

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	v
<i>Source Acknowledgements</i>	vii
<i>List of Common Abbreviations</i>	xxiii
<i>Table of Cases and Reports</i>	xxvii
<i>Table of Treaties and Conventions</i>	xxxviii
<i>Table of International Instruments</i>	xli
<i>Table of Statutes of International Tribunals</i>	xliii
<i>Table of Rules of Procedure and Evidence of International Courts</i>	xliv
<i>Table of National Legislation</i>	xlvi

PART I SOURCES AND PRINCIPLES OF INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL LAW

Introduction	1
1. SOURCES OF INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL LAW	5
(A) International Custom and the Value of Precedents	5
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Tadić</i> , Appeals Chamber, Jurisdiction Decision, 2 October 1995	6
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Kupreškić et al.</i> , Trial Chamber, Judgment of 14 January 2000	17
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Aleksovski</i> , Appeals Chamber, Judgment of 24 March 2000	22
Commentary	25
Questions	26
Further Reading	26
(B) Treaties and Instruments Establishing International Tribunals	26
IMT Nuremberg, <i>Göring et al.</i> , Judgment of 30 September–1 October 1946	27
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Delalić et al. (Čelebići case)</i> , Trial Chamber, Judgment of 16 November 1998	30
Commentary	33
Questions	34
Further Reading	34

(C) General Principles of Law	34
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Erdemović</i> , Appeals Chamber, Judgment of 7 October 1997 (Joint Separate Opinion of Judge McDonald and Judge Vorah)	36
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Furundžija</i> , Trial Chamber, Judgment of 10 December 1998	38
Commentary	40
Questions	41
Further Reading	41
(D) International Criminal Law and Human Rights	41
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Kupreškić et al.</i> , Trial Chamber, Judgment of 14 January 2000	42
STL, <i>In re Hariri</i> , President, Order on Conditions of Detention, 21 April 2009	44
ICC, <i>Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo</i> , Pre-Trial Chamber I, Decision on the Applications for Participation in the Proceedings of VPRS 1, VPRS 2, VPRS 3, VPRS 4, VPRS 5 and VPRS 6, 17 January 2006	48
ICTR, <i>Prosecutor v. Rwamakuba</i> , Trial Chamber, Decision on Appropriate Remedy, 31 January 2007	49
Commentary	51
Questions	52
Further Reading	52
2. THE FUNDAMENTAL PRINCIPLES OF INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL LAW	53
(A) <i>Nullum Crimen Sine Lege</i>	53
The Notion and Its Origins	53
IMT Nuremberg, <i>Göring et al.</i> , Judgment of 30 September–1 October 1946	55
International Military Tribunal for the Far East, <i>US et al. v. Araki et al.</i> , Separate Opinion of Bernard Victor Aloysius Röling, 12 November 1948	58
International Military Tribunal for the Far East, <i>US et al. v. Araki et al.</i> , Separate Opinion of Radhabinod Pal, 12 November 1948	59
Commentary	60
SCSL, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman</i> , Appeals Chamber, Decision on Preliminary Motion Based on Lack of Jurisdiction, 31 May 2004	61
Corollary Principles: Specificity, Non-Retroactivity and Non-Extension by Analogy	67

