

Table of Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>v</i>
<i>Abbreviations and Acronyms</i>	<i>xiii</i>
<i>Judicial Decisions and Individual Communications</i>	<i>xvii</i>
<i>General Comments and Recommendations</i>	<i>xxiii</i>
<i>Other UN Documents</i>	<i>xxxi</i>
<i>International Treaties and Instruments</i>	<i>xxxix</i>
Introduction	1
Background	1
Course of the Argument, Methodology, and Selection of Materials	3
Gaps in the Existing Literature.....	7

PART I HISTORY AND THEORY

1. The Rise and Fall of the Historic Divide between Socio-economic and Civil and Political Rights	13
1.1. Introduction.....	13
1.2. The Historic Divide between Socio-economic and Civil and Political Rights	14
1.2.1. The Bifurcation Decision	15
1.2.2. The Divide in the Treaties	18
1.2.3. Alleged Dichotomies between the Categories.....	22
1.3. The Dissolution of Boundaries between the Categories	25
1.3.1. All Rights Entail Positive and Negative Obligations	26
1.3.1.1. Positive Freedom, Substantive Enjoyment, and Substantive Equality	26
1.3.1.2. A Tripartite Structure of Obligations for All Rights	28
1.3.1.3. Positive Obligations in the Treaty Texts	30
1.3.2. All Rights Cost Money	32
1.3.3. All Rights are Vague and Polycentric	33
1.3.4. All Rights are Justiciable.....	34
1.4. The Remaining Dichotomy and the Hypothesis of Full Convergence.....	36
1.5. Conclusion.....	39

2.	The Concept of Progressive Realisation	41
2.1.	Introduction.....	41
2.2.	The General Concept of Progressive Realisation.....	42
2.2.1.	Human Rights as Principles and Optimisation Requirements	43
2.2.2.	The Umbrella and Narrow Meaning of Progressive Realisation	44
2.2.3.	Obligations of Conduct and Result.....	46
2.3.	The Immediate Obligations	47
2.3.1.	Strategies, Policies, and Plans of Action.....	48
2.3.2.	Non-discrimination	50
2.3.3.	Immediate Obligations of Result in Individual Cases.....	52
2.4.	Ensuring Progress Towards Complete Fulfilment	53
2.4.1.	Goal-driven Alignment of Immediate Measures.....	54
2.4.2.	Monitoring, Indicators, Benchmarks, Data.....	54
2.4.3.	Non-retrogression.....	56
2.5.	The Maximum of Available Resources	57
2.5.1.	Nature and Availability of Resources.....	58
2.5.2.	International Cooperation	59
2.5.3.	Minimum Core.....	60
2.6.	Role of the Committees and Standard of Review.....	61
2.6.1.	Margin of Appreciation or Discretion	62
2.6.2.	Reasonableness.....	64
2.7.	Conclusion.....	66

PART II
ANALYSIS OF COMMITTEE JURISPRUDENCE

3.	The General Conception of the Divide between Categories	69
3.1.	Introduction.....	69
3.2.	The CRPD-Com and CRC-Com	70
3.2.1.	Insistence on the Immediate/Progressive Rights Divide.....	71
3.2.2.	Uncertainties in the Categorisation of Mixed Rights	72
3.2.3.	Failure to Clarify the Standard of Realisation for Obligations	77
3.3.	The CEDAW-Com and CERD.....	80
3.4.	The HRC	82
3.5.	Permeability and Indistinguishability	83
3.6.	Conclusion.....	86
4.	Civil and Political Rights as Progressively Realisable	87
4.1.	Introduction.....	87
4.2.	The CRPD-Com.....	88

4.2.1.	Accessibility under Article 9 of the CRPD	88
4.2.1.1.	Accessibility and Civil and Political Rights	88
4.2.1.2.	Gradual Implementation and Progressive Realisation	90
4.2.2.	Equality and Non-discrimination under Article 5 CRPD.....	93
4.2.3.	Equal Recognition before the Law under Article 12 CRPD.....	96
4.2.4.	Independent Living under Article 19 of the CRPD.....	96
4.3.	The CRC-Com	98
4.3.1.	General Measures of Implementation	99
4.3.2.	The Right to be Heard under Article 12 of the CRC	100
4.3.3.	The Right to be Free from All Forms of Violence under Article 19 of the CRC	101
4.3.4.	Rights in Criminal Law and Criminal Proceedings under Article 40 of the CRC.....	104
4.4.	The CEDAW-Com and CERD.....	105
4.4.1.	General Obligation of Non-discrimination	105
4.4.2.	Special Measures	109
4.5.	The HRC	111
4.5.1.	General Obligations under Article 2 of the ICCPR	111
4.5.2.	The Right to Life under Article 6 of the ICCPR.....	112
4.5.3.	Children's Rights under Article 24 of the ICCPR.....	114
4.5.4.	Equality under Articles 3, 23 (4) and 26 of the ICCPR	115
4.6.	Conclusion.....	118
5.	Civil and Political Rights as Subject to Resource Availability	119
5.1.	Introduction.....	119
5.2.	The CRPD-Com.....	119
5.2.1.	Reasonable Accommodation and Progressive Realisation	120
5.2.2.	Available Resources Limiting Civil and Political Rights	122
5.2.3.	Proportionality Assessments Separated from Reasonable Accommodation.....	125
5.2.4.	Minimum Core.....	129
5.3.	The CRC-Com	132
5.3.1.	The Application of the Second Sentence of Article 4 of the CRC to Civil and Political Rights	132
5.3.2.	Budgeting and Prioritisation	136
5.3.3.	The Right to Life, Survival and Development under Article 6 of the CRC	137
5.3.4.	Minimum Core.....	141
5.4.	The CEDAW-Com and CERD.....	141

