

<i>Preface</i>	v
<i>Contents</i>	ix

CHAPTER 1	Introduction. The Making of a New European Legal Culture: The Aarhus Convention	
	Roberto Caranta, Anna Gerbrandy & Bilun Müller	
1	The research question	5
2	The Aarhus Convention and legal culture	9
3	Working on the <i>têtes de chapitre</i> of administrative law	11
4	Structure of the book	14
5	The making of a new European legal culture?	16
CHAPTER 2	The Aarhus-Acquis in the EU. Developments in the Dynamics of Implementing the Three Pillars Structure	
	Adam Daniel Nagy	
1	Introduction	19
2	First pillar: access to information	20
2.1	General framework of access to information at EU level	20
2.2	General framework of access to information at Member State level	23
2.3	The way forward	25
3	The second pillar: public participation	27
3.1	Public participation requirements at EU level, as applied by institutions and bodies	28
3.2	Public participation at Member State level based on EU law	29
3.3	Recent developments in public participation at EU and international levels	31
4	The third pillar: Access to justice in the EU and its Member States in general	35
4.1	Access to justice at EU level: the Aarhus Regulation	38
4.2	Access to information and its relation to access to justice at national level	41
4.3	Public participation and its relation to access to justice at Member States' level	41
4.4	Access to justice under Article 9(3) and (4) of the Aarhus Convention: options for reforming EU law	53
4.5	Role of national judges – different forms of interpretation requirements to ensure compliance with EU law	63
5	Recent developments and trends – a political opening for further environmental governance?	65
5.1	Complementary alternatives to meet the requirements of the Aarhus Convention	66
6	Conclusions	68

CHAPTER 3 **The Aarhus Convention – The Legal Cultural Picture.**
Country report for France
 Giulia Parola, LL.M

1	Introduction	73
2	Right to access to documents/information	75
2.1	Before the implementation of the Aarhus convention	75
3	Implementation of access to environmental information	76
3.1	Subject matter of the right to access	76
3.2	The interaction of right of access with duties to make some information generally available and with Directive 2003/98/EC on the re-use of public sector information	78
3.3	User friendliness of the environmental information (Art. 5(2) AC)	79
3.4	Information held by some private law entities (e.g. concessionaires)	80
3.5	The exceptions to the right of access (with specific reference to the “confidentiality of the proceedings of public authorities”)	81
3.6	The costs for exercising the right to access	82
4	Public participation	83
4.1	Before the implementation of the Aarhus Convention	83
4.2	The implementation of participation rights granted by the Aarhus Convention	85
4.2.1	Different participation rules applicable to specific activities, plans, programs and policies, and normative instruments	85
4.2.2	Participation beyond defence and consultation, as negotiation or co-decision, and compensation mechanisms to avoid NIMBY and facilitate compromise	87
4.2.3	eNGOs participation rights (also considering Art. 7 – “public which may participate”)	87
4.2.4	A reasonable timeframe for the different phases	88
4.2.5	A comparison between the Aarhus convention requirements for participation and those of EU EIA and SEA	88
4.2.6	Taking into account the results of public participation	89
5	Access to courts	90
5.1	Pre-implementation	90
5.2	Implementation of the third pillar	91
5.2.1	Alternatives to court procedures	91
5.2.2	Standing, including of eNGOs	93
5.2.3	The review of “substantive and procedural legality” as required by Art. 9(2) of the Aarhus Convention	94
5.2.4	The remedies available	95
5.2.5	Time and costs of judicial remedies and legal aid	96
6	Conclusions	97