European Court of Human Rights, <i>Kononov v. Latvia</i> , App. No. 36376/04, Grand Chamber, Judgment of 17 May 2010	68
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Milutinović et al.</i> , Decision on Dragoliub Ojdanić's Motion Challenging Jurisdiction – Joint Criminal Enterprise, 21 May 2003	72
Commentary	73
Questions	75
Further Reading	76
(B) Immunities	76
The Notion and Its Origins	76
Functional Immunities	76
Israel, <i>Eichmann v. Attorney-General</i> , Supreme Court, Judgment of 29 May 1962	77
United Kingdom, <i>R v. Bow Street Stipendiary Magistrate (Bartle) ex parte Pinochet Ugarte (No. 3)</i> , House of Lords, Judgment of 24 March 1999	79
USA, <i>Matar v. Dichter</i> , US Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit, Decision of 16 April 2009	85
Commentary	87
Personal Immunities	88
Spain, <i>Fidel Castro, Audiencia Nacional</i> (Central Criminal Court), Decision of 4 March 1999	89
France, <i>Gaddafi case, Cour de cassation</i> , Judgment of 13 March 2001	91
Belgium, <i>Sharon and Yaron, Cour de cassation</i> , Judgment of 12 February 2003	92
SCSL, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Appeals Chamber, Decision on Immunity from Jurisdiction, 31 May 2004	93
Commentary	96
Other Sources of 'Immunities'	96
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Karadžić</i> , Decision on Karadžić's Appeal of Trial Chamber's Decision on Alleged Holbrooke Agreement, 12 October 2009	97
Questions	99
Further Reading	99
(C) <i>Ne Bis In Idem</i>	99
The Notion and Its Origins	99
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Tadić</i> , Trial Chamber, Decision on the Defence Motion on the Principle of Non-Bis-In-Idem, 14 November 1995	100
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Karadžić</i> , Trial Chamber, Decision on the Accused's Motion for a Finding on Non-Bis-In-Idem, 16 November 2009	103

Commentary	104
The Complexity of Multiple Sovereigns	105
Amnesty and <i>Ne Bis In Idem</i>	108
ECCC, Decision on Appeal Against Provisional Detention Order of Ieng Sary, 17 October 2008	108
Commentary	111
Questions	112
Further Reading	112

PART II CRIMES

Introduction	113
1. WAR CRIMES	117
(A) The Notion and Its Origins	118
(B) Grave Breaches	118
(C) War Crimes in Non-International Armed Conflicts	118
(D) Link with the Armed Conflict	119
(E) Categories of War Crimes	120
(F) War Crimes Committed by Civilians	122
Superior Military Government Court of the French Occupation Zone in Germany, <i>Röchling et al.</i> , Judgment of 25 January 1949	122
Israel, <i>Enigster</i> , Tel-Aviv District Court, Judgment of 4 January 1952	127
Commentary	132
(G) Violations of the Rules on the Conduct of Warfare	132
Means of Warfare	132
Japan, <i>Shimoda et al. v. the State</i> , Tokyo District Court, Judgment of 7 December 1963	132
Commentary	138
Methods of Warfare	138
USA, <i>US v. Calley</i> , Court of Military Appeals, Judgment of 21 December 1973	138
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Galić</i> , Trial Chamber, Judgment of 5 December 2003	141
Commentary	153
Questions	153
Further Reading	153

2. CRIMES AGAINST HUMANITY	154
(A) The Notion and Its Origins	154
IMT Nuremberg, <i>Göring et al.</i> , Judgment 30 September–1 October 1946 (Streicher, von Schirach)	156
US Military Tribunal Sitting in Nuremberg, <i>US v. Altstötter et al.</i> (<i>Justice Trial</i>), Judgment of 3–4 December 1947	159
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Tadić</i> , Trial Chamber, Judgment of 7 May 1997	166
Commentary	168
(B) The Perpetrators and the Victims	168
US Military Tribunal Sitting in Nuremberg, <i>US v. Greifelt et al.</i> (<i>RuSHA Trial</i>), Judgment of 10 March 1948	169
France, <i>Papon case</i> , Cour de cassation, Judgment of 23 January 1997	170
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Limaj et al.</i> , Trial Chamber, Judgment of 30 November 2005	170
France, <i>Barbie case</i> , Cour de cassation, Judgment of 20 December 1985	174
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Martić</i> , Appeals Chamber, Judgment of 8 October 2008	175
Commentary	179
(C) The ‘Chapeau’ Elements	179
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Kunarac et al.</i> , Appeals Chamber, Judgment of 12 June 2002	181
Commentary	184
(D) The Specific Crimes Within Crimes Against Humanity	184
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Kupreškić et al.</i> , Trial Chamber, Judgment of 14 January 2000	186
ICTR, <i>Nahimana et al. v. Prosecutor</i> (the <i>Media case</i>), Appeals Chamber, Judgment of 28 November 2007	188
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Kunarac et al.</i> , Trial Chamber, Judgment of 22 February 2001	194
Commentary	198
Questions	199
Further Reading	199
3. GENOCIDE	200
(A) The Notion and Its Origins	200

