

Table of Contents

Editors	v
Contributors	vii
Foreword	xxi
Introduction <i>Anja Ipp & Annette Magnusson</i>	1
PART I	
Types of Disputes	5
CHAPTER 1	
Types of State Action Leading to Climate-Related Investor Claims <i>Beata Gessel-Kalinowska vel Kalisz, Maja Frontczak & Piotr Paprota</i>	7
§1.01 Introduction	7
§1.02 The Tension Between State's Right to Exercise Its Sovereign Powers and Standards of Protection	8
§1.03 Types of State Conduct Triggering Climate-Related Investor Claims	10
[A] State Inaction	11
[B] State Action	13
[1] Legislative	13
[a] Energy Transition	13
[i] Renewable Energy Incentive Schemes	13
[ii] Nuclear Energy Phase-Out	17
[iii] Fossil Fuels Phase-Out (Decarbonization)	19
[b] Administrative Pricing Regime for Electricity	22
[c] Limits on GHG Emissions	23
[d] General Restrictions on Exploration of Oil and Gas	24

Table of Contents

	[e]	Conservation of Unique Natural Sites Acting as Carbon Sinks	27
	[f]	Other	29
	[2]	Executive	29
	[a]	Absence or Withdrawal of Permit for a Specific Economic Operation	29
	[b]	Awarding of Energy Sales Agreements	32
	[c]	Decisions Disrupting Use and Enjoyment of an Investment	35
	[3]	Judicial	37
	[4]	Contractual - Mention	39
§1.04		Conclusions	40
CHAPTER 2			
Carbon Markets, Emissions Trading, and Investor-State Disputes			
<i>Marisa Martin & Paul Barker</i>			
§2.01		Overview of Carbon Markets	45
	[A]	Compliance Markets	45
	[B]	Voluntary Carbon Market	46
	[C]	Article 6 of the Paris Agreement	49
§2.02		International Investment Protection/ISDS	51
	[A]	Protected Investment	52
	[B]	Standards of Treatment	54
§2.03		Alignment of Investment Law with Climate Policy and Law	55
§2.04		Relevant Cases	57
§2.05		The Risk of Investor-State Disputes in the Carbon Markets	59
§2.06		Conclusion	61
CHAPTER 3			
International Commercial Arbitration and Investment Agreements Involving States			
<i>Wendy Miles KC</i>			
§3.01		Introduction	63
§3.02		International Commercial Arbitration	63
§3.03		International Climate Change Law	66
§3.04		Non-party Stakeholders and the Paris Agreement	70
§3.05		Paris Agreement in International Commercial Arbitration	72
	[A]	Fact of Transition	73
	[B]	Applicable Law(s)	75
	[C]	Legal Remedies/Damages	78
§3.06		Cost of Inaction	81
§3.07		Conclusion	81

PART II	
Procedural Issues	83
CHAPTER 4	
Climate Science: A Role to Play at Every Stage of Investment Arbitration?	
<i>Caline Mouawad & Gretta Walters</i>	85
§4.01 Introduction	85
§4.02 Threshold Phase	86
§4.03 Liability Phase	88
[A] Using Climate Science Techniques to Evaluate the Causal Impact of Already Realized Localized Environmental Harms	88
[B] Using Climate Science to Assess a State's Right to Regulate and Intervene for Climate Change Purposes	91
[C] Climate Science in Amicus Submissions	97
§4.04 Damages	100
§4.05 Conclusion	103
CHAPTER 5	
Climate-Related Counterclaims in International Investment Arbitration	
<i>Maxi Scherer & Clara Reichenbach</i>	105
§5.01 Introduction	105
§5.02 Jurisdiction: Establishing Consent	108
[A] Explicit Treaty Provision	109
[B] Submission Agreement	110
[C] Dispute Resolution Provision	111
[D] Arbitral Rules	112
§5.03 Admissibility: Close Connection Requirement and Pleading Standards	114
[A] The Close Connection Requirement	114
[1] Legal Connection	116
[2] Factual Connection	118
[B] Pleading Standards	120
§5.04 Source of Investor's Obligations	123
[A] Substantive Basis under International Law	123
[1] Internal: Explicit Obligations in the IIA	124
[2] External: Obligations under General International Law	127
[B] Substantive Basis under Domestic Law	132
[1] Proliferation of Domestic Climate-Related Obligations	132
[2] Elevating the Domestic Breach into an International Breach	133
[a] Hook Required to Elevate the Domestic Law Obligation	133
[b] Hook Not Required to Elevate the Domestic Law Obligation	136
§5.05 Conclusion	137

Table of Contents

CHAPTER 6

Valuation of Compensation in Fossil Fuel Phase-Out Disputes

Oliver Hailes

		139
§6.01	Introduction: Drivers of Disputes	139
§6.02	Legal Organisation of Fossil Fuel Production	142
§6.03	Applicable Standards of Compensation	145
	[A] Lawful Expropriation	145
	[B] Internationally Wrongful Acts	146
	[C] Causal Standard of Proof	148
§6.04	Appropriate Methods of Valuation	150
	[A] Defining the Market	150
	[B] Selecting the Method	151
	[1] Asset-, Market- or Income-Based Methods	152
	[2] Selection of DCF Valuation	153
	[C] Applying a DCF Method	155
	[1] Forecasting Cash Flows	155
	[2] Discounting Risks	157
§6.05	Possible Reduction of Quantum	158
	[A] Contributory Fault	158
	[B] Duty to Mitigate Damages	159
	[C] Counterclaims	160
§6.06	Conclusion	161