CHAPTER 4	The Aarhus Convention, The Legal Cultural Picture: Country Report for Germany Bilun Müller	
1	Introduction	103
2	The right to access to environmental information	103
2.1	Pre-implementation	103
2.1.1	The right to access to environmental information	103
2.1.2	Interaction of the right of access with duties to make some information generally available	106
2.1.3	The duty to provide information and private law entities	107
2.1.4	Influence of German legislation on the Aarhus Convention in the field of access to environmental information	108
2.2	Post-implementation	108
2.2.1	The right to access environmental information and the existing legal framework	108
2.2.2	Reactions to the implementation	109
2.2.3	EU law as an important instrument in easing the implementation of the Aarhus convention	109
2.2.4	The need for further reform	110
3	Participation rights	111
3.1	Pre-implementation	112
3.1.1	Including the public in decision making prior to the implementation of the Aarhus Convention	112
3.1.2	The influence of national legislation on the Aarhus Convention	112
3.2	Post-implementation	113
3.2.1	The right to public participation and the existing legal framework	113
3.2.2	Reactions to the amendments	114
3.2.3	Details of the participation procedures	115
3.2.4	The extent of participation in German law	116
3.2.5	The need for further reform	116
4	Access to the courts	117
4.1	Pre-implementation	118
4.1.1	The system of judicial review	118
4.1.2	Access to justice by environmental NGOs	119
4.1.3	Influence of national legislation on the Aarhus Convention	120
4.1.4	Compatibility of German law with Art 9 para 2 of the Aarhus Convention	121
4.2	Post-implementation	123
4.2.1	Openness of the existing legal framework for the right to access to the courts	123
4.2.2	Reactions to the new provisions	124

4.2.3	The need for further reform	125
5	Conclusion	126
CHAPTER 5	The Aarhus Convention: A Force for Change in Irish Environmental Law and Policy? Áine Ryall	
1	Introduction	129
2	Status of Aarhus Convention in Irish law	131
3	Access to environmental information	133
4	Public participation in environmental decision-making	136
5	Access to justice in environmental matters	140
5.1	Irish legislative measures aimed at implementing Aarhus obligations	143
5.2	Aarhus Convention in the Irish courts	145
6	Conclusions and future directions	149
7	Postscript	154
CHAPTER 6	The Application of the Aarhus Convention in Italy Alessandro Comino	
1	Introduction	159
2	Right to access to information	159
2.1	Anticipating and implementing Aarhus and the EU rules	159
2.2	The case law on the right of access	164
3	Participation	167
3.1	The general rules and their application to environmental cases	167
3.2	Participation in EIA and SEA procedures	171
4	Access to justice	172
4.1	Locus standi	173
4.2	The effectiveness of judicial review	176
4.3	Non-judicial proceedings	179
5	Conclusion	180
CHAPTER 7	The Aarhus Convention in the Netherlands Barbara Beijen	
1	Introduction	185
2	Access to documents	187
2.1	Pre-implementation	187
2.2	Post-implementation	187
2.2.1	General remarks	188
2.2.2	Procedural changes	189
2.2.3	Substantive changes	191

2.2.4	Directive 2003/4	192
2.2.5	Future developments	192
3	Participation	192
3.1	Pre-implementation	192
3.2	Post-implementation	193
3.2.1	Permits	193
3.2.2	Plans and programmes	195
3.2.3	Future outlook	196
4	Access to courts	197
5	Conclusion	202
 CHAPTER 8	 Mimicking Environmental Transparency. The Implementation of the Aarhus Convention in Romania Bogdana Neamtu & Dacian C. Dragos	
	Outline of the chapter	207
	Reflection of the Aarhus Convention in the national legislation	207
I	Right of access to documents/information	208
I.1	Background	208
I.2	Scope of the right of access to information	209
I.3	Duty to make some information generally available	210
I.4	Format/manner in which environmental information is made generally available	211
I.5	Bodies having the duty to provide information	214
I.6	Exemptions from free access	214
I.7	Costs for exercising the right of access	218
2	Participation rights	219
2.1	Different participation rules applicable to activities, to plans, programs and policies, and to normative instruments	219
2.2	Purpose of participation	220
2.3	NGO participation	220
2.4	Timeframes for the different phases	221
2.5	Utilization of the outcome of public participation	225
3	Access to courts	226
3.1	Administrative appeal. Alternatives to court proceedings	226
3.2	Standing	228
3.3	Review by the courts	228
3.4	Remedies available	229
3.5	Effectiveness of judicial remedies; Legal aid	231
4	Discussion of the main findings	233
4.1	Pre-implementation	233
4.2	Post-implementation	234