(B) The Elements of Genocide	201
The Underlying Acts	201
ICTR, <i>Prosecutor v. Akayesu</i> , Trial Chamber, Judgment of 2 September 1998	201
Commentary	203
Protected Groups	204
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Krstić</i> , Trial Chamber, Judgment of 2 August 2001	204
Commentary	207
Genocidal Intent	209
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Jelisić</i> , Trial Chamber, Judgment of 14 December 1999	209
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Jelisić</i> , Appeals Chamber, Judgment of 5 July 2001	214
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Krstić</i> , Trial Chamber, Judgment of 2 August 2001	217
Report of the International Commission of Inquiry on Darfur to the United Nations Secretary-General, 25 January 2005 (UN Doc. S/2005/60)	223
Commentary	227
(C) Cultural Genocide?	228
Germany, <i>Jorgić case</i> , Federal Court of Justice (<i>Bundesgerichtshof</i>), Judgment of 30 April 1999	228
(D) Prevention of Genocide vs. Complicity in Genocide	229
ICJ, Application of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide (<i>Bosnia and Herzegovina v. Serbia and Montenegro</i>), Judgment of 26 February 2007	230
(E) Domestic Implementation	234
Australia, <i>Nulyarimma v. Thompson</i> , Federal Court of Australia, Judgment of 1 September 1999	234
Questions	236
Further Reading	237
4. AGGRESSION	238
US Military Tribunal Sitting in Nuremberg, <i>US v. von Weizsäcker et al.</i> (<i>Ministries case</i>), Judgment of 11–13 April 1949	241
US Military Tribunal Sitting in Nuremberg, <i>US v. von Leeb et al.</i> (<i>High Command case</i>), Judgment of 27 October 1948	244
Commentary	247
US Military Tribunal Sitting in Nuremberg, <i>US v. Krauch et al.</i> (<i>I.G. Farben case</i>), Judgment of 30 July 1948	248
Commentary	251
United Kingdom, <i>R v. Jones</i> , House of Lords, Judgment of 29 March 2006	252

Commentary	254
Questions	255
Further Reading	255
5. TORTURE	256
(A) Overview: The Practice and the Prohibition	256
(B) Elements of the Crime of Torture	258
Severity of Pain or Suffering	259
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Brđanin</i> , Appeals Chamber, Judgment of 3 April 2007	260
Commentary	262
Public Official as Actor	265
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Kunarac</i> , Trial Chamber, Judgment of 22 February 2001	265
Commentary	268
Intent and Purpose	269
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Kunarac</i> , Appeals Chamber, Judgment of 12 June 2002	270
Commentary	271
(C) Necessity?	271
Israel, <i>Legality of the General Security Service Interrogation Methods</i> , Supreme Court, Judgment of 6 September 1999	271
Commentary	281
Germany, <i>Daschner Wolfgang and E.</i> case, Regional Court (<i>Landgericht</i>) of Frankfurt am Main, Decision of 20 December 2004	282
Questions	284
Further Reading	285
6. TERRORISM	286
(A) The Notion and Its Origins	286
(B) Outlawing Terrorist Acts	286
(C) Criminalizing Terrorism	288
Lebanon, <i>In re Dany Chamoun et al.</i> , Judicial Council, Judgment No. 5/1995 of 24 June 1995	288
USA, <i>US v. Fawaz Yunis</i> , US Court of Appeals, District of Columbia Circuit, Judgment of 29 January 1991	294
(D) Terrorists and International Humanitarian Law	301
USA, <i>Hamdan v. Rumsfeld</i> , Supreme Court, Judgment of 29 June 2006	301
Italy, <i>Bouyahia Maher Ben Abdelaziz et al.</i> , Supreme Court, Judgment No. 1072 of 17 January 2007	305

