

Contents

<i>List of Illustrations</i>	xv
<i>Preface</i>	xvii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xxvii
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xxix
<i>Table of International Legal Instruments and Other International Organizations' Documents</i>	xxxiii
<i>Table of Constitutions and Constitutional Legal Instruments</i>	xc
<i>About the Authors</i>	xcvii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xcix

PART I AIMS, METHODOLOGY, AND DEFINITIONS

1. Methodology and Definitions	3
1.1 Introduction	3
1.2 Methodology	4
1.2.1 Provide a historical account of the emergence of the right to science	4
1.2.2 Map the right to science in international and domestic legal instruments	6
1.2.3 Define the normative content of the right to science	7
1.3 Definitions	17
1.3.1 Science	20
1.3.1.1 Science and pseudoscience	25
1.3.1.2 The sciences	34
1.3.2 Science and technology	38
1.3.3 Science and culture	40
1.3.4 Scientific knowledge, progress, and advancement	42
1.3.4.1 Scientific knowledge	42
1.3.4.2 Scientific progress and scientific advancement	45
1.3.5 Benefits	48
1.4 What comes next	52

PART II THE HISTORY OF THE RIGHT TO SCIENCE

2. From the American Declaration to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights	57
2.1 The Second World War and the dawn of international human rights	57
2.2 The birth of the right to science: the drafting of the American Declaration of Human Rights	61

2.3	From the Inter-American Juridical Committee to the Organization of American States and the American Declaration of Human Rights	69
2.4	The birth of the United Nations	76
2.5	Toward the Universal Declaration of Human Rights	78
2.5.1	The discussion on the limits and teleology of science	91
2.5.2	The discussion on the right to benefit from progress in science and its applications	98
2.5.3	The discussion on the protection of intellectual property	102
2.6	The UDHR and its aftermath	108
3.	From the Universal Declaration to the Covenant on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights	111
3.1	The origins of economic, social, and cultural rights	111
3.1.1	The foundations of the right to science are set: the Seventh Session of the Commission on Human Rights (spring 1951)	117
3.1.2	The bulk of Article 15 is negotiated and approved: the Eighth Session of the Commission on Human Rights (spring 1952)	127
3.1.3	The right to science discussed anew: the UN General Assembly, Third Committee (fall 1957)	139
3.1.3.1	The discussion on the limits and the direction to give to science returns (the first Czechoslovakian amendment)	142
3.1.3.2	The discussion on the duty to encourage the development of international scientific and cultural cooperation (the second Czechoslovakian amendment)	152
3.1.3.3	The discussion on the protection of intellectual property returns	154
3.1.4	The Third Committee adopts draft Article 16 of the ICESCR	160
3.1.5	The long final stretch toward the adoption of the ICESCR	161
3.2	Conclusions	166

PART III MAPPING THE RIGHT TO SCIENCE IN LAW

4.	The United Nations and the Right to Science	173
4.1	Introduction	173
4.2	Treaty bodies and procedures	173
4.2.1	The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	175
4.2.1.1	Periodic reports	176
4.2.1.2	General Comments	181
4.2.1.2.1	General Comment No. 17	185
4.2.1.2.2	General Comment No. 25	188
4.2.1.3	Individual communications	198

4.3	Charter bodies and procedures	205
4.3.1	The UN General Assembly	206
4.3.1.1	The limits and purpose of science and technology	208
4.3.1.2	Technology transfer	224
4.3.2	The UN Security Council	231
4.3.3	The Human Rights Council	239
4.3.3.1	Universal Periodic Review	242
4.3.3.2	Special procedures	245
4.3.3.2.1	The 2012 Report on the Right to Enjoy the Benefits of Scientific Progress and Its Applications	250
4.3.3.2.2	The 2015 Report on Copyright Policy and the Right to Science and Culture	255
4.3.3.2.3	The 2015 Report on Patent Policy and the Right to Science and Culture	260
4.4	Conclusions	264
5.	UNESCO and the Right to Science	267
5.1	Introduction	267
5.2	Antecedents	268
5.3	Origins	269
5.4	Early days	272
5.5	High hopes, grand ambitions, and reality check	276
5.6	UNESCO's structure and governance	280
5.7	UNESCO's standard-setting activities	281
5.7.1	Conventions	282
5.7.2	Recommendations and Declarations	284
5.7.2.1	Recommendation on the Status of Scientific Researchers (1974)	286
5.7.2.2	Recommendation on Science and Scientific Researchers (2017)	288
5.7.2.3	Declaration of Ethical Principles in Relation to Climate Change (2017)	293
5.7.2.4	Recommendation on Open Science (2021)	295
5.7.2.5	Recommendation on the Ethics of Artificial Intelligence (2021)	302
5.7.2.6	The UNESCO declarations on the human genome, genetics, and bioethics	307
5.7.2.6.1	Universal Declaration on Human Genome and Human Rights (1997)	308
5.7.2.6.2	International Declaration on Human Genetic Data (2003)	311
5.7.2.6.3	Universal Declaration on Bioethics and Human Rights (2005)	315

