

# Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xv
<i>Table of International and Domestic Instruments</i>	xxix
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xli

<b>I. Introduction</b>	1
A. Climate Change	1
B. The International Law on Climate Change Mitigation	3
C. Doctrinal Analysis	7
1. The Need for Doctrinal Analysis	8
2. The Possibility of Doctrinal Analysis	14
D. The Objective of this Book	17
E. Framework of Analysis	18
1. A Standard Doctrinal Methodology	19
2. Ascending and Descending Reasoning	23
3. Relationships between Obligations	25
4. Concepts and Terminology	27
F. Structure of the Book	29
1. Identification of Mitigation Obligations	29
2. Applications of General Mitigation Obligations	30
G. Responses to Some Objections	32

## PART 1: IDENTIFICATION OF MITIGATION OBLIGATIONS

<b>II. Commitments</b>	37
Introduction	37
A. The UNFCCC Regime	38
1. The UNFCCC	38
a) Mitigation action	41
b) Support	43
c) Communication of information	45
2. The Kyoto Protocol	46
a) Mitigation action	48
b) Communication of information	50
3. The Paris Agreement	50
a) Mitigation action	53
(i) Procedural commitment	54
(ii) Substantive commitment	57

b) Support	60
c) Communication of information	62
B. Unilateral Declarations	63
1. The Recognition of Unilateral Declarations as a Source of Legal Obligations	64
2. Relevance to Climate Change Mitigation	65
3. National Reports	67
4. Copenhagen and Cancun Pledges	69
5. NDCs and Long-Term Strategies	71
6. Other Unilateral Declarations	74
7. The Cumulative Effect of Series of Declarations	76
C. Commitments under Other Treaty Regimes	78
1. Commitments Incidental to the Protection of the Ozone Layer	78
2. Commitments Incidental to the Regulation of International Civil Aviation	82
3. Commitments Incidental to the Regulation of Pollution from Ships	85
Conclusion	87
<b>III. Customary Obligations</b>	<b>88</b>
Introduction	88
A. Preliminary Methodological Issues	90
1. Ascending and Descending Approaches to the Identification of Customary Law	91
2. The Problem of Individuation	95
B. General Customary Obligations Relevant to Climate Change Mitigation	96
1. Obligation of Prevention	96
a) Descending approach	97
b) Ascending approach	101
2. Obligation of Cooperation	103
C. A Discrete Customary Obligation on Climate Change Mitigation	106
1. Deduction from General Obligations	106
2. Induction from the General Practice of States Accepted as Law	110
D. The Relation between Commitments and Customary Obligations	113
1. The Absence of Normative Conflict	115
2. A Relationship of Interpretation	119
E. Interpretative Interactions between Commitments and Customary Obligations	121
1. Interpreting Customary Law in Light of Negotiated Instruments	121
a) Compliance with commitments and pledges	121
b) Consistency with collective objectives	123
2. Interpreting Commitments in Light of Customary Law	126
Conclusion	128

<b>IV. Obligations Implied from Human Rights Treaties</b>	129
Introduction	129
A. The Relevance of Human Rights Treaties	136
1. The Ambivalent Relation between Climate Change Mitigation and Human Rights	137
a) The human rights impact of climate change	137
b) The human rights impacts of mitigation action	140
2. The Strategic Advantages of Human Rights Law	143
B. The Identification of Implied Mitigation Obligations	147
1. The Problem	148
2. Invalid Solutions	150
a) Extraterritorial obligations	150
b) 'Collective obligations'	153
c) Other-regarding obligations of cooperation	155
3. An Alternative Solution: An Inward-Looking Obligation of Cooperation	157
C. The Interpretation of Implied Mitigation Obligations	161
1. Systemic Integration	161
2. Refutation of the incorporation theory	164
a) The theory	164
b) The refutation	167
3. An Alternative Theory: Windows of Applicability	171
a) The theory	171
(i) Variable 1: The personal scope of the treaty	172
(ii) Variable 2: The relative importance of the right	172
(iii) Variable 3: The potential benefits of climate change mitigation for the protection of the right within the state's territory and under its jurisdiction	173
(iv) Variable 4: The potential unintended consequences of mitigation action for the enjoyment of treaty rights within the state's territory and under its jurisdiction	173
b) Applications	174
c) Discussion	176
Conclusion	178