5.5.	The HRC	142
5.5.1.	Disproportionate Burdens.....	143
5.5.2.	Minimum Core.....	145
5.6.	Conclusion.....	146
6.	The Application of the Margin of Appreciation and the Reasonableness Standard to Civil and Political Rights.....	147
6.1.	Introduction.....	147
6.2.	The Margin of Appreciation or Discretion.....	148
6.2.1.	The CRPD-Com.....	148
6.2.2.	The CRC-Com	149
6.2.3.	The CEDAW-Com and CERD.....	151
6.2.4.	The HRC.....	152
6.3.	Reasonableness.....	153
6.3.1.	The CRPD-Com.....	153
6.3.2.	The CRC-Com	155
6.3.3.	The CEDAW-Com and CERD.....	157
6.3.4.	The HRC.....	160
6.4.	Conclusion.....	163

PART III
TREATY INTERPRETATION

7.	The Applicable Rules of Treaty Interpretation, Ordinary Meaning, and Context.....	169
7.1.	Introduction.....	169
7.2.	The Rules of Interpretation Applicable to Human Rights Treaties	170
7.2.1.	The Special Nature of Human Rights Treaties.....	170
7.2.2.	Reconciling the Teleological Approach with the Crucible of Interpretation.....	172
7.3.	Ordinary Meaning, Article 31 (1) of the VCLT.....	175
7.3.1.	Article 2 of the ICCPR.....	176
7.3.2.	Articles 2 and 4 of the CRC and Article 4 (1) of the CRPD	177
7.3.3.	Article 2 of the CEDAW and Article 2 (1) of the ICERD.....	178
7.4.	Context, Article 31 (1) of the VCLT	179
7.4.1.	Prescription of Progressive Realisation Only for Socio-economic Rights	179
7.4.2.	Reporting Procedure in All Treaties.....	183
7.4.3.	Special Measures in the CEDAW, ICERD and CRPD	185
7.4.4.	Reasonable Accommodation in the CRPD.....	186
7.5.	Conclusion.....	187

8.	External Sources of Treaty Interpretation	188
8.1.	Introduction	188
8.2.	Relevant Rules of International Law, Article 31 (3) (c) of the VCLT	188
8.2.1.	Legal Certainty.....	189
8.2.1.1.	The CRPD and the CRC	190
8.2.1.2.	The CEDAW and the ICERD	192
8.2.1.3.	The ICCPR.....	194
8.2.2.	No Impossible Obligations	194
8.3.	Object and Purpose, Article 31 (1) of the VCLT	196
8.3.1.	Full and Equal De Facto Enjoyment of Human Rights as Object and Purpose	198
8.3.2.	Progressive Realisation does not Weaken Rights Protection.....	199
8.3.2.1.	No Justification for Indefinite Postponement.....	200
8.3.2.2.	No Conflict with Adjudication.....	204
8.3.3.	Progressive Realisation Additionally Strengthens Rights Protection.....	206
8.3.3.1.	Revealing Positive Obligations and Adding a Layer of Scrutiny.....	206
8.3.3.2.	Preventing an Unjustified Hierarchy.....	213
8.3.3.3.	Fostering State Acceptance by Applying a Realistic Standard	213
8.4.	Subsequent Agreements and Subsequent Practice, Article 31 (3) (a), (b) of the VCLT	214
8.4.1.	'Primary' State Practice.....	215
8.4.2.	The Relevance of Committee Pronouncements	216
8.4.3.	State Practice in Response to Committee Pronouncements	219
8.4.3.1.	Extensive Positive Obligations as the Central Concern of States Parties	219
8.4.3.2.	Agreement Regarding Progressiveness.....	221
8.4.3.3.	Agreement Regarding Relevance of Resource Considerations.....	223
8.5.	Conclusion.....	225
9.	Supplementary Means and Result of Interpretation.....	227
9.1.	Introduction	227
9.2.	The Admissibility of Utilising Supplementary Means of Interpretation.....	227
9.3.	Preparatory Work and Circumstances of Treaty Conclusion, Article 32 of the VCLT	229
9.3.1.	ICESCR and ICCPR	230
9.3.1.1.	Immediate is not Immediate (Certain Flexibility).....	231

9.3.1.2.	Progressive Realisation is not Indefinite Postponement	239
9.3.1.3.	Influence of the Positive/Negative Rights Divide	241
9.3.2.	ICERD	242
9.3.3.	CEDAW	244
9.3.4.	CRC	245
9.3.5.	CRPD	247
9.4.	Further Supplementary Means of Interpretation	250
9.5.	The Result of the Interpretation.....	253
9.6.	Conclusion.....	256
Conclusion, Recommendations, and Outlook.....		258
	Summary of Results.....	258
	Coordination, Cross-Referencing, and a Joint General Comment.....	258
	Outlook and Further Avenues of Research.....	262
	<i>Bibliography</i>	265
	<i>Index</i>	275