

Contents

Introduction	1
1 Introducing the international legal protection of vulnerable groups	4
<i>Introduction</i>	4
1. <i>Plain meanings of the terms vulnerable, vulnerability and vulnerable groups</i>	4
2. <i>Human rights case studies</i>	5
2.1. <i>Situation of irregular migrants from North and Sub-Saharan Africa in Italy</i>	6
2.1.1. <i>Analysis through the lens of IHRL</i>	7
2.2. <i>Situation of persons affected by Typhoon Haiyan</i>	9
2.2.1. <i>Analysis though the lens of IHRL</i>	10
2.3. <i>Situation of persons living in poverty in the U.S.A.</i>	11
2.3.1. <i>Analysis through the lens of IHRL</i>	12
2.4. <i>Implications from the point of view of IHRL</i>	14
3. <i>Conclusions</i>	15
2 Legal protection of vulnerable groups as an integral component of the scope of international human rights law	20
<i>Introduction</i>	20
1. <i>Historical context of the 1948 Universal Declaration of Human Rights</i>	21
2. <i>The 1948 Universal Declaration of Human Rights and its relevance to vulnerable groups</i>	23
2.1. <i>Conclusive remarks</i>	25
3. <i>UN Human Rights Conventions and their relevance to the legal protection of vulnerable groups and their members</i>	25
3.1. <i>The 1965 International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination</i>	26

- 3.2. The 1966 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and the 1966 International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights 27
 - 3.2.1. The 1966 ICCPR's relevance to the protection of vulnerable groups and their members 28
 - 3.2.2. The 1966 Covenant on ESCR and its relevance to the protection of vulnerable groups and their members 33
 - 3.3. The 1979 UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women 36
 - 3.4. The 1989 Convention on the Rights of the Child 38
 - 3.5. The 1990 International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of their Families 39
 - 3.6. The 2006 UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities 42
 - 4. *Regional human rights instruments relevant to the protection of vulnerable groups and their individual members* 44
 - 4.1. Human rights instruments adopted by the Council of Europe 44
 - 4.2. Human Rights Treaties adopted by the Organization of American States 47
 - 4.2.1. The 1988 Protocol of San Salvador 49
 - 4.2.2. Group specific treaties 50
 - 4.2.3. Latest Inter-American Human Rights Conventions 52
 - 4.3. African human rights instruments 56
 - 5. *Conclusions* 60
- 3 Practice of UN treaty bodies and Thematic UN Special Procedures relevant to the protection of vulnerable groups 75**
- Introduction* 75
- 1. *Relevant practice of the Human Rights Committee: general trends in the protection of vulnerable groups and their members* 77
 - 1.1. Sporadic reliance on notions of vulnerability and vulnerable persons and groups 81
 - 1.2. Conclusive remarks 84
 - 2. *Relevant practice of the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination* 85
 - 2.1. General Recommendations 86
 - 2.2. Concluding Observations 89
 - 2.3. CERD's definition of vulnerable ethnic groups: concluding remarks 90

3.	<i>Relevant practice of the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women</i>	93
3.1.	General Recommendations	94
3.2.	Concluding Observations	97
3.3.	Consideration of communications	99
3.4.	Concluding remarks	100
4.	<i>Relevant practice of the Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities</i>	102
5.	<i>Thematic UN Special Procedures</i>	104
5.1.	Relevant practice	105
5.2.	Concluding points	110
6.	<i>Conclusions</i>	111
4	Practice of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and the Committee on the Rights of the Child relevant to the protection of vulnerable groups	126
	<i>Introduction</i>	126
1.	<i>The Committee on ESCR</i>	127
1.1.	General Comments	127
1.1.1.	General Comments adopted between 1990 and 1999	128
1.1.2.	General Comments adopted between 2000 and 2009	133
1.1.3.	Group specific General Comments	139
1.1.4.	General Comments adopted in 2016	140
1.1.5.	General Comment No. 20	141
1.2.	Concluding Observations	143
1.3.	Concluding remarks	147
2.	<i>The Committee on the Rights of the Child</i>	151
2.1.	General Comments	152
2.1.1.	Relevant General Comments adopted between 2009 and 2016	152
2.1.2.	Relevant General Comments adopted between 2002 and 2007	156
2.2.	Concluding Observations	160
2.3.	Critical remarks	162
3.	<i>Conclusions</i>	165
5	Regional trends in the protection of vulnerable groups and their members	173
	<i>Introduction</i>	173
1.	<i>Relevant practice of the African Committee of Experts on the Rights and Welfare of the Child</i>	174

x *Protection of vulnerable groups under IHRL*

- 1.1. Concluding Recommendations/Observations on State periodic reports 174
- 1.2. Analysis of communications 176
- 1.3. General Comments 178
- 1.4. Conclusive remarks 179
2. *Relevant practice of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights* 180
3. *Relevant practice of the European Committee of Social Rights* 182
 - 3.1. The Roma as a vulnerable group: conceptualization and legal implications 182
 - 3.2. Other vulnerable groups 184
 - 3.3. Conclusive remarks 186
4. *Relevant practice of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights* 188
 - 4.1. Country and thematic reports 189
 - 4.2. Analysis of petitions 191
 - 4.3. Conclusive remarks 194
5. *Relevant practice of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights* 195
 - 5.1. Unlawfully detained persons and missing persons 196
 - 5.2. Children 197
 - 5.3. Women and girls 199
 - 5.4. Stateless persons and undocumented migrants 200
 - 5.5. Persons with disabilities 202
 - 5.6. Indigenous Peoples 204
 - 5.7. Concluding Reflections 205
6. *Conclusions* 207

6 **The vulnerability paradigm of the European Court of Human Rights**

218

Introduction 218

1. *Vulnerability of persons living with HIV/AIDS and the Roma* 218
 - 1.1. Persons living with HIV/AIDS 219
 - 1.2. The Roma 220
 - 1.3. Remarks 223
2. *Vulnerability of persons with disabilities* 224
 - 2.1. *Centre for Legal Resources on behalf of Valentin Câmpeanu v. Romania* 225
 - 2.2. Remarks 228
3. *Vulnerability of Asylum Seekers* 229
 - 3.1. Relevant case law 229
 - 3.2. Remarks 232

4. <i>Children's vulnerability: other relevant trends</i>	235
5. <i>Persons deprived of their liberty</i>	237
6. <i>Women</i>	238
7. <i>Latest trends</i>	240
8. <i>Bouyid v. Belgium: drawbacks of the ECtHR vulnerability paradigm?</i>	241
9. <i>Conclusions</i>	243
 7 Practice of domestic courts relevant to vulnerable groups and persons	 253
<i>Introduction</i>	253
1. <i>Practice of the Appellate Committee of the House of Lords and the UK Supreme Court</i>	253
2. <i>Relevant practice of the Constitutional Court of South Africa</i>	256
3. <i>Relevant practice of the Indian Supreme Court</i>	259
4. <i>Conclusions</i>	261
 8 Conclusive reflections	 267
1. <i>Vulnerable groups and International Human Rights Law</i>	267
1.1. <i>Protection available to vulnerable groups and their members under IHRL</i>	268
2. <i>Vulnerable groups and their vulnerability for the purposes of IHRL</i>	269
3. <i>The added value of the vulnerability paradigms elaborated by the MBs</i>	271
4. <i>Do the vulnerability paradigms have drawbacks?</i>	273
5. <i>Are there challenges to the international protection of vulnerable groups?</i>	275
6. <i>Bridging with Chapter 1 and brief comparison between the vulnerability paradigms of the MBs and other notions of vulnerability</i>	276
 <i>Selected bibliography</i>	 280