

Table of Contents

List of Abbreviations	15
1. Introduction	21
1.1. Research Questions and Objectives	23
1.2. “Reliability” as an Analytical Tool	25
1.3. Research Methods and Approach	31
1.4. State of the Art and Relevance	40
2. The Context: Franco-German Armaments Collaboration and European Armaments Cooperation	43
2.1. Historical Context: Evolution of European Defence Integration and Franco-German Armaments Cooperation	44
2.1.1. Historical Evolution of European Defence and Armaments Integration	44
2.1.1.1. The Belated Launch of the CSDP	51
2.1.1.2. The Introduction of European Armaments Cooperation to CSDP	54
2.1.1.3. European Defence and Armaments Integration after Lisbon	62
2.1.1.4. Intermediate Conclusions – European defence integration as an ongoing process	66
2.1.2. Historical Evolution of the Franco-German Armaments Collaboration	69
2.1.2.1. Launching Franco-German Armaments Collaboration	70
2.1.2.2. Diverging National Interests and Strategic Cultures	71
2.1.2.3. Diverging Positions on Armaments Exports impeding Franco-German Armaments Collaboration in the past	73
2.1.2.4. Intermediate Conclusions – no collaboration without exports	79

Table of Contents

2.2. Current Context: State of European Defence Integration and Franco-German Armaments Cooperation	79
2.2.1. European Defence and Armaments Integration today	80
2.2.1.1. A New Impetus for CSDP	83
2.2.1.2. Europe's Capability Gap	88
2.2.1.3. The Necessity and Challenges of European Armaments Cooperation	89
2.2.1.4. Armaments and the Single Market	97
2.2.1.5. Intermediate Conclusions – European defence and armaments integration in 2023	100
2.2.2. Franco-German Armaments Cooperation today	102
2.2.2.1. Relaunching Franco-German Armaments Collaboration	102
2.2.2.2. Necessities for Armaments Cooperation	105
2.2.2.3. Continuing Divergence and Challenges	107
2.2.2.4. The Continuous Contentious Issue of Armaments Exports	110
2.2.2.5. Need for Convergence of Armaments Export Policies	114
2.2.2.6. Intermediate Conclusions – need for legal reliability to ensure successful collaboration	119
3. Franco-German Armaments Collaboration – unreliable legal frameworks	121
3.1. Unreliabilities of Franco-German Armaments Collaboration in the Bilateral Framework	121
3.1.1. Foundations of Franco-German Armaments Collaboration – the Elysée Treaty	123
3.1.2. Mistakes were made in Franco-German Armaments Collaboration – the Schmidt Debré Agreement	124
3.1.2.1. Enabling Collaboration – non-veto of armaments exports	125
3.1.2.2. Non-Veto Principle – from application to non-application	126
3.1.2.3. Shortcomings and Germany's Non-Compliance	128
3.1.2.4. Intermediate Conclusions – no successful armaments collaboration without reliable rules for armaments exports	134

3.1.4. Let's try again – the Aachen Treaty	134
3.1.5. Mistakes were remade? – the New Franco-German Agreement on Armaments Exports	136
3.1.5.1. Enabling Collaboration once more and another Non-Veto Principle	138
3.1.5.2. Legal Status, Validity, and Reliability	140
3.1.5.3. The German Perspective	141
3.1.5.3.1. The Non-Veto Principle – unconstitutional?	146
3.1.5.3.2. The NFGAAE's Constitutionality	148
3.1.5.3.3. The NFGAAE – an ATT violation?	152
3.1.5.3.4. The NFGAAE – a violation of the EU's Common Position?	154
3.1.5.3.5. Further Thoughts	155
3.1.5.4. The French Perspective	156
3.1.5.5. Lasting Unreliabilities	158
3.1.6. Intermediate Conclusions – need for a different approach	163
3.2. European Union Law – a more reliable legal framework for Armaments Collaboration?	164
3.2.1. European Armaments Cooperation – torn between intergovernmentalism and supranationalism	165
3.2.1.1. Towards a European Defence Union and potential consequences for European Armaments Cooperation	169
3.2.1.1.1. Context and Need for deeper Defence Integration	169
3.2.1.1.2. Political Notions of EDU	172
3.2.1.1.3. EDU and Common Defence (Art. 42(2) TEU)	176
3.2.1.1.4. EDU and the Central Role of Armaments Cooperation	184
3.2.1.1.5. Assessment and Outlook – many open questions	189
3.2.1.2. The Future of European Armaments Cooperation and PESCO	191
3.2.1.2.1. European Capability Development – ECAP and EDA (Arts. 42(3), 45 TEU)	192

Table of Contents

3.2.1.2.2.	EDA's Shortcomings – lack of reliable capability development	194
3.2.1.2.3.	PESCO (Art. 46 TEU) – a framework for more reliable capability development?	198
3.2.1.2.4.	EDA-PESCO Relationship	204
3.2.1.2.5.	PESCO's Enforcement System	205
3.2.1.2.6.	Assessment and Outlook – high potentials	205
3.2.1.3.	The European Armaments Policy and its future	207
3.2.1.3.1.	Towards a genuine European Market for Defence Equipment?	208
3.2.1.3.2.	The Armaments Exception (Art. 346(1) (b) TFEU)	211
3.2.1.3.3.	EDEM Regulation	217
3.2.1.3.4.	The Transfer Directive – lacking effects	217
3.2.1.3.5.	The Procurement Directive – also lacking effects	223
3.2.1.3.6.	The European Defence Fund – the start of supranational capability development?	227
3.2.1.3.7.	Assessment and Outlook – incomplete EDEM	230
3.2.1.4.	Towards a Comprehensive European Armaments Export Regime?	233
3.2.1.4.1.	The EU's Common Position on Armaments Exports – substantial convergence?	237
3.2.1.4.2.	The Dual-Use Regulation – a starting point for EU-wide armaments export harmonisation?	242
3.2.1.4.3.	Addendum	243
3.2.1.4.4.	Assessment and Outlook – incomplete harmonisation	244
3.2.2.1.	Legal Change – a question of competence (Arts. 5(1), (2) TEU, 352 TFEU)	249
3.2.2.2.	Legal Change by Treaty Revision (Art. 48 TEU)	251

3.2.2.3. Changing the Armaments Exception Provision (Art. 346(1)(b) TFEU)	253
3.2.2.4. Transferring Multilateral Armaments Cooperation into EU Frameworks	255
3.2.2.5. Harmonising Armaments Exports – the “gretchenfrage”	256
3.2.3. Europeanising Franco-German Armaments Collaboration?	265
3.3. Multilateral European Armaments Cooperation – unreliable but effective?	267
3.3.1. OCCAR and LoI – unreliable and ineffective?	268
3.3.1.1. OCCAR	268
3.3.1.2. LoI	271
3.3.1.3. Integrating OCCAR and LoI into EDA?	274
3.3.2. The Bilateral Franco-German Armaments Collaboration in the context of European Union Law – exclusive cooperation within common integration	276
3.3.2.1. Franco-German Agreements and EU Law Links	277
3.3.2.2. Enhanced Cooperation (Art. 20 TEU)	278
3.3.2.3. Unlawful Enhanced Franco-German Armaments Cooperation?	281
3.3.3. A Future for Multilateral European Armaments Cooperation?	284
4. Conclusion and Outlook – The Future of Franco-German Armaments Collaboration in the context of the European Defence Policy	287
List of Cases	299
Bibliography	301