Commentary	310
Questions	311
Further Reading	311
7. PIRACY	312
USA, <i>US v. Smith</i> , Supreme Court, Judgment of 25 February 1820	314
USA, <i>The Ambrose Light</i> , Federal District Court of New York, Judgment of 30 September 1885	315
United Kingdom, <i>In Re Piracy Iure Gentium</i> , Judicial Committee of the Privy Council, Judgment of 26 July 1934	317
Kenya, <i>Hassan M. Ahmed et al. v. Republic</i> , High Court of Kenya, Judgment of 12 May 2009	319
Commentary	321
Questions	321
Further Reading	321
<hr/>	
PART III FORMS OF RESPONSIBILITY	
Introduction	323
1. COMMISSION	327
USA, <i>US v. Potter</i> , US Navy Board of Review, Judgment of 5 June 1968	328
ICTR, <i>Gacumbitsi v. Prosecutor</i> , Appeals Chamber, Judgment of 7 July 2006	330
Commentary	332
Questions	332
Further Reading	333
2. JOINT CRIMINAL ENTERPRISE	334
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Tadić</i> , Appeals Chamber, Judgment of 15 July 1999	335
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Brđanin</i> , Appeals Chamber, Judgment of 3 April 2007	344
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Martić</i> , Appeals Chamber, Judgment of 8 October 2008	347
Commentary	351
Questions	351
Further Reading	352

3. CO-PERPETRATION	353
ICC, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Pre-Trial Chamber, Decision on the Confirmation of Charges of 29 January 2007	354
Commentary	360
ICC, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Chui</i> , Pre-Trial Chamber, Decision on the Confirmation of Charges of 30 September 2008	360
Questions	361
Further Reading	362
4. PLANNING	363
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Kordić and Čerkez</i> , Trial Chamber, Judgment of 26 February 2001 and Appeals Chamber, Judgment of 17 December 2004	364
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Dragomir Milošević</i> , Appeals Chamber, Judgment of 12 November 2009	365
Commentary	367
Questions	367
Further Reading	368
5. ORDERING	369
(A) Overview	369
(B) Must the Order Be Executed?	370
USA, Court-Martial of General Jacob H. Smith, 3 March 1903	370
Commentary	372
(C) <i>Mens Rea</i>	373
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Blaškić</i> , Trial Chamber, Judgment of 3 March 2000	373
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Blaškić</i> , Appeals Chamber, Judgment of 29 July 2004	376
Commentary	379
Questions	379
Further Reading	380
6. AIDING AND ABETTING	381
Federal Republic of Germany, <i>S. and others (Hechingen and Haigerloch Deportation case)</i> , Tribunal (<i>Landgericht</i>) Hechingen, Judgment of 28 June 1947	382
Federal Republic of Germany, <i>S. and others (Hechingen and Haigerloch Deportation case)</i> , Court of Appeal (<i>Oberlandesgericht</i>) Tübingen, Judgment of 20 January 1948	386

