....	291
4.3.2.2	Member State perspectives	296
A.	United Kingdom	296
B.	France.....	297
C.	Germany	298
D.	The Netherlands.....	298
E.	Spain.....	299
F.	Italy.....	300
5	Interim conclusions.....	301
5.1	Findings.....	301
5.2	Normative assessment.....	302

PART III.	
EU CRYPTO LAW FRAMEWORK	305
 Chapter VI.	
Anti-Money Laundering Regulation.....	307
1 Background.....	307
2 Subject Matter and Scope	308
3 General Obligations on Obligated Entities	309
4 Customer Due Diligence.....	310
5 Ultimate Beneficial Owners	313
6 Reporting Obligations.....	314
7 Data Protection and Retention	314
8 Risks from Anonymous Instruments.....	314
9 Interim conclusions.....	315
9.1 Findings.....	315
9.2 Normative assessment.....	316
 Chapter VII.	
Regulation on Information Accompanying Transfers of Funds and certain Crypto-Assets	317
1 Background.....	317
2 Subject matter and scope	318
3 Obligations on the payer/originator's service provider	320
4 Obligations on the payee/beneficiary's service provider	321
5 Obligations on intermediary service providers.....	322
6 Data protection and retention	323
7 Sanctions and monitoring	323
8 Anti-Money Laundering Amendments	323
9 Interim conclusions.....	324
9.1 Findings.....	324
9.2 Normative assessment.....	325
 Chapter VIII.	
Directive on Administrative Cooperation 8	327
1 Background.....	327
2 DAC8	328
3 Interim conclusions.....	329
3.1 Findings.....	329
3.2 Normative assessment.....	329

Chapter IX.

Markets in Crypto-Assets Regulation	331
1 Background.....	331
2 Subject matter and scope	334
3 Offer of crypto-assets	337
3.1 General	337
3.2 White paper	340
3.2.1 Form and content of the white paper	340
3.2.2 Notification to the competent authority.....	342
3.2.3 Publication of the white paper	342
3.2 Other obligations of the offeror.....	344
4 Issuing asset-referenced tokens	345
4.1 General	345
4.2 Authorisation	347
4.3 White paper	350
4.4 Conduct of business and prudential rules	353
4.4.1 General rules.....	353
4.4.2 Reserve of assets rules	356
4.4.3 Acquisition of issuers of asset-referenced tokens	359
4.4.4 Recovery and orderly redemption.....	361
4.5 Significant asset-referenced tokens.....	361
5 Issuing e-money tokens	363
5.1 General	363
5.2 White paper	365
5.3 Significant e-money tokens	367
6 Providing crypto-asset services.....	368
6.1 General	368
6.2 Authorisation	370
6.3 Acquisition of crypto-asset service providers.....	374
6.4 Obligations for all crypto-asset service providers	376
6.5 Specific obligations depending on type of service	380
6.5.1 Custody and administration of crypto-assets on behalf of clients.....	380
6.5.2 Operation of a trading platform for crypto-assets	382
6.5.3 Exchange of crypto-assets against funds or other crypto-assets	384
6.5.4 Execution of orders for crypto-assets on behalf of clients ...	384
6.5.5 Placing of crypto-assets.....	385
6.5.6 Reception and transmission of orders on behalf of clients ..	385
6.5.7 Advice on crypto-assets and portfolio management	386
6.5.8 Transfer services.....	387
6.6 Significant crypto-asset service providers.....	387

7	Prevention of market abuse involving crypto-assets	387
8	Supervision	390
8.1	National level	390
8.2	European level	393
9	Interim conclusions	395
9.1	Findings	395
9.2	Normative assessment	396

Chapter X.

	Regulation on a Pilot Regime for Market Infrastructures based on Distributed Ledger Technology	399
--	---	-----

1	Background	399
2	Subject matter and scope	400
3	Requirements for operators	402
3.1	Requirements for all DLT market infrastructures	402
3.2	DLT MTF market infrastructure	403
3.2.1	General requirements	403
3.2.2	Authorisation	404
3.3	DLT SS market infrastructure	406
3.3.1	General requirements	406
3.3.2	Authorisation	407
3.4	DLT TSS market infrastructure	409
3.4.1	General requirements	409
3.4.2	Authorisation	410
4	Supervision	412
5	Interim conclusions	413
5.1	Findings	413
5.2	Normative assessment	413

Chapter XI.

	Digital Operational Resilience Act	415
--	--	-----

1	Background	415
2	Subject matter and scope	415
3	ICT risk management	417
4	ICT incident management, classification and reporting	422
5	Digital operational resilience testing	423
6	Third-party risk management	424
6.1	General requirements	424
6.2	Supervision	426
7	Information sharing	427
8	Competent authorities	427

9	Interim conclusions.....	428
9.1	Findings.....	428
9.2	Normative assessment.....	428
PART IV.		
	US COMPARISON.....	431
Chapter XII.		
	Virtual Currencies and Service Providers in the US.....	433
1	Introduction.....	433
2	Methodology.....	433
3	US regulatory frameworks.....	434
3.1	Money.....	434
3.1.1	Constitution.....	434
3.1.2	Counterfeiting statutes.....	435
3.1.3	Application to virtual currencies.....	436
3.2	Payments.....	436
3.2.1	Electronic Fund Transfer Act 1978.....	436
3.2.2	Uniform Commercial Code.....	438
3.2.3	Application to virtual currencies.....	440
3.3	Anti-money laundering.....	441
3.3.1	Bank Secrecy Act 1970.....	441
3.3.2	Money Laundering Control Act 1986.....	446
3.3.3	State regulation.....	448
3.3.4	Application to virtual currencies.....	449
3.4	Investments.....	449
3.4.1	Securities regulation.....	449
3.4.1.1	Overview.....	449
3.4.1.2	Notes.....	451
3.4.1.3	Investment contracts.....	452
3.4.1.5	Currency.....	458
3.4.2	Derivatives regulation.....	459
3.4.3	State regulation.....	463
3.4.3.1	Blue sky laws and federal pre-emption.....	463
3.4.3.2	Uniform Securities Act.....	464
3.4.3.3	State commodity laws.....	465
3.4.4	Application to virtual currencies.....	466
4	Legislative developments.....	469
5	Interim conclusions.....	471
5.1	Findings.....	471
5.2	Normative assessment.....	473

PART V.	
CONCLUSION	475
 Chapter XIII.	
Integration, assessment, and conclusions	477
1 Integration of research findings	477
1.1 Virtual currencies as money	478
1.2 Virtual currencies under e-money and payment services	479
1.3 Virtual currencies under anti-money laundering	480
1.4 Virtual currencies and investment services	481
1.5 Findings	483
2 In need of regulation?	484
2.1 Preliminary assessments	484
2.1.1 E-money and payment services	484
2.1.2 Anti-money laundering	485
2.1.3 Investment services	486
2.1.4 Findings	487
2.2 Regulatory need	487
2.2.1 Risk pertinence	488
2.2.2 Changing virtual currency landscape	489
2.2.3 Objectives of financial law frameworks	492
2.2.4 Desirability of regulation	495
3 Impact of the 2023 regulatory intervention	498
4 Conclusion	499
 <i>Selected Bibliography</i>	505