PART III

States' Right to Regulate	163
---------------------------	-----

CHAPTER 7

Regulating for Climate Change Without Breaching Investment Treaties

Manish Aggarwal & Ridhi Kabra

		165
§7.01	Introduction	165
§7.02	FET Standard and the Host State's Right to Regulate	166
	[A] Degree of Change Test	169
	[B] Reasonableness or Proportionality Test	170
§7.03	Protection Against Indirect Expropriation and the Host State's Right to Regulate	173
	[A] 'Sole Effects' Approach	174
	[B] 'Police Powers' Approach	175
§7.04	Conclusion	177

CHAPTER 8

Investor-State Disputes, the Climate Emergency, and the Duty to Regulate Fossil Fuels: A Human Rights Perspective

Helionor de Anzizu & Nikki Reisch

		179
§8.01	Introduction: The Climate Crisis, ISDS, and the Clash of State Duties	179
§8.02	The State's Duty to Regulate in the Context of Climate Change	184

	[A] The Obligation to Prevent Foreseeable Harm to Human Rights	184
	[B] Fossil Fuelled Climate Change as a Threat to Human Rights	187
	[C] The Human Rights Imperative to Phase Out Fossil Fuels	188
§8.03	The State's 'Right to Regulate' under Investment Law	191
	[A] ISDS and the Curtailment of State Policy Space	191
	[B] The 'Right to Regulate' as a Reaction to the Investment Protection Regime	193
	[C] The Omission of States' <i>Duty</i> to Regulate	194
§8.04	Investors Claims and the Future of the International Investment Regime in the Climate Emergency	198
	[A] Responding to and Adjudicating Investor Claims and Arguments in a Climate Emergency	198
	[B] The Future of ISDS in the Context of Climate Change	203
§8.05	Conclusion	206
CHAPTER 9		
Reconciling Human Rights and Investor Rights: The Case of Climate Change		
	<i>Suzanne Spears</i>	207
§9.01	Introduction	207
§9.02	The Evolution of Human Rights Law to Require Climate Mitigation Measures	209
	[A] Sources of the Duty to Take Climate Mitigation Measures	210
	[1] International Human Rights Law	210
	[2] Regional Human Rights Law	212
	[3] National Human Rights Law	214
	[B] Objections to the Existence of a Duty to Take Climate Mitigation Measures	215
	[1] Complex Causal Relationships	215
	[2] Territorial Limits of Human Rights Instruments	217
	[C] Advantages and Disadvantages of Locating the Duty to Take Climate Mitigation Measures in Human Rights Law	219
§9.03	The Potential Evolution of Investment Law to Consider Human Rights Law	221
	[A] Tribunals' Authority to Consider Human Rights Law	222
	[1] The Law Governing the Resolution of the Dispute	222
	[2] The Law to Be Taken into Account in Interpreting the Treaty	225
	[3] The Boundaries of the Dispute	227
	[4] The Pleadings of the Parties	229
	[B] Specific Uses of Human Rights Law in Investment Treaty Disputes	230
	[1] Determining Whether an Investment Is Protected	231
	[2] Assessing the Reasonableness of Host State Conduct	232

Table of Contents

	[3] Assessing the Legitimacy of Investor's Expectations	233
	[4] Interpreting Investment Treaty Provisions	234
	[5] Determining Whether the Police Powers Doctrine Applies	236
	[6] Identifying Essential Interests of the Respondent State	238
	[7] Determining the Proper Standard for Assessing Compensation	239
§9.04	Conclusion	240
PART IV		
	Investment Treaties and Energy Transition	243
CHAPTER 10		
	The Energy Charter Treaty: A Friend or Foe of Decarbonisation?	
	<i>Patrick W. Pearsall, David Ingle & Gary Smadja</i>	245
§10.01	Introduction	245
§10.02	Investment Protection in the Renewable Energy Sector	250
§10.03	The Protection Afforded to Renewable Energy Investors by the ECT	253
§10.04	ECT Claims Concerning Fossil Fuel Projects	257
§10.05	The Effect of Withdrawal from the ECT	260
CHAPTER 11		
	The Role and Relevance of Investment Treaties in Promoting Renewable Energy Investments	
	<i>Ladan Mehranvar & Lisa Sachs</i>	263
§11.01	Introduction	263
§11.02	Do Investment Treaties Attract Inward Foreign Investment Flows?	265
§11.03	Investor-State Disputes Involving Renewable Energy Investments	267
§11.04	FET Standard and Legitimate Expectations	273
	[A] Investors' Expectations of Stability	274
	[B] Due Diligence	277
	[C] Public Interest	281
§11.05	Renewable Energy Cases Raise Concerns about Unjust Enrichment	284
§11.06	Conclusion	286