CHAPTER 9	The Implementation and Influence of the Aarhus Convention in Spain Jorge Agudo González	
1	Introduction	241
2	First pillar: the right of access to information	241
2.1	The pre-implementation phase: Early and limited acknowledgement connected to a defensive approach	241
2.2	The post-implementation stage: Extensive development of this right through top-down influence	243
3	Second pillar: public participation rights	247
3.1	Pre-implementation phase: a legal tradition with long-standing practices	247
3.2	Post-implementation phase: a paradoxical implementation with steps forward and steps backward	255
3.2.1	Participation of the 'public concerned'	256
3.2.2	Mode and scope of participation	258
3.2.3	Time frames for participation	260
3.2.4	Due account of the results of participation	261
4	Third pillar: access to justice	262
4.1	Pre-implementation phase: a long 'journey' towards the acknowledgement of a broad right of access to justice	262
4.2	Post-implementation phase: an unsatisfactory implementation which amounts to a regressive step	267
5	Final remarks	273
CHAPTER 10	United Kingdom Carol Day	
1	Access to environmental information	277
1.1	Introduction	277
1.2	Routinely publishable information	278
1.3	What does the public have the right of access to?	278
1.4	The definition of public authorities	280
1.5	How quickly must the information be provided?	282
1.6	Exemptions to disclosure	282
1.7	Scotland	285
1.8	What is in the public interest?	285
1.9	Partial refusal and redaction of documents	286
1.10	Appealing against refusals	286
1.11	Charging for environmental information	286
2	Participation rights	288
2.1	Introduction	288
2.2	The effect of the Aarhus Convention	289

2.3	Public participation in relation to specific activities (Article 6)	290
2.4	Third party right of appeal	291
2.5	GMOs	291
2.6	Public participation in relation to plans, programmes and policies relating to the environment (Article 7)	292
2.7	The town and country planning system	292
2.8	National infrastructure projects	295
2.9	Scotland	296
2.10	Opportunities for participation in relation to normative instruments (Article 8)	296
2.11	Are consultation processes effective?	299
2.12	Case-Law on consultations	300
2.13	The role of NGOs in decision-making	301
3	Access to environmental justice	301
3.1	Introduction	301
3.2	The System for decision-making and administrative appeals	302
3.3	Judicial review (JR)	302
3.4	Other routes to redress	305
3.5	Standing	305
3.6	Scotland and Northern Ireland	306
3.7	Standing for groups	307
3.8	The effectiveness of JR as a remedy – “substantive and procedural legality”	308
3.9	Costs in the environmental procedure	310
3.10	Court fees	310
3.11	Lawyers’ fees	311
3.11	Scotland and Northern Ireland	315
3.12	Cross undertakings in damages and injunctive relief	315
3.13	Legal Aid	316
3.14	Brexit implications	317

CHAPTER II Towards a Common European Legal Culture under the ‘First Pillar’ of the Aarhus Convention
 Franziska Grashof

1	Introduction	321
2	The beginning: diversity in national legal rules and the legal culture on access to information	322
2.1	Sweden, the Netherlands and France: Rules on access to information and the legal culture of openness	323
2.2	Italy, the UK and Ireland: Some rules on access to environmental information and legal culture of secrecy	324
2.3	Germany and Spain: no rules on access to environmental information and legal culture of secrecy	325