## PART 2: APPLICATIONS OF GENERAL MITIGATION OBLIGATIONS

<b>V. The Nature of Mitigation Obligations</b>	183
Introduction	183
A. Conduct and Result	185
1. The Dichotomy between Conduct and Result	185
a) Origins	185
b) Reception in international law	187

2. Application to Mitigation Obligations	189
a) Customary obligations	189
b) Commitments	191
c) Obligations implied from human rights treaties	194
3. Understanding the Prevalence of Obligations of Conduct on Climate Change Mitigation	195
4. The Effectiveness of Obligations of Conduct	198
a) The perceived ineffectiveness of obligations of conduct	198
b) The relative strengths of obligations of conduct	199
c) Illustrations	201
5. From Obligations of Conduct to Obligations of Result	204
B. Substance and Procedure	206
1. The Distinction	207
2. An Ineffective Distinction	210
C. Corollary Duties	213
1. A Test of Compliance with Obligations of Conduct	214
2. Confusion in Two ICJ Judgments	216
a) <i>Pulp Mills</i>	216
b) <i>Certain Activities</i>	218
3. The Identification of Corollary Duties in Other Judicial Decisions	220
a) <i>South China Sea</i>	220
b) Interpretation of positive human rights obligations	222
4. Identifying Corollary Duties on Climate Change Mitigation	223
Conclusion	225
<b>VI. The Requisite Level of Mitigation Action</b>	<b>227</b>
Introduction	227
A. The Difficulty of Assessing the Consistency of National Action with Collective Objectives	231
1. The Lack of Agreement on Collective Objectives	231
a) The gradual definition of a collective objective	231
b) An incomplete political agreement	234
c) Applications in judicial settings	239
2. The Lack of Agreement on Burden Sharing	243
a) Differentiation principles	243
b) The indeterminacy of differentiation principles	245
c) Applications in judicial settings	248
B. The Limited Legal Force of Temperature Targets	250
1. The Dubious Obligation of Consistency with the Temperature Targets	251
a) Climate treaties	252
b) Customary law	254
c) Human rights treaties	256
2. Implications of the Temperature Targets for the Interpretation of States' Obligations	256
3. The Broader Normative Potential of the Temperature Targets	260

a) First scenario: towards shared understandings of the implications of temperature targets	260
b) Second scenario: towards a requirement of internal consistency in each state's interpretation of temperature targets	265
C. Judicial Methodologies	267
1. The Vain Quest for Predetermined Benchmarks	268
a) Illusory legal benchmarks	268
b) Illusory scientific benchmarks	269
c) Illusory objectivity of civil society assessments	271
2. Falling Back on Equity	273
a) The equity embedded within the law	273
b) Equity in the judicial interpretation of international law	275
c) The equitable assessment of a state's requisite level of mitigation action	278
Conclusion	280
VII. <b>Appropriate Measures</b>	281
Introduction	281
A. Duty of Cooperation	284
1. Foundations	284
2. Negotiation	287
3. Treaty Participation	290
4. Prohibition of Free-riding	293
B. Duty of Vigilance	295
1. Foundations	295
2. Climate Science	298
3. Monitoring and Reporting	299
4. Activity Assessment	300
a) Environmental assessment as an international law obligation	300
b) Environmental assessment as a tool for climate change mitigation	303
C. Duty of Consistency	306
1. Foundations	307
2. Consistency with Collective Objectives	309
3. Consistency with National Mitigation Strategy	312
4. Consistency with Emerging Standards	317
Conclusion	320
VIII. <b>General Conclusion</b>	321
<i>Selected Bibliography</i>	325
<i>Index</i>	341