

Contents

1	Resistance in International Human Rights Fora to Child Climate Political Activism	1
1.1	The <i>Parens Patriae</i> Doctrine	1
1.2	A Landmark Child-Led Climate Change Case	4
1.2.1	Chiara Sacchi et al. v Argentina et al. (Committee on the Rights of the Child): Background	4
1.2.2	The Committee on the Rights of the Child Inadmissibility Decision Rationale in Chiara Sacchi et al. v Argentina et al	6
1.3	Committee on the Rights of the Child Biases and Child <i>Disempowerment</i>	11
1.3.1	Children as Second Class Citizens Denied a Committee on the Rights of the Child Quasi-Judicial Remedy	11
1.3.2	The Denial of Inter-Generational Obligations to the Sacchi Child Complainants in Regard to Climate Change	16
1.3.3	Resistance to Children as Political Actors: <i>DC v Germany</i> (Communication to the Committee on the Rights of the Child)	17
1.3.4	The Committee’s Stance on Child Self-Advocacy Regarding Climate Change as Political and Civic Engagement	24
1.3.5	The Best Interest of the Child and the Child as Political Actor	25
1.4	Conclusion	40
	Materials	40
	Cases	42
	References	42

- 2 The Legacy of Colonialism in the Contemporary Application of *Parens Patraie* 45
 - 2.1 Introduction 45
 - 2.2 In the Matter of a Reference to the Court of Appeal for Quebec Concerning the Constitutionality of the Act Respecting First Nations, Inuit and Métis Children, Youth and Families, S.C. 2019, c. 24 (Supreme Court of Canada Judgement 2024 SCC 5) 46
 - 2.3 United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples: Rights Guarantees Implicating Indigenous Children’s Best Interests 47
 - 2.3.1 The Right of Indigenous Peoples to Integrity of the Family Unit and Perpetuation of Indigenous Cultures Intergenerationally 48
 - 2.3.2 Indigenous Child Empowerment Through Education Where Educational Institutions Are Established and Governed by Indigenous Communities as an Aspect of Indigenous Local Self-Government 50
 - 2.4 The Autonomous Collective and Individual Rights of Indigenous Children 52
 - 2.4.1 Excerpts from the Committee on the Rights of the Child General Comment No. 11 on ‘Indigenous Children and Their Rights Under the Convention’ 54
 - 2.5 Vestiges of the Colonial View of Children as Property Reflected in the ‘Reasonable Chastisement Defense’ 56
 - 2.5.1 Canadian Foundation for Children, Youth and the Law v. Canada (Attorney General): Introduction 58
 - 2.5.2 Violation of the Child’s s. 15 Charter Right to Equality Under the Law 61
 - 2.5.3 Violation of the Child’s s. 12 Charter Right to Be Protected from Cruel and Unusual Treatment or Punishment 62
 - 2.5.4 Violation of the Child’s s. 7 Charter Right to Security of the Person and to Fundamental Justice 63
 - 2.5.5 The Procedural Safeguard Issue: The Crown as Purported Protector of the Child’s Security Interest at Trial 63
 - 2.5.6 The Child’s Right to Fundamental Justice Under s. 7 of the Canadian Charter and Respect for the Child’s Human Dignity 64
 - 2.6 Teachers as “Persons in Authority” Under s. 43 of the Criminal Code of Canada 69
 - 2.7 Comparative Law: Selected Examples of Initiatives to End the Legalization of the Corporal Punishment of Children 70

2.7.1	World Organization Against Torture v. Ireland (Complaint No. 18/2003) The European Committee of Social Rights, Decision on the Merits, Adopted by the Committee December 7, 2004	71
2.7.2	The State’s Abrogation of Its <i>Parens Patriae</i> Protection Obligation to the Child Collective	74
2.8	Concluding Remarks	76
	Materials	78
	Cases	79
	References	80
3	Litigating the Child’s Bodily and Psychological Autonomy	81
3.1	Introduction	81
3.2	Age Discrimination Against Children in the Denial of Physician-Assisted Death in Canada	83
3.2.1	Carter v Canada (Attorney General) 2015 SCC 5	83
3.3	The <i>Disempowerment</i> of Children in Their Medical Decision-Making (UK and Canadian Law)	84
3.4	A Contested Right of Transgender Minors to Gender-Affirming Medical Care: Introduction	87
3.4.1	United States of America (Petitioner) v Jonathan Thomas Skremetti et al. (Respondent) (United States Supreme Court)	90
3.4.2	Transgender Adolescents and Their Right to the Vote	99
3.4.3	High Court Decision: Bell and Another v Tavistock and Portman NHS Foundation Trust (University College London Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust and Others Intervening) [2020] EWHC 3274 (Admin). (Also here referred to as <i>Tavistock</i>)	100
3.4.4	The Appeal Court Decision: Bell and Another v Tavistock and Portman NHS Foundation Trust (University College London Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust and Other Intervening) [2021] EWCA Civ 1363 (Also here referred to as <i>Tavistock</i>)	105
3.4.5	Concluding Remarks	109
	Materials	111
	Cases	111
	References	112
4	The State Imposing Jurisdictional Limits on <i>Parens Patriae</i> Obligations to Its Child Nationals	113
4.1	Introduction: Western States’ Resistance to the Repatriation of Their Child Nationals Held in Detention Abroad	113

4.2	P.N., K.K. and O.M. (on Behalf of S.N. et al.) v Finland (Communication No. 100/2019) Committee on the Rights of the Child, Decision on the Merits, October 20, 2022	122
4.2.1	Overview of the Case	122
4.2.2	The Committee Decision on Admissibility in P.N., K.K. and O.M. (on Behalf of S.N. et al.) v Finland	128
4.2.3	The Committee Decision on the Merits in P.N., K.K. and O.M. (on Behalf of S.N. et al.) v Finland	129
4.3	Case of H.F. et al. v France and J.D. and A.D. v France (Applications Nos. 24384/19 and 44234/20) European Court of Human Rights, Grand Chamber Judgment on Admissibility and the Merits, September 14, 2022	138
4.3.1	The Applications	138
4.3.2	The European Court of Human Rights' Legal Analysis of the Joined Applications 24384/19 and 44234/20	139
4.4	Concluding Remarks	145
	Materials	146
	Cases	148
	References	148
	Literature	148
5	Rethinking <i>Parens Patriae</i>	149
5.1	Introduction: Children as a Legally <i>Un-Protected</i> Group	149
5.2	Children Blocked From Filing Age Discrimination Complaints Under Canada's Human Rights Codes	152
5.3	Legal Emancipation of the Child as a Mirage	154
5.4	Concluding Remarks: Revisiting Age Discrimination Against Children	162
	Materials	163
	Cases	164
	References	164
	Literature	164