2.4	Romania: Rules on access to information but legal culture of secrecy	326
2.5	Conclusion	326
3	The first step towards the creation of a common legal culture on access to environmental information:	
	Directive 90/313/EEC	327
3.1	Sweden, the Netherlands and France: no significant changes in law and legal culture of openness	327
3.2	Italy, the UK and Ireland: broadening of legislation and enhancing the legal culture of openness	328
3.3	Germany and Spain: creation of rules on access to environmental information and break with the legal culture of secrecy	329
3.4	Romania: Even though not a Member State at the time, still enacting laws on access to information	330
3.5	Conclusion	331
4	The second step towards the creation of a common legal culture on access to environmental information: Aarhus Convention and Directive 2003/4/EC	331
4.1	The creation of the Aarhus Convention and Directive 2003/4/EC	331
4.2	The implementation of the rules of the Aarhus Convention and Directive 2003/4/EC	334
4.2.1	Sweden, the Netherlands and France: little change in the legal framework and the legal culture on access to environmental information	335
4.2.2	Italy, UK and Ireland: modifying rules and enhancing the legal culture on access to environmental information	337
4.2.3	Germany and Spain: modifying rules and enhancing the legal culture on access to environmental information	340
4.2.4	Romania: modifying rules but only modest impact on the legal culture on access to environmental information	342
4.2.5	Conclusion	342
5	A legal culture of openness at the Union level?	343
6	Conclusion: Has a common European legal culture developed under the 'first pillar' of the Aarhus Convention?	345

CHAPTER 12 **The Second Pillar of the Aarhus Convention and Beyond. Comparative Analysis of the Implementing Systems Vis-À-Vis their Legal Culture**
Margherita Poto

1	Introductory remarks	349
2	A participatory Convention and the threefold shift in mentality: political, diplomatic and legal	351

2.1	The political shift	351
2.2	The shift in diplomatic relations	352
2.3	The legal shift	352
3	The Aarhus Convention Compliance: internal mechanisms and national outputs	354
3.1	The Compliance Committee: a new participatory approach to monitor compliance	354
3.2	The European Union: a good level of compliance due to the legal tradition	356
3.3	The National Reports	358
3.3.1	Comparative data	358
3.3.2	United Kingdom: participation and political interests take it in turns	360
3.3.3	Southern Europe: individualism and centralisation as obstacles to substantial change	362
3.3.4	France: participatory rights in the tissue of representative democracy	363
3.3.5	Germany: talking the talk and (not always) walking the walk	365
3.3.6	The Dutch consensus culture: a stagnant “polder model”?	366
3.3.7	Ireland: a lukewarm reception of the AC	367
3.3.8	Romania: an initial acceleration followed by a sharp slowdown	368
3.3.9	Recommendations for the “not-fully compliant” countries	369
4	Reasons behind the delayed or poor compliance	370
4.1	Endogenous factors	370
5	Conclusion and way forward	371

CHAPTER 13 **Access to Justice under the Aarhus Convention: the Comparative View**

Dacian C. Dragos, Bogdana Neamtu

1	Introduction	375
2	Systems of remedies in different jurisdictions	375
3	Standing	381
3.1	Individual standing	383
3.2	Standing for NGOs, groups and <i>actio popularis</i>	385
4	The intensity and scope of the review	389
5	Injunctive relief, damages	394
6	Costs	397
7	Conclusions: a mixed picture in need of unity?	401

CHAPTER 14	Environmental NGOs (eNGOs) or: Filling the Gap between the State and the Individual under the Aarhus Convention	
	Roberto Caranta	
1	Introduction.	407
2	The eNGOs in the Aarhus Convention.	410
3	Environmental NGOs and EU law	413
3.1	Rules applicable to the EU institutions	416
3.1	Rules applicable to the public authorities of the Member States	421
4	The role of eNGOs in selected Member States	431
5	Comparative conclusions	434
CHAPTER 15	The Impact of the Convention of Aarhus on the Emerging European Legal Culture	
	Anna Gerbrandy & Laurens van Kreijl	
1	Introduction	443
2	European legal culture	443
3	The legal culture of the Aarhus Convention	447
4	The Aarhus Convention's influence on European legal culture	450
4.1	Transparency	450
4.2	Public Participation	451
4.3	Effectiveness through environmental justice	453
5	Conclusion	454
	<i>Table of Cases</i>	458
	<i>Index</i>	466