US Military Tribunal Sitting in Nuremberg, <i>US v. Ernst von Weizsäcker et al.</i> , (<i>Ministries</i> case), Judgment of 11–13 April 1949	387
Commentary	388
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Furundžija</i> , Trial Chamber, Judgment of 10 December 1998	390
USA, <i>Khulumani v. Barclay National Bank Ltd. et al.</i> , US Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit, Judgment of 12 October 2007	399
Questions	400
Further Reading	401
7. INCITEMENT TO COMMIT GENOCIDE	402
(A) The Notion and Its Origins	402
(B) The Meaning of Direct and Public Incitement	404
ICTR, <i>Nahimana et al. v. Prosecutor (Media case)</i> , Appeals Chamber, Judgment of 28 November 2007	405
ICTR, <i>Prosecutor v. Bikindi</i> , Trial Chamber, Judgment of 2 December 2008	412
Commentary	414
(C) Intent and Causation	416
Canada, <i>Mugesera v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)</i> , Judgment of 28 June 2005	416
Commentary	419
Questions	420
Further Reading	420
8. SUPERIOR RESPONSIBILITY	421
(A) The Notion	421
(B) A Controversial Start	422
US Military Commission in Manila, <i>Trial of General Tomoyuki Yamashita</i> , Case No. 21, US Military Commission, Manila, 8 October–7 December 1945	422
USA, <i>In re Application of Yamashita</i> , Supreme Court, Judgment of 4 February 1946	425
Commentary	431
(C) Crystallization and Codification	431
(D) Elements	436
Subordination: Effective Command and Control	436
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Hadžihasanović</i> , Appeals Chamber, Judgment of 22 April 2008	438

SCSL, <i>Prosecutor v. Brima</i> (AFRC case), Appeals Chamber, Judgment of 22 February 2008	444
Commentary	445
<i>Mens Rea</i>	446
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Strugar</i> , Appeals Chamber, Judgment of 17 July 2008	446
Commentary	450
<i>Actus Reus</i> : Omission	450
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Strugar</i> , Appeals Chamber, Judgment of 17 July 2008	451
Commentary	455
Questions	456
Further Reading	456

PART IV CIRCUMSTANCES EXCLUDING CRIMINAL RESPONSIBILITY

Introduction	459
1. JUSTIFICATIONS: SELF-DEFENCE	461
US General Military Court in Ludwigsburg (Germany), <i>Erich Weiss and Wilhelm Mundo</i> , Decision of 10 November 1945, Report of the Judge Advocate	461
Commentary	462
Questions	463
Further Reading	463
2. EXCUSES	464
(A) Superior Orders	464
Germany, <i>LLandoverly Castle case (Dithmar and Boldt case)</i> , Supreme Court (<i>Reichsgericht</i>) at Leipzig, Judgment of 16 July 1921	464
US Military Commission, <i>Csihas et al.</i> , Report of the Judge Advocate, September 1946	466
Italy, <i>Kappler et al.</i> , Military Tribunal, Judgment No. 631 of 20 July 1948	468
Israel, <i>Jamal Abd El-Kader Mahmud et al. v. The Military Advocate General et al. (Meir case)</i> , Supreme Court, Judgment of 27 December 1989	470
Commentary	471
Questions	472
Further Reading	472

(B) Duress	472
US Military Tribunal Sitting in Nuremberg, <i>US v. Ohlendorf et al.</i> (<i>Einsatzgruppen</i> case), Judgment of 10 April 1948	473
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Erdemović</i> , Appeals Chamber, Judgment of 7 October 1997	476
East Timorese Transitional Administration, <i>Prosecutor v. Leki</i> , Special Panels for Serious Crimes (SPSC), Judgment of 11 June 2001 (English original)	487
Questions	491
Further Reading	491
(C) Necessity	491
US Military Tribunal Sitting in Nuremberg, <i>US v. Flick et al.</i> , Judgment of 22 December 1947	492
Federal Republic of Germany, <i>Sch. and Dr. L. (Gestapo members case)</i> , German Federal High Court (<i>Bundesgerichtshof</i>), Judgment of 14 October 1952	494
Israel, <i>Eichmann v. Attorney General</i> , Supreme Court, Judgment of 29 May 1962	496
France, <i>Touvier case</i> , Court of Appeal, Versailles, Judgment of 2 June 1993	497
Commentary	499
Questions	499
Further Reading	500
(D) Mistake of Fact	500
USA, <i>US v. Schwarz</i> , Navy Court of Military Review, Judgment of 29 October 1971	500
Commentary	501
USA, <i>US v. McMonagle</i> , US Court of Military Appeals, Judgment of 27 September 1993	502
Commentary	504
Federal Republic of Germany, <i>Polish prisoner of war case</i> , Federal Court of Justice (<i>Bundesgerichtshof</i>), Judgment of 12 December 1950	504
Questions	506
Further Reading	507
(E) Mistake of Law	507
Germany, <i>Llandovery Castle case (Dithmar and Boldt case)</i> , Supreme Court (<i>Reichsgericht</i>) at Leipzig, Judgment of 16 July 1921	507
Netherlands, <i>In re Wintgen</i> , Special Court of Cassation, Judgment of 6 July 1949	508
Netherlands, <i>B.</i> , Court Martial, Judgment of 2 January 1951	509
Federal Republic of Germany, <i>Sch. and Dr. L. (Gestapo members case)</i> Federal High Court (<i>Bundesgerichtshof</i>), Judgment of 14 October 1952	510

