

# Contents

---

*Acknowledgments* . . . . . ix

*Foreword* . . . . . xi

*Introduction* . . . . . xiii

a. Responsibility and Guilt . . . . . xiv

b. Collective Responsibility . . . . . xvi

c. Collective Guilt . . . . . xx

d. Liability for the Acts of Others Under International Law . . . . . xxii

    i. Collective Responsibility Under International  
        Humanitarian Law . . . . . xxiii

    ii. Collective Responsibility Under International  
        Criminal Law . . . . . xxiv

**Part A: The Decline of the Concept of  
Collective Responsibility Under  
International Humanitarian Law**

**Introduction: The Legal Regulation of Wartime Conduct . . . 3**

**Chapter I. Collective Punishment . . . . . 7**

a. The Lieber Code of 1863 . . . . . 9

b. The Brussels Conference of 1874 . . . . . 11

c. The Hague Conventions of 1899 and 1907 . . . . . 16

d. The First World War and Its Aftermath . . . . . 28

e. The Geneva Prisoners of War Convention of 1929 . . . . . 32

f. The Second World War and Its Aftermath . . . . . 34

    i. Judgments of National Courts . . . . . 36

    ii. Trials Before Military Tribunals at Nuremberg . . . . . 41

g. The Geneva Conventions of 1949 . . . . . 44

    i. Geneva Convention III Relative to the Treatment of  
        Prisoners of War . . . . . 46

    ii. Geneva Convention IV Relative to the Protection of  
        Civilian Persons . . . . . 48

h. The Additional Protocols of 1977 . . . . . 55

    i. Additional Protocol II—Noninternational Armed  
        Conflicts . . . . . 60

    ii. Additional Protocol I—International  
        Armed Conflicts . . . . . 64

i. The War Crime of Collective Punishment . . . . . 68

j. Concluding Observations . . . . . 78



**Chapter II. Hostage-Taking** ..... 81

- a. The Law on Hostage-Taking Prior to the Second World War..... 83
- b. Judicial Interpretation in the Aftermath of the  
Second World War ..... 93
  - i. The Nuremberg Judgment ..... 93
  - ii. The Hostages Case ..... 95
  - iii. Other Post-Second World War Decisions ..... 101
- c. The Geneva Conventions of 1949..... 109
- d. The Additional Protocols of 1977..... 116
- e. Other Sources of the International Prohibition and Crime of  
Hostage-Taking ..... 121
- f. Concluding Observations ..... 128

**Chapter III. Belligerent Reprisals**..... 131

- a. The Customary Law of Belligerent Reprisals ..... 131
- b. The Treaty Law of Belligerent Reprisals Prior to the  
Second World War ..... 134
- c. Judicial Interpretation in the Aftermath of the  
Second World War ..... 139
- d. The Geneva Conventions of 1949..... 145
- e. The Additional Protocols of 1977..... 148
- f. Customary Status of Conventional Reprisal Prohibitions..... 154
- g. Jurisprudence of the International Criminal Tribunal  
for the Former Yugoslavia..... 156
- h. Does the Doctrine of Belligerent Reprisals Apply  
in Noninternational Armed Conflicts? ..... 166
- i. Non-State Actors and the Doctrine of Belligerent Reprisals .... 172
- j. Applying International Human Rights Law During  
Armed Conflict ..... 175
- k. Concluding Observations ..... 182

**Part B: Collective Responsibility From the  
Battlefield to the Courtroom: Liability for the  
Acts of Others Under International Criminal Law**

**Introduction: The Birth of International Criminal Justice**.... 189

**Chapter IV. Conspiracy, Common Plan, and Joint Criminal  
Enterprise Liability** ..... 197

- a. Accounting for the Crimes of the Second World War..... 198
  - i. The Preparatory Work ..... 199
  - ii. The London Conference on Military Trials ..... 207
  - iii. Codification ..... 214



|     |                                                                                 |     |
|-----|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| iv. | Application of the Concept by War Crimes Tribunals . . . . .                    | 218 |
| b.  | Joint Criminal Enterprise at the International Criminal<br>Tribunals . . . . .  | 226 |
| i.  | Establishment of the Doctrine . . . . .                                         | 227 |
| ii. | Subsequent Reliance on Joint Criminal Enterprise . . . . .                      | 233 |
| 1.  | Individual Criminal Responsibility Under<br>International Criminal Law. . . . . | 239 |
| 2.  | Collective Criminality and the Principle of<br>Personal Culpability . . . . .   | 245 |
| c.  | Concluding Observations . . . . .                                               | 253 |

## **Chapter V. Criminal Organizations . . . . . 257**

|      |                                                    |     |
|------|----------------------------------------------------|-----|
| a.   | Prelude to Nuremberg . . . . .                     | 257 |
| i.   | The Bernays Proposal . . . . .                     | 257 |
| ii.  | The U.N. War Crimes Commission . . . . .           | 262 |
| iii. | The London Conference on Military Trials . . . . . | 266 |
| b.   | Nuremberg and Subsequent Judgments . . . . .       | 273 |
| c.   | Criminal Organizations Beyond Nuremberg . . . . .  | 281 |
| d.   | Concluding Observations . . . . .                  | 290 |

## **Chapter VI. Superior Responsibility . . . . . 293**

|      |                                                                 |     |
|------|-----------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| a.   | Historical Development. . . . .                                 | 294 |
| b.   | The Post-Second World War Cases. . . . .                        | 299 |
| i.   | The Yamashita Case . . . . .                                    | 301 |
| ii.  | The International Military Tribunal for the Far East . . . . .  | 310 |
| iii. | Trials of German and Nazi War Criminals . . . . .               | 315 |
| c.   | International Codification and Domestic Prosecution. . . . .    | 325 |
| i.   | The Medina Court Martial. . . . .                               | 326 |
| ii.  | Additional Protocol I . . . . .                                 | 330 |
| iii. | The Kahan Commission. . . . .                                   | 335 |
| d.   | Jurisprudence of the International Criminal Tribunals . . . . . | 337 |
| e.   | The Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court. . . . .   | 347 |
| f.   | Concluding Observations . . . . .                               | 354 |

|                             |     |
|-----------------------------|-----|
| <i>Conclusion</i> . . . . . | 359 |
|-----------------------------|-----|

|                               |     |
|-------------------------------|-----|
| <i>Bibliography</i> . . . . . | 367 |
|-------------------------------|-----|

|                                 |     |
|---------------------------------|-----|
| <i>Table of Cases</i> . . . . . | 381 |
|---------------------------------|-----|

|                                    |     |
|------------------------------------|-----|
| <i>Table of Treaties</i> . . . . . | 387 |
|------------------------------------|-----|

|                        |     |
|------------------------|-----|
| <i>Index</i> . . . . . | 389 |
|------------------------|-----|

|                                          |     |
|------------------------------------------|-----|
| <i>About the PAIL Institute.</i> . . . . | 396 |
|------------------------------------------|-----|