5.7.3	Statements and declarations of expert conferences sponsored by UNESCO	317
5.7.3.1	World Conference of Science—Declaration on Science and the Use of Scientific Knowledge (1999)	318
5.7.3.2	Venice Statement on the Right to Enjoy the Benefits of Scientific Progress and Its Applications (2009)	321
5.8	Monitoring	325
5.8.1	Periodic reports	326
5.8.2	Individual communications: the 104 procedure	338
5.9	Conclusions	342
6.	Regional Human Rights Regimes and the Right to Science	345
6.1	Introduction	345
6.2	Americas	345
6.2.1	The Inter-American System of Protection of Human Rights and the Right to Science	349
6.2.1.1	The Charter of the OAS	350
6.2.1.2	The American Declaration of Human Rights	354
6.2.1.3	The American Convention on Human Rights	357
6.2.1.4	The Protocol of San Salvador to the American Convention on Human Rights	362
6.2.1.5	The Social Charter of the Americas	364
6.2.2	Measures of implementation	366
6.2.2.1	Periodic reports	368
6.2.2.2	Individual petitions and contentious cases	370
6.2.3	Conclusions	377
6.3	Europe	378
6.3.1	Council of Europe	380
6.3.1.1	1950 European Convention on Human Rights	381
6.3.1.2	1961 European Social Charter	387
6.3.1.3	1997 Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Dignity of the Human Being with Regard to the Application of Biology and Medicine (Oviedo Convention)	390
6.3.2	European Union	395
6.3.2.1	2000 Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union	396
6.3.2.2	EU science and technology policies	399
6.3.3	Conclusions	404
6.4	Africa	405
6.4.1	The OAU/AU human rights regime and the right to science	406
6.4.1.1	The African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights	407
6.4.1.2	The African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights	411
6.4.1.3	The African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights	417
6.4.2	Conclusions	420

9.4.2	Social elements	491
9.4.2.1	Freedom of scientific assembly	492
9.4.2.2	Freedom of scientific association	493
9.4.2.3	Freedom of movement of scientists	493
9.4.2.4	Right of scientists to take part in the conduct of scientific affairs	494
9.4.3	Labor elements	495
9.4.3.1	Right of scientists to work and follow scientific vocation freely	495
9.4.3.2	Right of scientists to just and favorable conditions, safe and healthy working conditions, and social security	497
9.4.4	Cultural elements	500
9.4.4.1	Right to benefit from the protection of the moral and material interests resulting from scientific production	501
9.4.4.2	Right to take part in cultural life	502
9.5	Obligations	503
9.5.1	Duty to respect	504
9.5.2	Duty to protect	513
9.5.3	Duty to fulfill	517
9.6	Indicators	523
9.6.1	Structural indicators	523
9.6.2	Process indicators	524
9.6.3	Outcome indicators	526
10.	The Right to Responsible Scientific Progress (Scientific Responsibility)	529
10.1	Introduction	529
10.2	Conceptualizing scientific responsibility	530
10.3	The normative basis of scientific responsibility	534
10.4	Normative content	544
10.4.1	Respect for scientific integrity	544
10.4.1.1	The nature of scientific integrity standards	545
10.4.1.2	Research integrity	546
10.4.1.3	Scientific citizenry	548
10.4.1.4	Scientific integrity responsibilities	550
10.4.2	Responsible anticipation	553
10.4.2.1	Respect for the interests of research subjects	553
10.4.2.2	Responsible anticipation	555
10.5	Obligations	563
10.5.1	Duty to respect self-regulatory practices	564
10.5.2	Duty to protect self-regulatory practices	566
10.5.3	Duty to fulfill scientific responsibility	567
10.6	Indicators	568
10.6.1	Scientific integrity	570
10.6.2	Protection of research participants	572
10.6.3	Responsible anticipation	574

11. The Right to Participate in Scientific Progress	577
11.1 Introduction	577
11.2 Conceptualizing participation in scientific progress	577
11.3 Normative basis	581
11.4 Normative content	587
11.4.1 Right to scientific literacy	588
11.4.2 Right to access the scientific professions	591
11.4.3 Right to participate in research	593
11.4.3.1 Citizens as scientists	593
11.4.3.2 Citizens as research subjects	596
11.4.4 Right to participate in science affairs	600
11.5 Obligations	602
11.5.1 Duty to respect	602
11.5.2 Duty to protect	605
11.5.3 Duty to fulfill	606
11.6 Indicators	611
11.6.1 Scientific literacy	611
11.6.2 Access to the scientific professions	612
11.6.3 Participation in research	613
11.6.4 Participation in science affairs	614
12. The Right to Benefit from Scientific Progress	615
12.1 Introduction	615
12.2 Conceptualizing the benefits of scientific progress	615
12.2.1 Access to the benefits of scientific progress	618
12.2.2 Benefits and harms	621
12.3 Normative basis	623
12.3.1 Right to access scientific knowledge	624
12.3.2 Right to the anticipation and monitoring of the impact of applications of scientific progress	626
12.3.3 Right to the development of beneficial applications of scientific progress	632
12.3.4 Right to the diffusion of, and access to, applications of scientific progress	633
12.3.5 Right to policies aligned with scientific evidence	636
12.4 Normative content	637
12.4.1 Right to access scientific knowledge	637
12.4.2 Right to the anticipation and monitoring of the impact of applications of scientific progress	638
12.4.3 Right to the development of beneficial applications of scientific progress	642
12.4.4 Right to the diffusion of, and access to, applications of scientific progress	645
12.4.5 Right to policies aligned with scientific evidence	649

12.5 Obligations	653
12.5.1 Duty to respect	653
12.5.2 Duty to protect	655
12.5.3 Duty to fulfill	660
12.5.3.1 Diffusion of scientific knowledge	661
12.5.3.2 Impact anticipation and monitoring	662
12.5.3.3 Development of beneficial applications of scientific progress	668
12.5.3.4 Diffusion of, and access to, applications of scientific progress	671
12.5.3.5 Policy alignment to scientific evidence	676
12.6 Indicators	685

PART V CONCLUSIONS

13. The Future of the Right to Science	693
13.1 Introduction	693
13.2 Three directions of development	694
13.2.1 Principles' specification	695
13.2.2 Monitoring	699
13.2.3 Justiciability	702
13.3 Toward a Science Treaty	706
<i>Bibliography</i>	713
<i>Index</i>	763