Questions	511
Further Reading	512
(F) Mental Disorder	512
Germany, <i>Stenger and Crusius</i> , German Imperial Court (<i>Reichsgericht</i>) in Leipzig, Judgment of 6 July 1921	512
Commentary	515
Questions	515
Further Reading	515
(G) <i>Tu Quoque</i>	516
IMT Nuremberg, <i>Göring et al.</i> , Judgment of 30 September–1 October 1946 (Dönitz)	516
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Kupreškić</i> , Trial Chamber, Judgment of 14 January 2000	518
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Martić</i> , Appeals Chamber, Judgment of 8 October 2008	520
Questions	521
Further Reading	522

PART V JURISDICTIONAL AND PROCEDURAL ISSUES

Introduction	523
1. PRIMACY VERSUS COMPLEMENTARITY	525
ICTR, <i>Prosecutor v. Kanyabashi</i> , Trial Chamber, Decision on the Defence Motion on Jurisdiction, 18 June 1997	526
ICTR, <i>In the Matter of Théoneste Bagosora</i> , Trial Chamber, Decision on the Application by the Prosecutor for a Formal Request for Deferral, 17 May 1996	526
ICC, <i>Prosecutor v. Kony et al.</i> , Pre-Trial Chamber, Decision on the Admissibility of the Case under Article 19(1) of the Statute, 10 March 2009	530
Commentary	534
2. STATE COOPERATION	535
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Blaškić</i> , Appeals Chamber, Judgment on the Request of the Republic of Croatia for Review of the Decision of Trial Chamber II of 18 July 1997, 29 October 1997	535
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Dokmanović</i> , Trial Chamber, Decision on the Motion for Release by the Accused Slavko Dokmanović, 22 October 1997	553
Commentary	555

3. SURRENDER AND ARRESTS	557
(A) Relations Between International Tribunals and Domestic Courts	557
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Martić</i> , Trial Chamber, Decision on the Prosecution's Motion to Request Leave to File a Corrected Amended Indictment, 13 December 2002	558
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Nikolić</i> , Appeals Chamber, Decision on Interlocutory Appeal Concerning Legality of Arrest, 5 June 2003	559
Commentary	563
(B) Interstate Relations	563
Italy, <i>Adler and 32 others (Abu Omar case)</i> , Milan Single Judge, Verdict of 4 November 2009, Reasons Filed on 1 February 2010	564
Commentary	570
4. TRIAL PROCEDURES	571
ICTY, <i>Prosecutor v. Limaj et al.</i> , Trial Chamber, Decision on the Prosecution's Motions to Admit Prior Statements as Substantive Evidence, 25 April 2005	572
ICC, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga Dyilo</i> , Trial Chamber, Decision Regarding the Practices Used to Prepare and Familiarise Witnesses for Giving Testimony at Trial, 30 November 2007	577
Commentary	580
Questions	580
Further Reading	580
<i>Index</i>	583